

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

**TPB Paper No. 10866
For Consideration by the
Town Planning Board on 16.9.2022**

**DRAFT CHEUNG SHA WAN OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K5/38
CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K5/38-R1 TO R9
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K5/38-C1 TO C27**

DRAFT CHEUNG SHA WAN OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/K5/38

**CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/K5/38-R1 TO R9
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/K5/38-C1 TO C27**

Amendment Items	Representers	Commenters
<u>Subject of Representations</u>	Total: 9	Total: 27
<u>Item A</u> Rezoning of Wang Cheong Factory Estate and the adjacent section of Tan Lai Street from “Open Space” (“O”) to “Residential (Group A)11” (“R(A)11”) with stipulation of building height restriction (BHR)	<u>Support (6)</u> R1 to R6: Individuals <u>Oppose Item A (2)</u>	<u>Oppose Item A (25)</u> <u>Related to R1 to R9 C1 to C4:</u> Individuals <u>Related to R1 C5:</u> Individual <u>Support R8 C6:</u> Individual <u>Support R9 C7:</u> Individual <u>Not Specified C8 to C25:</u> Individuals <u>Providing Views on Item A (2)</u> C26 and C27 (also R9): Individuals
<u>Items B3 and B4</u> Rezoning of a strip of land at Cheung Sha Wan Path from “O” and an area shown as ‘Road’ to “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Business” (“OU(B)”) and “OU(B)3” with stipulation of BHRs	R7 and R8: Individuals <u>Oppose Item A and Providing Views on Items B3, B4, E1 and E2 (1)</u>	
<u>Items E1 and E2</u> Rezoning of a site at Tai Po Road from “Comprehensive Development Area” (“CDA”) and “Green Belt” (“GB”) to “Residential (Group C)7” (“R(C)7”) and an area shown as ‘Road’	R9: Individual	
<u>Not Subject of Representations</u>		
<u>Item B1</u> Rezoning of a piece of land at the Sham Shui Po Sports Ground from an area shown as ‘Road’ to “O”		
<u>Item B2</u> Rezoning of a section of Cheung Sha Wan Road between Cheung Sha Wan Path and Hing Wah Street from “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”) and “O” to an area shown as ‘Road’		

Amendment Items	Representers	Commenters
<p><u>Item C</u> Incorporation of the area covered by the approved Urban Renewal Authority (URA) Lai Chi Kok Road/Kweilin Street and Yee Kuk Street Development Scheme Plan (DSP) No. S/K5/URA1/2 into the Plan and zoning the area as “R(A)12” with stipulation of BHRs</p> <p><u>Item D</u> Incorporation of the area covered by the approved URA Hai Tan Street /Kweilin Street and Pei Ho Street DSP No. S/K5/URA2/2 into the Plan and zoning the area as “R(A)13” with stipulation of BHRs</p>		

Notes: Soft copy of their submissions is sent to the Town Planning Board (the Board) Members via electronic means; and is also available for public inspection at the Board’s website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/whats_new/Website_S_K5_38.html and the respective Planning Enquiry Counters of the Planning Department (PlanD) in North Point and Sha Tin. A set of hard copy is deposited at the Board’s Secretariat for Members’ inspection.

1. **Introduction**

- 1.1 On 28.1.2022, the draft Cheung Sha Wan Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K5/38 (**Annex I**) was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). The Schedule of Amendments setting out the amendments incorporated into the OZP is at **Annex II** and the locations of the amendment items are shown on **Plans H-1a to H-1c**.
- 1.2 During the two-month exhibition period, a total of nine representations were received, which are all considered valid. On 29.4.2022, the representations were published for three weeks. Upon expiry of the statutory publication period, a total of 27 comments were received, which are all considered valid.
- 1.3 On 19.8.2022, the Board agreed to consider all the representations and comments collectively in one group.
- 1.4 This Paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of the representations and comments. The list of representers and commenters is at **Annex III**. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the meeting in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

