

Attachment II

Response-to-Comments Table (Public Comment)

Application for Permission Under Section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (Cap. 131) for Proposed Comprehensive Development including Flats, Retail and Community Facilities and Minor Relaxation of Plot Ratio and Building Height Restriction in “Comprehensive Development Area” Zone at Various Lots in S.D.4 and Adjoining Government Land, Kau Wa Keng, Kwai Chung

Responses to Public Comments

Public Comments	Page No.
1. Comments from Kau Wa Keng Old Village.....	2
2. Comments on Development Intensity and Compatibility.....	5
3. Comments on the Provision of Facilities and Amenities.....	6
4. Comments on Landscape Impact and Greening	7
5. Comments on Impacts during Construction	9
6. Comments on Traffic Impacts	9
7. Comments on Conservation of Kau Wa Keng	10
8. Comments on Drainage Impacts.....	11
9. Comments on Environmental Impacts.....	12
10. Comments on Land Utilization.....	12
11. Comments on Air Ventilation and Sunlight	13

Responses to Public Comments

PUBLIC COMMENTS

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
1.	Comments from Kau Wa Keng Old Village	
	(a) Most of the land within the Application Site is Tso/Tong Land and is owned by the Tsangs and Ngs. While the land dispute concerning land lots in Phase 1B among the Applicant and Tsang Wa Hon Tso has yet to be settled, it was considered illegitimate for the Applicant to submit the planning application on behalf of other landowners.	The Application Site is fully within the area zoned as “Comprehensive Development Area” (“CDA”) under multiple land ownership, with the Applicant holds the majority of the private land. Considering the existing land ownership pattern, the Proposed Scheme will be implemented by the same phasing strategy as the Approved Scheme (Planning Application No. A/KC/489, approved with conditions by the TPB on 14 July 2023), with two early phases to be implemented by the Applicant to ensure their timely implementation, and two remaining phases (their implementation will be subject to the respective third-party lot owners). In respect of TPB-PG No. 17A, each phase is self-contained in terms of layout design, provision of car parking spaces and separate vehicular access. Furthermore, development potential of the remaining phases will not be undermined by the early phases, fully respecting the interests of the third-party lot owners and allowing flexibility for the third-party owners to either implement the Proposed Scheme, or to pursue an alternative scheme independently through a separate S16 planning application to the TPB. Moreover, in compliance with TPB PG-No. 31B, reasonable steps have been taken by the Applicants to give notification to the current land owners of the Application Site before submitting the planning application, including (i) publishing notices in 3 specified local newspapers (namely Ming Pao, Wen Wei Po and China Daily) on 14 March 2025, and (ii) posting site notices in 3 prominent locations at the Application Site 2 weeks prior to the submission of the planning application.

Page 3 of 13

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
	(d) Two ancestral halls (namely 曾氏家祠 and 吳氏家祠) will be affected. No consent has been sought from the Tsangs' and Ngs' clan members, and no resolution has been provided by the Applicant.	(2) The Proposed Scheme has covered the entire "CDA" zone and the proposed phasing will not adversely affect its comprehensiveness; (3) Each phase is self-contained in terms of layout design and provision of ancillary private open space, car parking spaces and separate vehicular access; and (4) the development potential (in terms of plot ratio) of the remaining phases will not be absorbed by the early phases so as to fully respect the landed interest of the third-party lot owners. Various technical assessments in aspects of traffic, environmental drainage, sewerage, landscape, visual and air ventilation impacts have already considered the entire MLP covering the whole "CDA" and confirmed that there would be no adverse impacts arising from the Proposed Scheme to the village area with the implementation of the early phases. More importantly, with the proposed drainage, sewerage and landscape proposals, the existing living environment of the Old Village will be enhanced. In line with the spirit of "CDA" zone, the Proposed Scheme with phasing arrangement is prepared to demonstrate the potential development of the entire Application Site in a comprehensive manner. In formulating the Proposed Scheme, effort has been made to preserve the 12 existing Grade 3 historic buildings in the Old Village located in Remaining Phase B. As shown in the submitted Landscape Master Plan, these Grade 3 historic buildings will be integrated with the landscape setting in a holistic manner with a view to harmonising the historic asset into the Proposed Scheme. The two concerned ancestral halls (namely 曾氏家祠 and 吳氏家, which are currently not graded by AAB) are located in the Remaining Phase B. As illustrated in the Figure 8c in the Supporting Planning

