Minutes of 1242nd Meeting of the Town Planning Board held on 30.4.2021

Present

Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Mr Wilson Y.W. Fung

Mr Stephen L.H. Liu

Dr Frankie W.C. Yeung

Mr Peter K.T. Yuen

Mr Philip S.L. Kan

Dr Lawrence W.C. Poon

Mr Thomas O.S. Ho

Mr Alex T.H. Lai

Professor T.S. Liu

Miss Winnie W.M. Ng

Ms Sandy H.Y. Wong

Mr Franklin Yu

Chairperson

Vice-chairperson

Mr L.T. Kwok

Mr Daniel K.S. Lau

Ms Lilian S.K. Law

Professor John C.Y. Ng

Dr Jeanne C.Y. Ng

Mr Ricky W.Y. Yu

Dr Roger C.K. Chan

Dr Venus Y.H. Lun

Dr Conrad T.C. Wong

Chief Traffic Engineer (New Territories West), Transport Department Ms Carrie K.Y. Leung

Chief Engineer (Works) Home Affairs Department Mr Gavin C.T. Tse

Assistant Director (Environmental Assessment) Environmental Protection Department Mr Terence S.W. Tsang

Director of Lands Mr Andrew C.W. Lai

Director of Planning Mr Ivan M.K. Chung

Deputy Director of Planning/District Miss Fiona S.Y. Lung Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Mr K.K. Cheung

Dr C.H. Hau

Dr Lawrence K.C. Li

Mr Stanley T.S. Choi

Mr K.W. Leung

Professor Jonathan W.C. Wong

Mr C.H. Tse

Mr Y. S. Wong

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board Ms Lily Y.M. Yam

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board Ms Caroline T.Y. Tang

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board Mr Eric C.Y. Chiu 1. The meeting was resumed at 9:00 a.m. on 30.4.2021.

Opening Remarks

2. The Chairperson said that the meeting would be conducted with video conferencing arrangement.

Agenda Item 1

[Open Meeting]

Confirmation of Minutes of the 1242nd Meeting held on 31.3.2021 [The item was conducted in Cantonese.]

3. The draft minutes of the 1242nd meeting held on 31.3.2021 were confirmed without amendments.

Agenda Item 2

[Closed Meeting (Deliberation only)]

Consideration of Representations and Comments in respect of the Draft Tong Yan San Tsuen Outline Zoning Plan No. S/YL-TYST/13 and Consideration of Representations and Comments in respect of the Draft Tai Tong Outline Zoning Plan No. S/YL-TT/17

(TPB Papers No. 10728 and 10729)

[The item was conducted in Cantonese.]

Deliberation Session

4. The Secretary said that Members' declaration of interests was reported at the hearing session and recorded in the relevant minutes of the meeting held on 31.3.2021. No further declaration of interests had been received from Members since then. Members noted that Mr K.K. Cheung, Dr C.H. Hau, Dr Lawrence K.C. Li and Mr Y.S. Wong, who had declared

interests, had tendered apologies for being unable to attend the meeting. Memebers also noted that the interests related to having affiliation/business dealings with Hong Kong Housing Authority/Housing Department were considered indirect as the proposed public housing developments on the Tong Yan San Tsuen Outline Zoning Plan (TYST OZP) and Tai Tong Outline Zoning Plan (TT OZP) were related to housing sites in general, and the other interests of Members as declared were indirect as the concerned Members had no involvement in the Yuen Long South (YLS) Study and/or the representers'/commenters' submissions and they could stay in the meeting.

5. The Chairperson said that the amendments to the draft TYST OZP No. S/YL-TYST/13 and draft TT OZP No. S/YL-TT/17 were mainly to take forward Stages 1 and 2 of the YLS Development. The draft OZPs were exhibited on 10.7.2020 for public inspection. 79 representations and 140 comments were received for the TYST OZP, while 136 representations and 171 comments were received for the TT OZP. The hearing session for the consideration of representations and comments was held on 31.3.2021 and the minutes of the hearing session, which were issued to Members on 22.4.2021, were confirmed earlier today under Agenda Item 1. Today's meeting was to proceed with the deliberation of the representations and comments on the two OZPs. The Chairperson then invited the Secretary to briefly recapitulate the amendment items of the two OZPs, the major points made by the representers and commenters in their written and oral submissions, and the responses of relevant government departments.

6. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, the Secretary re-capitulated the following major points covered in the hearing session:

Amendment Items A1 to A5 of TYST OZP and Item A of TT OZP

(a) five sites to the west of Kung Um Road and in the vicinity of Tin Liu Tsuen and Shan Ha were rezoned to "Residential (Group A)3" ("R(A)3") for highdensity, high-rise public housing developments, with a number of sites in the vicinity rezoned for various government, institution and community (GIC) facilities, and open spaces. New/improved access roads were also proposed to serve the YLS Development;

Amendment Item B of both TYST OZP and TT OZP

(b) two sites on the TYST OZP and one site on the TT OZP, generally located in the vicinity of the recognised villages of Tin Liu Tsuen and Muk Kiu Tau Tsuen, were rezoned to "Residential (Group D)" mainly to reflect the existing low-density residential clusters;

Amendment Item C of both TYST OZP and TT OZP

(c) two sites on the TYST OZP and one site on the TT OZP, generally located in the vicinity of the recognised villages of Shan Ha and Wong Nai Tun Tsuen, were rezoned to "Village Type Development (1)" for reprovisioning of village houses affected by government projects;

Amendment Items D1 to D4 of TYST OZP

(d) three sites to the south of Yuen Long Highway and in the vicinity of Tin Shui Wai West Interchange (TSWWI) and Tong Yan San Tsuen Interchange were rezoned to "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Storage and Warehouse" ("OU(SW)") for high-density, high-rise multi-storey buildings (MSBs) to accommodate brownfield operations that could not be accommodated in conventional flatted factory buildings. An area to the south of TSWWI was rezoned to "Open Storage" to accommodate brownfield operations that could not practically be relocated into MSBs or conventional flatted factory buildings. Land was also reserved for open spaces as well as new/improved access roads;

Amendment Item E of TYST OZP

 (e) a site off the southern end of Kung Um Road towards the southern part of the TYST OZP was rezoned to "OU" annotated "Sewage Treatment Works" ("OU(STW)") for a proposed tertiary sewage treatment works (STW) capable of serving the whole YLS Development and adjacent areas;

Major Issues

- (f) Land Resumption, Compensation and Rehousing (C&R) Arrangement:
 - some representers/commenters demanded the same treatment for both indigenous and non-indigenous villagers; a 'land for land' compensation option and better monetary compensation rates should be offered; and early rehousing of the affected occupants of a residential care home for persons with disabilities (RCHD);

Responses from Government Departments

- (ii) C&R and related land matters were not directly related to the amendments to the OZPs and were outside the purview of the Town Planning Board (the Board);
- (g) Village Resite:
 - (i) option for village resite should be available to affected non-indigenous villagers and additional land (e.g. a piece of land near Shan Ha located to the south of Amendment Item C of TYST OZP) should be rezoned for village resite purpose;

Responses from Government Departments

(ii) the policy on village removal and village resite was outside the scope of the OZP and would be dealt with separately by the Government at a subsequent stage. The current proposal for village resite areas (Item C on both OZPs) had taken account of the YLS Study findings and the estimated number of affected houses (i.e. 33) subject to village removal terms;

- (h) Traffic and Transport:
 - the additional population would overburden the road network and transportation services. Road improvement works should be carried out as early as possible. Cycling should be promoted in the YLS Development and environmentally friendly transport services (EFTS) should also be provided;

Responses from Government Departments

- (ii) the traffic and transport impact assessment (TTIA) of the YLS Study concluded that the proposed YLS Development, with relevant traffic and transport improvement measures in place, would result in manageable traffic impact on the strategic, regional and local road networks as well as the West Rail Line (WRL) and was acceptable from traffic impact perspective;
- (iii) to enhance the regional transportation network, strategic road links and improvement works such as Route 11 and widening of Yuen Long Highway were proposed. The service of the WRL would also be enhanced by using 8-car trains and increasing the hourly service frequency from 20 to 24 trains during peak hours. Traffic improvement works and public transport services to be provided would be commensurate with the population intake by phases. The Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) was studying the potential EFTS arrangement to connect the Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area (HSK/HT NDA) with the YLS Development, as well as reviewing the pedestrian and cycle track network and associated cycling infrastructures in YLS;
- (i) Agricultural Activities and Livestock Farms:
 - (i) rezoning of agricultural land would affect the interest of the community and it would be impractical to relocate all affected

farmland to the proposed Agri-Park. The existing livestock farms in the area should be retained/relocated to secure local food supply;

