

Response-to-Comment to Traffic Impact Assessment Report

Response to Comments

Item	Comments	Responses
	<p>Transport Department Ref : email Date : From :</p> <p><u>Comments from Commissioner for Transport</u></p> <p><u>Traffic Impact Assessment Report</u></p> <p>10. Please note the proposed access road is included into the site boundary. Please review all relevant paragraphs, including those mentioning the access road connecting the application site and Sha Tau Kok Road.</p> <p>11. Paragraph 3.2.2 – The statement “<i>In order to provide vehicular and pedestrian access to the Subject Site, a new standard single two-lane carriageway in width of minimum 8m with 2.5m-wide footpath on the eastern side is proposed to connect Sha Tau Kok Road and the Subject Site...</i>” is appeared to be incorrect. As read from the submitted site boundary, the site abuts Sha Tau Kok Road – Shek Chung Au. Please review.</p> <p>12. 3.2.4 – “<i>The owner of “Sha Tau Kok Farm” has given consent to the applicant to construct a new road within the coach pick-up/drop-off zone and grant access to the Subject Site by it</i>”. Comment (10) is relevant. Please review.</p>	<p>Noted, Paragraph 3.2.1 to 3.2.3 has been revised accordingly with the consideration of the proposed access road being part of the Subject Site.</p> <p>Furthermore, please be advised that Paragraph 3.2.4 to 3.2.5 of previous TIA report is no longer valid and has been removed in the revised TIA report.</p> <p>Ditto.</p> <p>Ditto.</p>

Response to Comments (Cont’d)

Item	Comments	Responses
	<p>13. The proposed sales agreement stated that (i) “清明 / 重陽節拜祭高峰日子期間，沉香園將實施人流管制，每個龕位每天只能申請一次拜祭，每次最多四位親屬，限時一小時。” and (ii) “清明 / 重陽節拜祭高峰日子期間，沉香園將安排穿梭巴士接載拜祭人士到園拜祭祖先，只有持有乘車許可證的人士方可乘坐，每個龕位最多只能申請四張乘車許可證。” Please specify the same in the main text.</p> <p>14. Paragraph 3.4.3 - It is mentioned that a minimum of 14 staff will be deployed. Whereas Paragraph 5 of the Planning Statement stated that “<i>Extra manpower of about 14 people will be employed for special days</i>”. Please review the consistency, and advise whether “special days” refers to Peak Grave Sweeping Days.</p> <p>15. Figure 3.2 – the drawing indicates that the internal road is not connected to the existing local track to its north. Please review.</p>	<p>Noted. Paragraph 3.4.6 and 3.5.2 have been revised to include the concerned sales agreement.</p> <p>Noted, “Extra” has been replaced by “Minimum” in Paragraph 5 of the Planning Statement for consistency.</p> <p>Besides, please be advised that “special days” refers to Peak Grave Sweeping Days, and the term “special days” in the Planning Statement has also been revised to “Peak Grave Sweeping Days” for consistency.</p> <p>Noted, it is proposed to realign the two concerned local track sections, as well as one additional local track section to its west by the applicant’s own cost to fit in the internal road, as referred to Figure 3.2 of the revised TIA report.</p>