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
	(e) Compensation and rehousing arrangements remain uncertain. Details should be provided by the Applicant before the proposed development is to be taken forward. (f) The small house concessionary rights of the indigenous villagers in Kau Wah Keng Old Village will be affected by the proposed development. There are no discussions on the preservation of the traditional rights of the villagers.	Statement (Appendix A), the buildings in the Remaining Phase B will not be affected by the early phases of the Proposed Scheme. In respect of the TPB-PG No. 17A, each phase of the Proposed Scheme is self-contained in terms of layout design, provision of car parking spaces and separate vehicular access. Furthermore, development potential of the remaining phases will not be undermined by the early phases, fully respecting the interests of the third-party lot owners and allowing flexibility for the third-party owners to either implement the Proposed Scheme, or to pursue an alternative scheme independently through a separate S16 planning application to the TPB. This arrangement allows third-party lot owners under the remaining phases to submit to the TPB a revised layout, if they consider appropriate, in the future. Noted. These will be fully considered in detailed design stage. The Application Site was designated as "CDA" since 1992 for comprehensive redevelopment of the entire area (including the valley floor and area currently occupied by the Old Village) for private residential development. This Application has been submitted according to the planning intention of the "CDA" and the requirements suggested in the Planning Brief.
2.	Comments on Development Intensity and Compatibility	
	(a) The high-density and high-rise development at the Application Site, with residential blocks and building height up to 140mPD (31-40 storeys), is considered massive. It may create adverse impacts to the surrounding environment.	The Proposed Scheme adopts the principles of sensitive building design to ensure compatibility with the surrounding environment. Wind and visual permeability are ensured with the 3 numbers of 15m-wide air paths cum visual corridors to bring connection between the valley area to the north, allowing the visual permeability of the Proposed Scheme. In addition, the Proposed

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
	(b) The proposed development has increased its intensity (i.e. an approximate increase of 1000 households) as comparing to the previous application (A/KC/489). With the growth population in the Kau Wa Keng area, the living environment has become more crowded and congested.	Scheme provides a diagonal 15m air path on podium level aligned in an ESE-WNW direction, further improving the air ventilation of the Proposed Scheme. Technical assessments including Visual Impact Assessment (Appendix G) and Air Ventilation Assessment (Appendix H) have been submitted to confirm there would be no adverse impacts to the surrounding areas arising from the Proposed Scheme in terms of visual acceptability and air ventilation. Various technical assessments in aspects of traffic, environmental, drainage, sewerage, landscape, visual and air ventilation impacts have been conducted and submitted in support of the Proposed Scheme. Findings of the assessments confirmed that the Proposed Scheme is technically feasible and acceptable in that no adverse impacts would be generated to the future development at the Application Site and to the surrounding areas including the Kau Wa Keng Old Village and Kau Wa Keng San Tsuen upon both early phase development and full development stages with adoption of appropriate mitigation measures. More importantly, with the proposed drainage, sewerage and landscape enhancements, the living environment of the Kau Wa Keng will be enhanced.
3.	Comments on the Provision of Facilities and Amenities	
	(a) There are inadequate community facilities to support the increased population. Open spaces and facilities, such as schools, swimming pools and markets, should be provided.	As an enhancement to the Approved Scheme, the Proposed Scheme provides additional social welfare and retail facilities to serve the local community in the Kau Wa Keng area. Regarding social welfare facilities, the Applicant has proposed additional social welfare facilities while retaining all facilities committed in the Approved Scheme. they include a Child Care Centre, a Day Care Centre for the Elderly and three Residential Care Homes for the Elderly. The new

