APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/NE-MUP/155

Applicants : CHAN Heung Kwan, YAU Yee Hung and LI Yeung Ying represented by M&D

Planning and Surveyors Consultant Ltd.

Site : Lots 49, 50 (Part) and 52 RP (Part) in D.D. 37 and Adjoining Government Land,

Man Uk Pin, New Territories

Site Area : About 1260.8 m² (including about 39.18m² of Government Land)

Plan : Approved Man Uk Pin Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/NE-MUP/11

Zoning : "Agriculture" ("AGR")

Application: Temporary Open Storage of Steel Sheet Piles and Ancillary Office for a Period of

3 Years

1. The Proposal

- 1.1 The applicants seek planning permission to use the application site (the Site) for a temporary open storage of steel sheet piles and ancillary office for a period of three years (**Plan A-1**). The Site falls within an area zoned "AGR" on the approved Man Uk Pin OZP No. S/NE-MUP/11. According to the Notes of the OZP, temporary use or development of any land or building not exceeding a period of three years within "AGR" zone requires planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board) notwithstanding that the use is not provided for under the Notes of the OZP.
- 1.2 According to the applicants, there are three temporary single-storey structures (about 2.5m in height) with a total floor area of about 83.42m² for office use and two toilets. The remaining uncovered area are for open storage of steel sheet piles and circulation space for vehicles. Two parking spaces for light goods vehicle will be provided at the northern portion of the Site. The operation hours are between 9:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. from Mondays to Saturdays. There will be no operation on Sundays and public holidays. The ingress/egress of the Site is located at the south-western portion of the Site. The Site is accessible via a local track leading to Wo Keng Shan Road (Plans A-1 and A-2). The layout plan is at Drawing A-1. The Site is currently occupied by construction materials including steel sheet piles, converted containers for storage use and parking of vehicles/excavator without valid planning permission.
- 1.3 The Site, in part or in whole, is the subject of two previous applications (No. A/NE-MUP/75 and 146) (**Plan A-1**). The last application No. A/NE-MUP/146 for proposed temporary animal boarding establishment and ancillary office for a period of 3

years submitted by the same applicants was rejected by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (the Committee) on 17.1.2020.

In support of the application, the applicants have submitted the Application Form with attachments (**Appendix I**) which was received by the Board on 25.9.2020.

2. <u>Justifications from the Applicants</u>

The justifications put forth by the applicants in support of the application are detailed in the attachment of the application form at **Appendix I**. They can be summarized as follows:

- (a) the application is a temporary development which would not jeopardize the long-term planning of "AGR" zone;
- (b) the development would help maintaining the supply of construction materials in support of the construction industry in Hong Kong;
- (c) no 5.5 tonnes or above heavy goods vehicles are allowed at the Site;
- (d) the Site is not suitable for agricultural rehabilitation and the proposed development will optimize the use of valuable land resource;
- (e) the development is compatible with the surrounding land uses and would not have adverse traffic, environmental and drainage impacts on the surroundings; and
- (f) the development would not set an undesirable precedent for similar uses in the surrounding.

3. Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements

The applicants are the "current land owners". Detailed information would be deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection. For the Government land within the Site, the requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines TPB PG-No.31A is not applicable.

4. Background

According to the Chief Town Planner/Central Enforcement and Prosecution, Planning Department (CTP/CEP, PlanD), the Site is subject to two active enforcement cases (**Plan A-2**) for storage use (including deposit of containers). Enforcement Notices were issued on 2.10.2019 requiring the concerned owners to discontinue the unauthorised developments by 2.12.2019. Since the UDs have not been discontinued upon expiry of the notices, prosecution action is being taken.

5. Town Planning Board Guidelines

Town Planning Board Guidelines No. 13F for 'Application for Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses' (TPB PG-No.13F) promulgated by the Board on 27.3.2020 are relevant to the application. The Site falls within Category 3 area under the Guidelines. Relevant extract of the Guidelines is attached at **Appendix II**.

