

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

**Minutes of 729th Meeting of the
Metro Planning Committee held at 9:00 a.m. on 27.10.2023**

Present

Director of Planning
Mr Ivan M. K. Chung

Chairman

Mr Wilson Y.W. Fung

Vice-chairman

Ms Sandy H.Y. Wong

Mr Franklin Yu

Mr Daniel K.S. Lau

Ms Lilian S.K. Law

Professor Jonathan W.C. Wong

Professor Roger C.K. Chan

Mr Timothy K.W. Ma

Assistant Commissioner/Urban, Transport Department
Mr Horace W. Hong

Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department
Mr Paul Y.K. Au

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Territory South),
Environmental Protection Department
Mr Simon M.K. Ho

Assistant Director/Regional 1,
Lands Department
Ms Trevina C.W. Kung

Deputy Director of Planning/District
Mr C.K. Yip

Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Mr Stanley T.S. Choi

Mr Ricky W.Y. Yu

Mr Ben S.S. Lui

Professor Bernadette W.S. Tsui

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board
Ms Caroline T.Y. Tang

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms Josephine Y.M. Lo

Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms Andrea W.Y. Yan

Agenda Item 1

Confirmation of the Draft Minutes of the 728th MPC Meeting held on 13.10.2023

[Open Meeting]

1. The draft minutes of the 728th MPC meeting held on 13.10.2023 were confirmed without amendments.

Agenda Item 2

Matter Arising

[Open Meeting]

2. The Secretary reported that there were no matters arising.

Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon District

[Mr Michael K.K. Cheung, Senior Town Planner/Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon (STP/TWK), was invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 3

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions only)]

A/TW/539 Proposed Public Utility Installation (Dry Weather Flow Interceptor) in
“Open Space” Zone, Portions of Tsuen Wan Park adjacent to Wing
Shun Street and Tai Ho Road, Tsuen Wan, New Territories
(MPC Paper No. A/TW/539)

3. The Secretary reported that the application site (the Site) was located in Tsuen Wan and Mr Stanley T.S. Choi had declared an interest on the item for his spouse being a director of a company which owned properties in Tsuen Wan. The Committee noted that Mr Stanley T.S. Choi had tendered an apology for being unable to attend the meeting.

Presentation and Question Sessions

4. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr Michael K.K. Cheung, STP/TWK, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department had no objection to the application.

5. Some Members raised the following questions:

The Proposed Development

(a) apart from the construction of new drainage facilities, whether the proposed Dry Weather Flow Interceptor (DWFI) would involve rehabilitation/replacement of the associated existing sewers or drainage systems;

- (b) whether there was any specified standard for a DWFI building in terms of building design and landscape treatments;
- (c) whether the size of the proposed DWFI building was determined by the volume of stormwater to be processed;
- (d) whether the proposed DWFI would be able to cope with the stormwater under extreme weather conditions during the wet season;
- (e) whether there was any complaint about the odour caused by the completed DWFIs in Hong Kong;
- (f) the dissemination of public information regarding the progress of the proposed construction works;

The Affected Park Facilities

- (g) noting that the existing children cycling area (CCA) of the Tsuen Wan Park would be affected by the proposed DWFI at Site C, the re-provisioning arrangement and the design of the CCA; and
- (h) whether special arrangement could be provided during the construction period, e.g. designating time slots for children to cycle at the cycle practising area in the waterfront of Tsuen Wan.