2. **Background**

Item A – Proposed Public Housing Development at Wang Cheong Factory Estate Site

- 2.1 In order to meet the housing demand identified under the Long Term Housing Strategy, the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HKHA) has been invited to explore the feasibility of redeveloping its factory estates for public housing use. As announced in 2020 Policy Address and 2021 Policy Address Supplement, the preliminary findings of HKHA's study has indicated that four sites including Sui Fai Factory Estate in Fo Tan, Yip On Factory Estate in Kowloon Bay, Kwai On Factory Estate in Kwai Chung and Wang Cheong Factory Estate (WCFE) in Cheung Sha Wan are capable of producing some 4,800 units in 2031 and beyond. The feasibility study concluded that these four sites are technically feasible for housing development. The representations and comments of the amendments to the respective OZPs for the first two factory estate sites were considered by the Board on 22.7.2022 and 19.8.2022 respectively. Necessary amendments to the concerned OZP for the redevelopment of Kwai On Factory Estate will be taken forward in due course. To facilitate HKHA's redevelopment proposal of WCFE, the site of WCFE and the adjacent section of Tan Lai Street have been rezoned to "R(A)11" on the OZP (**Plan H-1a**).

Items B1 to B4 – Rationalising Zoning Boundaries Arising from the URA DSP

- 2.2 URA's Cheung Wah Street/Cheung Sha Wan Road Development Scheme was commenced on 24.9.2021 under section 25 of the Urban Renewal Authority Ordinance. The draft Cheung Wah Street/Cheung Sha Wan Road DSP No. S/K5/URA3/A was agreed by the Board on 17.12.2021 and then the draft URA DSP No. S/K5/URA3/1 was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Ordinance on 28.1.2022. The representations and comments in respect of the draft DSP will also be considered by the Board at this meeting.
- 2.3 Items B1 to B4 are areas adjoining the draft DSP. The amendments are to rationalise the zoning boundaries and to reflect the as-built conditions (**Plan H-1a**).

Items C to E2 – Reflecting the Completed Developments on the OZP

- 2.4 Three completed residential developments, including two at Lai Chi Kok Road/Kweilin Street and Yee Kuk Street, and Hai Tan Street/Kweilin Street and Pei Ho Street currently under URA's DSPs and one at Tai Po Road zoned "CDA", were completed and they have been rezoned into suitable zonings with appropriate development restrictions to reflect their as-built conditions (**Plans H-1b and H-1c**).

Amendments to the Notes of the OZP

- 2.5 In relation to the above amendment items, the Notes of the OZP have been revised accordingly. Opportunity was also taken to incorporate other technical amendments into the Notes of the OZP for reflecting the latest revision of the Master Schedule of Notes to Statutory Plans.

Amendments to the OZP

- 2.6 On 14.1.2022, the Metro Planning Committee (MPC) of the Board agreed that the proposed amendments to the approved Cheung Sha Wan OZP No. S/K5/37 were suitable for exhibition under section 5 of the Ordinance. The relevant MPC Paper No. 1/22 is available at the Board's website (<https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/papers/papers.html#2022>) and extract of the minutes of the said MPC meeting is at **Annex V**. Accordingly, the draft Cheung Sha Wan OZP No. S/K5/38 was gazetted on 28.1.2022.

3. Local Consultation

Prior to Submission of the Proposed Amendments to MPC

- 3.1 The Sham Shui Po District Council (SSPDC) was consulted on 9.11.2021 on the proposed redevelopment of WCFE for public housing development and the proposed corresponding amendments to the OZP. The SSPDC generally supported the proposed public housing development and the proposed amendments to the OZP with an individual Member raising objection to the proposed public housing development under Item A from traffic noise, development intensity and loss of open space perspectives. Other concerns expressed by Members include air ventilation impact, loss of local industries/jobs, plans for the remaining "O" zone and utilisation of floor area for welfare facilities. An extract of the minutes of the SSPDC meeting is at **Annex IV**.
- 3.2 The Sham Shui Po West Area Committee was also consulted on 15.11.2021 in respect of the redevelopment of WCFE and the Committee generally supported the proposed public housing development.

Upon Gazettal of the Draft OZP

- 3.3 During the statutory exhibition period of the draft OZP, SSPDC members were invited to submit views on the amendments in writing to the Secretary of the Board. No representation or comment from members of SSPDC was received.

4. The Representation Sites

- 4.1 The Sites and their Surrounding Areas

Representation Site under Item A (Item A Site)

- 4.1.1 Item A Site of about 1.05 ha is a piece of Government land falling within an area zoned "O" and is currently occupied by WCFE and a section of the surrounding public road, namely Tan Lai Street (**Plan H-2a**). WCFE was completed in 1984 under a Vesting Order managed by HKHA. It is an existing 11-storey flatted factory building with a building height of about 42mPD and a total of 1,020 factory rental units.