6. Previous Applications

- 6.1 The Site, in part or in whole, is the subject of two previous planning applications (No. A/NE-MUP/75 and 146). Planning application No. A/NE-MUP/75 for temporary open storage of new and second-hand vehicles (including 2 private cars and 4 light goods vehicles) covering a larger area for a period of 3 years submitted by different applicant of the current application was rejected by the Committee on 7.12.2012 on the grounds that the proposed development was not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; the proposed development did not comply with the then TPB PG-No. 13E in that no previous planning approval had been granted to the application site and there were adverse comments from the relevant government departments and local objections against the application; the proposed development was incompatible with the rural character of the surrounding area; there was no information in the application to demonstrate that the proposed development would have no adverse environmental and landscape impact on the surrounding areas.
- 6.2 Planning application No. A/NE-MUP/146 for proposed temporary animal boarding establishment and ancillary office for a period of 3 years submitted by same applicant of the current application was rejected by the Committee on 17.1.2020 on the grounds that the proposed development was not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; the applicants failed to demonstrate that the proposed development would not cause adverse environmental and traffic impacts on the surrounding areas; and setting of undesirable precedent for similar applications within the "AGR" zone.
- 6.3 Details of the previous applications are at **Appendix III** and its locations are shown on **Plan A-1**.

7. Similar Applications

- 7.1 There are two similar applications for temporary open storage use which fall within the same "AGR" zone in the vicinity of the Site in the Man Uk Pin area (**Plan A-1**).
- Application No. A/NE-MUP/63 for temporary open storage of new and scrap stainless steel for a period of 3 years was rejected by the Board on review on 11.11.2011 mainly on the grounds that the proposed development was not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; the proposed development did not comply with the then TPB PG-No. 13E in that no previous planning approval had been granted to the site and there were local objections to the application; the proposed development was not compatible with land uses of the surrounding areas; and setting of undesirable precedent for similar applications within the "AGR" zone. An appeal regarding the rejected application was received by Town Planning Appeal Board and the hearing of the appeal was dismissed on 9.12.2013.
- 7.3 Application No. A/NE-MUP/86 for temporary open storage of recycled materials (plastic) for a period of 1 year was rejected by the Committee on 16.8.2013 on the grounds that the proposed development was not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; the proposed development did not comply with the then TPB PG-No. 13E in that the proposed development was not compatible with the surrounding land uses; there was no previous planning approval granted at the site; there were adverse comments from the relevant Government departments and local objections against the application; and there was no information in the application to demonstrate that the proposed development would have no adverse traffic, environmental and landscape

impact on the surrounding areas.

7.4 Details of these similar applications are at **Appendix IV** and their locations are shown on **Plan A-1**.

8. The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1 and A-2, aerial photo on Plan A-3 and site photos on Plans A-4a to 4c)

- 8.1 The Site is:
 - (a) fenced off, currently occupied by construction materials, converted containers for storage use and parking of vehicles/excavator without valid planning permission;
 - (b) accessible from Wo Keng Shan Road via a local track (Plans A-1 and A-2).
- 8.2 The surrounding areas have the following characteristics:
 - (a) generally rural in character surrounded by vacant land, plant nursery, some temporary structures and fallow agricultural land (Plans A-3 and A-4a);
 - (b) sandwiched by two "Green Belt" ("GB") zones to the north and south (Plan A-2);
 - (c) to the immediate east and west are vacant land and some temporary domestic structures;
 - (d) to the further south are fallow agricultural land and vacant land.

9. Planning Intention

The planning intention of the "AGR" zone is intended primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes.

10. Comments from Relevant Government Departments

10.1 The following Government departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

Land Administration

- 10.1.1 Comments of the District Lands Officer/North, Lands Department (DLO/N, LandsD):
 - (a) the lots are an Old Schedule Lots held under the Block Government Lease (demised for agriculture use) without any guaranteed right of access. The applicant should make his own arrangement, and there is no guarantee that any adjoining Government land (GL) will be allowed for the vehicular access of the proposed use;

- (b) the existing structures on the subject lots were erected without approval from her office. The aforesaid structures are not acceptable under the Lease concerned and she reserves the right to take necessary lease enforcement actions against the aforesaid structure;
- (c) the structures on the subject lots will include a structure for toilet use. The applicants should note that any proposed septic tank and soakage pit system should meet current health requirements, and that they should apply for Certificates of Exemption for Building Works and Drainage Works from her office;
- (d) the GL between Lots 50 and 52 RP is being occupied without approval from her office. Her office reserves the right to take land control actions against the unauthorized occupation of GL (**Plan A-2**); and
- (e) if the planning application is approved, the owner of the lot concerned shall apply to his office for a Short Term Waiver (STW) and Short Term Tenancy (STT) for the erection of animal boarding establishment and site office, and regulation of the unauthorized occupation of GL respectively. The application for STW and STT will be considered by Government in its landlord's capacity and there is no guarantee that they will be approved. If the STW/STT are approved, their commencement date would be backdated to the first date of occupation and they will be subject to such terms and conditions to be imposed including payment of waiver fee/rent and administrative fee as considered appropriate by her office.