6. In response, with the aid of some PowerPoint slides, Mr Michael K.K. Cheung, STP/TWK, made the following main points:

The Proposed Development

- (a) the proposed DWFI mainly involved two flow interceptor devices (FIDs) for Tai Ho Road Box Culvert at Site A and Ma Tau Pa Road Box Culvert at Site B (the two box culverts). During the dry weather with low water flow,

the proposed FIDs located at the downstream of the two underground box culverts would intercept the dry weather flow from the culverts and divert the flow to the proposed DWFI building at Site C for on-site screening and filtering before discharging into Tsuen Wan Bay. Some public comments were concerned about misconnections of sewers and drainage systems in the Tsuen Wan area. According to the applicant, under a multi-pronged approach in tackling the odour and water pollution problems in Tsuen Wan Bay, the relevant government departments such as the Environmental Protection Department and Architectural Services Department would continue to rectify the misconnected sewers and drainage systems;

- (b) the building design of DWFI and the associated landscape treatments would generally be determined based on the local circumstances of each site and its catchment area;
- (c) whilst there was no information provided in the applicant's submission on whether the size of the proposed DWFI building was determined by the volume of stormwater to be processed. It was envisaged that the size of the proposed DWFI building was determined by the capacities of the two box culverts it would serve. In designing the proposed DWFI, a general principle of minimising the size of aboveground structures was adopted in order to avoid impacts on the park users;
- (d) the DWFI would be operated during dry weather conditions. Under wet weather conditions, the penstocks at the FIDs would be lifted to allow direct stormwater discharge from the two box culverts to the harbour;
- (e) according to the applicant, no complaint on the odour nuisance caused by the existing FIDs was received. As the proposed FIDs would be installed completely underground within the two box culverts, unacceptable odour nuisance arising from the proposed DWFI was not anticipated;
- (f) public notices with the estimated completion date of the construction works would be posted at the Site to ensure that members of the public could be

promptly informed of the construction progress;

The Affected Park Facilities

- (g) unlike the affected pet garden and elderly fitness station which would be reprovisioned within the Tsuen Wan Park before construction of the proposed DWFI, the CCA could only be reprovisioned in-situ after completion of the construction works of the proposed DWFI building at Site C due to its relatively large size in terms of site area (about 4,000m²) and hence, difficulty in identifying an alternative site for off-site reprovisioning. Notwithstanding that, the affected users could still enjoy cycling at the cycle practising area in the waterfront of Tsuen Wan during the construction period. The applicant had provided the preliminary design concept as shown in Drawing A-15 of the Paper that the cycling tracks of the reprovisioned CCA would be built around the proposed DWFI building and divided into three zones for different age groups; and
- (h) the suggestion of providing temporary children cycling facilities during the construction period would be conveyed to the applicant for consideration and liaison with the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD), as appropriate.

7. While noting that the construction agent, as a general practice, would post public notices regarding the construction progress at the affected area for public information, a Member expressed concern that the information published on such notices might not be up-to-date. The Member emphasised the need for promptly relaying the latest construction progress to the public to prevent any potential confusion. The Chairman said that the Member's views could be conveyed to the applicant and LCSD for their follow-up actions, as appropriate, with a view to enhancing the dissemination of information on the progress of the construction works and minimising any possible impacts on the general public using the open space.

8. Noting from the public comments that the open space facilities would be affected, resulting in a loss of open space in the Tsuen Wan Park available for public use, a Member

suggested that the applicant and LCSD should jointly consider co-using the Site for the proposed DWFI and other leisure activities for public enjoyment, such as community garden and education facilities/services to promote the public's better understanding of the functions and merits of the proposed DWFI.

Deliberation Session

9. The Chairman remarked that the Government had adopted a multi-pronged approach to enhance the water quality of the harbour and the overall environment, and the installation of DWFI was one of the most effective measures to control water pollution. There were similar previous applications for DWFI in other districts approved by the Committee. For the subject application, while the CCA could not be reprovisioned before commencement of the construction of the proposed DWFI building, other affected park facilities, including the pet garden and elderly fitness station, could be reprovisioned seamlessly to avoid impacts on park users. Also, the applicant had endeavoured to reduce the size of the aboveground structures so as to minimise possible impacts on the environment and park users.

10. The Committee agreed that Members' suggestions on dissemination of public information on the construction progress and co-using of DWFI site should be conveyed to the relevant government departments for consideration and/or follow-up actions, as appropriate.

11. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until 27.10.2027, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper

[Mr Franklin Yu joined the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 4

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions only)]

A/TWW/127 Proposed Minor Relaxation of Plot Ratio Restriction for a Permitted House Development in “Residential (Group C)” Zone, Lot No. 407 in D.D. 399, Ting Kau, Tsuen Wan West, New Territories
(MPC Paper No. A/TWW/127A)

Presentation and Question Sessions

12. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr Michael K.K. Cheung, STP/TWK, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) had no objection to the application.

[Ms Sandy H.Y. Wong joined the meeting during PlanD’s presentation.]

13. Two Members raised the following questions:

- (a) noting that there was no vehicular access to the application site (the Site), whether there was any requirement for provision of car parking space under the lease concerning the Site; and
- (b) the provision and maintenance of a platform or path along the seaward side of the Site as required under the lease.

14. In response, Mr Michael K.K. Cheung, STP/TWK, made the following main points:

- (a) there was no requirement under the lease for provision of car parking space and no car parking space would be provided at the Site upon redevelopment; and
- (b) the platform or path did not form part of the Site. It was located along the

southern side of the Site to facilitate the access by the public to the seaside.

Deliberation Session

15. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until 27.10.2027, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

[The Chairman thanked PlanD's representative for attending the meeting. He left the meeting at this point.]

Hong Kong District

[Mr Elton H.T. Chung and Ms Floria Y.T. Tsang, Senior Town Planners/Hong Kong (STPs/HK), and Ms Gloria Y.L. Sze, Town Planner/Hong Kong, were invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 5

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/H9/85	Proposed Public Utility Installation (Dry Weather Flow Interceptor) in "Open Space" Zone and area shown as 'Road', Portion of Aldrich Bay Park adjacent to Tai On Street (GLA-HK 1055 (Part)); Portion of Hing Man Street carpark (EHX-550 (Part)); and Portions of Aldrich Bay Promenade (GLA-HK 920 (Part)), Hong Kong (MPC Paper No. A/H9/85)
---------	---

16. The Secretary reported that the application site (the Site) was located in Shau Kei Wan and Ms Lilian S.K. Law had declared an interest on the item for being a former

Executive Director and committee member of The Boys' & Girls' Clubs Association of Hong Kong which had a service unit in Shau Kei Wan. As the interest of Ms Lilian S.K. Law was indirect, the Committee agreed that she could stay in the meeting.

Presentation and Question Sessions

17. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr Elton H.T. Chung, STP/HK, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department had no objection to the application.

18. Two Members raised the following questions:

- (a) whether other treatment works similar to those for Kai Tak area would be undertaken by the applicant to remove the sediments accumulated in the sewerage system of the Shau Kei Wan area, and whether the proposed dry weather flow interceptor (DWFI) would also help address the odour nuisance at the Shau Kei Wan Typhoon Shelter;
- (b) noting that there was no implementation programme for the planned open space where Site B was located and the proposed public sitting-out area at the western portion of Site B would only tentatively materialise by 2028, whether the applicant had provided any preliminary design concept for the sitting-out area; and
- (c) how the proposed DWFI would be operated and whether it would cause an odour problem during the processing of the dry weather flow.

19. In response, Mr Elton H.T. Chung, STP/HK, made the following main points:

- (a) the Government had adopted a multi-pronged approach to tackle the odour and water pollution problems along the harbourfront areas of Victoria Harbour. For example, the Environmental Protection Department would undertake investigation and enforcement actions to stop illegal discharge of

wastewater to public storm drains and the Drainage Services Department (DSD) would rehabilitate the aged public sewers. In addition, the applicant, i.e. DSD, had examined the effectiveness of a DWFI at the Kowloon Bay Sewage Interception Station in addressing the odour problem of the harbourfront area and notable results were achieved. The proposed DWFI would also be effective in alleviating the odour nuisance at the Shau Kei Wan Typhoon Shelter;