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
	(b) A refuse collection point (RCP) is proposed on a third-party land lot (i.e. Lot 1364RP) that has existing buildings on it. The proposed RCP is located at the entrance of Kwa Wa Keng San Tsuen and in proximity to other village settlements. It is concerned that the RCP would create environmental nuisance (e.g. odor and water pollution) to the villagers. (c) Given that the birth rate of Hong Kong is low, the existing 5 kindergartens have faced under-enrolled issues. New kindergartens included in the proposed development are considered as undesirable.	facilities will make the future "CDA" an inclusive residential neighbourhood offering a diversity of community supporting services. Furthermore, the Proposed Scheme assigns non-domestic GFA of about 6,700 m² to the retail facilities that provide local commodities and services tailored to the daily needs of the local communities. These facilities will offer wider range of goods and services in the northern part of Lai King Hill Road, balancing the spatial distribution of retail services in the neighbourhoods along Lai King Hill Road. The Proposed RCP is located at Remaining Phase A. Referring to the Environmental Assessment (Appendix C), the RCP is located at about 7m from the nearest existing air sensitive receiver (ASR). In order to minimize the potential odour nuisance on nearby ASRs, proper ventilation, deodourising (e.g. with 95% odour removal efficiency) and exhaust system will be provided where necessary. Hence, no adverse odourous impact is anticipated on the nearby ASRs. Furthermore, the good site practices such as frequent washing, proper covering of refuse bins and closing of roller shutters would also prevent water pollution from the RCP. It is also recommended to collect waste daily by licensed waste collector to ensure timely removal of waste. Therefore, adverse water quality impact is not anticipated. Noted. Please note that no kindergarten is proposed in the Proposed Scheme.
4.	Comments on Landscape Impact and Greening	

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
		planning application to the Town Planning Board.
5.	Comments on Impacts during Construction	
	(a) Adverse environmental impacts and safety concerns, such as dust, environmental degradation, water, might be generated to nearby residents during the construction stage. (b) There were previous examples that village houses were damaged due to vibration during the construction of the West Rail Line. In order to protect the villagers and their property, it is necessary to conduct technical assessments on the structure of the village houses.	Environmental Assessment Study (Appendix D) has been conducted. With the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures and good site practices, no adverse environmental impacts are anticipated. As the Proposed Scheme would not involve underground construction works that require deep excavation, no groundborne construction noise impacts are anticipated.
6.	Comments on Traffic Impacts	
	(a) There are insufficient transport services in the area to support the additional population. (b) Lai King Hill Road is the only vehicular access serving the Application Site and is always jammed with cars. With the inadequate capacity in the current condition, the proposed development will impose extra traffic burden to Lai Wa District, especially the road from Mei Lai Road to Cheung Sha Wan Road. (c) There are concerns on the fire safety of Kau Wa Keng San Tsuen due to the lack of emergency vehicular access.	Public Transport Assessment in traffic Impact Assessment (Appendix C) has been conducted. Shuttle services are proposed for the future residents of the development, and no adverse impact on existing transport services is expected. Traffic Impact Assessment (Appendix C), which includes the assessment of the capacity on Lai King Hill Road, has been conducted. The assessment results indicate that the proposed development is not anticipated to cause significant traffic impact. With the aim to improve the quality of life of the residents at the Application and the surrounding area, Proposed Scheme includes design and infrastructure enhancement measures to facilitate a gradual transformation of the entire Kau Wa Keng into a well-managed residential neighbourhood provided with good amenities.

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
		Referring to the MLP (Appendix B), upon completion of Phase 1A Development, emergency vehicles can access to the periphery of Kau Wa Keng San Tsuen via the internal access road of the Proposed Scheme. It provides better access to the northern part Kau Wa Keng San Tsuen, improving the fire safety of the area.
7.	Comments on Conservation of Kau Wa Keng	
	(a) Kau Wa Keng has a long history which can be traced back to more than 300 years ago. The area is home to 13 Grade III Historic Buildings recognised by the Antiquities and Monuments Office, highlighting its significant heritage conservation value. The proposed development will undermine the historic value of the Kau Wa Keng area.	The Proposed Scheme pays full respect to all 12 existing Graded Historic Buildings within the Application Site. The proposed conservation works for the 12 historic buildings within the Application Site are proposed as follows: • In-situ preservation of all Graded historic buildings; • Careful buildings disposition and basement development planning to avoid encroachment on the historic buildings; • Preserve and restore the main architectural external features and interior spaces of the historic buildings; • Remove later additions, structurally not safe or any illegal structures from the buildings which are of detrimental effect to the architectural significance of the historic buildings; • Design surrounding open space and streets to be compatible with the historical ambience of the buildings to enhance compatibility and integration; • Introduce adaptive uses of the historic buildings, for example exhibition halls, visitor centres, local convenience stores, cafeteria etc., integrating the buildings' historical significance into everyday life of the future residents and visitors; and • Ensure public access to encourage visits and uses from residents and visitors for visual appreciation and full immersion in the historical ambience. More importantly, the Proposed Scheme encourages adaptive-reuse of the historic

