

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

TPB Paper No. 10857

**For Consideration by the
Town Planning Board on 19.8.2022**

**DRAFT NGAU TAU KOK AND KOWLOON BAY
OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K13/31**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K13/31-R1 TO R7
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K13/31-C1 TO C2**

**DRAFT NGAU TAU KOK AND KOWLOON BAY
OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K13/31**

**CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K13/31-R1 TO R7
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K13/31-C1 TO C2**

Subject of Representations (Amendment Items) (Plan H-1)	Representers	Commenters
<p><u>Item A1:</u> Rezoning of a site to the north of Kai Fuk Road Flyover from “Other Specified Uses” (“OU”) annotated “Refuse Transfer Station” (“OU(RTS)”) and an area shown as ‘Road’ to “Commercial (1) (“C(1)”) with stipulation of building height restrictions (BHRs)</p> <p><u>Item A2:</u> Rezoning of a site bounded by Wai Yip Street and Hoi Bun Road from “Government, Institution or Community (1)” (“G/IC(1)”) , “OU(RTS)” and areas shown as ‘Road’ to “C(2)” with stipulation of BHRs, and designating section of Cheung Yip Street within the site as ‘Pedestrian Precinct/Street’</p> <p><u>Items A3 and A4:</u> Rezoning of two parcels of land to the immediate west and southeast of the “C(2)” zone respectively from “G/IC(1)”, “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Business” (“OU(B)”) and areas shown as ‘Road’ to “Open Space” (“O”)</p> <p><u>Items A5 and A6:</u> Rezoning of several strips of land along Hoi Bun Road, Wang Chiu Road, Sheung Yee Road, Wai Yip Street, Shun Yip Street and Cheung Yip Street from “G/IC(1)”, “OU(RTS)” and “OU(B)” to areas shown as ‘Road’ and designating section of Cheung Yip Street outside the “C(2)” zone as ‘Pedestrian Precinct/Street’</p>	<p>Total: 7</p> <p><u>Oppose Item B (4)</u> R1: Kowloon East Branch, The Democratic Party (民主黨九龍東支部) R2: 莫建成 (Former Kwun Tong District Council (KTDC) Vice-chairperson) R3 and R5: Individuals</p> <p><u>Oppose Item B, and Provide Views on Items A1 and A2 / Provide General Views (2)</u> R4 and R6: Individuals</p> <p><u>Provide General Views (1)</u> R7: Individual</p>	<p>Total: 2</p> <p><u>Support R1 (1)</u> C1: Individual</p> <p><u>Oppose Item B (1)</u> C2: Individual (also R6)</p>

Subject of Representations (Amendment Items) (Plan H-1)	Representers	Commenters
<u>Item B:</u> Rezonning of Yip On Factory Estate (YOFE) and the adjacent section of Wang Hoi Road from “OU(B)” and an area shown as ‘Road’ to “Residential (Group A)3” (“R(A)3”) with stipulation of BHR		

Notes: The names of all representers and commenters are attached at **Annex III**. Soft copy of their submissions is sent to the Town Planning Board (the Board) Members via electronic means; and is also available for public inspection at the Board’s website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/plan_making/S_K13_31.html and the Planning Enquiry Counters of the Planning Department (PlanD) in North Point and Sha Tin. A set of hard copy is deposited at the Board’s Secretariat for Members’ inspections.

1. **Introduction**

- 1.1 On 31.12.2021, the draft Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K13/31 (the draft OZP) (**Annex I**) was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). The Schedule of Amendments setting out the amendments incorporated into the draft OZP and its Notes is at **Annex II** and the locations of the amendment items are shown on **Plan H-1**.
- 1.2 During the two-month exhibition period, a total of seven representations were received. On 25.3.2022, the representations were published for three weeks for public comments. Upon expiry of the three-week publication period, two comments were received.
- 1.3 On 8.7.2022, the Board agreed to consider all the representations and comments collectively in one group.
- 1.4 This paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of representations and comments. The list of representers and commenters is at **Annex III**. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the meeting in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

2. **Background**

Items A1 to A6 – Planning and Engineering Study for the Development at Kowloon Bay Action Area (KBAA) – Feasibility Study (the KBAA Study)

- 2.1 To expedite the transformation of Kowloon East (KE) area into another core business district (CBD2), the 2013 Policy Address (PA) announced the development of two action areas in the Kowloon Bay and Kwun Tong Business Areas (KBBA and KTBA). The Energizing Kowloon East Office (EKEO) of Development Bureau (DEVB) commissioned the KBAA Study with the vision to transforming a cluster of government land into a hub primarily for commercial uses providing office, hotel, retail, entertainment, food and beverages, open spaces and public transport facilities,

etc. for KE area. To take forward the Recommended Outline Development Plan (RODP) of the KBAA Study (**Plan H-5a**), relevant portions of KBAA^[1] have been rezoned (**Plan H-1**) including rezoning of Lot 2 to “C(1)” zone (**Item A1**) and Lots 3 and 4 to “C(2)” zone (**Item A2**) for commercial developments subject to maximum gross floor area (GFA), BHRs and minimum provision requirement of public open space within private development (POSPD); rezoning of two parcels of land to the immediate west and southeast of the “C(2)” zone to “O” (**Items A3 and A4**) for public open space (POS) use; minor boundary adjustment (**Item A5**); and indication of the section of Cheung Yip Street to the north of Hoi Bun Road as “Pedestrian Precinct/Street” on the OZP (**Item A6**) for public enjoyment.