Traffic

- 10.1.2 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T):
 - (a) he does not support the application from traffic engineering point of view. The applicants should provide the following information/measures for his consideration:
 - (i) the applicants should substantiate the traffic generation and attraction from and to the site and the traffic impact to the nearby road links and junctions;
 - (ii) the applicants shall justify the adequacy of the parking spaces and loading/unloading spaces so provided by relating to the number of vehicles visiting the subject site;
 - (iii) the applicants should advise the width of the vehicular access;
 - (iv) the vehicular access should be no less than 7.3m wide;
 - (v) the applicants shall demonstrate the satisfactory manoeuvring of vehicles entering to and exiting from the subject site, manoeuvring within the Site and into/out of the parking and loading/unloading spaces, preferably using the swept path analysis;
 - (vi) the applicants shall advise the management/control measures to be implemented to ensure no queuing of vehicles outside the Site;

- (vii) the applicants shall advise the provision and management of pedestrian facilities to ensure pedestrian safety; and
- (b) the vehicular access between the Site and Wo Keng Shan Road is not managed by TD. The applicant should seek comment from the responsible party.
- 10.1.3 Comments of the Chief Highway Engineer/New Territories East, Highways Department (CHE/NTE, HyD):

he has no comment on the application. The access road leading from Wo Keng Shan Road to the Site is not maintained by his office.

Agriculture

10.1.4 Comments of the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC):

the Site is currently paved for open storage use. Agricultural activities are active in its vicinity and agricultural infrastructures such as road access and water source are also available. The Site can be used for agricultural activities such as greenhouses, plant nurseries, etc. As the Site possesses potential for agricultural rehabilitation, the application is not supported from agricultural point of view.

Environment

- 10.1.5 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):
 - (a) he has no objection to the application as there are no dusty operation / traffic of heavy vehicles involved in the proposed development;
 - (b) the applicants are advised to follow the latest 'Code of Practice on Handling Environmental Aspects of Temporary Uses and Open Storage Sites' issued by DEP and all pollution control ordinances, in particular the Water Pollution Control Ordinance, since a stream is located at the south-east of the Site (Plan A-2).

Landscape Aspect

- 10.1.6 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):
 - (a) she has some reservation on the application from the landscape planning perspective;
 - (b) according to the aerial photo of 2019, the site is located in an area of rural inland plains landscape character, mainly comprising abandoned agricultural land, some open storage use and temporary structures (**Plan A-4a**). It is observed that the Site is all hard paved without any existing trees. Though further significant adverse landscape impact arising from the development within the Site is not anticipated, the development is considered not compatible with the land use and landscape character of the surrounding area which was predominantly agricultural land and dense

woodlands; and

(c) since there is no major public frontage along the site boundary. Should the Board approve the application, it is considered not necessary to impose a landscape condition as it effect on enhancing the quality of the public realm us not apparent.

Drainage

- 10.1.7 Comments of the Chief Engineer/Mainland North, Drainage Services Department (CE/MN, DSD):
 - (a) he has no objection to the application;
 - (b) should the application be approved, a condition should be included to request the applicants to submit and implement a drainage proposal for the Site to ensure that it will not cause adverse drainage impact to the adjacent area;
 - (c) the Site is in an area where no public sewerage connection is available; and
 - (d) the applicants should avoid discharging the surface runoff form the Site to the upstream of the blocked section of the channel in order to avoid further deteriorate the existing condition. The applicant should also ensure that the flow from his lot will not overload the existing drainage system.

Building Matters

- 10.1.8 Comments of the Chief Building Surveyor/New Territories West, Building Department (CBS/NTW, BD):
 - (a) there is no record of approval by the Building Authority for the existing buildings/structures at the Site and BD is not in a position to offer comments on their suitability for the use related to the application; and
 - (b) there is also no record of submission of the building/structure to BD for approval. His advisory comments are at **Appendix VI**.

Fire Safety

- 10.1.9 Comments of the Director of Fire Services (D of FS):
 - (a) he has no in-principle objection to the application subject to fire service installations (FSIs) and water supplies for fire-fighting being provided to satisfaction of his department;
 - (b) in consideration of the design/nature of the proposal, FSIs are anticipated to be required. Therefore, the applicants are advised to submit relevant layout plans incorporated with the proposed FSIs to FSD for approval. In addition, the applicants should also be advised on the following points:
 - (i) the layout plans should be drawn to scale and depicted with dimensions and nature of occupancy;

- (ii) the location of where the proposed FSI to be installed should be clearly marked on the layout plans; and
- (iii) the applicants should observe the good practice guidelines for open storage sites;
- (c) moreover, having considered the nature of open storage, an approval condition requiring the provision of fire extinguisher(s) within 6 weeks from the date of planning approval should be incorporated if the application is approved. To address this approval condition, the applicants are required to submit a valid fire certificate (FS 251) to his department for approval; and
- (d) the applicants are reminded that if the proposed structure(s) is required to comply with the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123), detailed fire safety requirements will be formulated upon receipt of formal submission of general building plans.