Response to Comments

Item	Comments	Responses
	<p>Transport Department Ref : email Date : From :</p> <p><u>Comments from Commissioner for Transport</u></p> <p><u>Traffic Impact Assessment Report</u></p> <p>i. Noting that the proportion of shuttle bus has been reduced to 20% while the use of public transport (franchised bus) has increased to 40% in this submission. Please clarify the modal split assumptions.</p> <p>ii. To minimize the impact on public transport and the surrounding road network during Peak Grave Sweeping Days. Please consider enhancing the shuttle bus service and implementing mitigation measures to alleviate the additional loads on public transport.</p> <p>iii. For KMB 78K, since it also picks up passengers at Sheung Shui Terminus near Sheung Shui MTR Station, please also estimate how many passengers will take KMB 78K there.</p>	<p>Please be clarified that the modal split assumption is based on the latest transport mode survey conducted during 2025 Ching Ming Festive Period.</p> <p>Please be advised that the shuttle bus and public transport (KMB 78K) proposal are derived from the latest modal split assumption as mentioned in response to comment item (i), hence the utilization efficiency is considered maximised. Nevertheless, should the planning application being approved, the applicant will review the operational occupancy of the shuttle bus and adjust the shuttle bus service subjected to the actual demand.</p> <p>Noted, “Sheung Shui Terminus” has been included in the passengers queuing assessment, as referred to Section 4.11 and Figure 4.10 of the revised TIA report. The result indicates that there are sufficient queuing spaces of the anticipated nos. of passengers with the Proposed Development during 2033 Ching Ming Festive Period.</p> <p>On the other hand, please be advised that as the total hourly passengers of KMB 78K arise from the Proposed Development and the identified critical loading point of KMB 78K will not be affected, conclusion of the public transport assessment described in Section 4.9 of submitted TIA report is still valid and remain unchanged.</p> <p>Nevertheless, as it is assumed that part of them will no longer take KMB 78K at Fanling Station in this round of submission, peak 15-min. pedestrian flow arise from the Proposed Development along the footpath next to the queuing area of KMB 78K (Sha Tau Kok bound) (i.e. Link ID. P13) will be decreased, P13 has been reassessed accordingly, as referred to Section 4.10 and Figure 4.8 of the revised TIA report.</p>

Response to Comments (Cont’d)

Item	Comments	Responses																																																																																																	
	iv. Section 4.9 — For KMB 78K, the max loading point (Sha Tau Kok bound) should be the stop “Green Code” at Sha Tau Kok Road, and the bus stop “Ling Yeuk Tau” is the max loading point for Sheung Shui bound. Please arrange surveys at these two stopping points and revise Table. 4.9.5.	<p>Please be advised that based on our in-house survey, the max. loading point for both bounds of KMB 78K <u>during 2025 Ching Ming Festive period</u> is “Fanling Station” instead of the two bus stops concerned.</p> <p>Please kindly refer to below table regarding the total passengers of KMB 78K during 2025 Ching Ming Festive period at the two bus stops concerned for reference.</p> <p>Bus Occupancy of KMB 78K at Bus Stop “Green Code” and “Lung Yeuk Tau” during 2025 Ching Ming Festive Period</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="732 770 1415 1570"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Hour</th> <th colspan="3">Green Code (Sha Tau Kok Bound)</th> <th colspan="3">Lung Yeuk Tau (Sheung Shui Bound)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>No. of Bus Trips</th> <th>Total Capacity⁽¹⁾</th> <th>Total Passengers⁽²⁾</th> <th>No. of Bus Trips</th> <th>Total Capacity⁽¹⁾</th> <th>Total Passengers⁽²⁾</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0700 – 0800</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>42</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>39</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0800 – 0900</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>56</td> <td>4</td> <td>480</td> <td>86</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0900 – 1000</td> <td>4</td> <td>480</td> <td>109</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>102</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1000 – 1100</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>87</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>131</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1100 – 1200</td> <td>4</td> <td>480</td> <td>117</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>146</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1200 – 1300</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>84</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>95</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1300 – 1400</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>89</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>115</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1400 – 1500</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>61</td> <td>4</td> <td>480</td> <td>164</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1500 – 1600</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>82</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>116</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1600 – 1700</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>60</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>158</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1700 – 1800</td> <td>4</td> <td>480</td> <td>101</td> <td>3</td> <td>360</td> <td>167</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1800 – 1900</td> <td colspan="3"><i>Assuming no visitor will take 78K to the Proposed Development after 6pm as it is closed at 6pm</i></td> <td>4</td> <td>480</td> <td>124</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: 1) Assumed Bus Capacity is 120 passengers per vehicle 2) Larger value of nos. of passengers on bus before stopping and after stopping is adopted</p>	Hour	Green Code (Sha Tau Kok Bound)			Lung Yeuk Tau (Sheung Shui Bound)			No. of Bus Trips	Total Capacity ⁽¹⁾	Total Passengers ⁽²⁾	No. of Bus Trips	Total Capacity ⁽¹⁾	Total Passengers ⁽²⁾	0700 – 0800	3	360	42	3	360	39	0800 – 0900	3	360	56	4	480	86	0900 – 1000	4	480	109	3	360	102	1000 – 1100	3	360	87	3	360	131	1100 – 1200	4	480	117	3	360	146	1200 – 1300	3	360	84	3	360	95	1300 – 1400	3	360	89	3	360	115	1400 – 1500	3	360	61	4	480	164	1500 – 1600	3	360	82	3	360	116	1600 – 1700	3	360	60	3	360	158	1700 – 1800	4	480	101	3	360	167	1800 – 1900	<i>Assuming no visitor will take 78K to the Proposed Development after 6pm as it is closed at 6pm</i>			4	480	124
Hour	Green Code (Sha Tau Kok Bound)			Lung Yeuk Tau (Sheung Shui Bound)																																																																																															
	No. of Bus Trips	Total Capacity ⁽¹⁾	Total Passengers ⁽²⁾	No. of Bus Trips	Total Capacity ⁽¹⁾	Total Passengers ⁽²⁾																																																																																													
0700 – 0800	3	360	42	3	360	39																																																																																													
0800 – 0900	3	360	56	4	480	86																																																																																													
0900 – 1000	4	480	109	3	360	102																																																																																													
1000 – 1100	3	360	87	3	360	131																																																																																													
1100 – 1200	4	480	117	3	360	146																																																																																													
1200 – 1300	3	360	84	3	360	95																																																																																													
1300 – 1400	3	360	89	3	360	115																																																																																													
1400 – 1500	3	360	61	4	480	164																																																																																													
1500 – 1600	3	360	82	3	360	116																																																																																													
1600 – 1700	3	360	60	3	360	158																																																																																													
1700 – 1800	4	480	101	3	360	167																																																																																													
1800 – 1900	<i>Assuming no visitor will take 78K to the Proposed Development after 6pm as it is closed at 6pm</i>			4	480	124																																																																																													