Item B – Proposed Public Housing Development at YOFE

- 2.2 In order to meet the housing demand identified under the Long Term Housing Strategy, the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HKHA) has been invited to explore the feasibility of redeveloping its factory estates for public housing use. As announced in 2020 PA and 2021 PA Supplement, the preliminary findings of HKHA’s study indicated redeveloping the four sites including YOFE in Kowloon Bay (**Plan H-1**), Sui Fai Factory Estate in Fo Tan, Wang Cheong Factory Estate in Cheung Sha Wan and Kwai On Factory Estate in Kwai Chung are capable of producing some 4,800 units in 2031 and beyond. The technical feasibility of the four sites for housing development are then concluded. To facilitate the development proposal of HKHA, the YOFE site and the adjacent section of Wang Hoi Road have been rezoned to “R(A)3” with a BHR of 120mPD (**Plan H-1**).

Amendments to the Notes of the OZP

- 2.3 In relation to the above amendment items, the Notes of the OZP have been revised accordingly.
- 2.4 Opportunity is also taken to incorporate other technical amendments into the Notes of OZP for reflecting the latest revision of the Master Schedule of Notes to Statutory Plans.

Amendments to the OZP

- 2.5 On 10.12.2021, the Metro Planning Committee (MPC) of the Board agreed that the proposed amendments were suitable for exhibition under section 5 of the Ordinance. The relevant MPC Paper No. 10/21 is available at the Board’s website^[2] and the Board’s Secretariat for Members’ inspection, while the extract of the minutes of the said MPC meeting is at **Annex IV**. Subsequently, in response to the request of KTDC for the provision of social welfare facilities (SWFs) in the proposed developments at KBAA, MPC agreed on 24.12.2021 to further revise the Notes and Explanatory Statement of the OZP in order to incorporate the GFA exemption clause

^[1] There are Lots 1 to 6 within KBAA (**Plan H-2**), of which Lots 2 to 4 have been rezoned. Lot 1 is proposed for the development of Organic Resources Recovery Centre which is still subject to further feasibility study and is therefore not included in this round of OZP amendment, whereas Lots 5 and 6 for commercial/office developments (i.e. Capital Tower and The Quayside) have already been completed, and their current “OU(B)” zoning is retained.

^[2] The MPC Paper No. 10/21 and its attachments comprising relevant technical assessments are available at the Board’s website at <https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/papers/papers.html>.

for Government, Institution or Community (GIC) facilities as required by the Government under the “C(1)” and “C(2)” zones. The relevant MPC Paper No. Matter Arising (i) is available at the Board’s Secretariat for Members’ inspection, while the extract of the minutes of the said MPC meeting is at **Annex V**. Accordingly, the draft OZP was gazetted on 31.12.2021.

3. Local Consultation

- 3.1 EKEO, Housing Department (HD) and PlanD consulted the KTDC on 9.9.2021 on the RODP of the KBAA, the public housing development at the YOFE and the corresponding proposed amendments to the OZP respectively. Extract minutes of the KTDC meeting is at **Annex VI**. The main concerns of KTDC Members are related to additional traffic and pedestrian flow arising from these two projects, pedestrian connectivity, management matters of KBAA Lot 3 (**Plan H-5a**) for arts, cultural or creative (ACC) uses, adequate provision of retail, SWFs and transport facilities, as well as compensation arrangement for the affected YOFE tenants as set out in the letter from the Secretariat of KTDC to the Board dated 6.10.2021 at **Annex VII** and the Administration’s reply dated 5.11.2021 is at **Annex VIII**.
- 3.2 EKEO and PlanD jointly consulted the Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Development of the Harbourfront Commission (the Task Force) on 28.9.2021 on the said RODP and the proposed amendments to the OZP. While the Task Force did not object to the direction of the proposed KBAA development, they were concerned mainly about the pedestrian connectivity, walking experience from KBAA to the waterfront, introduction of integrated basement car parks with smart parking system connecting various lots in KBAA as well as the provision of retail and dining facilities along the frontage of the public transport interchange at Lot 2. Extract minutes of the Task Force meeting is at **Annex IX** and EKEO’s responses are stated in paragraphs 10.10 to 10.13 of the MPC Paper No. 10/21. Subsequently, EKEO submitted supplementary information to the Task Force regarding the pedestrian network under proposed development, and the Task Force provided further comments on the supplementary information. The letter from the Secretariat of the Task Force to the Board dated 1.3.2022 at **Annex X** summarises the Task Force’s concerns at the meeting on 28.9.2021 and the Task Force’s further comments on EKEO’s supplementary information.