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
	(b) Apart from the Graded Buildings, the whole environment of the Kau Wa Keng area should be completely preserved. Especially for Kau Wa Keng Old Village, it has been served as a residence for many artists and intellectuals from mainland China during war. The reflected historical significance has strongly supported the need of preservation.	buildings. Future owners and developers are obligated to retain GFA for the historic buildings and are encouraged to actively incorporate them into their development proposals through adaptive reuse. It should be noted that the Application Site is fully located within an area zoned as "Comprehensive Development Area (CDA)" which is intended for comprehensive development of the area (including the valley floor and area currently occupied by the Old Village) for private residential development. The Proposed Scheme for a comprehensive residential development at the Application Site is fully in line with the planning intention the "CDA" zone.
8.	Comments on Drainage Impacts	
	(a) Kau Wa Keng area is in a low-lying area and is prone to flooding. There are concerns that the proposed development will adversely affect drainage performance. (b) It is concerned that the existing nullah would be intercepted by the proposed roads and buildings upon the completion of early phase development.	As confirmed by Drainage Impact Assessment (Appendix E) the Proposed Scheme will not generate adverse impact to the existing drainage system along Lai King Hill Road and in the existing village area upon both the early phases and full development. Moreover, the Applicant would like to take the development opportunity to bring shared benefits to the local community by providing expedient measures to cater for the potential flooding issues. It is proposed to provide flood walls along the existing bank lines of the existing channels to reduce the flood risks in the nearby areas upon the completion of the early phases development. The existing nullahs are diverted by the rectangular channel to the drainage system within the Application Site. The diversion of the nullahs will be prioritised during the proposed development to minimise the impact. As confirmed by Drainage Impact Assessment (Appendix E) the Proposed Scheme will not generate adverse impact to

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
		the existing drainage system along Lai King Hill Road and in the existing village area upon both the early phases and full development.
9.	Comments on Environmental Impacts	
	(a) The proposed development may lead to severe environmental issues to the surrounding environment, such as noise, water and air pollution, and ecological impact.	Environmental Assessment Study (Appendix D) has been conducted. With the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures and good site practices, no adverse environmental impacts are anticipated.
10.	Comments on Land Utilization	
	(a) The proposed development has only consisted of small part of land, while the remaining land also has development potential. The "Green Belt" ("GB") zone area is government land and thus should be included in the development to alleviate Hong Kong's land shortage issue. (b) There is approximately 22,000m² of government land in the proposed development. To maximise development benefits, the development should be led by the government.	It should be noted that the Application Site is fully within an area zoned as "Comprehensive Development Area (CDA)" which is intended for comprehensive development of the area (including the valley floor and area currently occupied by the Old Village) for private residential development. The Proposed Scheme for a comprehensive residential development at the Application Site is fully in line with the planning intention the "CDA" zone. It should be noted that the Application Site is fully within an area zoned as "Comprehensive Development Area (CDA)" which is intended for comprehensive development of the area (including the valley floor and area currently occupied by the Old Village) for private residential development. The Explanatory Statement (ES) of the OZP also indicates that the "CDA" subject to <i>"development of the area would entirely rely on the initiatives of private sector"</i>. The Planning Brief (PB) prepared in 1995 further states that the planning intention of the "CDA" zone is to <i>"encourage the comprehensive redevelopment of the Kau Wa Keng valley floor and the area occupied by the Kau Wa Keng Old Village as a whole with a view to improving the environmental</i>

Responses to Public Comments

No.	Summary of Comments	Responses
		<i>and living conditions of the area in particular the Old Village”.</i> The Proposed Scheme put forward in this S16 Planning Application is designed to realise a comprehensive redevelopment optimising precious land resource for meeting territorial housing demand by private initiatives.
11.	Comments on Air Ventilation and Sunlight	
	(a) The proposed increase in building height would limit the enjoyment of natural sunlight, and block the breezeway of nearby residential areas. Air ventilation is adversely affected.	With a view to enhance liveability, the Proposed Scheme is carefully designed in full compliance with the Sustainable Building Design Guidelines (SBDG) in terms of building separation, building setback and site coverage of greenery. With environmentally sensitive design including careful building disposition and setbacks, it will assure a quality living environment for future residents in the area. It is confirmed by the Air Ventilation Assessment (Appendix I) that the Proposed Scheme will not caused adverse air ventilation impact to surrounding environment.

(Last updated on 07/07/2025)