Comments from Transport Department dated 13.1.2026

Comments	Responses
<p>The applicant to provide appropriate traffic management measure for visitors and sufficient shuttle bus service to mitigate the traffic implication (e.g. long queue at KMB 78K bus stop at Sheung Shui and Fanling) generated by the Proposed Development.</p>	<p>Please be advised that the shuttle bus service proposal has been reviewed and revised. Furthermore, with the latest anticipated nos. of shuttle bus and KMB 78K passengers arise from the Proposed Development, the anticipated queuing demand of KMB 78K at both Sheung Shui Terminus and Fanling Station could be fully accommodated by the existing available queuing area, as referred to Ch. 4.11 and Fig. 4.10 of the revised TIA report.</p>
<p>The road and junction improvement works proposed by the applicant in Figure 3.2 and 4.5 should be designed and constructed by the applicant at this own cost and to satisfaction of the Commission of Transport. All traffic improvement measures required for alleviating the traffic impact of the development shall be implemented prior the operation.</p>	<p>Noted.</p>
<p>There will be about 100 passengers queuing for KMB Rt. 78K at Fanling Station Road bus stop. Taking into account the bus stop environment at this location, it's considered that the situation will be too crowded from bus operation point of view.</p>	<p>Please kindly refer to the response to comment item 1.</p>
<p>Please provide photos showing the existing situation of the proposed queuing area (which is estimated to accommodate about 60 waiting passengers) at KMB Rt. 78K bus stop (Sheung Shui bound) at Tong To. In addition, the length of the queuing area is about 26m, pls show how do you calculate the 36m² queuing area and the details about the queuing arrangement.</p>	<p>Please kindly refer to the attached photo for the concerned bus stop, and please kindly note that the latest anticipated queue would be 53 passengers.</p> <p>For its available queuing area, please be advised that with the proposed footpath widening adjacent to the concerned bus stop as illustrated in Fig. 3.2 of the TIA report, it is assumed that whole existing 1.5m wide footpath within the concerned 26m long bus stop layby could be accommodated for queuing. With the consideration of the street furniture along the bus layby area such as structure columns of bus shelter, light pole and rubbish bin, 0.1m dead width is assumed to be deducted such that the remaining queuing area would be $26 \times 1.4 = 36\text{m}^2$.</p>