4. The Representation Sites and their Surrounding Areas

The Representation Sites and their Surrounding Areas (Plans H-1 to H-4)

- 4.1 Items A1 (about 2.1 ha) and A2 (about 2.9 ha) Sites lie at the heart of KBAA with Kai Fuk Road Flyover running in the middle. Whilst the two sites are largely vacant, the eastern portion of Item A2 Site is currently occupied by the Highways Department (HyD)’s temporary maintenance depot (**Plans H-2 and H-4**).
- 4.2 Item B Site (about 1.5 ha) is located to the immediate north of KBAA on the other side of Sheung Yee Road. It is currently occupied by YOFE built in 1980 under a vesting order to HKHA. The existing two 10-storey blocks with a building height

of about 40mPD have a total of around 1,400 factory rental units^[3].

- 4.3 To the north of the representation sites are a cluster of commercial/industrial developments mainly zoned “OU(B)” and “C” intermixed with open spaces at Zero Carbon Building, a north-south green spine zoned “O” aligned with Wang Mau Street and other open spaces. To the east and northeast are mainly a group of GIC facilities including former Ngau Tau Kok Police Station, Ngau Tau Kok Ambulance Depot, Construction Industry Council and Vocational Training Council buildings and Water Supplies Department (WSD)’s Kowloon East Regional Building all zoned “G/IC(1)”, as well as Sunshine Kowloon Bay Cargo Centre zoned “OU(B)”. To the south and west is the Kai Tak Development (KTD) falling within the draft Kai Tak OZP No. S/K22/7, where the Kai Tak Hospital Cluster zoned “G/IC”, commercial/industrial developments zoned “C(2)” and the harbourfront promenade zoned “O” are located. For Item B Site, it is located adjacent to a major residential-cum-commercial development (i.e. Telford Gardens and Telford Plaza) to its northeast across Wai Yip Street which is zoned “OU(Mass Transit Railway Depot with Commercial and Residential Development Above)”.

Development Parameters

- 4.4 Items A1 and A2 Sites are zoned “C(1)” and “C(2)” respectively for commercial developments. The key development parameters stipulated on the OZP and its Notes are summarized below, while the notional scheme is shown at **Plan H-5a and H-5b**:

	Item A1 Site	Item A2 Site
Zoning	“C(1)”	“C(2)”
Site Area	About 2.1 ha ^[a]	About 2.9 ha ^[a]
Maximum GFA ^[b]	204,600m ² ^[c]	201,400m ² ^[d]
Maximum BH	35mPD, 120mPD and 150mPD	120mPD and 135mPD
POSPDs	not less than 6,300m ² , of which not less than 4,400m ² to be provided at-grade	not less than 11,800m ² , of which not less than 8,400m ² to be provided at-grade

Notes:

- ^[a] Net site area of about 1.7 ha for both “C(1)” and “C(2)” sites.
- ^[b] The floor space for GIC facilities as required by the Government within the “C(1)” and “C(2)” zones are exempted from GFA calculation.
- ^[c] Includes the GFA of the public transport interchange (subject to detailed design) which is accountable for GFA calculation.

^[3] As stated in paragraph 4.30 of the MPC Paper No. 10/21, as at November 2021, the overall occupancy rate for YOFE was about 87.8%, and around 72% of the tenancies involved manufacturing and repairing of equipment, machinery, electrical appliances, lamps/lights, upholstered furniture, fabricated metal products and casting of metals, products of wood, rattan bamboo, paper, cork, straw, lacquer-wares and plaiting materials.

^[d] Includes the maximum built-over area of 400m² for ACC uses in Lot 3, which will be stated in future land lease as appropriate.

4.5 Item B Site is zoned “R(A)3” for a proposed public housing development with provision of GIC facilities and retail uses at YOFE. In accordance to the 2020 PA, SWFs with floor area not less than 5% of the respective domestic GFA will be provided in the podium floors of the housing site. The key development parameters stipulated on the OZP and its Notes are summarized below, while the notional scheme is shown at **Plan H-6a and H-6d**:

Item B Site	
Zoning	“R(A)3”
Site Area	About 1.5ha
Maximum Plot Ratio (PR)	
Domestic PR	7.5
Total PR	9
Maximum BH	120mPD
Number of Blocks	4
Estimated Number of Units ^[a]	2,200
Estimated Population ^[a]	about 6,000
SWFs ^[b]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 1 Neighbourhood Elderly Centre sub-base - 1 Residential Care Home for the Elderly cum Day Care Units - Home Care Services for Frail Elderly Persons - 1 Office Base of On-site Pre-school Rehabilitation Services - 1 Supported Hostel for Mentally Handicapped Persons - 1 Supported Hostel for Ex-mentally Ill Persons
Other Facilities ^[c]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - One 6-classroom kindergarten - Retail facilities
Parking Facilities	Ancillary car parking spaces and loading/unloading bays to be provided in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG)
Target Completion Year	2031

Notes:

- [a] Based on the indicative scheme prepared by HD and is subject to detailed planning and design. Average flat size of 50m² and persons per flat of 2.8 are assumed for the technical assessments purpose.
- [b] SWFs as listed above have been included for HD's technical assessment. The location, type and actual provision of SWFs will be subject to detailed design by HD in consultation with relevant Government departments including the Social Welfare Department (SWD). Floor space for SWFs, as required by the Government in the subject "R(A)3" zone, is exempted from the PR calculation.
- [c] Subject to detailed design in consultation with relevant Government departments.

