

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

TPB Paper No. 10335

For Consideration by the
Town Planning Board on 15.9.2017

Draft Sha Tin Outline Zoning Plan No. S/ST/33

Consideration of Representations No. TPB/R/S/ST/33 – R1 to R1667 (R1 to R1667) and
Comments No. TPB/R/S/ST/33 – C1 to C542 (C1 to C542)

DRAFT SHA TIN OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/ST/33
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/ST/33 – R1 to R1667 (R1 to R1667)
and COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/ST/33 – C1 to C542 (C1 to C542)

Subject of Representations/ Representation Site	Representers	Commenters
Amendment Item A: Proposed Sha Tin Cavern Sewage Treatment Works (STCSTW) at A Kung Kok and its supporting facilities	<p><u>Total: 3</u></p> <p><u>Oppose (3)</u></p> <p>R1 (part), R2 (part) and R3: Submitted by a Sha Tin District Council (STDC) Member, Green Sense and an individual</p>	<p><u>Total: 1</u></p> <p><u>Support (1)</u></p> <p>C368(part) without specifying the related representations: Submitted by a STDC Member</p>
Amendment Item B: Proposed Columbarium and Garden of Remembrance at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun	<p><u>Total: 13</u></p> <p><u>Support (1)</u></p> <p>R1 (part): Submitted by a STDC Member</p> <p><u>Oppose (12)</u></p> <p>R4 (part), R5 (part) and R6 to R15: Submitted by a STDC Member and individuals</p>	<p><u>Nil</u></p>
Amendment Item C: Olympic Stables at Sha Tin Race Course (STRC)	<p><u>Total: 734</u></p> <p><u>Support (185)</u></p> <p>R16 to R200: Submitted by New Territories School Heads Association, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), horse racing fans, local residents and individuals</p> <p><u>Oppose (549)</u></p> <p>R1 (part), R2 (part), R201 to R203, R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part),</p>	<p><u>Total: 541</u></p> <p><u>Support (538)</u></p> <p>C1 to C367, C368 (part) and C369 to C538 without specifying the related representation: Submitted by STDC Members, Chairman of Sha Tin Rural Committee, The Hong Kong Jockey Club (HKJC), Sports Federation & Olympic Committee of Hong Kong, Hong Kong Sports Institute (HKSI), Hong Kong Racehorse Owners Association, The Association of Chinese</p>

Subject of Representations/ Representation Site	Representers	Commenters
	<p>R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part): Submitted by STDC Members, Green Sense, Designing Hong Kong, local residents and individuals</p>	<p>Employees of HKJC, HKJC Horse Training Staff Association, Hong Kong Equestrian Federation, Hong Kong Tenpin Bowling Congress Limited, Hong Kong Badminton Association Limited, Hong Kong Table Tennis Association, The Cycling Association of Hong Kong, Riding for the Disabled Association Ltd., New Territories School Heads Association, Association of Principals of Secondary Schools, The Hong Kong Council of the Church of Christ in China, Momentum 107, Hong Kong Micro Movie Institute, apprentice jockeys, club jockeys, trainers, stable assistants, NGOs, horse racing reporters and photographers, horse racing fans, local residents and individuals.</p> <p><u>Oppose (3)</u></p> <p>C539 (part): Submitted by an individual opposing R16 to R200, R201 to R203 and supporting R1 (part), R2 (part), R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part)</p> <p>C540 (part): Submitted by an individual opposing R16 to R200</p> <p>C541 (part): Submitted by an individual opposing Amendment Item C without specifying the related representations.</p>

Subject of Representations/ Representation Site	Representers	Commenters
Amendment Item D: Proposed Public Housing Development at On Muk Street, Shek Mun	<p><u>Total: 932</u></p> <p><u>Oppose (932)</u></p> <p>R1 (part), R2 (part), R4 (part), R5 (part), R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667: Submitted by STDC Members, Green Sense, soccer fans, local residents and individuals</p>	<p><u>Total: 4</u></p> <p><u>Oppose (4)</u></p> <p>C539 (part): Submitted by an individual supporting R1 (part), R2 (part), R4 (part), R5 (part), R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667</p> <p>C540 (part): Submitted by an individual supporting R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667</p> <p>C541 (part): Submitted by an individual opposing Amendment Item D without specifying the related representations.</p> <p>C542: Submitted by Hong Kong Rugby Union supporting R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and other representations opposing Amendment Item D</p>

Note: Full lists of the Representers and Commenters are at **Annexes VI** and **VII**. All the representations and comments are deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection.

1 Introduction

- 1.1 On 13.1.2017, the draft Sha Tin Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/ST/33 (the Plan) (**Annex I**) was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). The Schedule of Amendments setting out the amendments incorporated into the Plan is at **Annex II**. The proposed amendments mainly involve the proposed STCSTW at A Kung Kok and its supporting facilities (Amendment Items A1 to A4), proposed Columbarium and Garden of Remembrance at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun (Amendment Items B1 to

B5), rezoning of Olympic Stables at STRC (Amendment Item C) and proposed public housing development at On Muk Street, Shek Mun (Amendment Item D).

- 1.2 During the two-month exhibition period, a total of 1,666 valid representations¹ were received. On 28.4.2017, the representations were published for public comments. During the three-week exhibition period, a total of 542 valid comments were received. On 21.7.2017, the Town Planning Board (the Board) agreed to consider the representations (R1 to R1667) and comments (C1 to C542) collectively in one group. This Paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of the representations and related comments received. A summary of the representations and comments is attached at **Annex III**. The representation sites are shown in **Plan H-1**. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the meeting in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

2 Background

- 2.1 The 2011-12 Policy Address announced that the Government would explore the use of rock cavern development as an innovative method to expand Hong Kong's land resources. To take forward the initiative, the Drainage Services Department (DSD) commenced a detailed feasibility study (the Study) on the relocation of the Sha Tin Sewage Treatment Works (STSTW) to cavern in May 2012. The Study confirmed that relocating the STSTW to cavern in an area currently zoned "Green Belt" ("GB") at Nui Po Shan of A Kung Kok is feasible. In view of the above, it was proposed to designate the site from "GB" to "Green Belt (1)" ("GB (1)") to facilitate an underground sewage treatment works while preserving the vegetated land above (Amendment Item A1). Two sites at A Kung Kok Street and Mui Tsz Lam Road were proposed to rezone from "GB" to "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Sewage Treatment Works" ("OU(STW)") to accommodate the supporting facilities for the operation of STCSTW (Amendment Items A2 and A3). A small parcel of land located at the junction of A Kung Kok Street and Mui Tsz Lam Road was proposed to rezone from "GB" to "Road" to reflect its current use and site condition (Amendment Item A4).
- 2.2 With a growing and ageing population in Hong Kong, the number of deaths and the corresponding number of cremations have been rising gradually year on year. As such, there is a pressing need for the supply of niches. To meet the demand for public niches, the Government announced in July 2010 that all 18 districts would collectively share the responsibility of developing district-based columbarium facilities. A site at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, which was zoned "Industrial" ("I"), "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Refuse Transfer Station" ("OU(RTS)") and "GB" (Amendment Items B1 to B3) has been identified for the columbarium development in Sha Tin. It was proposed to rezone the Amendment Items B1, B2 and B3 sites from "I", "GB" and "OU(RTS)" respectively to "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Columbarium and Garden of Remembrance" ("OU(Columbarium and Garden of Remembrance)") to facilitate the columbarium and garden of remembrance development. A strip of land along the eastern fringe of the Sha Tin Refuse Transfer Station (RTS) and a narrow strip of vegetated man-made slope located at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun were proposed to

¹ There are a total of 1,666 valid representations after discounting one invalid representation (i.e. R1668) and one disregarded representation (i.e. R526).

rezone from “I” to “OU(RTS)” and “GB” respectively to better reflect its current uses and site condition (Amendment Items B4 and B5).

