

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

TPB Paper No. 10618

**For Consideration by
the Town Planning Board on 31.1.2020**

**DRAFT URBAN RENEWAL AUTHORITY KAI TAK ROAD/SA PO ROAD
DEVELOPMENT SCHEME PLAN NO. S/K10/URA1/1
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-1 TO 90
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-C1 TO C10
AND
DRAFT MA TAU KOK OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K10/25
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATION NO. TPB/R/S/K10/25-1
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/25-C1 TO C3**

**DRAFT URBAN RENEWAL AUTHORITY KAI TAK ROAD/SA PO ROAD
DEVELOPMENT SCHEME PLAN NO. S/K10/URA1/1
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-1 TO 90
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-C1 TO C10
AND
DRAFT MA TAU KOK OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K10/25
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATION NO. TPB/R/S/K10/25-1
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K10/25-C1 TO C3**

Subject of Representations/ Representation Site	Representers (No. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-1 to 90)	Commenters (No. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-C1 to C10)
Representations related to the draft Urban Renewal Authority (URA) Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road Development Scheme Plan (DSP) No. S/K10/URA1/1¹		
Generally <u>support</u> the DSP	Sub-total: 20 R1* (1): Ng Po Keung (Kowloon City District Council (KCDC) member) R2* to R4*, R5, R6*, R7 to R8, R9*, R10 to R20 (19): Individuals	Total: 10 <u>Responding to R1 to R90 (1):</u> C1: Urban Renewal Authority <u>Generally support the DSP and providing views (6):</u> C5* (1): Ng Po Keung (KCDC member) (with 194 signatures enclosed)
Generally <u>oppose</u> the DSP	Sub-total: 66 R21 (1): 舊區街坊自主促進組 R71 (1): Gasing Phobsuk (Chairperson of the Thai Migrant Workers' Union) R22 to R70 & R72 to R86 (64): Individuals	C2* to C4*, C6* & C7* (5): Individuals <u>Oppose the DSP (1):</u> C8: Individual <u>Providing views related to the DSP (1):</u> C9: Individual <u>Providing other views (1):</u> C10*: Individual
Providing views	Sub-total: 4 R87 (1):	

¹ For the Representations and Comments in relation to the DSP, they are notated as **R1 to R90**, and **C1 to C10**. For those in relation to the OZP, they are notated as **R1 of OZP**, and **C1 to C3 of OZP**.

Subject of Representations/ Representation Site	Representers (No. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-1 to 90)	Commenters (No. TPB/R/S/K10/URA1/1-C1 to C10)
	<p>基督教愛協團契有限公司 (Christian Oi Hip Fellowship Limited (COHFL))</p> <p>R89 (1): 香港郭汾陽崇德總會有限公司 (Kwok Fan Yeung Virture-Promoting Association, Hong Kong Limited)</p> <p>R88 & R90* (2): Individuals</p>	
Subject of Representation	Representer (No. TPB/R/S/K10/25-1)	Commenters (No. TPB/R/S/K10/25-C1 to C10)
Representation related to the draft Ma Tau Kok Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K10/25		
Providing views	<p>Total: 1</p> <p>R1 of OZP* (1): Individual</p>	<p>Total: 3</p> <p><u>Indicated Support (1):</u> C1 of OZP: Individual</p> <p><u>Generally support the DSP and providing views (1):</u> C2 of OZP* Ng Po Keung (KCDC member) (with 194 signatures enclosed)</p> <p><u>Providing other views (1):</u> C3 of OZP*: Individual</p>

Note: The names of all representers and commenters are attached at **Annexes IIIa to IIIc**. Soft copy of their submissions is sent to Town Planning Board (the Board) Members via electronic means at **Annexes IVa to IVd** (for the Board Members only); and is also available for public inspection at the Board's website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/Website_S_K10_URA1_1_ENG.html and https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/Website_S_K10_25_ENG.html. A full set of hard copy is deposited at the Secretariat of the Board for Members' inspection; and is also available for public inspection at the Planning Enquiry Counters (PECs) of the Planning Department (PlanD) in North Point and Sha Tin.

* The same person submitted Representations/Comments to the DSP and/or Representation/Comments to the OZP (see **Annexes IIIa to IIIc** for details).

1. Introduction

1.1 On 5.7.2019, the draft Urban Renewal Authority (URA) Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road Development Scheme Plan (DSP) No. S/K10/URA1/1 and the draft Ma Tau Kok

Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K10/25 (**Annexes Ia & Ib**) were exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). During the two-month exhibition periods, 90 representations related to the DSP and 1 representation related to the OZP were received. On 4.10.2019, the representations were published for public comments, and in the first three weeks of the publication period, 10 comments related to the DSP and 3 comments related to the OZP were received.