Planning Intentions

- 4.6 The "C(1)" and "C(2)" zones under Items A1 and A2 are intended primarily for commercial developments, which may include uses such as office, shop, services, place of entertainment and eating place, functioning as territorial business/financial centre(s) and regional or district commercial/shopping centre(s). These areas are usually major employment nodes.
- 4.7 The "R(A)3" zone under Item B is intended primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building.

5. The Representations

5.1 Subject of Representations

- 5.1.1 There are a total of seven representations, including six (**R1 to R6**) opposing Item B (of which one (**R6**) also providing views on Items A1 and A2, and another one (**R4**) also providing general views) and another one (**R7**) providing general views.
- 5.1.2 The major grounds of representations, and PlanD's responses, in consultation with relevant Government Bureaux/Departments (B/Ds), are summarized in paragraphs 5.2 and 5.3 below.

5.2 Adverse Representations

5.2.1 **Item B for Public Housing Development at YOFE**

Major Ground(s) / Comment(s)	Representations
<i>Land Use</i>	
(1) The redevelopment of YOFE into public housing is considered not in line with the Government's prevailing re-industrialisation policy and "Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending	R2 and R3

<p>2030” (“HK2030+”) strategy. Kowloon Bay is positioned as a major logistics and supporting service centre in Hong Kong, offering many job opportunities. The Government’s proposal would create the domino effect in further reducing the supply of industrial units in the urban area and worsening unemployment.</p>	
<p>(2) The YOFE site is located within Kowloon Bay Business Area (KBBA), where a number of industrial buildings have been redeveloped to Grade A commercial blocks with smart city initiatives. The redevelopment of YOFE site into public housing is considered not in line with the planning intention of the area. There are a number of suitable sites in Kowloon Bay, Kai Tak and Ngau Tau Kok areas for housing development, hence YOFE site should be retained for business development.</p>	<p>R3 to R6</p>
<p>(3) The flat supply brought by redevelopment of YOFE into public housing is relatively small as compared to resumption of brownfield sites. In addition, the completion of proposed public housing development at YOFE site after 10 years cannot promise the housing supply in short run.</p>	<p>R1 and R2</p>
<p>Responses</p>	
<p>(a) In response to (1) to (3):</p> <p>The 2021 PA has reaffirmed the importance to meet Hong Kong people’s pressing housing needs, and pointed out that the core of the housing problem in Hong Kong lies in the shortage of land for housing development. As such, suitable sites in proximity to existing residential clusters in the urban area are reviewed for housing provision.</p> <p>On the other hand, according to the Information, Technology and Industry Bureau, the Government has been actively promoting re-industrialisation which refers to developing advanced manufacturing processes being less land or labour-intensive and based on new technologies and smart production. The focus of promoting re-industrialisation is not to revitalise traditional industries, but to enhance the competitiveness of the manufacturing industry in Hong Kong through innovative technologies. It appears that the industries accommodated in YOFE as at November 2021 (as stated in footnote 3 above) fall outside the scope of re-industrialisation.</p> <p>In terms of the location and land use compatibility, YOFE is situated at the eastern edge of the KBBA with Telford Gardens just on the other side of Wai Yip Street and mature residential districts to the further east (Plans H-1 and H-2). It is well served by MTR Kowloon Bay Station and bus/minibus terminus/stops nearby, with support of local retail facilities in the surroundings.</p>	

Having considered the policy objective of meeting the pressing housing demand, the YOFE site is considered suitable for the public housing development, which is not incompatible with the surrounding context. The technical feasibility and land use compatibility of redeveloping YOFE have been ascertained by relevant technical studies.

In terms of industrial floor space provision, although the redevelopment of YOFE will result in a loss of 48,500m² industrial GFA^[4], two rounds of incentive measures have been introduced by the Government to facilitate wholesale conversion / redevelopment of industrial buildings with higher intensity. Based on the approved planning applications submitted under the “Revitalisation Scheme 2.0” applying for 20% increase of plot ratio (PR) upon redevelopment, there will be additional 0.24 million m² industrial floor spaces generated from the redevelopment proposals in the short-to-medium term in Hong Kong, of which about 30% (i.e. 71,000m²) falls within KE area. Besides, this round of OZP amendment has included the rezoning of relevant portions within KBAA to provide additional commercial/office GFA of about 406,000m² for the KE area.

As for other land supply options, the Government has been adopting a multi-pronged approach to increase land supply. While suitable brownfield sites, amongst other land supply initiatives, could provide land for various developments in the New Territories, the proposed public housing development at the YOFE site could contribute about 2,200 public housing units in the urban area within 10 years (i.e. to be completed by 2031).

Major Ground(s) / Comment(s)	Representations
<i>Impact on Tenants</i>	
(4) The Government does not provide appropriate compensation and/or relocation arrangements before taking forward the redevelopment. The Government disregards the contribution of tenants at YOFE to support the local economy. It is difficult for the tenants at YOFE to identify suitable locations to continue their business. The Government shall not proceed with the redevelopment until it has secured the employment of the affected tenants and workers who make a living for several hundreds of families.	R1 to R3 and R6
(5) The Government had inadequate consultation with the YOFE tenants.	R1 to R3

^[4] Equivalent to total internal floor area (IFA) of about 36,400m², based on a conversion factor of 1m² IFA to 1.3333m² GFA.