Photo of KMB Rt. 78K Bus



Comments from Transport Department dated 15.1.2026

Comments	Responses
It is noting that the proposed shuttle bus service is enhanced to mitigate the traffic implication.	-
a. In Paragraph 3.5.6 - The average headway of 7.5mins does not align with Table 3.5.2. Please update;	Noted and updated.
b. Due to the higher demand of shuttle bus service, please provide contingency Plan if the shuttle buses cannot perform boarding and alighting at Po Nga Road layby in order not to block the carriageway for normal traffic;	<p>Temporary boarding and alighting activities of the shuttle bus along Ting Kok Road behind the existing bus stop outside Tai Po Government Office Building as illustrated in Figure 4.7 is proposed as a contingency plan in case the concerned layby is full. One of the two management staff serving near the layby (i.e. Staff No. 14 / 15) would lead the queuing passengers (28 at most) to walk towards Tai Po Government Office Building (walking time approx. 6 mins), while another staff would stay at the layby to assist the remaining passengers (if any).</p> <p>The total temporary stopping time of the shuttle bus at the proposed location outside Tai Po Government Office Building would be approx. 7 mins, as summarised in the timeline plan in Figure 4.7.</p>
c. Figure 3.5 & 4.9 - due to the higher demand of shuttle bus service, the assessment on the adequacy of proposed queuing area at Po Nga Road is required.	Please be advised that queuing area assessment at Po Nga Road has been included already, the results indicate that the available queuing area of 60m ² is sufficient for the anticipated 49 queuing passengers with required queuing area of 12m ² , as referred to Para. 4.11.2, Table 4.11.1 and Fig. 4.10 of the TIA report.
The traffic management measures for visitors and implementation of control measures regarding the nos. of visitors to/from the Proposed Development have not yet been included in TIA report.	The traffic management measures for visitors have been reviewed and further elaborated, as referred to Section 3.4 of the revised TIA report.

Comments	Responses
The traffic management plan, including the road and junction improvement works, shown in Figure 3.2 and Figure 4.5, and traffic management measures proposed by the applicant in TIA report should be submitted at subsequence stage for TD approval.	Noted.

Comments from Transport Department dated 30.1.2026

Comment	Response
<p>Noted that the applicant has provided proper measures to prevent the unauthorized vehicles and visitors from accessing the Proposed Development via 3 nos. of EVA entrances for controlling the no. of visitors. And the contingency plan for boarding/alighting of the proposed shuttle bus is included in Figure 4.7 of 28.1.2026 version of TIA report.</p> <p>We have no further comments to the application provided that the applicant shall provide relevant written confirmation from LandsD to secure LandsD's agreement on incorporating the proposed improvement works in the land lease or from FEHD to ensure the proposed improvement works/measures would be included in the Private Columbarium Licence accordingly.</p>	<p>The TIA report mentioned the following improvement works:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Proposed Access Road (paras. 3.2.2 to 3.2.5); 2. Proposed Priority Junction of Sha Tau Kok Road / Proposed Access Road (para. 3.2.6); 3. Proposed Cautionary Crossing Facilities (para. 3.2.7); 4. Proposed footpath widening adjacent to existing bus stop (Sheung Shui bound) (paras. 3.2.8 to 3.2.10); 5. Proposed Shuttle bus service (paras. 3.5.1 to 3.5.6); 6. Proposed Junction improvement works (para. 4.7.3); and 7. Other improvement works proposed in TIA report. <p>The applicant agrees to include the above-mentioned improvement works in the lease conditions of the land lease and Private Columbarium Licence.</p> <p>We would like to request the Lands Department and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department to provide written confirmation that the above-mentioned improvement works will be incorporated into the lease conditions of the land lease and the Private Columbarium Licence.</p> <p>The applicant undertakes to carry out these improvement works whether or not these improvement works are included in the lease conditions of the land lease or in the Private Columbarium Licence.</p>