- 4.1.2 Item A Site was previously zoned “R(A)”. Following Government’s short and medium terms measures to expedite the supply of housing units, an “O” site (about 2.3 ha) at junction of Lai Chi Kok Road and Tonkin Street was identified for public housing development and rezoned to “R(A)” in 2013 (subsequently developed into a Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) development, namely Lai Tsui Court) (**Plan H-5**). In the same OZP amendment exercise, a large part of the area occupied by WCFE, Wang Cheong Building and the Cheung Sha Wan Temporary Wholesale Poultry Market was rezoned from “R(A)” to “O” to make up for the loss of the “O” site at that time and the remaining part was rezoned to “G/IC” for a primary school to meet the Education Bureau’s requirement (**Plans H-2a and H5**).
- 4.1.3 The surrounding areas of Item A Site are predominantly residential in nature with various government, institution and community (GIC) facilities and open spaces including Sham Shui Po Sports Ground, Cheung Sha Wan Playground, Hing Wah Street West Playground and Sham Shui Po Park (**Plan H-6**). To the immediate east of Tan Lai Street are two industrial/industrial-office buildings which are zoned “Residential (Group E)”, a petrol filling station and a residential development named The Sparkle. To the further east across Fat Tseung Street is a “R(A)” zone earmarked for public housing development, in which the western portion is currently occupied by the Cheung Sha Wan Wholesale Vegetable Market and the eastern portion is a public housing development under construction (i.e. North West Kowloon Reclamation (NWKR) Site 1 (East)) (**Plan H-5**). To the southwest across the West Kowloon Corridor are a number of GIC facilities and schools, a planned comprehensive development at the “CDA” site currently occupied by two warehouses (**Plan H-5**).
- 4.1.4 To the immediate northwest is Wang Cheong Building and Cheung Sha Wan Temporary Poultry Market, both of which are zoned partly “G/IC” (reserved for a primary school) and partly “O”. To the north and northeast across Lai Chi Kok Road are education/community institutions and public housing developments (**Plans H-2a and H-5**).

Proposed Public Housing Development at Item A Site

- 4.1.5 Item A Site is zoned “R(A)11” subject to a maximum total plot ratio (PR) restriction of 9.0 with domestic PR of not more than 7.5, as well as maximum BHR of 152mPD (**Plan H-2a**). The proposed PR restriction is the same as the “R(A)” zones of the OZP and reference has been made to the BHR of 152mPD for the adjoining residential development (i.e. The Sparkle).
- 4.1.6 A local open space of not less than 3,240m² in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) (i.e. 1m² per person) will be provided in the podium garden. Moreover, a public open space (POS) with an area of not less than 800m² will be provided at grade as part of the proposed housing development for public enjoyment which will be handed over to the relevant Government department for management and maintenance upon completion (**Drawings H-1a and H-1b**).

- 4.1.7 The development site for the public housing development is about 0.79 ha. According to the notional scheme of the HKHA, the preliminary major development parameters are as follows, and the indicative development scheme plans including layout plans and elevation plan are at **Drawings H-1a to H-1c**:

Development Site Area ⁽ⁱ⁾	About 0.79 ha
Maximum PR	9
- Domestic PR	7.5
- Non-domestic PR	1.5
Maximum BH	152mPD
Number of Buildings	2
Number of Flats	About 1,200
Estimated Population ⁽ⁱⁱ⁾	About 3,240
Welfare Facilities (subject to detailed design) ⁽ⁱⁱⁱ⁾	<p>Floor area equivalent to not less than 5% of the total attainable domestic gross floor area (GFA) will be reserved for the provision of welfare facilities possibly including the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Small Group Home - Supported Hostel for Mentally Handicapped Persons - Short-term Food Assistance Service Team - Counselling Centre for Psychotropic Substance Abusers - Day Care Centre for the Elderly - Support Centre for Persons with Autism (sub-base) - Parents/Relatives Resource Centre for Ex-Mentally Ill Persons (sub-base) - Care and Support Networking Team
Other Facilities	Retail facilities (subject to the retail study of the Housing Department (HD))
Open Space for Residents	Not less than 3,240m ² in accordance with the HKPSG (i.e. 1m ² per person)
POS	Not less than 800m ² at grade within the site open to the public
Parking Facilities	Ancillary car parking spaces and loading/unloading bays to be provided in accordance with the HKPSG
Target Completion Year	2030/2031

Note:

- (i) The development site area excludes the public road and mainly follows the existing vesting order boundary of WCFE with rationalisation of the common site boundary with the adjoining Government Property Agency (GPA)'s Wang Cheong Building and

- will be subject to further changes in detailed design stage.
- (ii) Average household size of 2.7 is assumed for the technical assessments purpose.
 - (iii) The proposed welfare facilities are proposed to be exempted from PR calculation under the OZP which have been included for assessment. The location, type and actual provision of welfare facilities will be subject to detailed design by HKHA in consultation with relevant Government departments.

