

CONFIDENTIAL
(Downgraded on 5.5.2023)

Minutes of 1291st Meeting of the
Town Planning Board held on 14.4.2023

Kowloon District

Agenda Item 3

Consideration of Representations and Comments in respect of the Draft Urban Renewal Authority Nga Tsin Wai Road/Carpenter Road Development Scheme Plan No. S/K10/URA3/1 and the Draft Ma Tau Kok Outline Zoning Plan No. S/K10/29
(TPB Paper No. 10889)

[The item was conducted in Cantonese.]

Deliberation Session

1. The Chairperson said that in general, the majority of the representers and commenters did not object to the Nga Tsin Wai Road/Carpenter Road development scheme plan (DSP) but expressed concern on the compensation and rehousing arrangement and the notional design of the DSP. She noted that the major concerns of Members included the inclusion of Billionaire Avant (BA) in the DSP, preservation of tree groups within the Lee Kee Memorial Dispensary (LKMD) site, location of the Government, Institution and Community (GIC) complex and the pedestrian connectivity within and outside the DSP area. She then invited views from Members.

2. Members mainly have the following views:

General

- (a) two Members appreciated that the representatives of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) were well prepared to address the concerns raised by representers and commenters;

- (b) a Member expressed that replanning and redevelopment of the DSP area with the adoption of the planning tool of transfer of plot ratio from the Eastern Site (Site C1) to the Main Site (Site C2) so as to allow a low-rise setting with commercial elements for the Gateway Square connecting to Kai Tak Development Area was supported;

Inclusion of BA in the DSP

- (c) while a Member expressed sympathy to residents of BA and considered the inclusion of BA in the DSP would facilitate a holistic design of the area, other Members considered that there was no strong reason to support the inclusion as the building had been built for only eight years and no consent had been obtained from the majority of owners of BA for such inclusion for redevelopment. Even without the URA redevelopment scheme, it would be possible for other developers or land owners of those old-aged buildings around BA to initiate redevelopment proposals which might impose similar impacts on the residents of BA. Noting that it would take some time to fully implement the whole DSP, Members generally were of the view that URA should closely liaise with the residents of BA and to maintain a better communication throughout the construction period in order to timely address their concerns;

GIC Complex

- (d) a Member appreciated the phasing implementation of the DSP in that the new GIC complex at Site B would firstly be developed for relocation of the affected GIC facilities. This could allow seamless transition of the services provided by the affected GIC facilities and minimize disturbance to GIC users/market operators and visitors which was considered an important merit;

Pedestrian Connectivity

- (e) some Members suggested URA to further explore the possibility to provide at-

grade pedestrian connections all along from Mei Tung Estate to CRP, and then to the new GIC complex and the Main Site of the DSP and to enhance the pedestrian connections to Kowloon City Plaza and the MTR Sung Wong Toi Station;

Tree Preservation at LKMD Site

- (f) a Member pointed out that there was not only T107 (*Ficus microcarpa*) but also a *Delonix regia* and three mature trees that were found in the northwestern corner of the LKMD site. Hence, the location of the proposed Market Plaza should be shifted to the LKMD site in order to preserve the tree groups. Another Member also said that swapping the location of the proposed Market Plaza with the residential tower at the LKMD site might be a better option as it could not only help preserve the tree groups, but allow the residential tower to be located further away from BA; and

Others

- (g) a Member noted that most of the representers/commenters expressed concerns related to compensation and rehousing arrangement and the duration of acquisition in the hearing meeting. While understanding that such issues were not within the Town Planning Board's ambit under the Town Planning Ordinance, the Member considered that the concerns of the representers/commenters were mainly due to limited information provided by URA beforehand.

3. The Chairperson concluded that Members generally considered that the DSP was acceptable and should not be amended. Noting Members' concerns and views, the Chairperson suggested and Members agreed to convey the following comments/suggestions to URA:

- (a) to preserve the tree groups within the DSP especially the tree groups (including T107) within the LKMD Site as far as possible;
- (b) to explore the relative merits of different options for enhancing connectivity

from Mei Tung Estate to the Main Site including provision of at-grade pedestrian connections all along;

- (c) to explore whether there are merits to swop the location between the proposed Market Square and the residential tower at the LKMD Site;
- (d) to further examine whether there is any better alternative to the current proposal of developing the new GIC complex on part of CRP;
- (e) to maintain close liaison with residents/owners of BA and to further address their concerns especially during the construction period of the redevelopment project; and
- (f) to clearly explain the compensation and acquisition matters to the affected tenants/owners in appropriate time.