- (b) as shown in Drawings A-10 and 11 of the Paper, the preliminary design of the proposed public sitting-out area at the western portion of Site B, as proposed by the applicant, comprised passive amenities and landscape plantings without any fences. Subject to finalisation of the detailed design, the proposed public sitting-out area would be constructed by the applicant and handed over to the Leisure and Cultural Services Department for management and maintenance; and
- (c) the proposed DWFI building at Site B consisted of two wings, namely the East Wing and the West Wing, with the scale optimised to accommodate the essential equipment and compartments required for its operation, and a flow interception device (FID) would be located at each of the application sites (i.e. Sites A, B, C and D). Instead of having a DWFI for each of the FIDs, all dry weather flows intercepted by each FID would be diverted to the DWFI building at Site B for on-site screening and filtering before discharging back to the Shau Kei Wan Typhoon Shelter through the existing stormwater drainage system. After the dry weather flow was screened and filtered, the solid generated would be properly stored within the DWFI building and removed by dump trucks. The loading and unloading area for the dump trucks would also be located within the enclosed DWFI building and equipped with deodorisation system. Therefore, an odour problem caused by the proposed DWFI building was not anticipated.

20. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr Simon M.K. Ho, Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Territory South), Environmental Protection Department said that the odour and water pollution problems were mainly caused by accumulation of sediments and pollutants in the box culverts. The discharged sediments and pollutants would then accumulate in the Shau Kei Wan Typhoon Shelter due to its relatively slow water flow. With the installation of the proposed development, the sediments and pollutants in the water flow would be processed before discharging to the Shau Kei Wan Typhoon Shelter, which would improve the water quality of the area. As for the improvement works at the Kai Tak approach channel mentioned by a Member, Mr Ho supplemented that the works mainly involved implementation of in-situ bioremediation to treat the sediments accumulated therein, which was different from that of the proposed development.

21. A Member considered that the proposed development would enhance the water quality of the Shau Kei Wan Typhoon Shelter.

22. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until 27.10.2027, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

Agenda Item 6

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/H25/22 Proposed Public Utility Installation (Dry Weather Flow Interceptor) in
“Other Specified Uses” annotated “Amenity Area” Zone and area
shown as ‘Road’, Open Space and Amenity Area at Tunnel Approach
Rest Garden, Wan Chai, Hong Kong
(MPC Paper No. A/H25/22)

Presentation and Question Sessions

23. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Ms Floria Y.T. Tsang, STP/HK, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) had no objection to the application.

24. Noting that the site area and the scale of the proposed dry weather flow interceptor (DWFI) varied amongst the similar applications (No. A/TW/539, No. A/H9/85 and the subject application) considered by the Committee at this meeting, a Member asked whether there was any specified standard on the area required for a DWFI. In response, Ms Floria Y.T. Tsang, STP/HK, said that while the size of flow interception devices (FID) for each DWFI was similar in general, the overall scale of a DWFI and the site area required might vary depending on the local circumstances of each site. For the proposed DWFI under the subject application, the height of the aboveground portion of the proposed FID was 1.5m, or 2.6m including the sheltered seating bench. Moreover, unlike the circumstances under planning applications No. A/TW/539 and A/H9/85, the intercepted dry weather flow could not be diverted directly from the proposed FID to the proposed filtering station to the northwest of the application site (the Site) at Wan Shing Street for filtering due to the long distance between these two facilities. An underground dry weather flow pumping station was required at the Site to facilitate the pumping process. Although the proposed filtering station at Wan Shing Street did not form part of the application (zoned “Government, Institution or Community (2)” and planning permission was not required for the proposed filtering station), it was worth noting that the size of the filtering station was smaller than the others, given that the E&M installations for the filtering station were already in place in the existing Wan Chai East Preliminary Treatment Works to its immediate east.

Deliberation Session

25. In response to a Member’s question, the Chairman said that the sponge city concept had been adopted for the planning of New Development Areas (NDAs) and therefore, sites for DWFI or relevant facilities had already been reserved as appropriate in various NDAs at the planning and engineering study process.

26. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should

be valid until 27.10.2027, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

[The Chairman thanked PlanD's representatives for attending the meeting. They left the meeting at this point.]

