



# LCH Planning and Development Consultants Limited

Section 16 Application for Proposed Temporary Public Vehicle Park (Private Cars and Light Goods Vehicles Only) and Proposed Filling of Land at part of Remaining Portion of Section A of Lot Nos. 608, sub-section 1 of Section B of 608, part of Remaining Portion of Section C of 608, part of Remaining Portion of 614, 615, 617, Remaining Portion of 619 and part of Remaining Portion of 620 in Demarcation District 85, and the adjoining Government Land at Po Kak Tsai, Fanling for a period of 3 Years

Annex 1 - Response to Departmental Comments Table

No.	Comments Received	Our Responses
1.	<p><i>Comments from Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department dated 27 September 2023</i></p>	
a	<p>The site is located in an area of rural inland plains landscape character comprising of woodlands, temporary structures, open storages and residential buildings at the northwest within the "R(A)" zone. Based on the aerial photo of 2022 and our site record taken on 28.11.2022, the site is partly hard paved and in operation as private vehicles parking. Some trees of common species are observed along the northern site boundary. Compared with aerial photos of 2005 and 2006, vegetation clearance within the site had taken place in 2006. Further vegetation clearance at the northern portion of the site is observed when compare the aerial photo in Mar 2022 and our site record. There is a concern that approval of the application would further alter the landscape character and degrade the landscape quality of the "GB" zone. We have some reservations to the application from the landscape planning perspective.</p>	<p>Well noted of the comment. Refer to the supporting planning statement, the application is complied with Town Planning Board Guideline No.10 which will not degrade the landscape quality of the "GB" zone, and the planning merits involved cannot be neglected.</p> <p>For the compatibility of the proposed development, it aligns with the concept of the compatible use within the green belt zone which acts as a buffer between urban and rural area by satisfying the requirements on the development parameters. The development is in small-scale and low intensity, with only one minimal structure as the guard room erected on the site which ensures the compatibility with the rural character.</p> <p>For the essential nature of the proposed development, the proximity of the site to Shan Lai Court and Po Kak Tsai Village also favours the development of vehicle park to cater the excessive demand for car parking spaces in the vicinity. Proper parking spaces can reduce illegal parking which allow smoother traffic along Po Kak Tsai Road and enhance mobility of the nearby residents. The barrier-free access from the Application Site to Sha Lai Court also provides residents with convenience. These merits can further create a harmonious environment in the community.</p>

		<p>For the existing greenery and vegetation, they will be preserved in order to maintain the natural landscape and the compatibility with the surrounding environment. There is a Bombax Ceiba planted by the Applicant at the eastern boundary which would be preserved. No tree felling and clearance of vegetation is anticipated during the construction and operation stage so as to maintain the rural landscape character of the "GB" zone.</p> <p>In addition, the design of the proposed layout of the site can enhance the visual and landscape compatibility. Mesh fencing will be provided along a particular section of the boundary to maximize the visual permeability. A small resting area is also designed near to the entrance of the proposed vehicle park. This strip of land will be planted with grass and small planters will be placed along the boundary between the resting area and the vehicle park. Greenery potential can be maximized and promote smooth integration between the rural area and the proposed vehicle park. Therefore, land resources can be fully utilized to address the needs of the nearby residents without altering the landscape area in "GB" zone.</p>
b	<p>It is noted on the Indicative Layout Plan (Annex 2) of the Supporting Planning Statement that cluster of trees are located at the northeast of site. With reference to our site record, some trees are observed along the northwest boundary. Those trees have not been recorded in the supporting Planning Statement. Information provided in Indicative Landscape Treatments (Annex 6) is insufficient. The applicant should provide the information on all existing trees within the site. The location of car parking spaces should be adjusted to avoid adverse impacts to the trees. Assessment on potential impacts arising from the proposed development on the existing landscape resources, the proposed tree treatments and proposed mitigation measures, if any, should be illustrated in a landscape proposal. The applicant</p>	<p>Well noted of the comment. According to the Aerial Photos (<i>Annex 1</i>) provided in the Supporting Planning Statement, the cluster of trees along northwest boundary is located outside the site boundary, while there is a small part of vegetation located at the northwestern corner within the site boundary which will not be removed and will be protected by fencing. The trees and vegetation outside or within the boundary will not be removed and the location of car parking spaces would not cause adverse impacts to the trees.</p> <p>In addition, only a small cluster of vegetation which was not planted by the Applicant is observed at the northern boundary within the application area. These vegetation will not be removed and the proposed development will not adversely affect the existing</p>

should make reference to the Guidance Notes on Application for Permission under Section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (Cap. 131)."

vegetation along the northern boundary. However, a small cluster of weeds and wildgrasses is located at the northern part of the application area. Not only do the weeds and wildgrasses reduce aesthetics of the site, but they can also cause several problems such as breeding of insects and pests. In order to maintain a neat and well-maintained appearance of the site, the small amount of weeds and wildgrasses will be removed.