- 1.2 The DSP covers private lots at 31-49 Sa Po Road (odd nos.) and 55-73 Sa Po Road (odd nos.) and 24-82 Kai Tak Road (even nos.), two pieces of government land, a back lane, a portion of Sa Po Road and portion of the surrounding public pavement on the approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/24 (**Plan H-3**). It is formulated based on recommendations for the street block under the Urban Renewal Plan (URP) for Kowloon City as recommended under the District Urban Renewal Forum (DURF) study in 2014². The area covered by the DSP is zoned “Residential (Group A)” (“R(A)”). The draft DSP is in **Annex Ia**.
- 1.3 The amendment to the OZP mainly involves the latest amendments to the Master Schedule of Notes to Statutory Plans (MSN) in relation to the subsuming of ‘Market’ use under ‘Shop and Services’ use endorsed by the Town Planning Board (TPB) on 28.12.2018. The schedule of Amendment to the approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/24 is at **Annex II**. The DSP area excised from the OZP boundary is also indicated on the draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/25 (**Annex Ib**).
- 1.4 On 22.11.2019, the Board decided to consider the representations and comments of the DSP and OZP collectively. This paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of the representations and comments. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the hearing in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

2. **DSP and OZP**

DSP

- 2.1 On 22.2.2019, URA submitted to the Board the draft Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road DSP No. S/K10/URA1/A in accordance with section 25(5) of the URA Ordinance (URAO). The submission comprises the draft DSP with its Notes and Explanatory Statement (ES), a planning report with technical assessments on traffic, environment, visual, air ventilation, drainage, sewerage, geotechnical aspects and social impact assessment (SIA) (Stage 1) report. On 4.4.2019, URA further submitted the SIA (Stage 2) report to the Board. A full set of the planning report including all technical assessments are deposited at the Board’s Secretariat for Members’ inspection and is available on the Board’s website.

² Under URP for Kowloon City, a site at Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road was proposed to be rezoned from “R(A)2” to “Comprehensive Development Area” (“CDA”) for mixed development with commercial, community and residential uses (**Plan H-1**) so as to transform the area to a gateway leading to Kai Tak Development Area (KTDA) with seamless integration with its USS. Following the URP for Kowloon City, the DSP included an entrance plaza connecting with the subway to the USS to serve as a gateway to create a sense of arrival, and there are provision of commercial/community facilities and public vehicle park (PVP) to meet the local demand.

- 2.2 On 14.6.2019, the Board considered the draft DSP. Under section 25(6)(b) of the URAO, the Board deemed the draft DSP together with its Notes and ES as being suitable for publication. On 5.7.2019, the draft DSP was exhibited under section 5 of the Ordinance.
- 2.3 Under the DSP, the “R(A)” zone is intended primarily for high-density residential development with the provision of a sunken plaza and underground public vehicle park (PVP), and it is subject to a maximum domestic and total plot ratio (PR) of 7.5 and 9.0 respectively, and a maximum building height (BH) of 120mPD, or the PR and the height of the existing building, whichever is the greater.

URA’s Notional Scheme

- 2.4 According to URA’s notional scheme (**Drawings H-1a, H-2 & H-3**) for the DSP, the proposed development includes three residential towers over a non-domestic podium comprising retail, Government, institution or community (GIC) facilities, private residential clubhouse and podium garden. A sunken plaza is proposed at the southern edge of the DSP to allow for integration with the existing pavement of Prince Edward Road East and underground connection with the government’s subway that links up with the future underground shopping street (USS) in Kai Tak Development Area (KTDA) (**Plan H-5**). The sunken plaza is proposed to be opened for public use 24 hours daily. A PVP and some floor space for GIC facilities will be provided within the development. A portion of Sa Po Road is included in the DSP and is proposed to be closed. A new private road will be provided within the DSP for public use and diverting traffic from Sa Po Road to Kai Tak Road. The preliminary design drawings are at **Drawings H-1a, H-1b & H-2** and the development parameters are set out in the table below:

Scheme area	6,106m ²
Net site area ⁽ⁱ⁾ (about)	5,352m ²
Maximum GFA ⁽ⁱⁱ⁾	About 48,168m ²
- Domestic	- About 40,140m ²
- Non-domestic	- About 8,028m ²
Maximum PR	9
- Domestic	- 7.5
- Non-domestic	- 1.5
Maximum BH	120mPD
No. of residential towers	3
No. of storeys	38 (about)
- Domestic	30
- Non-domestic	3
- Basement carpark/non-domestic portion connecting to a sunken plaza	5
Estimated population	1,940
No. of flats ⁽ⁱⁱⁱ⁾	810 (about)
GIC facilities	About 800m ² GFA

Parking Facilities - Ancillary parking - Public vehicle parking - Loading/unloading (L/UL) bays	- 120 private car and 14 motor-cycle parking spaces (underground) - 300 private car parking spaces (underground) - 6 heavy goods vehicles (HGV) and 5 light goods vehicles (LGV) (at grade)
Local Open Space	To be provided in accordance with the requirements of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) (i.e. 1m ² per person).
Others	A sunken plaza of 1,000m ²
Notes: (i) Net site area to be adopted for PR calculation, subject to survey and detailed design. (ii) The exact GFA is subject to detailed design and prevailing Schedule 1 of the Building (Planning) Regulations (B(P)R). (iii) Subject to detailed design at project implementation stage.	