Responses from Government Departments

- (ii) while most active farmland in YLS area (10ha out of 15ha) would be retained, one chicken farm and one pig farm as well as some active farmland would be affected by the current round of amendments. Those farms and farmland could not be retained due to conflict with the proposed YLS Development. As no feasible and implementable environmental mitigation measures could be identified to resolve the odour nuisance from the livestock farms, the YLS Study recommended that a total of two chicken farms and three pig farms be removed to make way for comprehensive development. One chicken farm in the Tai Tong area would be retained in the remaining stages of YLS Development;
- (j) Brownfield Operations:
 - there were doubts on the technical and financial feasibility of the proposed MSBs and it was likely that some existing brownfield operations could not be accommodated within such buildings. More land should be reserved to accommodate the affected vehicle repair workshops;

Responses from Government Departments

(ii) the development of MSBs was one of the directions for consolidation of brownfield uses. It was anticipated that general warehouse/storage uses and vehicle repairing operations, amongst others, could technically be accommodated in MSBs. While the implementation and operation details and development model of the MSBs were still being studied, the Development Bureau (DEVB) was liaising with stakeholders to gauge their views on MSB development;

- (k) Provision of GIC Facilities and Open Spaces:
 - there were insufficient public services and GIC facilities, e.g. wet market, in the YLS Development. There was also inadequate local open space (LO) in Tai Tong;

Responses from Government Departments

- (ii) the planned provision of GIC facilities in Yuen Long District was generally adequate, except for hospital beds, child care/elderly facilities, libraries, etc. Hospital services were assessed on a wider regional basis. As for child care and elderly facilities, their provision requirements were long-term goals. Relevant government departments would continue to explore the scope to provide additional GIC facilities in Yuen Long District. There was surplus in the planned provision of district open space (DO) (+36.5 ha) and LO (+79.9 ha) in Yuen Long. A wet market had been proposed in an area zoned "R(A)3";
- (l) Development Intensity and Technical Feasibility:
 - there were concerns on technical feasibility of the development and whether the proposed plot ratio (PR) for public housing was too high/too low;

Responses from Government Departments

(ii) the Government announced a policy directive in 2018 to increase the domestic PR for public housing by up to 30% subject to technical feasibility. The domestic PR of 6.5 and non-domestic PR of 0.5 currently proposed for the "R(A)3" zone were in line with the policy. Based on the technical assessments conducted, no insurmountable adverse impact was anticipated;

- (m) Individual Proposals:
 - the site occupied by a concrete batching plant (CBP) of Golik Holdings Limited in Amendment Item D1 should be excluded from rezoning so as to avoid affecting the supply of concrete products for the North West New Territories;
 - (ii) the site occupied by the 'Chan's Memorial Hall' in Amendment Item D1, together with the surrounding land parcels associated with the memorial hall owned by the Chan's family should be excluded from land resumption. Alternatively, a non-in-situ land exchange option should be offered so that the memorial hall could be rebuilt elsewhere;
 - (iii) a direct connection from Tai Tong Road to the site for four proposed primary schools (Item A of TT OZP) should be provided to reduce the traffic flow via Kiu Hing Road/Kung Um Road and avoid overloading the local road network;
 - (iv) other proposals involved inclusion/exclusion of individual lot(s) for YLS Development;

Responses from Government Departments

- (v) retention of the CBP or memorial hall would render the Amendment Item D1 site unsuitable for its intended MSB use due to significant loss of floor space. It would also affect improvement works to the TSWWI and two proposed roads;
- (vi) the CBP operator was in liaison with DEVB on relocation. There were other suppliers of concrete products in the New Territories and no significant issue was expected in terms of supply;
- (vii) the TTIA concluded that with the proposed traffic and transport improvement measures, the traffic impacts including those arising

from the proposed schools would be manageable and acceptable;