Representation Sites under Items B3 and B4 (Item B3 and Item B4 Sites)

- 4.1.8 In relation to the draft URA's Cheung Wah Street/Cheung Sha Wan Road DSP No. S/K5/URA3/1 as stated in paragraphs 2.2 and 2.3 above, opportunity was taken to rezone the areas adjoining the draft DSP to rationalise the zoning boundaries and reflect the as-built conditions (**Plan H-1a**).
- 4.1.9 Item B3 and Item B4 Sites cover a portion of existing industrial buildings at Cheung Sha Wan Road and a portion of Cheung Sha Wan Path respectively. The sites are located between the Sham Shui Po Sports Ground and the eastern part of the Cheung Sha Wan Industrial/Business Area accommodating a mix of industrial and commercial buildings and predominantly zoned "OU(B)" (**Plan H-2b**).

Representation Sites under Items E1 and E2 (Item E1 and Item E2 Sites)

- 4.1.10 Item E1 Site is zoned "R(C)7" subject to a maximum GFA of 6,717m², maximum BH of 124mPD, and maximum site coverage of 50% to reflect the as-built conditions of a low-rise residential development known as Triazza completed in 2014. Item E2 Site is shown as 'Road' to reflect the alignment of the existing Tai Po Road fronting the residential development (**Plans H-1c and H-2d**).
- 4.1.11 The sites are surrounded by trees, woodlands and shrubs in the "GB" zone to the north and south with religious institutions to the southwest, and a few low-rise residential developments zoned "R(C)" along Tai Po Road (**Plans H-1c and H-2d**).

Other Amendment Sites

- 4.1.12 The locations of Items B1, B2, C and D, which are not the subject of any representation, are indicated on **Plans H-1a, H-1b, H-2b and H-2c** for information.
- 4.2 Planning Intentions

The planning intentions of the zones in relation to the above representation sites are as follows:

- (a) The "R(A)11" zone under Item A is intended primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building.

- (b) The “OU(B) and “OU(B)3” zones under Items B3 and B4 respectively are intended primarily for general business uses. A mix of information technology and telecommunications industries, non-polluting industrial, office and other commercial uses are always permitted in new “business” buildings. Less fire hazard-prone office use that would not involve direct provision of customer services or goods to the general public is always permitted in existing industrial or industrial-office buildings.
- (c) The “R(C)7” zone under Item E1 is intended primarily for low-to-medium density residential developments where commercial uses serving the residential neighbourhood may be permitted on application to the Board.

5. The Representations

5.1 Subject of Representations

- 5.1.1. Amongst the nine representations, there are six representations (**R1** to **R6**) from the individuals supporting redevelopment in respect of the OZP without specifying the amendment items and views, and three representations (**R7** to **R9**) from other individuals opposing Item A. One representation (**R9**) also provided views on Items B3, B4, E1 and E2.
- 5.1.2. The major grounds/comments of representations (**R7** to **R9**) and Government departments’ responses are summarised in paragraph 5.3 below.

5.2 Supportive Representations

The supportive views of **R1** to **R6** are noted.

5.3 Adverse Representations

Item A

5.3.1 Site Suitability for Housing Development

Major Grounds/Comments	Rep No.
(1) Providing public housing at the site should not override other considerations including the adverse air ventilation and visual impacts on the surrounding areas.	R9
Responses	
(a) The Government has been adopting a multi-pronged approach to increase housing land supply and to meet the acute housing demand, including to review the feasibility of redeveloping HKHA’s factory estates for public housing use. The preliminary findings of HKHA’s study has indicated that four factory estates are capable of producing some 4,800 units in 2031 and beyond. The site of WCFE is suitable for residential development and could contribute about 1,200 public housing units within 10 years (i.e. to be	

completed by 2031).