4. After deliberation, the Board noted the supporting views of **R1 to R33, and R34 (part) of DSP** and decided not to uphold **R34 (part) and R35 to R60 of DSP**, and agreed that the DSP should not be amended to meet the representations for the following reasons:

- “(a) the Development Scheme Plan (DSP) will facilitate redevelopment of existing old and dilapidated buildings in the Development Scheme (DS) area into new residential developments for more housing supply and an improved living environment with commercial and community facilities, an underground public vehicle park and open spaces (**R34 (part), R35 to R58**);
- (b) the DSP aims to retain the vibrant streetscape and dining character of Kowloon City by proposing ground floor shops along the pedestrianised avenues. At-grade landscaped diversified spaces within the DS area provides venues for cultural activities and local festival events curated by Chiu/Thai communities. Urban Renewal Authority (URA) will help identify suitable premises to enable affected shop operators with local character to relocate and continue operation in the same district as far as practicable (**R47, R51, R52 and R58**);

- (c) although the DSP will reduce the areas zoned “Open Space” in the Kowloon City area, it will provide about 10,400m² at-grade landscaped diversified spaces, which are open-air public spaces in various forms, extending the open space in the Carpenter Road Park to the core Kowloon City area to bring visual relief in a dense urban environment and providing two pedestrian avenues for better pedestrian connectivity **(R35 to R37, R39 to R46, R48 and R57)**;
- (d) the gateway square will be integrated with adjoining open spaces including the sunken plaza at KC-015 which will provide an underground pedestrian connection to Kai Tak Development Area (KTDA). Actual design of the gateway square will be subject to detailed design and liaison between URA and relevant Government departments **(R53)**;
- (e) the DSP provides additional Government, Institution and Community (GIC) facilities to meet local demand. Non in-situ redevelopment of GIC facilities could minimise operational disruption to the public and market operators as it allows seamless reprovisioning of market activities and GIC services **(R35 to R37, R39 to R46, R48, R50 and R57)**;
- (f) there are no insurmountable technical problems arising from the DSP on traffic, environmental, air ventilation and visual aspects as indicated in the technical assessments. Relevant guidelines, requirements and ordinances will be observed by URA during implementation **(R35 to R37, R39 to R48 and R53)**;
- (g) the DSP has adopted a staggered height profile and incorporated various design measures to enhance air ventilation and visual comfort of the proposed redevelopment. The submitted Visual Impact Assessment demonstrated that the proposed building height is not incompatible with the existing Kowloon City high-rises **(R35 to R49)**;
- (h) the coverage of the DSP has taken into account recommendations of the Urban Renewal Plan for Kowloon City and various factors such as building condition, resource allocation and planning gains **(R50, R53 and R54)**;

- (i) the transfer of gross floor area (GFA) between Site C1 and Site C2 enables creation of a gateway square at Site C1, which could be integrated with adjoining open spaces to form a sizable open space connecting to the KTDA. A maximum non-domestic GFA of 2,000m² for sub-area (1) of the “Residential (Group A)” zone is considered adequate to achieve the planning intention for a low-rise commercial development to complement the gateway square **(R50 and R53)**;
- (j) the statutory and administrative procedures in consulting the public on the DSP have been duly followed. URA will continue to engage local stakeholders and residents on the redevelopment **(R35 to R37, R39 to R47, R49 and R59)**; and
- (k) acquisition, compensation and rehousing arrangements are outside the scope of the DSP and the ambit of the Town Planning Board **(R34 (part), R55, R56, R58, R59 and R60).**”

5. After further deliberation, the Board noted the supportive views of **R1(part) of the OZP** and decided not to uphold the remaining views of **R1(part)** for the following reason:

“Amendment Item A concerns amendment of building height restriction of a “Government, Institution or Community” site from three storeys to 45mPD, therefore it has no effect on the planned population and the open space provision. There is a surplus provision in district open space and a shortfall of local open space in the Ma Tau Kok Planning Area. However, there is a surplus of both types of open spaces in Kowloon City District as a whole. The open space standard of 3.5m² per person recommended in HK2030+ is a long-term goal and has been adopted in the planning of new development areas.”

6. The Board also agreed that the draft DSP and the draft OZP, together with their respective Notes and updated Explanatory Statements, were suitable for submission under section 8 of the Town Planning Ordinance to the Chief Executive in Council for approval.

7. The Chairperson reminded Members that according to the Town Planning Board Guidelines No. 29B, the Board's decision on the draft DSP upon hearing of representations and comments would be kept confidential for 3 to 4 weeks after the meeting.