- 2.3 The Olympic Stables located at the southwest of STRC was originally used by HKSI and was later used as the venue for 2008 Olympic and Paralympic Equestrian Events. After the completion of the Equestrian Events, the HKJC proposed to retain the site for stables, training facilities for jockeys and horses, horse swimming pool and ancillary facilities to preserve the legacy of co-hosting the Olympic event and to support local horse racing development. In view that redevelopment of HKSI has substantially increased the total gross floor area to accommodate additional facilities to meet the future needs of the elite sports training, the site is no longer required for HKSI’s future development. The site has been operated and managed by the HKJC since the end of the 2008 Olympic Equestrian Events to support horse racing activities. It was zoned “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”) (Amendment Item C). It was proposed to adjust the zoning boundary of “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Race Course” (“OU(Race Course)”) to include the Olympic Stables to better reflect the current use and function of the site.
- 2.4 It was stated in the 2013 Policy Address that the Government would adopt a multi-pronged approach to identify suitable land to meet housing and other needs. In this regard, the Government had identified some 150 potential housing sites, including sites zoned “Open Space” (“O”) and “G/IC” without implementation programme, for public housing development. One of the sites is at On Muk Street in Shek Mun (Amendment Item D) which was zoned “O”. In view of the above, it was proposed to rezone the Amendment Item D site from “O” to “Residential (Group A) 6” (“R(A)6”) subject to a maximum gross floor area of 26,240m² and a maximum building height of 110mPD.

3 Local Consultation

- 3.1 During the Stage 3 Public Engagement for the Relocation of STSTW to Caverns, DSD has consulted Health and Environment Committee (HEC) of STDC on March 2016 regarding the results and recommendations of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and the latest progress of the project.
- 3.2 Food and Health Bureau (FHB) and Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) consulted the HEC of STDC on 12.5.2016 regarding the proposed columbarium and garden of remembrance development in Shek Mun (Amendment Item B) and the initial recommendations of the Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) for the provision of about 40,000 niches at the proposed site. The HEC gave support to the proposed columbarium and garden of remembrance development.
- 3.3 Prior to the submission of the proposed amendments to the approved Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/32 for consideration by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (RNTPC) of the Board, the Development and Housing Committee (DHC) of STDC was consulted on 3.11.2016. The minutes of the meeting are attached at **Annex VIII**.

- 3.4 DHC Members generally supported the proposed STCSTW, the proposed columbarium and garden of remembrance development and the rezoning of the Olympic Stables site (Amendment Items A to C). However, there were concerns on the possible adverse air and noise impacts during the construction stage of STCSTW, future use of the existing STSTW site after relocation and the traffic impact of the columbarium development. There were also suggestions that HKJC should provide more sports and community facilities and the Government should compensate the loss of the “G/IC” site due to the rezoning of Olympic Stables.
- 3.5 DHC Members in general did not support the proposed public housing development at On Muk Street, Shek Mun (Amendment Item D). They were concerned that existing transport infrastructures and community facilities were insufficient to support additional housing development. They also commented that the proposal was not compatible with the waterfront character in Sha Tin. Some DHC Members raised concerns on the implementation of open space and other community facilities and urged the Government to implement the planned facilities before proposing more housing developments in Sha Tin.
- 3.6 Details of the consultation and DHC Members’ views were included in the RNTPC paper No. 3/16 for proposed amendments to the approved Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/32 and considered by RNTPC on 23.12.2016. Upon gazetting of the draft Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/33 on 13.1.2017, Planning Department (PlanD) informed STDC on 13.1.2017 that the draft OZP incorporating the proposed amendments had been published for public inspection until 13.3.2017. During the exhibition periods, 11 STDC Members have submitted their representations and comments which are incorporated in paragraphs 4 and 5 below.

4 The Representations

- 4.1 There are a total of 1,666 valid representations and they are related to the following Amendment Items:

Amendment Item A

- 4.2 A total of three representations were submitted by a STDC Member (Mr. YUNG Ming-chau, Michael) (**R1 part**), Green Sense (**R2 (part)**) and an individual (**R3**). All representers oppose to Amendment Item A.

Grounds of Representations

- 4.3 The main grounds of the adverse representations are summarized below:

Environmental and Ecological Impacts

- (a) Concerns have been raised on the air and water pollution, noise, ecology and water gathering ground (WGG), delivery and use of explosives, and other environmental impacts caused by the proposed STCSTW.

Tree Preservation

- (b) The “GB” site is a landscape buffer and the proposed amendment is not supported from a tree preservation point of view.

Construction and Maintenance Cost, and Waste Generation

- (c) The relocation of STSTW to cavern and the future maintenance cost would be very high. Huge amount of waste created would increase the burden to landfills.

Provision of GIC Facilities in the STCSTW

- (d) Opportunities have not been taken to address the shortage of community facilities in the area.

Future Use of the Ex-STSTW Site and Ma Liu Shui (MLS) Reclamation Site

- (e) The future development at the ex-STSTW site would adversely affect the local traffic and community facilities. The planning for relocation of STSTW and MLS site should be considered by the Board in one go.

Proposal from the Representer

Provision of Community Facilities in STCSTW

- 4.4 One representer (**R1 (part)**) proposed that community facilities should be provided in the administration building of STCSTW for community use.

Amendment Item B

- 4.5 Among the total 13 representations, one representation (**R1 (part)**) was submitted by a STDC Member (Mr. YUNG Ming-chau, Michael) supporting Amendment Item B. The remaining 12 representations are adverse representations submitted by a STDC Member (Ms. WONG Ping-fan, Iris) (**R4 (part)**) and individuals (**R5 (part) and R6 to R15**).

Grounds of Representations

- 4.6 While **R1 (part)** supports in principle the amendment item, he provides the following comments:
- (a) Traffic management measures should be formulated to minimize adverse impacts on local traffic.
 - (b) Microclimate study should be conducted to ensure a comfortable environment.
 - (c) The feasibility of relocating the refuse transfer station to cavern should be studied.

- 4.7 For the adverse representations, the main grounds of the representations are summarized below:

Compatibility with Surrounding Uses

- (a) The proposed development is incompatible with the surrounding uses, and is in proximity to public housing developments and schools, which will be contrary to the Chinese tradition.