Responses

(b) In response to (4):

Clearance, decanting and related land matters are outside the scope of the OZP and hence the ambit of the Board. The concerns of the affected stakeholders on the above should be dealt with separately by the Government in firming up the implementation arrangements.

As advised by HKHA, it is noted that HKHA's factory estates are operated on commercial principles, and are let to tenants on three-year fixed term tenancies. Pursuant to the tenancy agreement, the HKHA has the right to terminate the tenancies by giving three months' notice. Tenants are not legally or contractually entitled to relocation or any form of compensation. To assist tenants' removal, HKHA has provided advance notice to tenants affected by redevelopment/clearance programme, an ex-gratia allowance (EGA), restricted tender opportunities to bid for vacant factory units in HKHA's two remaining factory estates (i.e. Chun Shing and Hoi Tai Factory Estates in Kwai Chung and Tuen Mun respectively), and other cash sums to eligible tenants. The various allowances and cash sums provided by HKHA should be able to provide some assistance to the affected tenants. From the announcement of clearance of the four factory estates on 24.5.2021 up to June 2022, over 90% affected tenants in four factory estates had moved out or submitted notice for surrender of their factory units.

As advised by HKHA, amongst the 920,000m² vacant flatted factory spaces in the private sector as at December 2021, there are units generally comparable to YOFE in terms of building age, floor space, rent, location, etc. These industrial units in the private sector could serve as alternatives for the affected tenants who wish to continue their businesses.

HKHA has arranged and completed the restricted tender exercise in September 2021. A total of 40 sets of units with IFAs ranging from 25m² to 150m² in Chun Shing and Hoi Tai Factory Estates were let to affected tenants of HKHA's factory estates, with 11 tenants were from YOFE.

Local small and medium enterprises (SMEs) could apply for the SME Export Marketing Fund and Dedicated Fund on Branding, Upgrading and Domestic Sales by Trade and Industry Department for financing SME business.

(c) In response to (5):

Pursuant to 2019 PA, HKHA has been conducting studies on the feasibility to redevelop its factory estates for public housing use. HKHA has kept informing the affected tenants of the series of clearance package and other related arrangements since 24.5.2021, such as meeting with the tenants' representatives. HKHA will continue to maintain close liaison with affected tenants and provide timely response to their enquiries and concerns.

Major Ground(s) / Comment(s)	Representations
<i>Provision of Supporting Facilities</i>	
(6) There will be inadequate daily supporting and community facilities (e.g. wet markets, restaurants, medical facilities) to the future residents at YOFE site, resulting in much inconvenience to the residents.	R1 to R3
(7) It is shocking to provide elderly and mentally handicapped facilities at the lower floors of public housing developments in proximity to highways, of which the users may be susceptible to air and noise pollution.	R6
Responses	
<p>(d) In response to (6):</p> <p>The YOFE site is close to the existing residential neighborhood, and there will be adequate supporting and community facilities through existing and planned provisions.</p> <p><u><i>Retail Facilities</i></u></p> <p>In view of the existing retail provision in the vicinity of YOFE site, suitable retail shops such as fresh and frozen food shop, convenience store, eating place will be provided on site according to HKHA's initial plan to address the basic need of future residents.</p> <p>For provision of wet markets, there are one public market (i.e. Ngau Tau Kok Market) and one private market (i.e. Kai Yip Estate Market), in addition to three shopping centres with department stores, including Megabox, Amoy Plaza and Telford Plaza within 1km distance from YOFE (Plan H-7).</p> <p><u><i>GIC Facilities</i></u></p> <p>The existing and planned provision of major GIC facilities (including medical facilities^[5]) in the Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay Planning Scheme Area (Annex XI) are generally adequate to meet the demand of the overall planned population in accordance with the requirements of the HKPSG and concerned B/Ds' assessment, except for hospital beds, residential care homes for the elderly, community care services facilities and child care centres:</p> <p>The Hospital Authority (HA) plans its services on a cluster basis. The Kowloon East Cluster (KEC) provides services for residents in Kwun Tong</p>	

^[5] Provision of clinics/health centres is in surplus in the Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay Planning Scheme Area in accordance with the requirements of the HKPSG. Out of five General Out-patient Clinics (GOPCs) or Community Health Centres (CHCs) in Kwun Tong District, two of them are within close proximity of YOFE site, i.e. Kowloon Bay Health Centre GOPC and Ngau Tau Kok Jockey Club GOPC (**Plan H-7**).

and Sai Kung. There are a number of hospital redevelopment projects planned in KEC. The projected service demand will be catered for in the First and Second Ten-year Hospital Development Plans. In addition, the New Acute Hospital at KTD falling under the Kowloon Central Cluster is located to the south of KBAA (**Plan H-7**). It is planned for completion in 2024 and will provide about 2,400 beds and associated medical and supporting facilities.