OZP

- 2.5 On 14.6.2019, the Board also agreed to the proposed amendments to the approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/24 as highlighted in paragraph 1.3 above. On 5.7.2019, the draft OZP was exhibited under section 5 of the Ordinance (**Plan H-11**).

3. Public Consultation

Administrative Arrangement for Public Consultation on the Draft DSP No. S/K10/25/URA1/A

- 3.1 Under the administrative arrangement to enhance transparency in the processing of draft DSP, the draft DSP (including SIA reports) was made available for public inspection/comment in the PECs of PlanD from March to April 2019. During the inspection periods of the draft DSP and SIA reports, a total of 38 comments were received. The views of the commenters, including a KCDC member, individuals owners/occupiers, associations in and management company/employee of the affected buildings, are summarised in paragraph 3.3 below. These comments were submitted together with the draft DSP for the Board's consideration on 14.6.2019. The relevant TPB Paper No. 10542 and the minutes of the Board meeting are deposited at the Board's Secretariat for Members' inspection. The TPB paper and minutes are also available at the Board's website.

Consultation with the Housing and Infrastructure Committee (HIC) of KCDC

- 3.2 On 21.3.2019, URA consulted the HIC of KCDC on the draft DSP. An extract of the minutes is at **Annex VI**. URA's representatives had responded to members' questions at the meeting and the minutes of the meeting was submitted to the Board

for its consideration on the draft DSP on 14.6.2019.

Comments Received during the Inspection Periods and at HIC of KCDC

3.3 The major comments received during the inspection periods in March to April 2019 and/or the HIC of KCDC held on 21.3.2019 are summarised below:

- (a) The site boundary of the Scheme should be expanded.
- (b) More community facilities (i.e. PVP, community hall, child care centres, activity rooms etc.) within the Scheme area should be provided;
- (c) The number of public car parking spaces should be increased;
- (d) Compensation for affected owners of tenanted properties and tenants should be improved. Support for the affected residents in particular the ethnic minority groups residing in the Scheme area should be enhanced;
- (e) Preservation of unique culture and character in the community should be considered in redevelopment projects;
- (f) The Scheme should include commercial floor space to offer replacement premises to affected business operators;
- (g) Whether construction works of sunken plaza and domestic units will be carried out at the same time, and the connectivity with Kai Tak and other areas should be improved. Escalators or travelators are suggested at the pedestrian subway connecting to Kai Tak for better accessibility; and
- (h) There was doubt on cooperation model between URA and developers.

Circulation to HIC Members after Gazettal

3.4 On 5.7.2019, the draft DSP and the OZP were circulated to HIC members of KCDC, and they were notified of the 2-month public inspection period during which written representation could be submitted for the Board's consideration. One KCDC member of the Lung Shing Constituency submitted a representation (**R1**) and comment (**C5**) on the DSP, and a comment (**C2 of OZP**) on the OZP.

4. The Representations

4.1 Subject of Representations

4.1.1 Among the 90 representations for the DSP, 20 representations (**R1 to R20**) generally supporting the redevelopment plan were submitted by one KCDC member and 19 individuals, while 66 representations (**R21 to R86**)³ generally opposing the redevelopment were submitted by a local concern group (舊區街坊自主促進組), the chairperson of the Thai Migrant Workers' Union and 64 individuals. In addition, 4 representations (**R87 to R90**), submitted by COHFL (基督教愛協團契有限公司), Kwok Fan Yeung Virture-Promoting Association, Hong Kong Limited (香港郭汾陽崇德總會有限公司) and 2 individuals, expressed views.

³ **R67 to R73** attached a submission in standard format written in Thai, and the authorised agent on behalf of **R68 & R70 to R73** clarified that most Thai people do not read Chinese nor English and requested the Board to provide documents in suitable languages. The translation of the representations are attached at **Annex IVe** for Members' reference, and the major opposing grounds are similar to **R21 to R66**.

- 4.1.2 Regarding the one representation for the OZP, **R1 of the OZP** (same submission as **R90**) expressed views. A full set of their submission is available at the Board's website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/Website_S_K10_URA1_1_ENG.html and https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/Website_S_K10_25_ENG.html, and PlanD's PEC in North Point and Sha Tin. A summary of the grounds of representations and comments and PlanD's responses, with inputs from relevant government departments, is attached at **Annexes Va** and **Vb**.