Traffic and Transport Issues

- (b) The proposed columbarium would overload the traffic in the area and there is no parking provided. Traffic management measures should be formulated and a new road from Siu Lek Yuen Road to the proposed columbarium development site should be considered.
- (c) The technical feasibility of the proposed pedestrian underpass for access from On Muk Street to the proposed columbarium site should be ascertained prior to the planning of columbarium facilities. The entrance of the proposed pedestrian underpass should be located away from the schools.
- (d) During the grave sweeping period, the large pedestrian flow and hawkers will cause safety concerns to nearby students and local residents.

Air Pollution

- (e) The proposed development should be smoke-free to minimize air pollution and adverse impact to the nearby residents and students.

Boundary of Refuse Transfer Station

- (f) If the RTS is expanded, the number of garbage trucks would increase and the traffic and nuisance problems would worsen.

Proposal from the Representer

Retain the Site for Construction Industry Training Ground

- 4.8 One representer (**R5**) proposed that the representation site is suitable for Construction Industry Training Ground.

Amendment Item C

- 4.9 Among the total 734 representations, 185 representations (**R16 to R200**), which were submitted by Sha Tin Sports Association Limited (**R16**), New Territories School Heads Association (**R17**), Hong Kong Women Development Association Limited (**R18**), horse racing fans, local residents and individuals, support Amendment Item C.

- 4.10 The remaining 549 representations (**R1 (part), R2 (part), R201 to R203, R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part)**), in which 543 were submitted in standard forms, are adverse representations submitted by two STDC Members (Mr. YUNG Ming-chau, Michael and Ms. PONG Scarlett Oi-lan) (**R1 (part) and R203**), Green Sense (**R2 (part)**), the Incorporated Owners of Jubilee Garden (**R201**), the Owners' Corporation of the Palazzo (**R202**), Designing Hong Kong Limited (**R205**), local residents and individuals.

Grounds of Representations

- 4.11 The 185 representations support the amendment item mainly on the following grounds:
- (a) the proposal will enable better land utilization, replace the aging facilities in STRC and address the congestion problem of the stables, which help to train jockeys and horses, and to create job opportunities;
 - (b) the amendment will facilitate the improvements of Penfold Park by HKJC and to provide more equestrianism, recreational and sports facilities in Sha Tin District;
 - (c) the site is more preferable to be used by race course facilities instead of walled buildings, which could enable better air ventilation in the whole district;
 - (d) the subject site, which is located next to STRC, is only accessible via STRC;
 - (e) HKJC has stated that the subject site would only be used for horse training instead of private recreational club; and
 - (f) the proposal would support horse racing development and enhance the standard of horse racing and the competitiveness of Hong Kong. The tax revenues from horse racing activities could be contributed to charitable organizations.
- 4.12 The main grounds of the 549 adverse representations are summarized below:

Justification for Expansion and Rezoning

- (a) HKJC has already purchased a 150ha land in Conghua of Guangdong for horse training centre development. Hence, there is no justification for HKJC to use the subject site for its operation.
- (b) The site will be privatized by HKJC after rezoning, which implies a loss of "G/IC" land for public facilities.

- (c) There is no strong justification for departure from the planning intention of the original “G/IC” zone.

Scope of Always Permitted Uses

- (d) The public would not be able to provide comments on the HKJC’s expansion proposal to the Board in future as ‘Race Course’ and ‘Private Club’ uses are always permitted within “OU(Race Course)” zone.
- (e) The definition of ‘Race Course’ use under Column 1 is too broad and planning permission is not required for facilities that are ancillary to ‘Race Course’ use. The ‘Race Course’ use should be sub-divided to other sub-uses (i.e. stable and horse training) for better development control.

Public Consultation

- (f) There is a lack of public consultation and study on the feasibility for alternative uses.

Justification for Renewing the Land Lease of the STRC for a Further 50 Years

- (g) A 50-year land tenure was granted to STRC leading to queries of transfer of benefits. The Board members should declare their interests with HKJC and associated organizations and consider withdrawing from the meeting.

Proposals from the Representers

- 4.13 The representers have put forward the following proposals in relation to the representation site:

Return the Site to HKSI

- (a) The site should be returned to HKSI for elite sports training. **(R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part))**

Retain the Site for Open Space, GIC and Other Uses

- (b) The site should be retained for other uses which may be beneficial to the community including sports and recreational uses, sports training or leisure facilities, hospital and medical uses, public open space, community facilities and public rental housing use. **(R1 (part), R2 (part), R3 (part), R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part))**

Column 1 and 2 Uses of “OU(Race Course)” Zone and Classification of Uses

- (c) Only stables and horse training uses should be classified as always permitted uses within the “OU(Race Course)” zone. **(R201 to R203, R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part))**
- (d) ‘Private Club’ should be incorporated as a Column 2 use in the “OU(Race Course)” zone or to formulate a more specific classification for uses in race course or to impose relevant restrictions on new developments under the Remarks. **(R201 to R203)**

Amendment Item D

- 4.14 A total of 932 representations (i.e. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R4 (part), R5 (part), R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667**), in which 794 were submitted in standard forms, are adverse representations submitted by STDC Members (Mr. YUNG Ming-chau, Michael and Ms. WONG Ping-fan, Iris) **(R1 (part) and R4 (part))**, Green Sense **(R2 (part))**, 撐場大聯盟 **(R852)**, soccer fans, local residents and individuals.

Grounds of Representations

- 4.15 The main grounds of the adverse representations are summarized below:

Traffic and Transport Issues

- (a) The problem of illegal parking has been worsening in Shek Mun area. The parking provisions for Light Goods Vehicles (LGVs) in Shek Mun cannot meet the demand and the requirement under Hong Kong Planning Standard and Guidelines (HKPSG).
- (b) The proposed development will generate additional pedestrian and traffic flow, and adversely affect the traffic conditions in Shek Mun. The increase in residential population will induce additional passenger loading to the Ma On Shan Rail. The TIA only assessed its individual impacts and no traffic improvement measure has been proposed.

Environmental and Visual Impacts

- (c) The noise and glare nuisances from Kitchee Centre would adversely affect the future residents of the proposed development.
- (d) During the construction stage of the proposed development, the noise and air pollution will affect the football players in Kitchee Centre and the nearby residents.

- (e) The proposed development could not achieve a stepped building height profile. The landscape of Shing Mun River will be adversely affected by the proposed development.

Use of Brownfield Sites

- (f) The Government should have a long term housing development strategy and consider using brownfield sites and golf courses for residential development.

Compatibility with Surrounding Land Uses

- (g) Infill residential development in the industrial/commercial area will affect the quality of life of future residents.

Open Spaces Provision in Sha Tin

- (h) Residents in Shek Mun would not be able to use the planned open space and recreational facilities. The 20m open space along the riverside cannot compensate the loss of open space.

Provision of Retail and GIC Facilities

- (i) Prior to any new development, the Government should increase the provision of community, recreational and transport facilities (i.e. new road, sports centre, library, school, clinic and open space) to meet the demand of existing residents in Shek Mun and Sha Tin. The future population growth of Sha Tin should also be controlled.

Contribution to Housing Supply

- (j) The provision of 560 flats only is not cost effective and could not help resolve housing problem.