Kowloon District

[Mr Steven Y.H. Siu, Senior Town Planner/Kowloon (STP/K), was invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Items 7 and 8

Section 16 Applications

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/K14/825 Proposed Shop and Services (Bank, Fast Food Counter, Local Provision Store, Electrical Shop and/or Showroom) in "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Business" Zone, Units No. 2, 6, 8 and 10 on G/F, How Ming Factory Building, 99 How Ming Street, Kwun Tong, Kowloon

A/K14/826 Proposed Shop and Services (Bank, Fast Food Counter, Local Provision Store, Electrical Shop and/or Showroom) in "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Business" Zone, Units No. 1, 3, 5, 7, 12, 16 and 18 on G/F, How Ming Factory Building, 99 How Ming Street, Kwun Tong, Kowloon
(MPC Paper No. A/K14/825 and 826)

27. The Committee agreed that as the two s.16 applications for proposed shop and services (bank, fast food counter, local provision store, electrical shop and showroom) were similar in nature and the application premises were located within the same building, they

could be considered together.

Presentation and Question Sessions

28. With the aid of some plans, Mr Steven Y.H. Siu, STP/K, briefed Members on the background of the applications, the proposed uses, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department had no objection to the applications.

29. Members had no question on the applications.

Deliberation Session

30. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the applications, on the terms of the applications as submitted to the Town Planning Board. Each of the permission should be valid until 27.10.2027, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The permissions were subject to the approval conditions stated in the Paper. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in the appendix of the Paper.

Agenda Item 9

Section 16 Application

[Open Meeting (Presentation and Question Sessions Only)]

A/K14/827 Proposed Minor Relaxation of Building Height Restriction for Permitted Government Use (Fire Station-cum-Ambulance Depot) and Proposed Flat (Departmental Quarters) in “Government, Institution or Community (2)” Zone, Government Land to the west of On Yu Road, Anderson Road Quarry Development, Kowloon
(MPC Paper No. A/K14/827)

Presentation and Question Sessions

31. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr Steven Y.H. Siu, STP/K, briefed Members on the background of the application, the proposed development, departmental and public comments, and the planning considerations and assessments as detailed in the Paper. The Planning Department (PlanD) had no objection to the application.

32. Members had no question on the application.

Deliberation Session

33. While not opposing the proposed development, a Member considered that the two similar applications for proposed minor relaxation of building height restrictions (BHR), with one for permitted joint-user complex and proposed underground public vehicle park (No. A/K14/812) and the other for permitted refuse collection point and recycling store (No. A/K14/813), quoted in the Paper were essentially not similar to the subject application. The proposed uses of the two quoted applications were passive in nature while the proposed departmental quarters under the subject application would involve active human activities. The proposed composite building with departmental quarters atop a fire station-cum-ambulance depot (FSAD) might not be an ideal arrangement as the FSAD could potentially cause disturbance to the future residents above. In that regard, the Committee noted that the proposed podium garden with a floor-to-floor height of 5m would serve as a buffer between the departmental quarters and the FSAD. To minimise the possible disturbance to the residents, it was the norm that the broadcasting system of FSAD would be pre-set to a lower volume during night time. Moreover, there were similar developments in other districts. For instance, the Committee on 4.9.2020 approved an application for minor relaxation of BHR from 40m to 55.6m for a composite building of departmental quarters cum FSAD in the “Government, Institution or Community (4)” zone in Tseung Kwan O and the construction was currently underway.

34. After deliberation, the Committee decided to approve the application, on the terms of the application as submitted to the Town Planning Board. The permission should be valid until 27.10.2027, and after the said date, the permission should cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted was commenced or the permission was renewed. The permission was subject to the approval conditions stated in the Paper. The Committee also agreed to advise the applicant to note the advisory clauses as set out in

the appendix of the Paper.

[The Chairman thanked PlanD's representative for attending the meeting. He left the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 10

Any Other Business

[Open Meeting]

35. There being no other business, the meeting closed at 10:10 a.m..