Moreover, the small strip of land will be planted with grasses and small planters will be placed along the boundary of the resting area. The green area of the resting area can also increase the vegetation coverage which helps to maintain the rural character of the site.

For the proposed tree treatments, please refer to *Annex 6* on the supporting Planning Statement. Fencings surrounding the trees are constructed to protect the existing trees from damages.

**2. Comments from Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation dated 27 September 2023**

Based on the aerial photo, the majority of the subject site is paved and is an existing car park. According to our inspection in November 2022, a mature *Bombax ceiba* 木棉 was recorded near the eastern boundary of the subject site. In addition, there is a 1823 complaint case on suspected illegal tree felling at the subject site referred to us by 1823 on 10 October 2022 (CASE#3-7422693818 New Complaint - WS221005A96061 流水響布格子近公廁旁砍伐政府土地樹木). The complainant claimed that tree felling within the subject site (area within private lots) was observed in mid-2022. No follow up action has been taken by this Department as no sign of recent tree damage could be found in the government land within the subject site. While I have no strong view on the subject application from nature conservation perspective, you may wish to consider if the approval of the

Well noted of the comment. This Application aims to address the excess demand for proper car parking spaces in the community while preserving the natural landscape and rural character of the application site.

The mature *Bombax Ceiba* was planted and managed by the Applicant. All trees including the *Bombax Ceiba* will be preserved. The current proposal has emphasized the preservation of greenery and it would not set an undesiirable precedent by making appropriate use of land resources to satisfy the communal needs of the nearby residents and simultaneously minimizing undesirable impacts to the surrounding environment. Therefore, this Application is compatible with the goals of nature conservation and sustainable development.



	subject application will set an undesirable precedent which should not be encouraged.	
<b>3.</b>	<b><i>Comments from District Planning Officer/ Sha Tin, Tai Po and North, Planning Department dated 19 December 2023</i></b>	
	<p>Regarding the proposed 'rest place' in the application form, please also provide details of the 'rest place' area in terms of its site area, open hours, layout plan of the 'rest place' and whether it is open for public or the users only as there is a gate proposed to enclose the 'rest place' area.</p>	<p>The Applicants have strong connection with the villagers. It is the Applicants' intention to bring planning merit to the community. The 'rest place' area can be considered as a community garden which allows villagers and visitors passing by to sit and relax.</p> <p>Since the concerned parcel of land is private land, due to liability issue, it is recommended to provide a gate at the entrance. However, it will be opened to the public at designated hours, say from 7am to 7pm daily.</p> <p>Refer to the supporting planning statement, this 'rest place' is about 110 sq.m. in site area. To minimise the building footprint on the "GB" zone, it is not proposed to erect any structures/ buildings on this part. There will be movable chairs and shelters to facilitate passive recreational activities on this area. Mesh fencing will be provided along this section of boundary to maximum the visual permeability. Small planters will be placed to separate this strip of land from the proposed car park.</p>
<b>4.</b>	<b><i>Comments from Commissioner for Transport dated 21 December 2023</i></b>	
(i)	<p>The application should substantiate the traffic generation and attraction from and to their public car park and the traffic impact on the nearby road links and junctions. Particular attention should be paid to Po Kak Tsai Road which is a single track 2-way access road.</p>	<p>According to the table showing estimated trip generation and trip attraction on weekdays on the supporting planning statement, 7am-9am and 5pm-8pm will be the peak hours for workers to leave and arrive the car park on weekdays. It is estimated that only 50 cars will be leaving and arriving the car park during the peak hour on weekdays, while the remaining 88 cars will leave and arrive the car park occasionally at non-peak hours on weekdays and at weekends.</p>

Regarding the existing usage of Po Kak Tsai Road, the current traffic flow on Po Kak Tsai Road is low as it mostly accommodates drivers to a few of the warehouses in the vicinity which operate between 9am to 5pm on weekdays. Vehicles going to and leaving the warehouses will pass by the two captioned junctions between 9am to 5pm. Therefore, the additional vehicular trips generated by the proposed development will not overlap the existing vehicular trips which will not cause traffic congestion during the day on both Po Kak Tsai Road and the two captioned junctions.