Football and Sports Development in Hong Kong

- (k) It is not cost effective and environmentally friendly to demolish the one-year old Kitchee Centre. There is a shortage of sports facilities and Kitchee Club has no funding to rebuild a new centre. The proposal will affect football development in Hong Kong.

Public Consultation

- (l) The public consultation is inadequate during the rezoning process.

Proposals from the Representers

- 4.16 The representers have put forward the following proposals in relation to the representation site:

The site to be retained as “Open Space” or rezoned to “G/IC” or “GB”

- (a) The site should be retained as “Open Space” or rezoned to “Government, Institution or Community” and implemented as early as possible. Sports, cultural and recreational facilities should be provided. The Kitchee Centre should be expanded to support Hong Kong football development. **(R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part) and R749 to R1667)**
 - (b) The site should be developed as a green belt of low ecological value. **(R1666)**
- 4.17 A summary of grounds of representations/representers’ proposals and PlanD’s responses to the representations is attached at **Annex III**. The representations are attached at **Annex IV**.

5 The Comment on Representations

- 5.1 Among the 542 valid comments received, some are related to more than one amendment items, and there are 541 comments (i.e. **C1 to C367, C368 (part), C369 to C538, C539 (part), C540 (part) and C541 (part)**) related to Amendment Item C; four comments (i.e. **C539 (part), C540 (part), C541 (part) and C542**) related to Amendment Item D; and one comment (i.e. **C368 (part)**) related to Amendment Item A. There is no comment related to Amendment Item B. A summary of the comments on representations and PlanD’s responses is at **Annex III**. The comments are attached in **Annex V** and summarized below.

Amendment Item A

- 5.2 While **C368 (part)** submitted by a STDC Member (Ms. WONG Ping-fan, Iris) supports in principle the Amendment Item A, she provides the following comments:
- (a) The RTS in Sha Tin should be considered relocating to cavern.
 - (b) Relevant department should set up a ‘Community Liaison Committee’ to enhance the communication and interaction with community and stakeholders.
 - (c) The local residents in Sha Tin should be consulted on the future use of the ex-STSTW site.

Amendment Item B

- 5.3 There is no comment on representations against Amendment Item B.

Amendment Item C

- 5.4 Among the total 541 comments, 538 comments (**C1 to C367, C368 (part), C369 to C538, C539 (part), C540 (part) and C541 (part)**) support the Amendment Item C which were submitted by HKJC (**C1**), Sports Federation & Olympic Committee of Hong Kong (**C2**), Hong Kong Tenpin Bowling Congress Limited (**C3**), Hong Kong Table Tennis Association (**C4**), Hong Kong Badminton Association Limited (**C5**), Hong Kong Racehorse Owners Association (**C6 to C20**), Momentum 107 (**C21**), Environmental Association (**C22**), Hong Kong Micro Movie Institute (**C23**), 力行社有限公司 (**C24**), 馬鞍家悠站 (**C25**), STDC Members (Ms. WONG Ping-fan, Iris (**C368 (Part)**), Ms. TUNG Kin-lei (**C369**), Mr. CHIU Man-leong (**C370**), Mr. LI Sai-wing (**C371**), Mr. WONG Fu-sang, Tiger (**C372**), Mr. LEUNG Ka-fai, Victor (**C373**), Ms. LAM Chung-yan (**C374**), Mr. SIU Hin-hong (**C499**) and Mr LEE Chi-Wing, Alvin (**C500**)), Chairman of Sha Tin Rural Committee (**C375**), HKSI (**C376**), Shatin Women's Association Limited (**C377**), AFS Intercultural Exchanges Limited (**C378**), Association of Principals of Secondary Schools, The Hong Kong Council of the Church of Christ in China (**C379**), New Territories School Heads Association (**C381**), 廣康歡樂協會 (**C382**), 馬鞍山民康促進會 (**C383**), Greeners Action (**C384**), The Association of Chinese Employees of HKJC (**C480**), HKJC Horse Training Staff Association (**C481**), The Cycling Association of Hong Kong, China Limited (**C501**), Hong Kong Equestrian Federation (**C502**), Riding for the Disabled Association Ltd (**C503**), apprentice jockeys, club jockeys, trainers, stable assistants, horse racing reporters and photographers, horse racing fans, local residents and individuals.
- 5.5 The remaining three comments (**C539 (part), C540 (part) and C541 (part)**) submitted by individuals opposing to Amendment Item C mainly on grounds similar to representations as mentioned in paragraph 4.11 above.

Grounds of Comments

- 5.6 While the supporting comments on Amendment Item C (**C1 to C367, C368 (part) and C369 to C538**) are mainly on grounds similar to the representations as mentioned in paragraph 4 above, some representers provide the following additional comments:
- (a) Majority of the active racehorses population are residing in Sha Tin and the original stable complex in STRC cannot meet the demand of the current horse population. The Olympic Stable is an inseparable part of racing operation in Sha Tin as it provides alternative accommodation, training and supporting facilities for racehorses. (**C1**)
 - (b) Sha Tin is the core venue for HKJC's racing operations with the majority of the active racehorse population residing in Sha Tin. The Conghua Training Centre will play a complementary role in providing pre-training,

rehabilitation and extended spelling (rest and recuperation) facilities for horses. (C1)

- (c) HKJC pledged to the STDC in Nov 2016 on the need for local consultation on major developments concerning STRC. All community initiatives proposed by the HKJC will be taken forward in close consultation with district stakeholders. (C1)
- (d) The Sports Federation & Olympic Committee of Hong Kong and HKSI support the continued use of the Olympic Stables site by HKJC. The amendment does not impede or detract from elite training facilities at HKSI Fo Tan venue. (C2 and C376)
- (e) DHC of the STDC has been consulted in Nov 2016 on the proposed amendment. There was a majority support for the continued use of the Olympic Stables site by HKJC. (C368 (part), C369 to C374, C499 and C500)

Amendment Item D

- 5.7 A total of four comments (i.e. C539 (part), C540 (part), C541 (part) and C542) were submitted by Hong Kong Rugby Union (C542) and individuals. All commenters oppose to Amendment Item D mainly on grounds similar to the representations as mentioned in paragraph 4.15 above.

6 Planning Considerations and Assessments

- 6.1 The Representation Sites and the Surrounding Areas (Plans H-1a to H-1b, H-2a to H-2c, Plans H-3a to H-3c, and H-4a to H-4i)

Amendment Item A

- 6.1.1 The Amendment Item A1 site, covering a land area of about 23.45 ha, is located at the underground area of a “GB” zone at A Kung Kok. The Amendment Item A2 site, covering a land area of about 2.72 ha, is located at A Kung Kok Street and Mui Tsz Lam Road. Part of the site is currently occupied by Evangelical Lutheran Church of Hong Kong Recreation Camp and Training Centre under short term tenancy (STT). The Amendment Item A3 site, covering a land area of about 0.31 ha, is a vegetated man-made slope located at Mui Tsz Lam Road opposite to Chevalier Garden. The Amendment Item A4 site, covering a land area of about 0.11 ha, is a small parcel of land located at the junction of A Kung Kok Street and Mui Tsz Lam Road currently being used as road.
- 6.1.2 Residential developments and GIC facilities namely the Chevalier Garden, Tai Shui Hang Village, Ma On Shan Tsung Tsin Secondary School and Hay Nien Primary School are located to the north of the representation sites across the Mui Tsz Lam Road and a nullah. To the immediate southwest of the representation sites is the Ah Kuk Kok Fishermen Village. To the northwest of the representation sites across A

Kuk Kok Street and Ma On Sha Road is the Vehicle Detention Centre operated by Custom and Excise Department.