- (b) The technical assessments conducted on traffic, sewerage, air quality, noise, air ventilation and visual aspects concluded that redeveloping WCFE for public housing is technically feasible with the implementation of suitable mitigation/improvement measures at the detailed design stage.

5.3.2 Impact on the Tenants of WCFE

Major Grounds/Comments	Rep No.
(1) The compensation and relocation arrangements are insufficient.	R7
(2) Redevelopment of WCFE would lead to closing and affect the livelihood of small business and result in unemployment. The occupancy rate of WCFE indicated a strong demand for affordable industrial units.	R7, R9
Responses	
<p>In response to (1) and (2):</p> <p>(a) Clearance, compensation and relocation arrangements are outside the scope of the OZP and the ambit of the Board. These issues should be dealt with separately by HKHA under their prevailing clearance package and related arrangements.</p> <p><u>Assistance on Relocation</u></p> <p>(b) As advised by HKHA, its factory estates are operated on commercial principles, and are let to tenants on three-year fixed term tenancies. Pursuant to the tenancy agreement, the HKHA has the right to terminate the tenancies by giving three months' notice. Tenants are not legally or contractually entitled to relocation or any form of compensation. To assist tenants' removal, the HKHA has provided advance notice to tenants affected by redevelopment/clearance programme, an ex-gratia allowance, restricted tender opportunities to bid for vacant factory units in HKHA's two remaining factory estates (i.e. Chun Shing Factory Estate in Kwai Chung and Hoi Tai Factory Estate in Tuen Mun), and other cash sum for eligible affected tenants/licensees. The various allowances and cash sums provided by HKHA should be able to provide some assistance to the affected tenants.</p> <p>(c) Apart from notifying the affected tenants individually of the series of arrangements provided, the HKHA has also met with the tenants' representatives on various occasions to explain the details of the relevant arrangements. The HKHA will continue to maintain close liaison with affected tenants and provide timely response to their enquiries and concerns.</p>	

Alternative Industrial Premises

- (d) As advised by HKHA, amongst the 920,000m² vacant flatted factory spaces in the private sector as at December 2021, there are units generally comparable to WCFE in terms of building age, floor space, rent, location, etc. These industrial units in the private sector could serve as alternatives for the affected tenants who wish to continue their businesses.
- (e) Although the redevelopment of WCFE will result in a loss of about 34,760m² industrial GFA⁽¹⁾, the Government has introduced two rounds of incentive measures to facilitate wholesale conversion/redevelopment of industrial buildings with higher intensity. Based on the approved planning applications submitted under the “Revitalisation Scheme 2.0” applying for 20% increase of PR upon redevelopment, there will be additional 0.24 million m² industrial floor spaces generated from the redevelopment proposals in the short-to-medium term in Hong Kong. Some of the additional spaces falls within the Cheung Sha Wan Industrial/Business Area, which is located about 500m away to the northwest of Item A Site, which may provide some employment opportunities to the local community.

5.3.3 Provision of GIC Facilities and Open Space

Major Grounds/Comments	Rep No.
(1) The WCFE was originally zoned “O” to compensate the loss of the “O” site which had been developed into a HOS development. The site of WCFE should be maintained as “O” zone for open space development.	R8
(2) The Government had no intention to implement the planned “O” zone. The district open space provision in Cheung Sha Wan area is in deficit.	R9
(3) The area is heavily populated with many high-rise residential developments and there is insufficient GIC facilities/open space to support the future population.	R8
Responses	
<p>In response to (1) to (3):</p> <p><u>Open Space Provision</u></p> <p>(a) The open space provision is assessed according to the requirements under the HKPSG taking into account the population increase in the proposed developments under Item A Site and URA’s Cheung Wah Street/Cheung Sha Wan Road Development Scheme. Within the Cheung Sha Wan Planning Area, there is a surplus of about 3.7 ha in planned local open space (Annex</p>	

⁽¹⁾ Based on a conversion factor of 1m² internal floor area (IFA) to 1.33m² GFA as advised by HKHA.

VI). For district open space which is assessed on a wider basis, although there is a deficit of about 11.2 ha within the Cheung Sha Wan Planning Area, there is a surplus of about 12.7 ha within the Sham Shui Po district (**Annex VII**). The overall provision of open space is generally adequate to meet the demand of the planned population.

