

**Proposed Rezoning From “AGR” & “GB” To “G/IC” for
a Proposed “Social Welfare Facilities” (Residential Care Homes for The Elderly) (RCHE)
Lot 232 RP, 232 S.A RP, 232 S.A ss. 1 to 14, 232 S.B RP, 232 S.B ss. 1 to 27,
232 S.C to 232 S.E, 233 RP, 233 S.A to 233 S.M, 237 RP, 237 S.A to 237 S.R,
239 RP, 239 S.A to 239 S.G in D.D.23, Tung Tsz, Tai Po, N.T.
S12A Application for Planning Application No. Y/NE-TK/19
Response-to-Comment – TD
(Updated 25 February 2025)**

| Comments | Response |
|---|---|
| <p>1. Comments of the Commissioner for Transport Department as follows:</p> <p><u>Supporting Planning Statement Main Paper</u></p> <p>(i) Para. 2.1.1 - The access road connecting the Site is not managed by TD. Comments from the management and maintenance department shall be obtained.</p> <p>(ii) Para. 2.3 - Comments from BD and FSD on the EVA shall be obtained.</p> <p>(iii) Para. 3.4 - The TIA was prepared by CTA Consultant Limited instead of CKM Asia Limited.</p> <p>(iv) Figure 4 - Please indicate the pedestrian route on the plan. The management and maintenance departments of the village access shall be consulted. Please also see comment (xvi) below.</p> <p><u>Appendix 2 – Traffic Impact Assessment</u></p> <p>(v) Para. 2.4.1 - The provision of parking spaces and loading/unloading spaces shall meet the operation need, including the parking need of their staff and visitors –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - please justify the sufficiency of parking spaces and loading/unloading spaces, including but not limited to making reference to similar developments; - similar to hospitals / clinics, please consider providing loading/unloading spaces. for MGV/HGV as well as ambulance; - there are 40 suites provided within the development where their parking needs | <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Revised.</p> <p>Revised and attached. Refer to Figure 4.</p> <p>Noted and please refer to Table 2.2 of the revised TIA report for similar developments to justify the sufficiency of parking spaces and loading/unloading spaces.</p> <p>Please note that the proposed parking provision has been reference to other existing RCHE, please refer to Section 2.4 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Please be clarified that there are 29 nos. of suites. Please note that the proposed parking provision</p> |

**Proposed Rezoning From “AGR” & “GB” To “G/IC” for
a Proposed “Social Welfare Facilities” (Residential Care Homes for The Elderly) (RCHE)
Lot 232 RP, 232 S.A RP, 232 S.A ss. 1 to 14, 232 S.B RP, 232 S.B ss. 1 to 27,
232 S.C to 232 S.E, 233 RP, 233 S.A to 233 S.M, 237 RP, 237 S.A to 237 S.R,
239 RP, 239 S.A to 239 S.G in D.D.23, Tung Tsz, Tai Po, N.T.
S12A Application for Planning Application No. Y/NE-TK/19
Response-to-Comment – TD
(Updated 25 February 2025)**

| Comments | Response |
|--|---|
| <p>should be reasonably estimated.</p> <p>(vi) Para. 2.4 - Illegal parking were found at Tung Tsz Road and the adjacent village roads. Please explore the possibility to provide suitable number of public parking spaces to address the potential shortfall of parking spaces.</p> <p>(vii) Para. 3&4 - The assessment for road links shall be included.</p> <p>(viii) Para. 4.2.1 - Please also consider other historical traffic data, e.g. Annual Traffic Census (ATC) to determine the growth factor.</p> <p>(ix) Para. 4.3.1 - Please seek PlanD’s confirmation on the list of committed and planned developments.</p> | <p>has been reference to other existing RCHE, please refer to Section 2.4 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Taking into consideration the site constraints of the site, it is revealed that the size of site is very small (~1,500m²). As shown in Figure 2.2, besides the essential space for fulfilling all necessary requirements of E&M and fire regulations (provision of sufficient fire escape staircases), etc., there are various structural columns inside the proposed development, very limited space is left for manoeuvring, parking / loading and unloading of motor vehicles inside the site, not to mention the turnaround space. Turntable has been added for manoeuvring of vehicles to the parking spaces.</p> <p>In addition, the access road between the site and Tung Tsz Road is a single track for two-way traffic. In view of the RCHE nature where emergency vehicles will use the proposed access road, therefore public parking spaces is not proposed at the site.</p> <p>Noted and please refer to Table 3.3 and Table 5.2 of the revised TIA report for the assessment for road links.</p> <p>Please refer to Table 4.1 of the revised TIA report for ATC to determine the growth factor.</p> <p>Please refer to Appendix C of the revised TIA report for the reply from PlanD regarding the list of committed and planned developments for your record.</p> |