Various SWFs including elderly, child care and rehabilitation facilities (about 5% of the total attainable domestic GFA) as requested by SWD have been incorporated in the proposed housing development of YOFE site. These SWFs will be exempted from PR calculation. The Government will continue to adopt a multi-pronged approach with long, medium and short-term strategies to identify suitable sites or premises for the provision of more welfare services, so as to meet the ongoing welfare service needs of the direct.

(e) In response to (7):

It is a common practice and reasonable to provide SWFs on the lower floors of the public housing development to serve the local residents. The concerned SWFs are not subject to insurmountable environmental impacts (including air and noise pollution) with the implementation of suitable mitigation/improvement measures at the detailed design stage.

Major Ground(s) / Comment(s)	Representations
<i>Technical Matters</i>	
(8) The local road network is not able to accommodate additional traffic flow brought by the new population. The YOFE site which is adjacent to busy highways may be subject to air and noise pollutions.	R1 and R6
(9) The YOFE site, which would be surrounded by two sides of buildings between 120mPD and 170mPD, would deprive the future residents of natural light and air ventilation.	R6
(10) The provision of vertical green shrubs in the YOFE public housing site seems not feasible and sensible.	R6
(11) Situated in KBBA, the redevelopment of YOFE into public housing will lead to disturbance at nighttime and hygienic problems in the area.	R5

Responses

(f) In response to (8) and (9):

Traffic Impacts

As revealed from the Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) for YOFE site, all the assessed critical road junctions will be operating with acceptable capacity during the design years^[6], taking into account the traffic improvement measures proposed under other interfacing projects (e.g. KBAA).

Notwithstanding the above, traffic improvement measures at J1 (Kai Cheung Road / Wang Kwong Road) (**Plan H-6e**) and J16 (Hoi Bun Road / Cheung Yip Street) (**Plan H-6f**) to be implemented by Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD), HyD, Transport Department, HD and/or other future project proponent(s) have been proposed to further enhance the adjacent road network. Commissioner for Transport (C for T) has no comment on the TIA which concludes that the proposed development is acceptable from the traffic point of view.

Environmental Impacts

An Environmental Assessment Study (EAS) for YOFE site demonstrated that with the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures (including acoustic windows and fixed windows at affected units), the proposed public housing development is not anticipated to be subject to adverse air quality and noise impacts. Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) has no adverse comment on the EAS and the zoning amendment.

Air Ventilation Impacts

An Air Ventilation Assessment – Expert Evaluation (AVA-EE) has been conducted. With proposed design features (**Plan H-6a**) (including (i) two minimum 15m-wide building separations along the East-West axis according to the Sustainable Building Design Guidelines, i.e. between Blocks C and D & between Blocks A and B; (ii) the building separation of 17m between Blocks A and C as well as between Blocks B and D aligned with Wang Hoi Road; (iii) 5m-wide non-building area abutting the eastern side of Wang Mau Street currently stipulated on the OZP), significant adverse air ventilation impact on the surrounding wind environment is not anticipated when comparing with the OZP-compliant scheme. As such, Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape (CTP/UD&L), PlanD has no adverse comment on the zoning amendment from air ventilation perspective.

^[6] Design years are set at 2031 (i.e. the planned completion year) and 2036 (i.e. 5 years after the planned completion year).

<p><u><i>Natural Lighting Aspect</i></u></p> <p>According to HKHA, all flats in the residential blocks will fulfill the requirement of lighting and ventilation under Building (Planning) Regulations.</p>	
(g)	<p>In response to (10):</p> <p>HKHA undertakes to confirm the feasibility of the proposed vertical greening (Plan H-6c) during the detailed design stage. In this connection, CTP/UD&L, PlanD has no adverse comment on the proposal from landscape planning perspective.</p>
(h)	<p>In response to (11):</p> <p>The proposed public housing development at the YOFE site is not expected to generate disturbance and nuisance to the KBBA in the vicinity. HKHA undertakes that its design and management will comply with relevant legislations and regulations.</p>

5.3 Representations Providing Views

5.3.1 **Items A1 and A2 for Commercial Developments in KBAA**

Major Ground(s) / Comment(s)		Representations
<i>POS</i>		
(1)	The inclusion of proposed POSs at podium deck level within the commercial developments at Lots 2 and 4 as open space provision under the HKPSG is strongly objected since those areas being managed by the developers are not genuine open spaces and their attractiveness will be rather limited.	R6
(2)	Underground developments and elevated walkways are permitted in the POSPDs at KBAA sites. It is strongly objected since the at-grade POSs atop underground developments will simply become paving and landscape area without large trees and the possibility of a mini-ecosystem. No active recreational facilities will likely be provided for office workers.	R6
<i>Pedestrian Connectivity</i>		
(3)	There is no convenient pedestrian linkage (e.g. footbridges) from KBAA sites to various locations, and no effort to improve the at-grade access from the KBAA sites towards the waterfront.	R6