Amendment Item B

- 6.1.3 The Amendment Item B1, B2 and B3 sites, covering a land area of about 2.28 ha, 0.23 ha and 0.18 ha respectively, are bounded by a vegetated man-made slope zoned “GB” to the north, east and south, the Sha Tin Refuse Transfer Station zoned “OU(RTS)” to the west and the Tate’s Cairn Highway to the northwest. The sites are currently occupied by the Construction Industry Council Training Academy Shatin Training Ground under STT. The Amendment Item B4 site, covering a land area of about 0.26 ha, is a strip of land located along the eastern fringe of the “OU(RTS)” site which is currently being used as a vehicular access for the Sha Tin RTS. The Amendment Item B5 site, covering a land area of about 0.23 ha, is a narrow strip of vegetated man-made slope located at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun.
- 6.1.4 Residential development and GIC facilities, namely the Shek Mun Estate, Wong Kam Fai Secondary and Primary School, and International Christian School, are located at about 0.3km to the west of the representation sites across Tate’s Cairn Highway. To the further west of the representation sites are the Shek Mun MTR Station and Shek Mun Business Area.

Amendment Item C

- 6.1.5 The Amendment Item C site, covering a land area of about 4.76 ha, is the Olympic Stables currently managed and operated by the HKJC. The representation site is bounded by HKSI to the west, the STRC to the immediate north and east, and the Shing Mun River to the south. The representation site is accessible only via roads within the racecourse.

Amendment Item D

- 6.1.6 The Amendment Item D site, covering a land area of about 0.43 ha, is situated along the Siu Lek Yuen Nullah and located in proximity to the Shek Mun Business Area to the north and Shek Mun MTR Station to the northeast. To the immediate east of the representation site is the Kitchee Centre. To the south of the representation site is reserved for the development of riverfront promenade. Open spaces and residential development namely the On Muk Street Garden, On King Street Park and Ravana Garden are located to the immediate northwest and further northwest of the representation site.

6.2 Planning Intentions

- 6.2.1 The “GB” zone is primarily for defining the limits of urban and sub-urban development areas by natural features and to contain urban sprawl as well as to provide passive recreational outlets. There is a general presumption against development within this zone.

- 6.2.2 The “OU(STW)” zone is primarily to provide/reserve land for Sewage Treatment Works use.
- 6.2.3 The “OU(Columbarium and Garden of Remembrance)” zone is primarily to provide/reserve land for Columbarium and Garden of Remembrance use.
- 6.2.4 The “OU(RTS)” zone is primarily to provide/reserve land for Refuse Transfer Station use.
- 6.2.5 The “I” zone is intended primarily for general industrial uses to ensure an adequate supply of industrial floor space to meet demand from production-oriented industries. Information technology and telecommunications industries and office related to industrial use are also always permitted in this zone.
- 6.2.6 The “OU(Race Course)” zone is intended primarily to provide/reserve land for race course and its ancillary uses, and provision of outdoor open-air public space for active and/or passive recreational uses serving the needs of the local residents as well as the general public.
- 6.2.7 The “G/IC” zone is intended primarily for the provision of Government, institution or community facilities serving the needs of local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.
- 6.2.8 The “R(A)6” zone is intended primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building. Developments within the “R(A)6” zone are subject to a maximum GFA of 26,240m² and a maximum building height of 110 mPD.
- 6.2.9 The “O” zone is intended primarily for the provision of outdoor open-air public space for active and/or passive recreational uses serving the needs of local residents as well as the general public.

6.3 Responses to Grounds of Representations and Proposals

Amendment Item A

Adverse Representations

Environmental and Ecological Impacts

- 6.3.1 Impacts on noise, air and water quality, ecology, hazard to life and other potential environmental impacts had been assessed in accordance with the Environment Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO). The EIA

conducted by DSD concluded that, with the implementation of the proposed mitigation measures during the construction and operation phases, the proposed STCSTW would be environmentally acceptable and comply with the requirements of the EIAO and Technical Memorandum on EIAO (EIAO – TM). The EIA has been approved by Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) on 28.11.2016.

Tree Preservation

- 6.3.2 A tree survey was carried as part of the approved EIA. According to the EIA Report, arising from construction of the proposed STCSTW, a permanent loss of woodland of about 0.65 ha is envisaged and will be mitigated by compensatory planting of approximately 0.92 ha of native species. All temporarily affected loss of woodland will be reinstated. Approximately 638 nos. of existing trees, which are generally of medium form and fair to poor amenity value, will be removed on slopes of Nui Po Shan during construction of the proposed STCSTW. Approximately 140 nos. of heavy standard trees will be compensated upon completion of the construction works and approximately 10,000 nos. of tree whips will be compensated on the woodland mix planting areas on new slopes and the reinstatement planting areas.

Construction and Maintenance Cost, and Waste Generation

- 6.3.3 The Feasibility Study of the STCSTW affirmed that relocating the STSTW to caverns is financially viable. Rocks produced during excavation would be deposited at the designated construction and demolition facilities, and will be recycled for construction works in future. The dewatered sludge generated at the operation and maintenance phase would be disposed to the proposed Sludge Treatment Facilities (i.e. T-Park) for further processing and conversion to renewable energy.

Provision of GIC Facilities in STCSTW

- 6.3.4 The district and local open space, and other GIC facilities are generally sufficient to meet the needs in accordance with the HKPSG. The table showing the provision of open space and major G/IC facilities in the Sha Tin OZP is attached at **Annex IX**. In any event, the representers' views have been conveyed to DSD for consideration. DSD will also further consult the public and relevant stakeholders on the design of the administration building.

Future Use of the Ex-STSTW Site and MLS Reclamation Site

- 6.3.5 As stated in the 2017 Policy Address, a planning and engineering study will be jointly conducted by PlanD and Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) to further explore the land uses and required infrastructure of the ex-STSTW site and MLS reclamation site. Relevant stakeholders will be consulted in the course of the study.

Representer's Proposal

Provision of Community Facilities in the STCSTW

- 6.3.6 In regard to the proposal on provision of community facilities in the administration building of STCSTW, the response in paragraph 6.3.4 is relevant.

Amendment Item B

Supportive Representation

- 6.3.7 The supportive views on Amendment Item B are noted.

Adverse Representations

Compatibility with Surrounding Uses

- 6.3.8 The proposed columbarium is located at least 200m away from the closest school and housing estate. Most importantly, the proposed columbarium is separated from those developments by the Tate's Cairn Highway which serves as an effective visual barrier. Aesthetic architectural design with landscape and greening features will be provided at the proposed columbarium and garden of remembrance to blend in with the natural environment and to minimize the negative visual impact.