4.2 Major Grounds of Representations

*Supportive (20 representation: **R1** to **R20**)*

- 4.2.1 **R1** indicated support for the redevelopment plan and requested URA to offer assistance, reasonable compensation and rehousing in public rental housing for the affected owners and/or tenants.
- 4.2.2 **R2** to **R20** indicated general support for the redevelopment plan on the grounds that there are too many old and dilapidated buildings, and 'in-fill' buildings without holistic planning, they consider the redevelopment will provide more flats, public car parking spaces, community facilities, public/circulation space, greenery, retail shops and will be a better use of land. Moreover, the connectivity between KTDA and Kowloon City would also be enhanced. In addition, **R15** indicated that the acquisition of properties should be expedited.

*Adverse (65 representations: **R21** to **R85**)*

*Preservation of local character, social network and/or livelihood of residents/business operators (**R21** to **R85**)*

- 4.2.3 **R21** to **R85**, mainly in the form of two standard letters (each in two versions of different languages), opposed the redevelopment on the grounds that it would destroy the local character (e.g. the Kowloon Walled City site and Thai festivals), social network (including the community for Thai or other minority groups), and local business (e.g. car repair workshops and Thai grocery stores) in the area. If the affected families and business operators have to move out of Kowloon City, it would affect local employment and will be hard for them to re-establish their livelihood in other areas.
- 4.2.4 **R66** opined that URA should assess the impacts of the redevelopment on local residents and consult relevant stakeholders; and **R72** indicated that the existing well-established social services in the area will be affected by the redevelopment. **R73** suggested to reserve land in KTDA for relocating the Thai community and providing social facilities for their community.

*Providing Views (2 representations: **R90**; and **R1** of OZP)*

GIC facilities and open space provision in the area and air quality

- 4.2.5 **R90** (same submission as **R1** of OZP) provided views on both the DSP and OZP. The representer expressed concerns mainly relating to the provision of open

space, community facilities in the area and adverse air quality of the proposed sunken plaza which is the entrance to the proposed subway connecting KTDA.

4.3 Representer's Proposals (*1 representation: R1*)

R1 proposed to extend the DSP boundary to include Shek Ku Lung Road and the odd nos. of Kai Tak Road and to provide additional public car parks, community hall/multi-purpose rooms and child-care services in the redevelopment (**Plan H-10**).

4.4 Matters not within the purview of the Board (R21 to R89)

4.4.1 **R21 to R86** generally opposed the redevelopment plan due to the unsatisfactory arrangements related to resettlement/rehousing (e.g. priority in public rental housing and Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) applications, provision of decanting buildings and 'Flat-for-Flat' arrangement), compensation and business re-establishment (e.g. 'Shop-for-Shop' arrangement and offer of concessionary rent at the redevelopment).

4.4.2 **R74 to R86** opposed the redevelopment plan as they considered that there were problems related to the freezing survey, and they requested URA to conduct the freezing survey accurately, and compensation should be based on the freezing survey registration.

4.4.3 **R87 to R89** expressed views that the redevelopment would affect the operation/services of the COHFL⁴ (基督教愛協團契有限公司) (for **R87** and **R88**) and Kwok Fan Yeung Virtue-promoting Association, Hong Kong Limited⁵ (香港郭汾陽崇德總會有限公司) (for **R89**). These two organizations currently operate within the DSP area and COHFL currently provides mental health services. They expressed views that assistance/support on relocation arrangement and reasonable compensation should be offered, in particular the provision of mental health services and related facilities in Kowloon City (**R87**).

4.5 Matters not relating to the DSP and OZP (R74 to R86, R90; R1 of OZP)

4.5.1 **R74 to R85** considered that there was insufficient information and translation of documents in Thai and other languages. They proposed to extend the consultation period for the DSP and provide translation of documents in Thai and other languages.

4.5.2 Regarding the OZP, the representer (**R90; R1 of OZP**) expressed concerns that a welfare complex at a "Government, Institution or Community" ("G/IC") site (i.e. the Lok Sin Tong (LST) site at Lung Kong Road, Kowloon City) originally proposed for providing services for the elderly, children and minority groups and health care will now be used for transitional housing instead (**Plan H-2**).

⁴ COHFL is operating in a premises within the DSP area, on 10/F, Kam Fai Commercial Building, 31-35 Sa Po Road.

⁵ Kwok Fan Yeung Virtue-promoting Association, Hong Kong Limited is operating in a premises within the DSP area, at Units A & B, 8/F, Kam Fai Commercial Building, 31-35 Sa Po Road.