- (b) Furthermore, an at-grade POS of not less than 800m² and a local open space of not less than 3,240m² on podium garden in accordance with the HKPSG (i.e. 1m² per person) will be provided within the proposed public housing development (**Drawing H-1b**). The proposed development could utilise the site to provide much needed public housing units to address housing shortage and will also allow early implementation of the POS.
- (c) There are a number of major existing open space and sports facilities within 500m of Item A Site including Sham Shui Po Sports Ground, Cheung Sha Wan Playground, Hing Wah Street West Playground and Sham Shui Po Park (**Plan H-6**).

GIC Facilities

- (d) The existing and planned provision of GIC facilities are generally adequate to meet the demand of the planned population⁽²⁾ in accordance with the requirements of the HKPSG and assessments of relevant Government bureaux/departments (B/Ds), except secondary school places and some elderly and child care facilities (**Annex VI**). As the provision of secondary school places is planned on a territory-wide basis, the deficits in Cheung Sha Wan Planning Area can be met by the surplus provision in the Sham Shui Po District (**Annex VII**). The standard set for elderly and child care facilities is a long-term goal and the actual provision is subject to consideration of the Social Welfare Department (SWD) in the planning and development process as appropriate.
- (e) Various welfare facilities (floor area equivalent to not less than 5% of the total attainable domestic GFA) as requested by SWD have been incorporated in the proposed housing development of WCFE site. The Government will continue to adopt a multi-pronged approach with long, medium and short term strategies to identify suitable sites or premises for the provision of more welfare services, so as to meet the ongoing welfare service needs of the district. A number of GIC facilities including medical and health services as well as a reprovisioned upgraded indoor recreation centre will also be provided in URA's Cheung Wah Street/Cheung Sha Wan Road Development Scheme.

⁽²⁾ The planned population arising from HKHA's public housing development and URA's Cheung Wah Street/Cheung Sha Wan Road Development Scheme have also been taken into account. The representations and comments in respect of the draft DSP will be considered by the Board at the same meeting.

5.4 Representation Providing Views

Major Grounds/Comments	Rep No.
<p><u>Items B3 and B4</u></p> <p>(1) The proposed GIC complex would further reduce the open space and diminish the quality of open space.</p>	R9
<p><u>Items E1 and E2</u></p> <p>(2) The “GB” zone is reduced which is a loss for the public.</p>	R9
Responses	
<p>In response to (1):</p> <p>(a) Items B3 and B4 are for rationalising the zoning boundaries arising from the URA DSP and reflecting the as-built conditions (Plan H-2b). The proposed GIC complex at the URA DSP is not covered by the amendment to the OZP. Responses on provision of open space in paragraphs 5.3.3 (a) to (c) above are also relevant.</p>	
<p>In response to (2):</p> <p>(b) Item E1 and Item E2 Sites were previously zoned “CDA” (80%) and “GB” (20%) and the concerned private residential development, with a planning permission granted in 2001, was completed in 2014. The sites are rezoned from “CDA” and “GB” to “R(C)7” and an area shown as ‘Road’ to reflect the completed development and the alignment of Tai Po Road respectively (Plan H-2d).</p>	

6. Comments on Representations

- 6.1 Among the 27 comments received from individuals, 25 of them (**C1 to C25**) oppose Item A and two (**C26** and **C27** (also **R9**)) provide views on Item A. Specifically, **C1 to C4** provide views related to **R1 to R9**, **C5** provides views related to **R1**, and **C6** and **C7** support **R8** and **R9** respectively.
- 6.2 The major concerns raised in the comments are largely similar to the grounds of objections as detailed in paragraph 5.3 above. Other major comments not covered by the representations are summarised below:

6.2.1 Site Suitability

Major Grounds/Comments	Cmt No.
(1) The site is small and narrow which is not suitable for housing development. Production of limited units could not address the problem of housing shortage.	C1, C8, C9
(2) The rezoning of WCFE for public housing development is against Government's previous commitment and it is a legitimate expectation of local residents for the site to be developed as an open space.	C6, C8, C13
Responses	
In response to (1):	
(a) Responses on site suitability in paragraphs 5.3.1(a) and (b) above are relevant.	
In response to (2):	
(b) Responses on provision of open space in paragraphs 5.3.3(a) to (c) above are relevant.	