**Proposed Rezoning From “AGR” & “GB” To “G/IC” for
a Proposed “Social Welfare Facilities” (Residential Care Homes for The Elderly) (RCHE)
Lot 232 RP, 232 S.A RP, 232 S.A ss. 1 to 14, 232 S.B RP, 232 S.B ss. 1 to 27,
232 S.C to 232 S.E, 233 RP, 233 S.A to 233 S.M, 237 RP, 237 S.A to 237 S.R,
239 RP, 239 S.A to 239 S.G in D.D.23, Tung Tsz, Tai Po, N.T.
S12A Application for Planning Application No. Y/NE-TK/19
Response-to-Comment – TD
(Updated 25 February 2025)**

| Comments | Response |
|--|--|
| <p>(x) Table 4.2 - Population intake for Planning Application Nos. A/TP/672 and A/NE-TK/702 had been commenced at the time of survey, the applicant shall consider the intake progress and justify the adoption of the trips generated and attracted by this development.</p> <p>(xi) Para.4.4 - The Land Sharing Pilot Scheme No. 001 at Lo Fai Road is also undergoing planning application. Please review the assessment accordingly.</p> <p>(xii) Para. 4.6 - We notice that reference was made to the trip generations of the existing Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Shuen Wan Complex for the Elderly –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - it appears that the trip generation was on the low side. Please advise how the trip rates of Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Shen Wan Complex for the Elderly was obtained; - please include one more reference to substantiate the current rates are reasonable. <p>(xiii) Figure 2.1 - The width of run-ins should be kept to the minimum compatible with satisfactory operation of vehicles using the run-in. Please justify the proposed 7.5m wide run-in/out.</p> <p>(xiv) Figure 2.1 - Please indicate the area on two sides of run-in/out and demonstrate the sightline at the run-in/out comply with TPDM requirements.</p> | <p>Please refer to the revised Table 4.3 and the footnotes, and Table 4.4 of the revised TIA report for the revised assumption for population intake for Planning Application Nos. A/TP/672 and A/NE-TK/702.</p> <p>Please note that the assessment for the Land Sharing Pilot Scheme No. 001 at Lo Fai Road has been reviewed, please refer to Section 4.3 and Section 4.4 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Please refer to Table 4.7 of the revised TIA report for the derivation of the trip rates of Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Shuen Wan Complex for the Elderly.</p> <p>Please refer to Table 4.7 of the revised TIA report for additional reference sites to substantiate the adopted rates.</p> <p>Noted and please note that the proposed width of run-ins is ~8m, please refer to Figure 2.2 of the revised TIA report and Figure SP-02 to Figure SP-05 for the revised swept paths.</p> <p>Please refer to Figure 2.3 of the revised TIA report for the proposed run-in/out and its sightline assessment.</p> |

**Proposed Rezoning From “AGR” & “GB” To “G/IC” for
a Proposed “Social Welfare Facilities” (Residential Care Homes for The Elderly) (RCHE)
Lot 232 RP, 232 S.A RP, 232 S.A ss. 1 to 14, 232 S.B RP, 232 S.B ss. 1 to 27,
232 S.C to 232 S.E, 233 RP, 233 S.A to 233 S.M, 237 RP, 237 S.A to 237 S.R,
239 RP, 239 S.A to 239 S.G in D.D.23, Tung Tsz, Tai Po, N.T.
S12A Application for Planning Application No. Y/NE-TK/19
Response-to-Comment – TD
(Updated 25 February 2025)**

| Comments | Response |
|---|--|
| <p>(xv) Figure 4.4 - The increase of traffic flow along the route are not consistent. Please review.</p> <p>(xvi) Others –</p> <p>(a) The applicant shall review if there is a proper pedestrian route from the development to public road, in particular on the part of the village access where there is a lack of separation of pedestrian and the vehicles.</p> <p>(b) We notice that minibus and coach loading / unloading are proposed. Please advise if there are shuttle services and if positive, provide details of the services including but not limited to the routes, assessment on the sufficiency of the loading / unloading provision at the pick-up points etc.</p> | <p>Since the visibility splay for southbound vehicles does not fulfil TPDM requirement of 60m sight distance, it is proposed to add flashing alarm lights as safety measure to alert pedestrians and drivers that vehicle is going out. Please refer to Section 2.3 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Noted and rectified, please refer to Figure 4.16 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Please note that a footpath is proposed between the Site and Tung Tsz Road, please refer to Section 2.3 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Please be advised that shuttle services will be provided, please refer to Section 2.6 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> |