5. COMMENTS ON REPRESENTATIONS

5.1 For the DSP, there are 10 valid comments (**C1** to **C10**). **C1** submitted by URA provided responses to all representations (**R1** to **R90**) which are summarised below:

- (a) scheme boundary: the scheme boundary generally follows URP for Kowloon City. The project seeks to restructure and re-plan the area through redevelopment to rationalize the land uses and to improve the overall living and environmental conditions (e.g through the provision of a sunken plaza for better connectivity, public car park and community facilities). The existing site area of the DSP is considered appropriate to reach the corresponding urban renewal objectives.
- (b) GIC facilities and sunken plaza: about 800m² non-domestic GFA is reserved to meet community needs and a sunken plaza of 1,000m² will be provided for public use.
- (c) PVP: to alleviate the insufficient car parking spaces in the area, an underground PVP of about 300 private car parking spaces is proposed.
- (d) preservation of social network and social characters: URA and the Social Service Team (SST) will continue to provide assistance to the ethnic minority groups. According to the Urban Renewal Strategy (URS), URA will help identify suitable premises in the district of the redevelopment projects to enable affected operators to relocate and continue operation in the same district as far as practicable.
- (e) dissemination of information for the draft DSP; acquisition, compensation and rehousing arrangement; and matters related to SIA and freezing survey: these issues will be addressed by URA under their prevailing policies/mechanisms separately.

5.2 **C2** to **C7** supported the redevelopment plan, requested for expediting urban renewal, provision of community facilities and public car parking spaces, or expressed views that URA should offer reasonable compensation and rehousing arrangement and take care of the minority groups. In addition, **C5** (same submission as **C2 of OZP**)⁶, with 194 signatures enclosed, requested the extension of DSP boundary, that is same as **R1**'s proposal. **C9** submitted by an individual provides comments related to preserving the social network of Thai community. The other comments (**C8** & **C10**) mainly raised concerns on compensation and rehousing and provided views on provision of community facilities respectively.

5.3 For the OZP, there are 3 valid comments (**C1** to **C3 of OZP**). **C1 of OZP** is submitted by an individual indicating support without providing reasons. **C2** and **C3 of OZP** are the same submissions as **C5** and **C10** of the DSP respectively.

⁶ Submitted by the KCDC member of Lung Shing Constituency.

6. **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS AND ASSESSMENTS**

6.1 **The Representation Site and the Surrounding Areas (Plans H-2 to H-9b)**

DSP Area

6.1.1 The DSP area is:

- (a) located in Kowloon City;
- (b) bounded by Sa Po Road to the east, Prince Edward Road East to the south, Kai Tak Road to the west and Carpenter Road to the north, excluding two buildings at 51 Sa Po Road (built in 2006) and 33 Carpenter Road (built in 2014) (**Plan H-9a**); and
- (c) mainly characterised by tenement buildings that are 5-to-10 storeys in height built between 1962 and 1990, and a 12-storey commercial building built in 1981 (**Plan H-9a**). Based on URA's building condition survey carried out in January 2019 (**Drawing H-4**), more than 70% of the buildings are in 'varied' or 'poor' conditions and some have suspected unauthorized structure (UBWs) identified and subdivided units.

6.1.2 The surrounding areas of the DSP have the following characteristics:

- (a) the area is primarily a residential area zoned "R(A)2" dominated with low and medium-rise residential developments with ground floor shops, and sporadically with new high-rise residential developments (**Plans H-9a & H-9b**). Kowloon City is one of the renowned specialty dining area with a variety of authentic restaurants;
- (b) separated from the KTDA by Prince Edward Road East. A subway, to be constructed by the Government, will connect the southern portion of the site to the USS in KTDA with further access to the Mass Transit Railway (MTR) stations (i.e. Sung Wong Toi Station and Kai Tak Station) (**Plans H-4 & H-5**); and
- (c) to the east is Regal Oriental Hotel.

Representation Site on draft OZP

- 6.1.3 The representation on OZP relates to general matters on the provision of open space and community facilities in the area, and a "G/IC" site (Lok Sin Tong site) at Lung Kong Road that is not subject of amendment of the draft OZP (**Plan H-11**). There is no representation related to the proposed amendments to the Notes of the OZP.

6.2 **Planning Intentions**

The planning intention of the "R(A)" zone under the DSP is as follows:

The “R(A)” zone is intended primarily for high-density residential developments with the provision of a sunken plaza and underground PVP. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of a building connecting to the sunken plaza. GIC facilities as required by Government may be exempted from GFA calculation.

6.3 Responses to Grounds of Representations and Comments

Supportive Representations and Comments

- 6.3.1 The views of the supportive representations and comments (**R1 to R20, C2 to C7; C1 of OZP**) are noted.
- 6.3.2 Specific comments related to compensation, rehousing and acquisition (**R1, R15, C3, C5 & C7**), local character, social network, livelihood of affected parties (**C5**) and/or minority groups (**C4**), the responses in the below paragraphs are relevant.