6.2.2 Alternative Options

Major Grounds/Comments	Cmt No.
(1) The Wang Cheong Building, Cheung Sha Wan Wholesale Vegetable Market and Cheung Sha Wan Temporary Wholesale Poultry Market should be considered for public housing development (Plan H-5).	C8, C9, C13
(2) WCFE should be retained/preserved for industrial use, or revitalised for GIC uses, restaurants, shops or museum.	C4, C7, C11, C12, C14, C17, C26
Responses	
In response to (1) and (2):	
(a) Responses on site suitability in paragraphs 5.3.1(a) and (b) above are relevant.	
(b) Concerted efforts by the Government to identify suitable land for housing development will persist. Should there be any other potential site considered suitable for public housing development, the relevant Government B/Ds would proceed to review its feasibility and suitability as	

appropriate with a view to increasing the housing land supply. Notwithstanding this, the Item A Site itself has been confirmed suitable for public housing development in terms of land use compatibility and technical feasibility. Regarding the proposed sites at various parts of Cheung Sha Wan for public housing development, they have been designated for respective specific planning purposes.

6.2.3 Other Aspects

Major Grounds/Comments	Cmt No.
(1) Redevelopment of WCFE for public housing development would cause adverse environmental, air ventilation and visual impacts to the surrounding areas including the adjoining residential development, i.e. The Sparkle. The proposed buildings would block the views from The Sparkle, causing wall effect.	C8, C9, C10, C13, C15, C18, C25
(2) Sufficient open space/recreational facilities are needed to support the social, physical and mental health of the residents in the area when fighting against the pandemic.	C2, C3, C7
(3) All the proposed open space within the public housing development should be open for public enjoyment.	C10
(4) There was inadequate consultation with the WCFE tenants on the compensation and relocation arrangements.	C11
Responses	
<p>In response to (1):</p> <p>(a) Various technical assessments including Environmental Assessment Study, Air Ventilation Assessment (AVA)-Expert Evaluation, and Visual Appraisal (VA) etc. have confirmed that the proposed public housing development is technically feasible with no insurmountable technical problems with the implementation of suitable mitigation/improvement measures at the detailed design stage.</p> <p>(b) Design features, including building gap wider than 15m, building setback and permeable podium design are recommended to minimise the potential impacts on the surrounding pedestrian wind environment induced by the proposed development (Drawings H-1a and H-1c). A quantitative AVA will be carried out at the detailed design stage.</p> <p>(c) The proposed public housing development is generally visually compatible with the surrounding urban built environment where a number of existing/planned high-rise residential developments exist (Drawings H-2a to H-2f). The design layout and building setback has paid due regard to the building disposition of The Sparkle while meeting the requirement for a</p>	

<p>ventilation corridor of about 15m and provision of POS in the middle of the site (Drawing H-1a).</p> <p>(d) According to the Town Planning Board Guidelines (TPB PG-No. 41), in the highly developed context of Hong Kong, it is not practical to protect private views without stifling development opportunity and balancing other relevant considerations. In the interest of the public, it is far more important to protect public views, particularly those easily accessible and popular to the public or tourists. Visual impact assessment/VA should primarily assess the impact on sensitive public viewers from the most affected viewing points.</p>
<p>In response to (2):</p> <p>(e) Responses on provision of open space in paragraphs 5.3.3 (a) to (c) above are relevant. The provision of sports/recreational facilities is considered sufficient to meet the demand of the planned population in accordance with the requirements of the HKPSG.</p>
<p>In response to (3):</p> <p>(f) Responses on provision of open space in paragraph 5.3.3 (b) above are relevant.</p>
<p>In response to (4):</p> <p>(g) Responses on assistance on relocation in paragraphs 5.3.2 (a) to (c) above are relevant.</p>

7. **Departmental Consultation**

7.1 The following Government B/Ds have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs, where appropriate:

- (a) Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department;
- (b) Director of Environmental Protection;
- (c) Director of Housing;
- (d) Director-General of Trade and Industry; and
- (e) Government Property Administrator.

7.2 The following Government B/Ds have been consulted and they have no comment on the representations and comments:

- (a) Secretary for Development;
- (b) Secretary for Education;
- (c) Secretary for Health;
- (d) Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments), Development Bureau;

- (e) Chief Architect/Central Management Division 2, Architectural Services Department;
- (f) Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department;
- (g) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department;
- (h) Chief Engineer/Railway Development 2-2, Railway Development Office, Highways Department;
- (i) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department;
- (j) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, Highways Department;
- (k) Commissioner for Transport;
- (l) Commissioner of Police;
- (m) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services;
- (n) Director of Fire Services;
- (o) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene;
- (p) Director of Health;
- (q) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
- (r) Director of Social Welfare;
- (s) District Lands Officer/Kowloon West, Lands Department;
- (t) District Officer (Sham Shui Po), Home Affairs Department;
- (u) Head of the Geotechnical Engineering Office, CEDD;
- (v) Project Manager (South), CEDD; and
- (w) Project Manager (West), CEDD.