Traffic and Transport Issues

- 6.3.9 Existing and new developments have been taken into account in the TIA conducted by FHB/FEHD in 2016. The TIA concluded that the resultant impacts of the proposed columbarium are acceptable with suitable traffic mitigation measures including partial closure of the carriageway at On Hing Lane, provision of special bus services operating between MTR Shek Mun Station and the proposed columbarium site during Ching Ming and Chung Yeung Festivals, and provision of new pedestrian underpass for access from On Muk Street to the proposed columbarium site. Furthermore, visitors are encouraged to make use of public transport services.
- 6.3.10 The preliminary scheme of the proposed pedestrian underpass is included in the TIA conducted by FHB/FEHD. An engineering feasibility study will be carried out for the proposed pedestrian subway to assess the technical aspects and draw up the finalised scheme to tie in with operation of the columbarium. STDC and relevant stakeholders will be consulted on the project.
- 6.3.11 During the grave sweeping period, appropriate special traffic arrangement including partial road closure on On Hing Lane and provision of bus services between MTR Shen Mun Station and the proposed columbarium site will be implemented by TD and the Hong

Kong Police Force (HKPF) to ensure pedestrian safety on these specific days. FEHD would also step up enforcement action if illegal hawking activity is detected therein.

Air Pollution

- 6.3.12 According to FHB, the proposed columbarium is a pilot project for a totally smoke-free columbarium to assess public acceptance for complete restriction on the burning of paper offerings and joss sticks in the columbarium. No burning of offerings and joss sticks would be allowed in the columbarium premises, including the niche floors and communal areas. Appropriate smoke-free management measures will be implemented at the operation stage.

Boundary of Refuse Transfer Station

- 6.3.13 Amendment Items B3 and B4 are intended to reflect the actual boundary of the current RTS. According to EPD/CEDD, there is no plan to expand the existing RTS at this stage.

Representer's Proposal

Retain the Site for Construction Industry Training Ground

- 6.3.14 The Construction Industry Council (CIC) Training Ground will be reprovisioned elsewhere and the site will no longer be required for CIC's future development. The site at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, which is screened by a vegetated man-made slope to the north, east and south, the Sha Tin RTS to the west and the Tate's Cairn Highway to the northwest and is accessible via railway network, is considered suitable for the columbarium development in Sha Tin.

Amendment Item C

Supportive Representation

- 6.3.15 The supportive views on Amendment Item C are noted.

Adverse Representations

Justification for Expansion and Rezoning

- 6.3.16 According to the HKJC, majority of the active racehorses population are residing in Sha Tin and the original stable complex in STRC cannot meet the demand of the current horse population. The Olympic Stable is an inseparable part of racing operation in Sha Tin as it provides accommodation, training and supporting facilities for racehorses. HKJC's development in Conghua District, Guangdong Province, aims to provide additional facilities which cannot be accommodated in the STRC (e.g. pre-training facilities, uphill gallop, spelling and

rehabilitation facilities). These facilities could not and would not replace the functions of the stables and training facilities currently available in the STRC for jockeys and horses. In other words, the core stables and training operations will stay at the STRC and the development in Conghua District only serves to complement the training facilities in the STRC.

- 6.3.17 The Olympic Stable site was originally part of the venue of the HKSI and was later used for the 2008 Olympic and Paralympic Equestrian Events. After the equestrian events, HKJC requested to retain the site for the provision of stables, training arenas and facilities for jockeys and horses, and an equine swimming pool and ancillary facilities. The Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) considered that with the substantial increase in the gross floor area and the availability of additional facilities upon redevelopment, HKSI would be able to meet its future needs in elite sports training despite a reduction in its land area. At the same time, it was considered that the STRC indeed required additional land to cope with its needs after its operation for more than 30 years since its opening in 1978. Hence, with the policy support of the HAB, the site was let to the HKJC under a STT for existing use since January 2009.
- 6.3.18 The proposed amendment, with the policy support from HAB, is to reflect the current use of the site to preserve the legacy of co-hosting the Olympic event, and to support local horse racing development. The HKJC confirms that the Olympic Stables site will continue to be used for stables and horse training purposes. Furthermore, the Notes of the OZP for the STRC has been updated to provide a clear planning intention for the land use and a set of uses which are permitted as of right or may be permitted on application to the Board. In particular, 'Place of Recreation, Sports or Culture' has been included as a Column 2 use to allow flexibility for HKJC to provide communal sports and recreational facilities within STRC to better serve the local community through the planning application system.

Scope of Always Permitted Uses

- 6.3.19 The objective of the OZP is to indicate the broad land-use zones for Sha Tin. Since the beginning of the operation of STRC, including its clubhouse and other ancillary facilities, the STRC has been zoned "OU(Race Course)" zone. 'Race Course' and 'Private Club' uses listed under Column 1 are to reflect the existing race course and clubhouse facilities at the STRC. In practice, the use and development of the STRC are subject to the Master Layout Plans (MLPs) stipulated under the lease. The MLPs set out the distribution and details of land uses within the STRC including the location, use, area, height of the buildings. HKJC cannot alter the uses of land or buildings as set out in the MLPs except with the consent of the Director of Lands. If HKJC applies to alter the MLPs, the Lands Department (LandsD) will handle the application according to the established procedures, including consultation with relevant bureaux/departments, and may impose additional terms and conditions if consent is given. Furthermore, HKJC has pledged to

conduct local consultation on major developments concerning the STRC.

Public Consultation

- 6.3.20 In processing the proposed amendment, PlanD has followed the established statutory and non-statutory procedures to solicit public views including District Council consultation. The DHC of STDC has been consulted on 3.11.2016 regarding the proposed amendments to the OZP. The draft OZP was exhibited on 13.1.2017 under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance) for public inspection for a period of two months till 13.3.2017.

Justification for Renewing the Land Lease of the STRC for a Further 50 Years

- 6.3.21 The STRC has all along been planned for horse racing and related purposes with the main objective of providing the public with facilities to enjoy horse racing. Having regard to the unique nature of the STRC, with the policy support of the HAB, the Government approved the grant of a 50-year special purpose lease to HKJC to continue the existing use of the site for horse racing and related purposes so as to facilitate the long-term planning and development of horse racing and community facilities in the STRC. Subject to the approval of the OZP amendment by Chief Executive in Council (CE in C), the LandsD will process HKJC's application for inclusion of the Olympic Stable site in the lease of the STRC in accordance with established procedures. If approved, the Lands Department will execute the relevant lease documents with HKJC.
- 6.3.22 There is already an existing mechanism for the Board members to declare interests in any matter under consideration by the Board. The guidelines for declaration of interest as set out in the "Town Planning Board Procedure and Practice" will be followed.

Representers' Proposals

Return the Site to HKSI

- 6.3.23 According to HAB, since the redevelopment of HKSI has substantially increased the total gross floor area to accommodate additional facilities to meet the future needs of the elite sports training, the site is no longer required for HKSI's future development. As stated in comment No. C376, HKSI has no in principle objection to the continued use of the Olympic Stables site by HKJC for horse training purpose.