Adverse Representations and Comments

*Preservation of local character, social network and/or livelihood of residents/business operators (**R21 to R85, C5, C9; C2 of OZP**)*

- 6.3.3 The Kowloon City area is pre-dominantly with mixed residential buildings with eating places and shops on lower floors. There are many restaurants and shops, including specialty restaurants serving different country cuisines, mainly concentrated along the streets to the west of Kai Tak Road. URA (**C1**) indicated that according to their freezing survey, 19 households (5% of the total 401 surveyed households), and 6 business operators (8% of the total 75 surveyed business operators) are of Thai background. There are also a few households of other ethnic minority groups. Although only a small portion of the affected households and business operators are Thai community, URA indicated that the SST will continue to provide assistance to the ethnic minority groups to alleviate their concerns.
- 6.3.4 According to the URS, URA will help identify suitable premises in the district of the redevelopment project to enable the affected shop operators to relocate and continue operation in the same district as far as practicable. As an example, the URA Board gave special approval for a development project at Sung Hing Lane/Kwai Heung Street to assist dried seafood selling operators to continue their operations in the Central and Western District to preserve such local character. For the subject DSP, similar arrangements will be considered for the affected shops constituting a recognised local character, if the DSP is approved by the Chief Executive in Council (CE in C). Moreover, a sunken plaza will be provided within the redevelopment for public enjoyment and place-making as well as to nourish and celebrate the local character of the area. URA is advised to carefully take into account preservation of local character in the DSP project.
- 6.3.5 Regarding the suggestion of **R73 & C9** to reserve land in KTDA for relocating and providing social facilities for the Thai community, it should

be noted that there are land reserved for various GIC facilities in KTDA to serve the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, including Kowloon City residents of different ethnic group. As also advised by the Director of Social Welfare (DSW), there are non-government organisations (e.g. LST Lee Yin Yee United Centre for Ethnic Minorities (李賢義裔群社少數族裔支援服務中心)) providing services for ethnic minority groups including the Thai in the Kowloon City area.

Providing Views

GIC facilities and open space provision in the area (R90 & C10; R1 & C3 of OZP)

- 6.3.6 Based on the requirements in HKPSG, as shown in **Annex VII**, the planned provision for various major community facilities in the area is generally sufficient except for secondary school classrooms (-80 classrooms), elderly community care services facilities (-573 subsidised places). For secondary school classrooms, they are assessed on a wider district basis, and there is a surplus provision of about 520 classrooms in Kowloon City District.
- 6.3.7 Regarding the existing shortfall in the provision of elderly community care services facilities and residential care home for the elderly, it should be noted that the population-based planning standards for elderly services and facilities were reinstated in the HKPSG on 28.12.2018. The revised standards reflect the long-term target towards which the provision of elderly services and facilities would be adjusted progressively. Since elderly facilities are premises-based, consideration will be given to include facilities requested by SWD in the planned GIC and residential developments in the area. In fact, requirements for RCHE were incorporated in land sale conditions on various lots in KTDA with a total provision of 1,000 spaces in KTDA to increase the supply within district in the medium term.
- 6.3.8 Under the notional scheme of the DSP, not less than 800m² non-domestic GFA is reserved for community use to meet local needs. In addition, there is provision under the Notes to exempt floor space for GIC facilities (including social welfare facilities that is an always permitted use) required by Government from GFA calculation. URA has been invited to further liaise with SWD and consider including more GIC facilities in the redevelopment at the detailed design stage where feasible.
- 6.3.9 For open space provision, there is a surplus provision of about 4 ha of district open space in Ma Tau Kok area (**Annex VII & Plan H-12**). For local open space, while there is a shortfall (about -6.6 ha) in the area, there is a surplus provision of about 3.4 ha in the wider Kowloon City District. Local open space at 1m² per person in accordance with the HKPSG will be provided within the DSP to meet the demand generated by the residents. In addition, a sunken plaza of 1,000m², connecting the proposed pedestrian subway to KTDA, will be opened for public use (**Plan H-1**). The sunken plaza will allow better connection between the older district of Kowloon

City and KTDA, and it will be a vibrant plaza with hard and soft landscape, event space and place making elements at various levels for public enjoyment.

Air quality of the proposed sunken plaza (R90)

- 6.3.10 **R90** raised concerns on the air quality of the proposed sunken plaza and the proposed subway entrance area connecting to Kai Tak. According to the Environmental Assessment (EA) submitted under the DSP, sufficient buffer distances are provided between air sensitive receivers and roads as required. No sensitive use, fresh air intake or openable windows will fall within the air quality buffer zone which covers part of the sunken plaza and pedestrian subway entrance area. Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) advised that the above design considerations have demonstrated compliance with the relevant buffer distance requirement for vehicular emission under HKPSG and no adverse vehicular emission impacts from nearby roads including Prince Edward Road East to the area concerned is anticipated.