*Avoid Queuing Back*

Additionally, the monthly rental system of the car park allows car owners to enter and exit the car park promptly, eliminating the need for queuing at the ingress/egress. This streamlined process ensures a smooth circulation of vehicles along Po Kak Tsai Road, thereby minimizing the likelihood of traffic congestion at the road and the adjacent junctions.

*Illegal Parking Issue*

The illegal parking issue reflects the inadequacy of proper parking spaces along Po Kak Tsai Road and the proposed development aims to alleviate existing illegal parking situation. Once the operation of the proposed vehicle park begins, the passing-bays will not be occupied by illegal parking which allows smoother circulation of vehicles and enhance road safety.

*Provision of Passing-bays*

There will be passing-bays as Po Kak Tsai Road is a single track 2-way access road. For the location of the passing-bays, please refer to Location of Passing-bay along Po Kak Tsai Road (*Annex 4*) of the supporting planning statement. It shows a section of straight road along Po Kak Tsai Road which is adjacent to the Application Site.



		<p>There are total six passing-bays distributed evenly along the straight road, with an additional two passing bays positioned at both ends of the section where turning occurs.</p> <p>In addition to the 6 meters wide of Po Kak Tsai Road which is abundant for two-way traffic, these passing-bays can further ensure road safety by reducing the risk of collisions with oncoming vehicles along the Po Kak Tsai Road.</p> <p><i>Sight Line Analysis</i></p> <p>Please refer to <i>Diagram 3</i> of the supporting planning statement for sight line analysis. As the speed limit on Po Kak Tsai Road is 50km/h, the proposed sight distance is 70 meters at the ingress/egress which is complied with Transport Planning and Design Manual. The proposed distance is sufficient for the driver to stop the car before the obstacles and to avoid it.</p> <p>As there is no traffic congestion and no significant increase in traffic flow at all periods during the day, no adverse traffic impact is anticipated.</p>
(ii)	The applicant shall demonstrate the satisfactory maneuvering of the vehicles entering and exiting the subject site, maneuvering within the car park aisles and into/out of the parking spaces, preferably using the swept path analysis.	<p>Please refer to the swept path assessment. It is shown that there is the width of Po Kak Tsai Road is adequate for a container truck to pass through the road and the junctions. Other smaller vehicles such as private cars and light goods vehicles can wait at the passing-bays along Po Kak Tsai Road to allow container trucks that require more spaces to pass through the road and junctions without any difficulties. The adequacy of road width and passing-bays along Po Kak Tsai Road can contribute to smoother traffic circulation and minimize the chances of accidents that may occur when larger vehicles and smaller vehicles attempt to navigate the road simultaneously. Additionally, the road width is sufficient to allow two-way traffic of smaller vehicles such as private cars without any</p>



(iii)	<p data-bbox="311 1120 383 1937">The applicant shall advise the provision and management of pedestrian facilities to ensure pedestrian safety.</p>
difficulties. Any disturbance to other drivers is not anticipated when the car park users enter or exit the vehicle park.	<p data-bbox="311 257 558 1120">There is an existing barrier-free pedestrian road attached to the Application Site, which increases accessibility of Shan Lai Court residents and people with reduced mobility. The road allows pedestrian to commute between Shan Lai Court and the car park within 3-minute walking distance, which ensures their safety by simply walking on the pedestrian road without the risks of being hit by vehicles.</p> <p data-bbox="590 257 798 1120">The proposed rest place shown on the Indicative Layout Plan (<i>Annex 2</i>) of the supporting planning statement provided both villagers and car park visitors with a safe space to wait, rest or chat, especially for the elderly and individuals with limited mobility. They can leave the site using the gate of the rest place instead of the main exit of the vehicle park to reduce the risks of car accidents.</p> <p data-bbox="829 257 1037 1120">A "Pedestrian accident blackspot ahead" road sign will be posted at the ingress/egress of the car park which serves as a warning to drivers, alerting them to the presence of a high-risk area for pedestrian accidents. With the advanced notice, drivers can exercise extra caution and be more attentive to the potential hazards in the surroundings.</p> <p data-bbox="1069 257 1260 1120">Road pumps will also be installed at the ingress/egress and within the car park in order to help control and reduce the speed of vehicles which helps mitigate the risks of car accidents, particularly in areas where pedestrians may present. These two measures can ensure safety of both drivers and pedestrians.</p>



(iv)	Please advise that the Po Kak Tsai Road is not managed by this Office. The applicants should seek comments from the management and maintenance parties of Po Kak Tsai Road.	Well noted. The Applicant will reach out to the appropriate management and maintenance parties of Po Kak Tsai Road.
------	---	---