Retain the Site for Open Space, GIC and Other Uses

- 6.3.24 The district and local open space and a range of GIC facilities including sports centre, hospital beds are generally sufficient to meet the needs in accordance with HKPSG. There is no request from the Government departments for other GIC use of the site and the HKSI no longer needs the site for elite sports training. In view that the Olympic Stable site is an

inseparable part of racing operation in Sha Tin, with the policy support of the HAB, the site is considered suitable to retain its current stable use to support the operation of STRC.

Column 1 and 2 Uses of “OU(Race Course)” Zone and Classification of Uses

- 6.3.25 In response to the proposal on Column 1 and 2 uses of “OU(Race Course)” Zone and Classification of Uses and incorporating ‘Private Club’ as a Column 2 use in “OU(Race Course)” zone, the responses in paragraph 6.3.19 is relevant.

Amendment Item D

Adverse Representations

Traffic and Transport Issues

- 6.3.26 The provision of car parking space in the proposed development is sufficient to meet the needs in accordance with the HKPSG. Parking survey for goods vehicles in the Shek Mun area has been carried out by Housing Department (HD) and the result revealed that there are sufficient parking capacities in the Shek Mun area. The HKPF will step up enforcement actions to combat the problem of illegal parking in Shek Mun if necessary.
- 6.3.27 Existing and new developments have been taken into account in the TIA conducted by HD. Based on the findings of the TIA report, the scale of the proposed public housing development is small and will not generate adverse traffic impact on the surrounding road network. Improvement measures for junctions with marginal capacity have been proposed. C for T has no in principle objection to the proposed public housing development from a traffic engineering perspective.

Environmental and Visual Impacts

- 6.3.28 According to HD, the proposed public housing development is set back about 20m from its eastern boundary to allow buffer distance with Kitchee Centre. Furthermore, most flats are oriented towards the Shing Mun River or the adjacent On Muk Street Garden to minimize the effect of light and noise generated from Kitchee Centre. The proposed public housing development will be guided by a planning brief as stated in the Explanatory Statement of the OZP. An Environmental Assessment Study (EAS) will be conducted by HD at the detailed design stage.
- 6.3.29 There are appropriate legislations (i.e. Noise Control Ordinance and Air Pollution Control Ordinance) to control noise emission and air pollution of construction works. Contractors are required to comply with the relevant requirements to minimize environmental impact during the construction stage.

- 6.3.30 The visual appraisal (VA) conducted by HD indicates that for the vantage points at both sides of Shing Mun River where there are heavy pedestrian or visitor flow, the visual impact would be insignificant. The proposed development at a maximum building height of 110mPD coheres with the building height profile of the adjacent Shek Mun Estate Phase 2 (about 110-140mPD) and respects the building heights of City One Shatin (about 82-108mPD) located to the southwest of the Site across the Siu Lek Yuen Nullah. It is also compatible with the adjacent industrial-office buildings, i.e. Ever Gain Building (No. 3) (about 93mPD) and Ever Gain Centre (about 112mPD). Mitigation measures including setback from the waterfront promenade, semi-basement carpark and truncated built form are proposed to minimize the visual impact of the proposed development.

Use of Brownfield Sites

- 6.3.31 The Government has formulated the Long Term Housing Strategy in order to gradually avert the current supply-demand imbalance, so as to build more public rental housing units and to ensure the rational use of existing land resources, to provide more subsidized sale flats and to stabilize the residential property market through steady land supply and appropriate demand-side management measures. Meanwhile, the Government has also adopted a multi-pronged approach to release land resources, which included the development of brownfield sites, to address the pressing needs for housing and other development. In addition, with a view to facilitating Government's formulation of appropriate policies and measures for tackling brownfield sites in a holistic manner, the Study on Existing Profile and Operations of Brownfield Sites in the New Territories has commenced in April 2017 and is expected for completion in 2018.

Compatibility with Surrounding Land Uses

- 6.3.32 The site is located adjacent to On Muk Street Garden and close to other residential developments in Shek Mun (i.e. Shek Mun Estate Phase 2 and Ravana Garden). The site is also well-served by public transport services and located in proximity to the Shek Mun Business Area (SMBA), which is under transformation from a traditional industrial area to a mixed-use precinct with a mixture of new non-polluting business uses including office, retail, eating place and other commercial uses. In view of the above, the site is considered suitable for residential development in harmony with the surrounding open space, residential and non-polluting business uses.
- 6.3.33 The proposed public housing development would have about 12m building setback from On Muk Street to its north to allow buffer distance with adjacent industrial building. Adverse chimney emission and noise impacts on the subject site are not anticipated. An EAS will be conducted at the detailed design stage. Other relevant technical assessments including TIA, VA and AVA conducted have concluded

that the proposal is acceptable on traffic engineering, visual and air ventilation aspects.

Open Spaces Provision in Sha Tin

- 6.3.34 The proposed development would not have adverse impact on the open space provision within the area covered by the OZP. There is a surplus of planned district and local open space of 17.96 ha and 58.78 ha respectively in the Sha Tin Planning Area in accordance with the HKPSG. There are number of open spaces provided in Shek Mun area i.e. On King Street Park, Shek Mun Playground, On Muk Street Garden and riverfront promenade adjoining Shek Mun Estate Phase 2. Besides, a 20m-wide public waterfront promenade to the southwest of the public housing development site has been retained as open space for public enjoyment. The waterfront promenade will be implemented to tie in with the completion of the housing development.

Provision of Retail and GIC Facilities

- 6.3.35 The provision of GIC facilities in Sha Tin Planning Area is generally sufficient to meet the needs in accordance with the HKPSG. There are various shopping and dining facilities at the adjacent On Lai Street and On Kwan Street in the SMBA. New retail and social welfare facilities including wet market, residential care home for elderly, child care centre and social security field unit are under construction in the Shek Mun Estate Phase 2 nearby to serve the neighborhood.

Contribution to Housing Supply

- 6.3.36 The proposed public housing development is targeted for completion in 2021/22 and will provide a total of about 560 units. The proposed development is on relatively flat, readily formed land without extensive site formation works. The construction cost is expected to be comparable to other developments of similar scale.

Football and Sports Development in Hong Kong

- 6.3.37 The Kitchee Centre site is not included in the Amendment Item D. Rezoning of the land occupied by the Kitchee Centre is postponed until the relocation arrangement for the Kitchee Centre is settled.

Public Consultation

- 6.3.38 In processing the proposed amendment, PlanD has followed the established statutory and non-statutory procedures to solicit public views including District Council consultation. The DHC of STDC has been consulted on 3.11.2016 regarding the proposed amendments to the OZP. The draft OZP was exhibited on 13.1.2017 under section 5 of the Ordinance for public inspection for a period of two months till 13.3.2017.

Representer's Proposals

The Site to be Retained as "Open Space" or rezoned to "G/IC" or "GB"

6.3.39 In response to the proposal on retaining the site as "Open Space", rezoning the site to "G/IC" and provision of sports and recreational facilities, and developing the site as green belt, in view that the site is formed and located in proximity to MTR Shek Mun Station and supporting retail facilities in Shek Mun, it is considered suitable to be rezoned for public housing development to meet the housing needs in the short-to-medium term. The district and local open space and a range of GIC facilities are generally sufficient to meet the need of planned population of Sha Tin in accordance with the HKPSG.