6.4 Responses to Representer's Proposals

Extension of Development Scheme (R1)

- 6.4.1 DURF proposed an URP for Kowloon City in 2014 (**Plan H-1**) after two rounds of extensive public consultation and engagement with local stakeholders. The URP for Kowloon City highlighted that the street block to the east of Kai Tak Road (covering substantial portion of the subject DSP) is at a strategic location as it will be directly connected to KTDA via a subway, and a gateway development comprising a comprehensive commercial/residential development with community facilities to enhance the connection with KTDA is recommended. As the subject DSP boundary is based on the above proposal formulated through local engagement, with refinements to extend the boundary further south to include and restructure Sha Po Road and two amenity areas (**Plan H-3**), it is considered appropriate for taking forward the proposal of DURF that had the support of majority of public views collected in the public engagement.
- 6.4.2 URA indicated that the boundary of the DSP is generally in line with that recommended for the street block under URP for Kowloon City. The project seeks to restructure and re-plan the area through redevelopment to rationalise the land uses and to improve the overall living and environmental conditions. A split-level sunken plaza is proposed in the southern part of the DSP leading to KTDA and its USS. It will allow better connection between the old and new districts. The redevelopment plan also aims at alleviating part of the parking demand in the area and providing appropriate community facilities. In addition, URA will also conduct a Preliminary Project Feasibility Study and work with relevant stakeholders to explore opportunities of urban renewal in the wider district under the planning-led strategy and approach.

Provision of additional carpark (R1)

- 6.4.3 With reference to the Traffic Impact Assessment conducted by URA submitted under the DSP, an underground PVP of about 300 public car parking spaces is proposed to meet the existing shortfall of car parking spaces in the eastern part of Kowloon City. If considered necessary, URA will carry out studies to seek opportunities to enhance the traffic and walking environment of the area through a planning-led and an integrated urban renewal approach, and will share the result with relevant government departments to help further address the insufficient supply of car parking spaces condition in the area. Commissioner for Transport (C for T) has no adverse comment on URA's intention in providing an underground PVP.

Provision of additional GIC facilities (R1)

- 6.4.4 Regarding the provision of GIC facilities, responses in paragraphs 6.3.6 to 6.3.8 are relevant.
- 6.4.5 In addition, a neighbourhood elderly centre⁷ is within 500m radius of the DSP within Kowloon City. Tung Tau Community Centre and Kai Tak Community Hall are located about 200m and 600m from the DSP respectively.

6.5 Matters not within the purview of the Board (R1, R15, R21 to R89, C3, C5, C7, C8; C2 of OZP)

- 6.5.1 Some representations and comments have raised concerns on resettlement/rehousing, compensation arrangements, business re-establishment and the freezing survey. As these issues are outside the ambit of the Ordinance and purview of the Board, they should be addressed by URA under their prevailing policies. URA's prevailing acquisition, compensation and rehousing policy are stated in Appendices 11 and 12 of the Planning Report attached to TPB Paper No. 10542, and considered by the Board on 14.6.2019, and summarised in URA's comment (C1).
- 6.5.2 Regarding **R87's**⁸ proposal to provide mental health and related services in Kowloon City, SWD has subvented a non-governmental organisation (NGO) to operate an Integrated Community Centre for Mental Wellness⁹ (ICCMW) providing one-stop, district-based community mental health support services in Kowloon City. There are also eight subvented vocational rehabilitation units in Kowloon City district (including sheltered workshops, supported employment and integrated vocational rehabilitation services centres) for persons with disabilities, including ex-mentally ill persons, to

⁷ Yan Chai Hospital Ng Wong Yee Man Neighbourhood Elderly Centre is located at 55 Hau Wong Road.

⁸ **R87** is submitted by COHFL, a non-profit making body which targets to serve persons with mental illness and is one of the beneficiaries of SWD's time-limited "Financial Support Scheme for Self-Help Organisations of Persons with Disabilities/ Chronic Illness" from October 2018 to September 2020.

⁹ Vitality Place by The Society of Rehabilitation and Crime Prevention, Hong Kong is located at Hunghom Commercial Centre, 37 Ma Tau Wai Road. The services provided range from early prevention to risk management for ex-mentally ill persons, persons with suspected mental health problems, their families/carers and residents living in Kowloon City District.

facilitate their re-integration into the community.

6.6 Matters not relating to the DSP and OZP (R74 to R85, R90, C4, C10; R1 & C3 of OZP)

- 6.6.1 Noting that there were submissions made in Thai and some residents in the Ma Tau Kok area are of Thai background, simultaneous interpretation service between Cantonese/English and Thai would be provided at this hearing. As the hearing paper was prepared by PlanD in English and Chinese only, a briefing with interpreter to briefly explain the paper to the Thai representers/commenters has been arranged before the meeting. Regarding the remark to extend the publication period for the DSP, there is no provision under the Ordinance for such time extension.
- 6.6.2 **R90 (C10; R1 and C3 of OZP)** raised concern that the proposed welfare complex planned by LST Benevolent Society in Kowloon City (that was subject of OZP amendment in the previous round) will now be used for transitional housing instead. DSW advised that the LST redevelopment for provision of elderly and rehabilitation services including care and attention home for the elderly, nursing home, day care centre for the elderly, early education and training centre, carer support centre, parents resource centre, home care services and medical services, etc. will proceed as planned in the long term. The site is planned to be used for transitional housing during the interim period before the redevelopment commence to allow an optimal use of available land.