Responses	
(a)	<p>In response to (1) and (2):</p> <p>According to Chapter 4 of HKPSG, countable open space should be accessible to the residential or worker population it is meant to serve, and may include open space both at ground level and on podium. In this regard, the POSs at podium deck of “C(1)” and “C(2)” sites (Plans H-5c and H-5d) are easily accessible and connected to MTR Kowloon Bay Station via a network of planned footbridges (Plan H-5e). In addition, vertical linkages between the elevated open space and ground level (Plan H-5e) would be provided for creation of a quality public realm. While the proposed POSs within KBAA is intended to be designed, constructed, managed and maintained by the future developers, the design of the POSs, with reference to the ‘Public Open Space in Private Developments Design and Management Guidelines’ promulgated by the DEVB, would be vetted by a design review panel formed by relevant B/Ds during the submission of the Landscape Master Plans of which the requirement to be imposed under the lease.</p> <p>There is no particular technical problem identified in providing active recreational facilities in the KBAA POSs through comprehensive planning of the POSs and the proposed commercial development to provide synergy. The underground retail uses and the comprehensive pedestrian linkages, which will be integrated with the proposed POSs at KBAA, will enhance the accessibility, attractiveness and vibrancy of the POSs.</p>
(b)	<p>In response to (3):</p> <p>Convenient all-weather pedestrian routes (mainly via elevated walkways) have been planned to provide access among the MTR Kowloon Bay Station, KBAA and the waterfront (Plan H-5e). These include the proposed walkways from Telford Plaza towards Siu Yip Street (Item 1), Wai Yip Street (Item 2) and Sheung Yee Road (Items 3a and 3b), connections between “C(1)” and “C(2)” sites (Item 4a), and the footbridge over a slip road of the Kwun Tong Bypass connecting with Kai Tak Hospital Cluster (Item 5b). At the same time, equal attention has also been paid to at-grade pedestrian connections. The stretch of Cheung Yip Street between Sheung Yee Road and Hoi Bun Road (Item 4b) would be pedestrianized and landscaped for public passage, thereby enhancing the north-south pedestrian circulation via KBAA. After crossing Hoi Bun Road (Item 5a), the public could continue walking towards the waterfront along Cheung Yip Street next to the New Acute Hospital and Hong Kong Children’s Hospital.</p>

5.3.2 General Views

Major Ground(s) / Comment(s)	Representations
(1) Due to pandemic, the consultation period on the OZP amendments shall be extended.	R4

(2) There is concern on unemployment due to closure of business of the local industry.	R7
Responses	
<p>(a) In response to (1):</p> <p>The statutory and administrative procedures in consulting the public on the zoning amendments have been duly followed. The draft OZP has been exhibited under section 5 of the Ordinance for public inspection for a period of two months. There is no provision under the Ordinance to extend public inspection period.</p>	
<p>(b) In response to (2):</p> <p>Although the redevelopment of YOFE will result in a loss of 48,500m² industrial floor space, as mentioned in paragraph 5.2.1(a) above, additional 71,000m² industrial floor spaces will be generated from the redevelopment proposals within KE area under “Revitalisation Scheme 2.0”, which would bring about employment opportunities to the local community.</p>	

6. The Comments on Representations

Two comments from individuals (**C1 and C2**^[7]) were received. **C1** concurred with **R1** in opposing Item B on the grounds as stated in paragraph 5.2.1(2) above, and the response in paragraph 5.2.1(a) above is relevant. **C2** opposed Item B on the grounds as stated in paragraph 5.2.1(4) above and providing views that COVID-19 has affected the livelihood of many small businesses and terminated thousands of employment opportunities. The response in paragraph 5.2.1(b) is relevant.

7. Departmental Consultation

7.1 The following B/Ds have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs, where appropriate:

- (a) Head of EKEO, DEVB;
- (b) Director of Housing;
- (c) Director of Social Welfare;
- (d) Secretary for Health;
- (e) Director of Health;
- (f) DEP;
- (g) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene;
- (h) Secretary for Innovation, Technology and Industry;
- (i) Director-General of Trade and Industry;
- (j) CTP/Strategic Planning, PlanD;
- (k) CTP/Studies & Research 1, PlanD;

^[7] Commenter C2 is also the representer of R6.

- (l) CTP/Housing and Office Land Supply, PlanD; and
- (m) CTP/UD&L, PlanD.

7.2 The following B/Ds have been consulted and they have no major comment on the representations and comments:

- (a) Secretary for Development;
- (b) Principal Assistant Secretary (Harbour), DEVB;
- (c) Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments), DEVB;
- (d) Secretary for Education;
- (e) District Lands Officer/Kowloon East, Lands Department (LandsD);
- (f) Chief Estate Surveyor/Land Supply, LandsD;
- (g) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department;
- (h) Chief Engineer/Construction, WSD;
- (i) C for T;
- (j) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, HyD;
- (k) Commissioner for Tourism;
- (l) Commissioner of Police;
- (m) Chief Architect/Central Management Division 2, Architectural Services Department;
- (n) Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department;
- (o) Director of Fire Services;
- (p) Director of Marine;
- (q) Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation;
- (r) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services;
- (s) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
- (t) District Officer/Kwun Tong, Home Affairs Department;
- (u) Government Property Administrator; and
- (v) Project Manager/East, CEDD.