- (viii) it was difficult to preserve individual affected land parcels without adversely affecting the coherence of the proposed developments.
 Some of the concerned lots fell within the YLS Development Remaining Stages and were outside the amendment items;
- (n) Other Issues:
 - (i) there were insufficient employment opportunities in the area;
 - (ii) there were concerns on the location of the proposed STW;
 - (iii) there were concerns on technical aspects such as environmental and visual;

Responses from Government Departments

- (iv) about 5,790 employment opportunities would be created as part of YLS Development Stages 1 and 2. The entire YLS Development would provide about 13,630 employment opportunities, while the nearby HSK/HT NDA would provide about 150,000 additional employment opportunities. The San Tin/Lok Ma Chau Development Node would provide further 64,000 employment opportunities;
- (v) the proposed location of STW had taken into account the public views expressed during Stage 2 Community Engagement of the YLS Study, i.e. that the facility should be sited away from the existing and future residents to minimise potential environmental nuisance, and was commensurate with the planned urban fringe setting at the southern tip of the YLS Development. Based on the technical assessment conducted, no insurmountable environmental impact from the proposed STW was anticipated; and

(vi) various technical assessments had been conducted, which concluded that no insurmountable problems concerning air quality, noise, sewerage and sewage treatment, waste management, water quality, land contamination, landscape and visual impacts, ecology, fisheries and cultural heritage were envisaged during the construction and operation phases of the YLS Development.

[Dr Frankie W.C. Yeung joined the meeting at this point.]

7. The Chairperson recapitulated that many representers/commenters had provided views on C&R arrangements. Whilst C&R was not an issue to be dealt with under the planning regime and was outside the ambit of the Board, as she pointed out in the hearing session held on 31.3.2021, the Government would strive to address the concerns and needs of the affected residents/operators/land owners in a reasonable and fair manner, and to engage these stakeholders early and improve the communications with them. She then invited views from Members.

8. Members generally considered that the zonings on the two draft OZPs were appropriate and should be maintained. They had the following comments on the YLS Development or amendments to the two OZPs:

General Issues related to YLS Development

9. Some Members reiterated their support to developing YLS as an extension of the Yuen Long New Town. Given the proximity of Yuen Long New Town, those facilities to be provided in YLS Development could help meet the needs of the residents of Yuen Long New Town. In terms of mode of development, a Member said that a more 'human-centric' approach for comprehensive development without calling for complete removal of the existing communities should be adopted. It was important to preserve some elements of the existing environment and communities in order to create a sense of place and belonging. The Vice-chairperson echoed this view and said that for major development projects, it was essential to preserve the character of a place, in particular the cultural and heritage elements, so as to avoid creating new towns that were monotonous.

10. On employment opportunities in the North West New Territories, a few Members generally considered that a balanced mix of jobs of different nature should be provided in the YLS Development, HSK/HT NDA and San Tin/Lok Ma Chau Development Node.

Development of MSBs

11. The Vice-chairperson and some Members expressed support for designating land for MSB development and considered MSB an important step towards better utilisation of land resources. MSB development also represented an opportunity to introduce changes to transform the existing mode of operation of brownfield activities. It could help Hong Kong advance towards building a more resilient city and achieving Net Zero in the long run. The Government should map out the overall demand for brownfield activities in Hong Kong and formulate a long-term plan to enhance operation of the brownfield activities, as well as a detailed strategy to guide the implementation of green measures to reduce energy consumption and carbon emission.

12. The Vice-chairperson and a Member further said that while the zonings on the TYST OZP for MSB development were considered appropriate, many of the details regarding implementation of the MSB development were not available at the current stage. In particular, the concept of MSB development was yet to be proven from operational point of view. There were concerns that the MSB development might lean towards favouring larger operators. Attention should be paid to the mode of operation of the MSBs to ensure viability for small and medium operators. In that regard, it was suggested that pilot testing be conducted as early as possible to identify ways to firm up the development model for MSBs.