District Officer's Comments

10.1.10 Comments of the District Officer (North), Home Affairs Department (DO(N), HAD):

he has consulted the locals regarding the application. The Chairman of Sha Tau Kok District Rural Committee and the incumbent North District Council member of subject constituency have no comment on the application but expressed some safety concern as the existing local track road is too narrow for heavy goods vehicles. The Indigenous Inhabitant Representative and Resident Representative of Man Uk Pin object the application.

- 10.2 The following Government departments have no comment on/no objection to the application:
 - (a) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C, WSD); and
 - (b) Project Manager (North), North Development Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (PM(N), CEDD).

11. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Period (Appendix V)

On 6.10.2020, the application was published for public inspection. During the statutory public inspection period, seven public comments were received. The Chairman of Sheung Shui Rural Committee indicates no comment on the application. A member of North District Council objects the application on the grounds that such temporary application is piecemeal in nature and a comprehensive planning in North District should be considered instead. The Hong Kong Bird Watching Society, WWF-HK, the Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden Corporation, and two individuals object to the application mainly on the grounds that the development is not in line with the planning intention of "AGR" zone; approval of the application would set an undesirable precedent to the future similar applications within the "AGR" zone; 'destroy first, build later' should not be tolerated; and the development would generate adverse traffic and environmental impact on the surrounding area.

12. Planning Considerations and Assessments

- 12.1 The application is for a temporary open storage of steel sheet piles and ancillary office for a period of three years at the Site, which falls entirely within the "AGR" on the OZP (Plan A-1). The development is not in line with the planning intention of "AGR" zone which is intended primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes. DAFC does not support the application as the Site possesses potential for agricultural rehabilitation and can be used as greenhouse cultivation or plant nursery. No strong planning justification has been given in the submission to justify for a departure from the planning intentions, even on a temporary basis.
- 12.2 The Site falls within Category 3 area under the TPB PG-No. 13F on 'Application for Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses' promulgated by the Board on 27.3.2020. The following considerations in the Guidelines are relevant:
 - Category 3 areas: applications would normally not be favourably considered unless the applications are on sites with previous planning approvals. Sympathetic consideration may be given if genuine efforts have been demonstrated in compliance with approval conditions of the previous planning applications and relevant technical assessments/proposals have been included in the fresh applications, if required, to demonstrate that the proposed uses would not generate adverse drainage, traffic, visual, landscaping and environmental impacts on the surrounding areas. Planning permission could be granted on a temporary basis up to a maximum period of three years, subject to no adverse departmental comments and local objections, or the concerns of the departments and local residents can be addressed through the implementation of approval conditions.
- 12.3 The Site is situated in an area of rural inland plain landscape character which comprises of mostly vacant land and fallow agricultural land intermixed with some temporary structures for domestic use (Plan A-4a). The development is considered not compatible with the rural landscape character of the surrounding areas. CTP/UD&L, PlanD has some reservation on the application from the landscape planning point of view. There is a concern that approval of the application would set an undesirable precedent and would encourage more similar developments within the area. The cumulative impact of such approval would further degrade the landscape quality of the surrounding area.
- 12.4 C for T does not support the application from the traffic engineering viewpoint as the applicants fail to demonstrate in the submission that the temporary development will not cause adverse traffic impact on the surrounding areas in that the applicants have not provided traffic-related information for his review including potential traffic impact arising from the development, adequacy of the parking spaces and loading/unloading spaces and satisfactory manoeuvring of vehicles entering to and exiting from the Site etc. Other Government departments, including DEP, CE/MN of DSD, CBS/NTW, BD and D of FS have no objection or no adverse comment on the application.
- 12.5 The application does not comply with the TPB Guidelines No. 13F in that the Site falls within Category 3 area where application would normally not be favourably considered unless the applications are on sites with previous planning approvals. The Site is not the subject of previous planning approval for similar open storage uses; there are adverse departmental comments and local objections to the application; and the applicants have

failed to demonstrate that the development would not cause adverse traffic and landscape impacts on the surrounding area.