**Proposed Rezoning From “AGR” & “GB” To “G/IC” for
a Proposed “Social Welfare Facilities” (Residential Care Homes for The Elderly) (RCHE)
Lot 232 RP, 232 S.A RP, 232 S.A ss. 1 to 14, 232 S.B RP, 232 S.B ss. 1 to 27,
232 S.C to 232 S.E, 233 RP, 233 S.A to 233 S.M, 237 RP, 237 S.A to 237 S.R,
239 RP, 239 S.A to 239 S.G in D.D.23, Tung Tsz, Tai Po, N.T.
S12A Application for Planning Application No. Y/NE-TK/19
Response-to-Comment – TD
(Updated 24 March 2025)**

| Comments | Response |
|--|--|
| <p>1. Comments of the Commissioner for Transport Department as follows:</p> <p>TD’s comments via PlanD’s email dated 25.2.2025 remain valid.</p> <p><u>Comments on the RtC to SWD’s comments from traffic engineering perspective:</u></p> <p><u>RtC 13</u></p> <p>The provision of parking spaces and loading/unloading spaces shall meet the operation need, including the parking need for their staff and visitors. The operation of the shared-use parking space for mini-bus and emergency vehicles shall be justified.</p> <p><u>Access road to subject site</u></p> <p>The access road connecting the Site is not managed by TD. Comments from the management and maintenance departments shall be obtained. The proposed new access road and footpath shall be designed and constructed by the applicant and the management and maintenance agents shall be identified. TD will not take up the management role of a village access in village area.</p> | <p>Noted.</p> <p>Please note that the proposed parking provision has been revised and made reference to other existing RCHE, and should be sufficient for the daily operation needs of the proposed development, please refer to Section 2.4 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> <p>Noted and please note that the proposed new access road and footpath shall be designed and constructed by the Applicant and the management and maintenance agents shall be Lands Department.</p> |

**Proposed Rezoning From “AGR” & “GB” To “G/IC” for
a Proposed “Social Welfare Facilities” (Residential Care Homes for The Elderly) (RCHE)
Lot 232 RP, 232 S.A RP, 232 S.A ss. 1 to 14, 232 S.B RP, 232 S.B ss. 1 to 27,
232 S.C to 232 S.E, 233 RP, 233 S.A to 233 S.M, 237 RP, 237 S.A to 237 S.R,
239 RP, 239 S.A to 239 S.G in D.D.23, Tung Tsz, Tai Po, N.T.
S12A Application for Planning Application No. Y/NE-TK/19
Response-to-Comment – TD
(Updated 24 March 2025)**

| Comments | Response |
|---|--|
| <p><u>Comments from Transport Operation (NT) Division:</u></p> <p>Please note there is no direct public transportation to the subject site. The public could access to Tung Tsz Road by NT GMB Route Nos. 20B, 20T and Resident’s service NR532, and to Ting Kok Road by NT GMB Route Nos. 20C, 20E, 20R and Bus Route Nos. 73P, 74E, 75K and 275R. The applicant could consider to provide transport services for the staff, residents and the public if necessary subject to the detailed submission by the applicant and the transport service provider.</p> | <p>Noted and please refer to Section 2.6 of the revised TIA report for details.</p> |

3.3 Visual Impact Assessment

A Report of the Visual Impact Assessment of the Development prepared by RLEE Architects Ltd is enclosed as per Appendix 1. It presents the Findings and Surveys conducted and summarized **the Impact to the Visual Aspect created** due to the increased in Plot Ratio and Height.

3.4 Traffic Impact Assessment

A Report of the Traffic Impact Assessment of the Development prepared by **CTA Consultant Limited** is enclosed as per Appendix 2. It presents the Findings and Surveys conducted and summarized that NO adverse Impact to the Traffic Aspect is created due to the increased in Plot Ratio.

3.5 Environmental Impact Assessment

A Report of the Environmental Impact Assessment of the Development prepared by Novox Limited is enclosed as per Appendix 3. It presents the Findings and Surveys conducted and summarized that NO adverse Impact to the Environmental Aspect is created due to the increased in Plot Ratio.

3.6 Landscape Master Planning

A Report of the Landscape Master Planning of the Development prepared by R LEE Architects Limited is enclosed as per Appendix 4. **Vegetation at the front of the development along Access road, Green wall on southeast facade, various planter on flat roof on 1/F and 7/F, and roof garden are proposed.** The Landscaping design could benefit the surroundings by improving the visual, Air Purification and Micro-Climate aspects.