13. A Member said that with the world-wide trend of digitisation of manufacturing, the construction industry was actively promoting the use of Modular Integrated Construction (MIC) and Design for Manufacture and Assembly. The Government should comprehensively review whether there was suitable land in Hong Kong that could be used for fabrication of MIC components. Another Member concurred and said that currently, most of the MIC prefabrication factories were not located in Hong Kong. Consideration might be given to exploring whether there was a need to set up a MIC fabrication facility in the New Territories. In that connection, a Member pointed out that MIC factories had very large footprint requirements and that was the main reason why most of those factories were located in the

Mainland. Considering the shortage of land for development in Hong Kong, it might not be advantageous to designate large pieces of land in Hong Kong for MIC operations, as the land could be used for many other purposes uses such as housing.

14. Two Members considered that the access/servicing arrangements for the MSBs were crucial to the success of the MSBs and the Government should ensure suitable arrangements were put in place for the MSBs through careful planning at the implementation stage.

15. While noting Members' comments, the Chairperson remarked that the amendments to the OZPs were to designate suitable land use zonings to facilitate the implementation of the YLS Development. The implementation details of various development proposals would be dealt with by relevant government departments at a later stage.

Housing Supply

16. A Member said that the OZP amendments for housing development should be supported. The Member further said that the Government should strive to utilise land resources and explore whether there was scope to further increase housing supply in YLS, as even just an additional 1% to 2% on top of the current proposal could mean new homes for many families. Since the YLS Development would be implemented over a time span of almost 20 years, early liaison with the affected stakeholders as well as close monitoring of any impact on the community during the construction stage were crucial to the success of the project.

Transport and Cycle Track Network

17. Two Members said that the EFTS under study was a correct approach in facilitating movement of people within the region and the proposed extensive cycle track network would be an important feature of the YLS Development. Together, they would allow residents to travel easily within this generally self-sufficient community and the transport options were in line with the objective of creating a more environmentally sustainable city.

18. Another Member said that despite that the provision of dedicated cycle track with a width of 4m along Kiu Hing Road was not feasible due to site/technical constraints,

consideration should be given to providing a bicycle-priority lane with appropriate markings so as to facilitate cycling as a way for local commuting.

The Proposed Primary Schools

19. Regarding the clustering of four primary schools in Amendment A of the TT OZP, a Member expressed some reservation and said that it might be more desirable for individual primary school to be developed separately within the residential areas. The Vice-chairperson opined that such proposal might have both pros and cons. The clustering of the schools could have some benefits, such as allowing the shared use of facilities among the schools. Another Member said that there were both successful and unsuccessful examples of 'school villages', and based on past experience, one of the major issues faced by the schools in a cluster setting was the coordination of use of the shared facilities among the schools. If proceeded, the Education Bureau (EDB) should closely monitor the shared use of facilities by the four primary schools upon operation.

20. Two Members added that the access arrangement for the four primary schools should be carefully planned at the implementation stage as the four schools located together would generate considerable amount of traffic.

21. A Member opined that on a regional level, EDB should critically and comprehensively review school provision in the New Territories. It was noted that there were no secondary schools in some areas, such as Kam Tin.

Livestock Farms

22. Regarding the role of local livestock farms on food supply, the Vice-chairperson and some Members said that there was an international trend to promote the use of local farm produce and the Government should provide assistance to the affected farm operators to relocate their farms. While it was noted that some of the livestock farms might cause pollution and therefore were considered incompatible with the proposed comprehensive development, it appeared that the assistance given by relevant government departments such as the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) to the affected livestock farms on identifying suitable relocation sites was quite limited. Another Member concurred and said that the arrangement for relocating affected farms and the long-term plan on land supply for livestock farming should be improved. With the adoption of suitable modern technologies to mitigate the adverse environmental impact, the livestock farms might be able to co-exist with other uses in an urban setting and AFCD should proactively provide assistance to the livestock farm operators in that regard.

Preservation of Culture, History and the Community

23. Two Members said that Yuen Long had a long history of settlement and was renowned for its rich cultural resources. While the YLS Development would transform the area from a mostly rural environment to an urban setting, the history and cultural aspects of the existing villages should be preserved as much as practicable.

24. Two other Members said that the current development proposal had put little emphasis on measures to promote preservation of buildings with cultural value in the area such as the Yeung Hau Temple. It might be desirable if the Government could put in additional resources in the implementation phase for preservation of cultural and historical resources in the area. It was necessary for the Government to strike a balance between the need of development and the impact on affected land owners/local residents and make suitable arrangements for those affected. Furthermore, it was noticed in recent years that in many areas with new developments, tension was built up between the newly-moved in residents and the indigenous/local community mainly due to differences in lifestyles and habits. Since Yuen Long was expected to be a major supply of new housing units in the coming years, the Government should consider setting up a community liaison office in the area to help create a more harmonious community.