7. CONSULTATION

- 7.1 The following government departments have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs, where appropriate:
- (a) District Officer (Kowloon City), Home Affairs Department;
 - (b) DSW;
 - (c) DEP; and
 - (d) C for T.
- 7.2 The following Government bureau/departments have been consulted and they have no major comment on the representations and comments:
- (a) Secretary for Education;
 - (b) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Service;
 - (c) Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department;
 - (d) Project Manager (East), Civil Engineering and Development Department;
 - (e) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department;
 - (f) Director of Fire Services;
 - (g) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, HyD;
 - (h) District Lands Officer/Kowloon East, Lands Department (LandsD);
 - (i) Chief Estate Surveyor/Urban Renewal, LandsD;
 - (j) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
 - (k) Commissioner of Police;

- (l) Director of Health;
- (m) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department; and
- (n) Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, PlanD.

8. **PLANNING DEPARTMENT'S VIEWS**

- 8.1 The view of supportive representations (**R1 (part)** to **R20**) should be noted.
- 8.2 Based on the assessments in paragraph 6 above and for the following reasons, PlanD does not support the other representations **R1 (part)**, **R21** to **R90**; **R1 of OZP** and considers that the DSP and OZP should not be amended to meet the representations:
- (a) the development scheme plan (DSP) will facilitate the redevelopment of the DSP area to provide more housing to meet the acute housing demand, a better living environment with commercial and community facilities, a sunken plaza to connect to Kai Tak Planning Area and underground public vehicle park to address local demand (**R1 (part)**, **R21** to **R90**);
 - (b) the boundary of the DSP is generally in line with the recommendations of the Urban Renewal Plan for Kowloon City recommended under the District Urban Renewal Forum study (**R1 (part)**);
 - (c) the sunken plaza and subway entrance area will not be subject to adverse air quality impacts (**R90**);
 - (d) the provision of community facilities and open space in Ma Tau Kok/Kowloon City district is generally in line with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (**R1 (part)** and **R90**; **R1 of OZP**);
 - (e) the statutory and administrative procedures in consulting the public on the DSP and OZP have been duly followed. The exhibition of the DSP and OZP for public inspection and the provisions for submission of representations and comments form part of the statutory consultation process under the Ordinance (**R74** to **R85**); and
 - (f) implementation issues such as acquisitions, rehousing and compensation are outside the purview of the Board (**R21** to **R89**).
- 8.3 URA should be requested to consider provision of more social welfare facilities as requested by Government departments in the DSP in the detailed design stage as far as possible, and to further consult the relevant stakeholders and community on way to retain the local character, social networks of residents as well as assisting long-time business operators to re-establish themselves in the locality.

9. **DECISION SOUGHT**

- 9.1 Members are invited to give consideration to the representations and comments taking into consideration the points raised in the hearing session, and decide whether

to propose/not to propose any amendment to the draft DSP and draft OZP to meet/partially meet the representations.

- 9.2 Should the Board decide that no amendment should be made to the draft DSP and draft OZP to meet the representations, Members are also invited to agree that the draft DSP and draft OZP, together with their respective Notes and updated Explanatory Statements, are suitable for submission under section 8 of the Ordinance to the CE in C for approval.

10. ATTACHMENTS

Annex Ia	Draft Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road DSP No. S/K10/URA1/1
Annex Ib	Draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/25 (reduced size)
Annex II	Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/24
Annex IIIa to IIIc	Lists of Representers and Commenters in respect of the Draft Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road DSP No. S/K10/URA1/1 and the Draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/25
Annexes IVa to IVe	Submissions of all Representations and Comments (for TPB Members only via electronic means)
Annexes Va & Vb	Summary of Representations and Comments on Representations and Government Departments' Responses
Annex VI	Extract of the Minutes of the HIC Meeting of KCDC held on 21.3.2019 (Chinese Version only)
Annex VII	Provision of Open Space and Major GIC Facilities in Ma Tau Kok OZP Area
	<u>Draft Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road DSP No. S/K10/URA1/1</u>
Drawings H-1a to H-2	Notional Scheme
Drawing H-3	Landscape Proposal
Drawing H-4	Building Conditions
Plan H-1	Urban Renewal Plan for Kowloon City
	<u>Draft Kai Tak Road/Sa Po Road DSP No. S/K10/URA1/1</u>
Plan H-2	Location Plan of Representation Sites
Plan H-3	Site Plan
Plan H-4	Aerial Photo
Plan H-5	Connectivity with KTDA
Plans H-6 to H-8	Site Photos
Plan H-9a	Building Age Plan
Plan H-9b	Building Height Plan
Plan H-10	Indicative Location of R1 's Proposal

Draft Ma Tau Kok OZP No. S/K10/25

Plan H-11

Location Plan of Representation Site

Plan H-12

Open Space and GIC Facilities in Ma Tau Kok and Vicinity Area

PLANNING DEPARTMENT
JANURARY 2020