8. Planning Department's Views

8.1 Based on the assessments in paragraphs 5.2 and 5.3 above, PlanD does not support R1 to R7 and considers that the OZP should not be amended to meet the representations for the following reasons:

Items A1 and A2

- (a) the proposed public open spaces (POSs) at podium deck level within the Kowloon Bay Action Area (KBAA), which are easily accessible to the public via planned footbridges and vertical linkages, can be included in the calculation towards open space standards according to the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG). The design of the proposed POSs would be vetted by a design review panel formed by relevant bureaux/departments during the submission of the Landscape Master Plans of which the requirement to be imposed under the lease. The underground retail uses and the comprehensive pedestrian linkages, which will be integrated with the proposed POSs, will enhance the accessibility, attractiveness and vibrancy of the POSs (**R6**);

- (b) convenient all-weather pedestrian routes (mainly via elevated walkways) and at-grade pedestrian connections have been planned to provide access among the MTR Kowloon Bay Station, KBAA and the waterfront (**R6**);

Item B

- (c) the Government has been adopting a multi-pronged approach to increase housing land supply in meeting the pressing housing demand. The Yip On Factory Estate (YOFE) site is considered suitable for the public housing development to enhance the housing supply in urban area. The development is not incompatible with the surrounding context. The technical feasibility and land use compatibility of redeveloping YOFE have been ascertained by relevant technical studies (**R1 to R6**);
- (d) the industrial floor spaces in Kowloon East (KE) area are sufficient despite the redevelopment of YOFE for residential use, given the additional floor spaces in KE area from the “Revitalisation Scheme 2.0” in the short-to-medium term, which would bring employment opportunities to the local community (**R1 to R7**);
- (e) retail shops will be suitably provided in the public housing development at YOFE to address the basic need of future residents. In addition, the existing and planned provision of community facilities are generally adequate to meet the demand of the overall planned population in Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay Planning Scheme Area in accordance with the requirements of the HKPSG and concerned bureau/department’s assessment, except for some facilities. As advised by relevant bureaux/departments, the projected service demand of hospital beds in the Kowloon East Cluster will be catered for in the First and Second Ten-year Hospital Development Plans, whereas Social Welfare Department will consider the provision in the planning and development process as appropriate, with a view to meeting the demand and long-term goal (**R1 to R3 and R6**);
- (f) there is no insurmountable traffic, environmental and air ventilation impacts arising from the public housing development with the implementation of suitable mitigation/improvement measures at the detailed design stage (**R1, R5 and R6**);
- (g) clearance, decanting and related land matters are outside the scope of the Outline Zoning Plan and hence the ambit of the Town Planning Board (**R1 to R3 and R6**); and

Others

- (h) the statutory and administrative procedures in consulting the public on the zoning amendments have been duly followed. The draft Outline Zoning Plan has been exhibited under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance) for public inspection for a period of two months. There is no provision under the Ordinance to extend public inspection period (**R4**).

9. Decision Sought

- 9.1 The Board is invited to give consideration to the representations and comments, taking into consideration the points raised in the hearing session, and consider whether to propose/not to propose any amendment to the draft OZP to meet/partially meet the representations.
- 9.2 Should the Board decide that no amendment should be made to the draft OZP to meet the representations, Members are also invited to agree that the draft OZP, together with the Notes and updated Explanatory Statement, are suitable for submission under section 8 of the Ordinance to the Chief Executive in Council for approval.

10. Attachments

Annex I	Draft Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay OZP No. S/K13/31 (reduced size)
Annex II	Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay OZP No. S/K13/30
Annex III	Lists of Representers and Commenters in respect of the Draft Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay OZP No. S/K13/31
Annex IV	Extract of Minutes of MPC Meeting held on 10.12.2021 (English Version Only)
Annex V	Extract of Minutes of MPC Meeting held on 24.12.2021
Annex VI	Extract of Minutes of KTDC Meeting on 9.9.2021 (Chinese Version only)
Annex VII	Letter from the KTDC Secretariat dated 6.10.2021 (Chinese Version only)
Annex VIII	The Administration's Reply to the KTDC Secretariat's Letter dated 5.11.2021 (Chinese Version only)
Annex IX	Extract of Minutes of the Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Meeting held on 28.9.2021 (English Version Only)
Annex X	Letter from the Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront dated 1.3.2022 (English Version only)
Annex XI	Provision of Major GIC Facilities and Open Space in Ngau Tau Kok and Kowloon Bay Planning Scheme Area
Plan H-1	Location Plan of Representation Sites
Plan H-2	Site Plan of Representation Sites
Plan H-3	Aerial Photo of the Representation Sites
Plans H-4a and H-4b	Site Photos of the Representation Sites
Plan H-5a	KBAA – RODP
Plan H-5b	KBAA – Perspective of Indicative Massing
Plan H-5c	KBAA – Master Urban Design Plan
Plan H-5d	KBAA – Landscape Master Plan
Plan H-5e	KBAA – Pedestrian Network Plan
Plan H-6a	YOFE – Indicative Layout Plan

Plan H-6b	YOFE – Indicative Section Plan
Plan H-6c	YOFE – Landscape Plan
Plan H-6d	YOFE – Landscape Section Plan
Plans H-6e and 6f	YOFE – Proposed Junction Improvements Plans
Plan H-7	Major Community, Medical and Retail Facilities in the Vicinity of the Representation Sites

**PLANNING DEPARTMENT
AUGUST 2022**