Other Issues

25. On the issue of C&R arrangements, Members generally noted that the C&R arrangements were not directly related to the OZP and there was no ground for proposing any further amendment to the draft OZPs to meet the representations on C&R matters.

26. A Member noted the local vantage points selected for assessing the visual impact of high-density developments and opined that it might be more desirable if more vantage points

could be identified for the assessment.

27. A Member said that Tai Lam Country Park was abutting the southern fringe of the Remaining Stages of YLS Development. Suitable planning and building designs should be adopted so that there would be a gradual transition from the urban context to the country park. On the other hand, the country park could become a major recreational outlet for the community in YLS and convenient connections to the country park should be provided.

28. Mr Ivan M.K. Chung, Director of Planning, upon the Chairperson's invitation, explained that creating a sustainable and livable neighbourhood was one of the important guiding principles of the YLS Development. It was also part of the planning strategy for making Hong Kong a more resilient city. Some of the general directions and strategies to be adopted in the YLS Development included:

- (a) in the subsequent detailed planning and design stage, there was scope to implement various sustainable designs. For example, the improvement works to the Yuen Long Nullah would not only improve the drainage capacity of the nullah but also create a pleasant environment and promote walkability;
- (b) relevant government departments would explore the scope of reusing treated water from the STW for suitable uses. The reed bed adjacent to the STW could act as a flood retention area and there might be scope to provide suitable elevated walkway, cycle track and sitting out areas for public enjoyment;
- (c) suitable connections would be provided to facilitate the public's access to Tai Lam Country Park located to the south of the STW and land would also be reserved for the provision of country park supporting facilities. Regarding green transport, an EFTS proposal was under study and an extensive cycle track network of 12.5km had been proposed in the YLS Development. It was hoped that a convenient, low-carbon transportation network could be created for local residents to get around the area; and
- (d) energy efficient building design would be encouraged for government buildings. Waste management plan would also be explored to reduce

municipal solid waste.

29. The Chairperson concluded that Members were in general in support of amendments to the two OZPs. Whilst some of the issues mentioned by Members were outside the scope of OZP amendments, they were worth noting and could provide useful reference for the implementation of the YLS Development. She then made the following remarks:

Development of MSBs

(a) the first MSB prototype would be developed in HSK/HT NDA. Site formation works were being carried out and the development of the MSB prototype was tentatively planned to commence in 2023. Regarding the mode of development, the implementation mechanism was currently under study and market sounding was underway. The Development Bureau aimed to conclude the study in 2021 and come up with proposed development models for discussion with stakeholders. To facilitate the accommodation of brownfield operations while ensuring the financial viability of the MSB development, control on tenant mix and level of rent might be put in place. Relevant bureaux/departments would be invited to brief the Board once the proposal was finalised;

Preservation of Historic and Cultural Elements of the Community

(b) on the issue of protection of buildings with cultural and heritage significance, it should be noted that no Declared Monument or graded historic buildings fell within the amendment sites. However, it was still important to preserve the social connections and history of the place wherever possible. There could be different means to facilitate preservation of the history and culture of the local communities, such as reflecting relevant themes through naming of places or housing estates;

Development of the Proposed Primary Schools

(c) regarding the four primary schools under Amendment Item A of the TT OZP,

the Government might fine-tune the development programme to meet the actual and changing population profile of the new residents in the area. As the sites were zoned "G/IC", there was scope to convert some of the primary school sites for secondary schools development if required; and

C&R Arrangements

(d) whilst the C&R arrangement was an issue outside the ambit of the Board, there was no doubt that early liaison with the affected stakeholders was important. In that regard, the Lands Department had recently published an online video to facilitate the public's general understanding of the prevailing C&R arrangements. The Government would continue to work in that direction and enhance communication with the affected stakeholders.

30. Members generally considered that all grounds and proposals of the representations and comments had been addressed by the departmental responses as detailed in TPB Papers No. 10728 and 10729, and the presentations and responses made by the government representatives at the hearing session held on 31.3.2021.