# LCH Planning and Development

Consultants Limited

Section 16 Application for Proposed Temporary Public Vehicle Park (Private Cars and Light Goods Vehicles Only) and Proposed Filling of Land at part of Remaining Portion of Section A of Lot Nos. 608, sub-section 1 of Section B of 608, part of Remaining Portion of Section C of 608, part of Remaining Portion of 614, 615, 617, Remaining Portion of 619 and part of Remaining Portion of 620 in Demarcation District 85, and the adjoining Government Land at Po Kak Tsai, Fanling for a period of 3 Years

Annex 2 - Response to Public Comments Table

No.	Comments Received	Our Responses
1	<p>Po Kak Tsai Road is narrow with a lot of curves along the road. In addition, the traffic flow and pedestrian flow on Po Kak Tsai Road are already high and there are insufficient road signs, attracting more vehicles to the site would cause severe traffic congestion and increase the risks of accidents and injuries.</p>	<p>The width of Po Kak Tsai Road is approximately 6 meters which allows two-way traffic, and there are adequate vehicle passing-bays along Po Kak Tsai Road which minimize the risks of traffic accidents and allow smoother traffic.</p> <p>Moreover, the sight distance of 70 meters at the ingress/egress of the Application Site is complied with Transport Planning and Design Manual, and a "Pedestrian accident blackspot ahead" warning sign will also be placed at the ingress/egress for clearer indication for the drivers entering the proposed vehicle park, which ensures safety of road users.</p> <p>Traffic congestion problem is not anticipated as all parking spaces are monthly rental parking spaces with designated spaces provided for each vehicle. Vehicle owners could park their cars efficiently and no queuing of vehicles is needed. Instead of worsening the traffic condition, the proposed vehicle park can alleviate traffic congestion by reducing illegal parking along Po Kak Tsai Road.</p>
2	<p>There are concerns related to the drainage issue as the proposed site was recently flooded due to the adverse weather. Filling of land would deteriorate the situation.</p>	<p>The drainage proposal is the same as previously submitted, which Drainage Services Department and Environmental Protection Department had no objection on technical perspective. Also, despite the proposed filling of land, the proposed drainage connection is adequate in respect of the requirements under "Technical Note to</p>



		prepare a Drainage Submission". Thus, no adverse drainage impact is anticipated.
3	The air pollution and the noise pollution caused by the increasing number of vehicles would cause disruption to the nearby residents living in Po Kak Tsai Village.	The Applicant will follow the relevant mitigation measures and requirements in the latest "Code of Practice on Handling Environmental Aspects of Temporary Uses and Open Storage Sites" to minimize any potential environmental impact. No adverse environmental impact is anticipated.
4	There is no necessity to construct a vehicle park as the number of residents living in Po Kak Tsai Village is low.	<p>The proposed vehicle park serves the nearby residents including residents living in Po Kak Tsai Village and Shan Lai Court, and there is excess demand for car parking spaces of residents in Shan Lai Court in particular.</p> <p>Among the 448 public comments and letters received, there are more than 70% of the public comments and letters supporting this proposal, acknowledging that the proposed vehicle park would serve the needs of Shan Lai Court.</p>
5	As the site originally partly falls within 'Green Belt' ("GB") zone, cutting down of trees would create a barrier between "GB" on either side, greatly impacting the ecosystem and preventing small animals from migrating from one side to another, Changing the land use of the site would pose an adverse impact to the natural and ecological environment.	Existing cluster of trees along the eastern boundary of the Application Site will be preserved to maintain the landscape environment. The Bombax Ceiba also at the eastern boundary is planted by the Applicant and would be preserved as well. No tree felling and vegetation clearance shall be anticipated, and the natural habitats of the existing animals would not be removed or harmed. Thus, possible disruption on the landscape, natural and ecological environment can be minimized.
6	The construction of vehicle park would affect the access of emergency vehicles.	As mentioned, the width of Po Kak Tsai Road is approximately 6 meters which allows two-way traffic. There are also adequate vehicle passing-bays along Po Kak Tsai Road and no traffic congestion problem along the road is anticipated. Thus, it would not affect the access of emergency vehicles.



7	Increased number of outsiders using the vehicle park would cause safety and security concerns in Po Kak Tsai Village.	The proposed vehicle park only accommodates the nearby residents, which does not attract outsiders. Also, a guard room is placed at the ingress/egress of the vehicle park which prevent outsiders who are not the monthly renter of the vehicle parking spaces from entering.
---	---	--