- 12.6 While the Site, in part or in whole, is the subject of two previous planning applications (No. A/NE-MUP/75 and 146), only planning application No. A/NE-MUP/75 was for similar use (i.e. temporary open storage of new and second-hand vehicles) covering a larger area which was rejected by the Committee in December 2012 mainly on the grounds of not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; not in compliance with the then TPB PG-No. 13E in that no previous planning approval had been granted to the application site and there were adverse comments from the relevant government departments and local objections against the application; and there was no information in the application to demonstrate that the proposed development would have no adverse environmental and landscape impact on the surrounding areas. There are two similar applications (No. A/NE-MUP/63 and 86) for temporary open storage which fall within "AGR" zone in the vicinity of the Site (Plan A-1). These applications were rejected by the Board on review/ by the Committee in 2011 and 2013 respectively mainly on considerations as set out in paragraphs 7.2 and 7.3. The circumstances of the current application are similar to the rejected previous and similar applications.
- 12.7 Regarding the local objection conveyed by DO(N), HAD and the adverse public comments as detailed in paragraphs 10.1.10 and 11 above respectively, Government departments' comments and planning assessments above are relevant.

13. Planning Department's Views

- 13.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 12 and having taken into account local objection conveyed by DO(N), HAD and public comments mentioned in paragraphs 10.1.10 and 11 above respectively, the Planning Department does not support the application for the following reasons:
 - (a) the development is not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone, which is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes and to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes. There is no strong justification in the submission for a departure from such planning intention, even on a temporary basis;
 - (b) the development does not comply with the Town Planning Board Guidelines for "Application for Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses" under Section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No. 13F) in that there is no previous approval for open storage granted for the Site and there are adverse departmental comments and local objections; and
 - (c) the applicants fail to demonstrate that the development would not cause adverse traffic and landscape impact on the surrounding areas.
- 13.2 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid on a temporary basis for a period of 3 years until 20.11.2023. The following conditions of approval and advisory clauses are suggested for Members' reference:

Approval Conditions

- (a) no operation between 5:00 p.m. and 9:00 a.m. on Mondays to Saturdays, as proposed by the applicants, is allowed on the Site during the planning approval period;
- (b) no operation on Sundays and public holidays, as proposed by the applicants, is allowed on the Site during the planning approval period;
- (c) no medium or heavy goods vehicle exceeding 5.5 tonnes, including container tractor/trailer, as defined in the Road Traffic Ordinance is allowed to be parked/stored on or enter/exit the Site at any time during the planning approval period;
- (d) the submission of a drainage proposal within 6 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board by 20.5.2021;
- (e) in relation to (d) above, the provision of drainage facilities within 9 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board by 20.8.2021;
- (f) the provision of fire extinguisher(s) with valid fire certificate (FS 251) within 6 weeks from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by 1.1.2021;
- (g) the submission of proposals for fire service installations and water supplies for firefighting within 6 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by 20.5.2021;
- (h) in relation to (g) above, the implementation of proposals for fire service installations and water supplies for firefighting within 9 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by 20.8.2021;
- (i) the submission of traffic review within 6 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Commissioner for Transport or of the Town Planning Board by 20.5.2021;
- (j) in relation to (i) above, the implementation of traffic mitigation measures identified therein within 9 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Commissioner for Transport or of the Town Planning Board 20.8.2021;
- (k) if any of the above planning conditions (a), (b) or (c) is not complied with during the planning approval period, the approval hereby given shall cease to have effect and shall be revoked immediately without further notice;
- (l) if any of the above planning conditions (d), (e), (f), (g), (h), (i) or (j) is not complied with by the specified date, the approval hereby given shall cease to have effect and shall on the same date be revoked without further notice; and
- (m) upon expiry of the planning permission, the reinstatement of the Site to an amenity area to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning or of the Town

Planning Board.

Advisory Clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are at Appendix VI.

14. Decision Sought

- 14.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant the permission.
- 14.2 Should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicants.
- 14.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the period of which the permission should be valid on a temporary basis.

15. Attachments

Appendix I Appendix II	Application Form with Attachment received on 25.9.2020 Relevant extract of Town Planning Board Guidelines for Application for
Appendix III	Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses (TPB PG-No. 13F) Previous applications
Appendix IV	Similar s.16 Applications within "AGR" Zone in the vicinity of the Application Site on the Man Uk Pin Outline Zoning Plan
Appendix V	Public Comments
Appendix VI	Recommended Advisory Clauses
Drawing A-1	Site Layout Plan
Plan A-1	Location Plan
Plan A-2	Site Plan
Plan A-3	Aerial Photo
Plans A-4a to 4c	Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT NOVEMBER 2020