31. After deliberation, the Town Planning Board (the Board) <u>noted</u> the supportive views of the Representation No. **R51** of the TYST OZP and Representations No. **R16 to R18** of the TT OZP.

32. The Board <u>decided not to uphold</u> the Representations No. **R1 to R50** and **R52 to R79** of the TYST OZP and considered that the OZP <u>should not be amended</u> to meet the representations for the following reasons:

"Positioning and Scale of the Yuen Long South (YLS) Development

(a) as an extension of Yuen Long New Town, the YLS Development forms one of many prongs of the land supply options in Hong Kong and would be integral to meeting the territory's medium to long-term need for housing development. The YLS Study has ascertained the feasibility and acceptability of the YLS Development. The intensity and scale of the YLS Development, including Stages 1 and 2 (i.e. the subject of the current amendment items), is considered reasonable, appropriate and justified (**R2**, **R4 to R25**, **R47**, **R68 to R70**, **R79**);

Traffic and Transport Considerations

(b) the traffic and transport impact assessment (TTIA) of the YLS Study has concluded that the YLS Development, with relevant traffic improvement measures, will have manageable traffic impact and is acceptable from traffic impact perspective. The scope and implementation programme of the proposed road improvement works (including Items A5 and D4), as well as the design of pedestrian, cycling and green mobility facilities are being/will be formulated under separate studies. Supporting public transport services will also be in place prior to population intake by phases (R4 to R24, R29 to R31, R36, R47, R50, R53, R66 to R70, R72, R73, R75, R78, R79);

Environmental and Ecological Considerations

(c) the approved environmental impact assessment (EIA) report and subsequent environmental review (ER) have concluded that no insurmountable environmental problems are envisaged during the construction and operation phases of the YLS Development. The rezoning of a piece of disturbed "Green Belt" ("GB") land with convenient access to the strategic road network (Items D1 to D4) for gainful uses would not have a detrimental effect on the integrity of the subject "GB" zone on the OZP. The environmental and ecological impacts of the YLS Development will continue to be monitored under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO) regime (**R26 to R30, R52, R55, R56, R59, R61 to R63**);

Proposed Sewage Treatment Works

(d) the proposed sewage treatments works (STW) (Item E) is an essential infrastructure to support the entire YLS Development and nearby developments, and has been included in the initial development phases to tie in with its implementation programme. The location of the proposed STW is considered appropriate and its detailed design will be carried out by relevant works department(s), which will duly consider the potential impacts during the construction and operation phases and would be subject to the provisions of the EIAO, where appropriate (**R6**, **R26** to **R30**, **R36**, **R50**, **R59**, **R60**, **R64**);

Individual Sites

(e) the amendment items reflect the proposed land uses under the YLS Study, which are the result of iterative refinements following three stages of community engagement of the YLS Study. The concerned affected land parcels are essential for the comprehensive development of YLS into a sustainable, green and liveable community. Retention of individual land parcels would result in piecemeal development to the detriment of the overall land use planning. Affected stakeholders are entitled to relevant compensation and rehousing (C&R) arrangement, as appropriate, which would be dealt with separately by the Government in firming up the implementation arrangements (R37 to R46, R53 to R58, R66, R67, R74, R77);

Provision of Government, Institution and Community (GIC) Facilities and Open Spaces

(f) in accordance with the standards stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) and the requirements of relevant bureaux/departments (B/Ds), sites have been reserved for a wide range of GIC facilities and open spaces within Yuen Long District. The provision of open spaces (including Items A4 and D3) and GIC facilities (including Items A1 and A2) for the YLS Development will contribute to the overall provision, as well as meeting the demands of the new population and existing population nearby (**R4 to R25, R68 to R70, R76, R79**);

Public Housing

(g) the development intensities for the public housing sites in YLS Development Stages 1 and 2 (Item A3) have been optimised, and are considered technically acceptable and feasible, while conforming to the density threshold for public housing sites under prevailing policy. To meet the acute demand for public housing, all the proposed housing sites under the current amendment are designated for public housing only (R25, R31 to R36, R48, R49, R68 to R71);