Comments from Transport Department dated 26.2.2026

	Comments	Responses
(a)	He has no comments on the application from traffic operation perspective; and	Noted.
(b)	He has no comments on the application from traffic engineering perspective, and the applicant shall provide (i) relevant written confirmation from LandsD to secure LandsD's agreement on incorporating the proposed improvement works in the land lease or from the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) to ensure the proposed improvement works/measures would be included in the Private Columbarium Licence accordingly; and (ii) the confirmation all the improvement works proposed would be carried out by the applicant's at his own cost.	<p>The TIA report mentioned the following improvement works:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Proposed Access Road (paras. 3.2.2 to 3.2.5); 2. Proposed Priority Junction of Sha Tau Kok Road / Proposed Access Road (para. 3.2.6); 3. Proposed Cautionary Crossing Facilities (para. 3.2.7); 4. Proposed footpath widening adjacent to existing bus stop (Sheung Shui bound) (paras. 3.2.8 to 3.2.10); 5. Proposed Shuttle bus service (paras. 3.5.1 to 3.5.6); 6. Proposed Junction improvement works (para. 4.7.3); and 7. Other improvement works proposed in TIA report. <p>The applicant agrees to include the above-mentioned improvement works in the lease conditions of the land lease and Private Columbarium Licence.</p> <p>We would like to request the Lands Department and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department to provide written confirmation that the above-mentioned improvement works will be incorporated into the lease conditions of the land lease and the Private Columbarium Licence.</p>

	Comments	Responses
		<p>The applicant undertakes to carry out these improvement works whether or not these improvement works are included in the lease conditions of the land lease or in the Private Columbarium Licence.</p> <p>The applicant promises that they will liaise with TD, LandsD and FEHD to incorporate the proposed improvement works/measures in the land lease and Private Columbarium Licence if the application is approved by the TPB.</p> <p>We confirm that all the improvement works proposed would be carried out by the applicant's at his own cost.</p>

Comments from Planning Department dated 15.1.2026

	Comments	Responses
10.	Traffic management measures proposed should be included into the TIA. Comments 1 and 2 above is relevant.	Noted. Traffic management measures have been reviewed, further elaborated and included into the TIA, as referred to Section 3.4 of the revised TIA report.
11.	Para 3.2.2 – Please clarify “3 nos. of right-of-way will be further provided...”	Please refer to updated Para 3.2.2 for details.

Comments from Planning Department on TIA report dated 9.2.2026

	Comments	Responses
1.	Please advise the definition of “members”	Please be advised that purchasers of the niches (i.e. the persons who signed the Sales Agreement as indicated in Appendix A of the TIA report) are the members of the columbarium.
2.	Para 3.4.3 to Para 3.4.8 – Please advise whether these measures will be implemented during both normal days and peak grave sweeping days. If not, please specify on which period these measures are applicable, and advise what are the measures to be adopted in other period.	Please be advised that the concerned measures will be implemented during both normal days and peak graves sweeping days.
3.	Para 3.4.3 – While it is stated that only members and their family members are allowed to enter. Please advise whether access to the proposed development will be allowed for friends of the members and niches potential buyers.	<p>Please be advised that the member of each niche could register for up to 4 visitors (including the member himself) each day, who could be either family members or friends, to visit the columbarium.</p> <p>For niche potential buyers, they also have to make a reservation in advance to visit the columbarium on days other than peak grave sweeping days only. During the visit, they would be accompanied by the columbarium staff.</p>
4.	Para 3.5 – Please advise who are eligible for using the shuttle bus service. Comment (3) above is relevant.	Please be advised that only visitors with boarding permits would be allowed to use the shuttle bus service, as referred to Para. 3.5.2 of the TIA report for details.