8. Planning Department's Views

8.1 The supportive views of **R1** to **R6** are noted.

8.2 Based on the assessments in paragraph 5.3 above, the Planning Department does not support **R7** to **R9** and considers that the Outline Zoning Plan should not be amended to meet the representations for the following reasons:

Item A

- (a) the Government has been adopting a multi-pronged approach to increase housing land supply and to meet the acute housing demand. The Site of Wang Cheong Factory Estate (WCFE) is considered suitable for the public housing development to enhance the housing supply. The development is not incompatible with the surrounding context. The technical feasibility and land use compatibility of redeveloping WCFE have been ascertained by relevant technical studies (**R8**);
- (b) relevant technical assessments confirmed that there is no insurmountable technical impacts arising from the public housing development and the potential visual impact is considered not unacceptable with the implementation of suitable mitigation/improvement measures at the detailed design stage (**R9**);
- (c) the existing and planned provision of government, institution and community facilities are generally adequate to meet the demand of the planned population in both Cheung Sha Wan Planning Area and Sham Shui Po district in

accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines and assessments of relevant Government bureaux/departments. As for the elderly and child care facilities, the Social Welfare Department will consider the provision in the planning and development process as appropriate, with a view to meeting the demand and long-term goal (**R8** and **R9**);

- (d) while the proposed development will lead to a loss of planned open space, the development will provide much needed public housing units to address housing shortage and will also allow early implementation of a public open space of not less than 800m². The Site is also surrounded by a number of major existing open space and sports facilities. There are surpluses of both planned district and local open spaces within the Sham Shui Po district. The overall provision of open space is considered not unacceptable (**R8** and **R9**);
- (e) the redevelopment of WCFE for residential use will not affect the supply of the industrial floor spaces in the Cheung Sha Wan Industrial/Business Area. There are also additional floor spaces in Cheung Sha Wan Industrial/Business Area provided through the “Revitalisation Scheme 2.0” in the short-to-medium term, which would bring employment opportunities to the local community (**R7** and **R9**); and
- (f) clearance, compensation and relocation arrangements are outside the scope of the Outline Zoning Plan and the ambit of the Town Planning Board (**R7** and **R9**).

9. Decision Sought

- 9.1 The Board is invited to give consideration to the representations and comments, taking into consideration the points raised in the hearing session, and decide whether to propose/not to propose any amendment to the draft OZP to meet/partially meet the representations.
- 9.2 Should the Board decide that no amendment should be made to the draft OZP to meet the representations, Members are also invited to agree that the draft OZP, together with the respective Notes and updated Explanatory Statement, are suitable for submission under section 8 of the Ordinance to the Chief Executive in Council for approval.

10. Attachments

Annex I	Draft Cheung Sha Wan OZP No. S/K5/38 (reduced size)
Annex II	Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Cheung Sha Wan OZP No. S/K5/37
Annex III	List of Representers and Commenters in respect of Draft Cheung Sha Wan OZP No. S/K5/38
Annex IV	Extract of Minutes of SSPDC Meeting held on 9.11.2021
Annex V	Extract of Minutes of the MPC Meeting on 14.1.2022

Annex VI	Provision of Major Community Facilities and Open Space in Cheung Sha Wan Planning Area
Annex VII	Provision of Major Community Facilities and Open Space in Sham Shui Po District
Drawings H-1a to H-1c	Indicative Development Scheme Plans for Amendment Item A
Drawings H-2a to H-2f	Photomontages for Amendment Item A
Plans H-1a to H-1c	Location Plans of the Amendment Sites
Plans H-2a to H-2d	Site Plans of the Amendment Sites
Plans H-3a to H-3d	Aerial Photos of the Amendment Sites
Plans H-4a to H-4k	Site Photos of the Amendment Site
Plan H-5	Building Height Plan for the Surrounding Developments of Amendment Item A
Plan H-6	Pedestrian Access Network and Open Spaces in Sham Shui Po

PLANNING DEPARTMENT
SEPTEMBER 2022