Land Resumption, Compensation, Rehousing and Village Resite

(h) land resumption, C&R arrangements and village removal/resite are largely outside the scope of the subject OZP, which is to show the broad land use framework and planning intention for the area. The concerns of the affected stakeholders would be dealt with separately by the Government in firming up the implementation arrangements. The extent of the proposed village resite areas (Item C) is based on actual anticipated demand and is considered reasonable, appropriate and justified (R1 to R24, R26 to R31, R35, R64, R66, R68 to R76, R79);

Industries and Brownfield Operations

(i) to provide accommodation for affected industrial and brownfield operations, suitable land has been rezoned for development of multi-storey buildings (MSBs) (Item D1), which is a land-efficient means to support the sustainable development of relevant industries and brownfield operations. Land has also been rezoned as "Open Storage" (Item D2) to support those operations that could not practically be relocated into MSBs or conventional flatted factory buildings. Other options and channels are also in place for affected brownfield operators to relocate their operations to more suitable locations (R4 to R24, R31, R36, R50, R66, R68 to R70, R72); and

Agriculture and Community Networks

(j) while some agricultural land/uses will inevitably be affected, operators may choose to relocate elsewhere and there are established compensation mechanisms in place to support the affected farmers and licensed livestock farmers under the prevailing regimes. New neighbourhoods complemented by various GIC facilities, open spaces and infrastructure will be provided as part of the comprehensive YLS Development to the benefit of the new and existing residents (**R4 to R24, R26, R30, R60, R68 to R70, R79**)."

33. The Board also <u>decided not to uphold</u> the Representations No. **R1 to R15** and **R19 to R136** of the TT OZP and considered that the OZP <u>should not be amended</u> to meet the representations for the following reasons:

"Positioning and Scale of the YLS Development

(a) as an extension of Yuen Long New Town, the YLS Development forms one of many prongs of the land supply options in Hong Kong and would be integral to meeting the territory's medium to long-term need for housing development. The YLS Study has also ascertained the feasibility and acceptability of the YLS Development (R1 to R3, R26 to R28, R30 to R52);

Traffic and Transport Considerations

(b) the TTIA of the YLS Study has concluded that the YLS Development, with relevant traffic improvement measures, will have manageable traffic impact and is acceptable from traffic impact perspective. The scope and implementation programme of the proposed road improvement works, as well as the design of pedestrian, cycling and green mobility facilities are being/will be formulated under separate studies. Supporting public transport services will also be in place prior to population intake by phases (R1, R10, R16, R20, R22, R24 to R30, R33 to R38, R40 to R53);

Provision of GIC Facilities and Open Spaces

(c) in accordance with the standards stipulated in the HKPSG and the requirements of relevant B/Ds, sites have been reserved for a wide range of GIC facilities and open spaces within Yuen Long District. The provision of GIC facilities (including Item A) and open spaces for the YLS Development will contribute to the overall provision, as well as meeting the demands of the new population and existing population nearby (R21, R26 to R28, R31, R33 to R52);

Land Resumption, Compensation, Rehousing and Village Resite

(d) land resumption, C&R arrangements and village removal/resite are largely outside the scope of the subject OZP, which is to show the broad land use framework and planning intention for the area. The concerns of the affected stakeholders would be dealt with separately by the Government in firming up the implementation arrangements. The extent of the proposed village resite area (Item C) is based on actual anticipated demand and is considered reasonable, appropriate and justified (R1, R3 to R13, R15 to R25, R28, R31, R33 to R52, R54, R55); and

Agriculture, Brownfield Operations and Community Networks

(e) while some agricultural land/uses and business undertakings will inevitably be affected, operators may choose to relocate elsewhere and there are established compensation mechanisms in place to support the affected farmers, licensed livestock farmers and business operators under the prevailing regimes. New neighbourhoods complemented by various GIC facilities, open spaces and infrastructure will be provided as part of the comprehensive YLS Development to the benefit of the new and existing residents (**R1, R6 to R18, R23, R24, R26 to R28, R33 to R52, R56 to R139**)." their respective Notes and updated Explanatory Statements, were suitable for submission under section 8 of the Town Planning Ordinance to the Chief Executive in Council for approval.

35. There being no other business, the meeting was closed at 10:45 a.m.