6.4 Responses to Grounds of Comments

Amendment Item A

6.4.1 The supporting views on Amendment Item A are noted.

Amendment Items C and D

6.4.2 The additional grounds raised by the commenters on Amendment Item C are noted. The remaining grounds are largely similar to those raised in the representations. The responses to the representations in paragraph 6.3 above are relevant.

7 Consultation

7.1 The following Government departments have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs, where appropriate:

- (a) Secretary for Food and Health;
- (b) Secretary for Home Affairs;
- (c) Director of Health;
- (d) District Officer (Sha Tin), HAD;
- (e) District Lands Officer/Shan Tin, LandsD;
- (f) Director of Housing;
- (g) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene;
- (h) Secretary for Education;
- (i) Commissioner for Transport;
- (j) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
- (k) Director of Environmental Protection;
- (l) Chief Engineer/Sewerage Projects, DSD; and
- (m) Chief Engineer/Port Works, CEDD.

7.2 The following departments have no comment on the representations/comments:

- (a) Commissioner for Sport, HAB;
- (b) Chief Project Manager/ Project Management Branch 3, ArchSD;
- (c) Project Manager/New Territories East, CEDD;
- (d) Chief Engineer/Land Works, CEDD;
- (e) Head of Geotechnical Office, CEDD;
- (f) District Survey Office, Sha Tin, LandsD;
- (g) Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation;
- (h) Chief Highway Engineer/New Territories East, HyD;
- (i) Chief Engineer/Development(2), WSD;
- (j) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, DSD;
- (k) Chief Building Surveyor/New Territories East 2 & Railway, BD;
- (l) Director of Fire Services;
- (m) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Antiquities and Monuments Office); and
- (n) Director of Social Welfare.

8 **Planning Department's Views**

The supportive views of **R1 (part)** on Amendment Item B and **R16 to R200** on Amendment Item C are noted. Based on the assessment in paragraph 6 above, PlanD does not support the adverse representations on Amendment Items A, B, C and D, and considers that the Plan should not be amended to meet the representations for the following reasons:

Amendment Item A

- (a) The 2011-12 Policy Address announced that the Government would explore the use of rock cavern development as an innovative method to expand Hong Kong's land resources. The feasibility study conducted by DSD in May 2012 confirmed that relocating the STSTW to cavern at A Kung Kok is technically feasible and financially viable. **(R1 (part), R2 (part) and R3)**
- (b) The findings of the technical assessments conducted by DSD revealed that the proposed development will not have significant impact on ecological, environmental, landscape and visual, traffic, infrastructural and geotechnical aspects to the surrounding areas. The EIA has been approved by DEP on 28.11.2016. **(R1 (part), R2 (part) and R3)**

Amendment Item B

- (c) The site at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun is considered suitable for columbarium development in Sha Tin to meet the demand for public niches. The VA conducted by FHB/FEHD indicates that the proposed columbarium is not visually incompatible with the surrounding areas. In addition, the TIA concluded that the proposed development will not have significant impacts on traffic aspects to the surrounding areas. Appropriate traffic mitigation measures have been proposed to mitigate the identified traffic and transport impacts arising from the proposed columbarium. **(R4 (part), R5 (part) and R6 to R15)**

- (d) Adverse impacts generated by air pollution are not anticipated as the proposed columbarium is intended to be a pilot project to test the public acceptance of a completely smoke-free public columbarium. **(R4 (part), R5 (part) and R6 to R15)**
- (e) An engineering feasibility study will be carried out for the proposed pedestrian subway to assess the technical aspects and draw up the finalised scheme to tie in with operation of the columbarium. STDC and relevant stakeholders will be consulted on the project. **(R4 (part), R5 (part) and R6 to R15)**

Amendment Item C

- (f) The proposed amendment of the Olympic Stables site is to reflect the current use of the site and will not involve new development proposals. The Olympic Stables is compatible with the surrounding land uses and would not create adverse impact on the traffic, environmental and visual aspects. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R201 to R203, R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part)**
- (g) The HKSI has confirmed that the site is no longer required for its future development. In view that the site is accessible only via roads within the racecourse, and has been operated and managed by the HKJC since the end of the 2008 Olympic Equestrian Events to support horse racing activities, rezoning of the Olympic Stables site to “OU(Race Course)” would better reflect the current use and function of the site. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R201 to R203, R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part)**
- (h) Since the beginning of the operation of STRC, including its clubhouse and other ancillary facilities, the STRC has been zoned “OU(Race Course)” zone. The update to the Notes of the OZP is simply to provide a clear planning intention for the land and a set of uses which are permitted as of right or may be permitted on application to the Board. In particular, ‘Place of Recreation, Sports or Culture’ has been included as a Column 2 use to allow flexibility for HKJC to provide communal sports and recreational facilities within STRC to better serve the local community through the planning application system. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R201 to R203, R204 (part), R205 to R206, R207 (part), R208 to R215, R216 (part), R217 to R358, R359 (part), R360 to R402, R403 (part), R404 to R437, R438 (part), R439 to R525, R527 to R565, R566 (part), R567 to R587, R588 (part), R589 to R747 and R748 (part)**

Amendment Item D

- (i) The site is formed and located in proximity to MTR Shek Mun Station and supporting retail facilities in Shek Mun, it is considered suitable for public housing development to meet the housing needs in the short-to-medium term. The

findings of the technical assessments revealed that the proposed development will not have significant impacts on traffic, visual and air ventilation aspects to the surrounding areas. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R4 (part), R5 (part), R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667**

- (j) The district and local open space and a range of GIC facilities are generally sufficient to meet the needs in accordance with the HKPSG. Besides, a 20m-wide public waterfront promenade along the Siu Lek Yuen Nullah has been retained as open space for public enjoyment. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R4 (part), R5 (part), R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667**
- (k) Rezoning of the land occupied by the Kitchee Centre is postponed until the relocation arrangement for the Kitchee Centre is settled. The current rezoning will not affect the operation of Kitchee Centre. **R1 (part), R2 (part), R4 (part), R5 (part), R204 (part), R207 (part), R216 (part), R359 (part), R403 (part), R438 (part), R566 (part), R588 (part), R748 (part) and R749 to R1667**

9 Decision Sought

The Board is invited to give consideration to the representations and the related comments and decide whether to propose/not to propose any amendment to the Plan to meet/partially meet the representations.

10 Attachments

Annex I	Draft Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/33 (reduced size)
Annex II	Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Sha Tin OZP No. S/ST/32
Annex III	Summary of Representations and Comments
Annex IV	Submissions made by the Representers
Annex V	Submissions made by the Commenters
Annex VI	List of Representers
Annex VII	List of Commenters
Annex VIII	Extract of the Minutes of the Meeting of Development and Housing Committee of Sha Tin District Council held on 3.11.2016
Annex IX	Provision for Open Space and Major GIC Facilities in Sha Tin
Plans H-1a to H-1b	Location Plan of the Representation Sites
Plans H-2a to H-2c	Site Plan of the Representation Sites
Plans H-3a to H-3c	Aerial Photo
Plans H-4a to H-4i	Site Photos