

APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION
UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/H20/198

<u>Applicant</u>	Parking Project Task Force of Transport Department represented by Prudential Surveyors International Limited
<u>Site</u>	At the Junction of Shing Tai Road and Sheung Mau Street, Chai Wan
<u>Site Area</u>	About 4,990m ²
<u>Lease</u>	Government land
<u>Plan</u>	Approved Chai Wan Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/H20/25
<u>Zoning</u>	“Government, Institution or Community(2)” (“G/IC(2)”) - maximum building height (BH) of 70mPD (including roof-top structures), or the height of the existing building, whichever is the greater
<u>Application</u>	Proposed Driving School with Permitted Government Use (Driving Test Centre & Government Offices) and Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)

1. The Proposal

- 1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for proposed driving school with permitted Government use (driving test centre & Government offices) and public vehicle park (excluding container vehicle) at the application site (the Site), which is zoned “G/IC(2)”¹ on the approved Chai Wan OZP No. S/H20/25 (**Plan 1**). According to the Notes of the OZP for “G/IC(2)” zone, ‘Driving School’ is a Column 2 use which requires planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board) whereas driving test centre and Government offices subsumed under ‘Government Use (not elsewhere specified)’ and ‘Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)’ are Column 1 uses which are always permitted.
- 1.2 According to the applicant, the proposed development is a joint-user complex, providing a mix of facilities and services in the following:
 - a driving school cum driving test centre for reprovisioning of the current Ap Lei Chau Driving School (ALCDS), including office accommodation

¹ The Site was not earmarked for any designated Government, institution or community (GIC) use at the time of rezoning to “G/IC(2)”.

for driving school and facilities for driving improvement course/pre-service course;

- a public vehicle park (PVP); and
- office accommodation for Transport Department (TD) and Highways Department (HyD).

1.3 The layout of the proposed development is at **Drawings A-1 to A-12**. The development parameters of the proposed development are as follows.

Site Area	About 4,990m ²
Plot Ratio (PR)	About 6.8
Gross Floor Area (GFA) #	About 33,930m ²
- Driving school cum driving test centre	About 7,200m ²
- PVP	About 9,100m ²
- Government offices	About 17,630m ²
BH[#]	- Not more than 70mPD (including roof-top structures) - 13 storeys plus 1 basement floor
Site Coverage (SC)	About 64%
Greenery Coverage	Not less than 10% (at grade) Not less than 20% (total)
Car Parking Spaces	<u>PVP</u> - Minimum 160 (for private cars) (of which 132 to be provided in three APS towers) - 36 (for light buses) <u>Ancillary Parking Spaces</u> - 6 (for Government vehicles/staff)
Loading/unloading Bays	2 (for light goods vehicles)

Note:

The GFA breakdown for the driving school cum driving test centre, PVP and Government office as well as the BH of the driving school cum driving test centre are initial proposal and may be subject to adjustment during detailed design of the proposed development.

1.4 The proposed vehicular access for driving school cum driving test centre and loading/unloading area of the Government offices is located at Sheung Tat Street whereas that for the PVP and Government offices is located at Shing Tai Road (**Drawing A-2**).

Driving school cum driving test centre

1.5 The proposed driving school cum driving test centre is for the reprovisioning of the existing ALCDS. The ALCDS, which is the sole designated driving school on Hong Kong Island, is operating under a short term tenancy (STT)². The existing ALCDS site has been rezoned as “Open Space” since 2015 such that it will be used for open space development. In approving relevant proposed amendments to the Aberdeen & Ap Lei Chau OZP, the Board urged relevant Government departments to take expeditious action in reprovisioning

² The existing ALCDS site has been used as driving school since 2016. The current STT No. SHX-1401 for driving school is for an initial term of 2 years from 1.9.2021 to 31.8.2023 and thereafter quarterly until 31.5.2026.

ALCDS elsewhere so that the site could be released for open space development the earliest³.

PVP

- 1.6 The proposed PVP is one of the six APS pilot projects initiated by the TD. Under the model of “Single Site, Multiple Uses”, it will be integrated vertically with other developments and provide around 200 parking spaces by means of APS and conventional parking. Conventional parking spaces will also be provided to cater for vehicles that cannot be accommodated in APS. It will also serve as contingency in case of system failure of APS and meet the barrier free access requirement.

Government office accommodation

- 1.7 The proposed development will provide office space to TD to relocate its offices in Wan Chai Government Offices Compound which is subject to redevelopment for convention and exhibition facilities as stated in the 2017 Policy Address. It will also be used for reprovisioning HyD’s offices currently accommodated in leased premises as well as to provide office space for new posts.

Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA)

- 1.8 A TIA has been carried out to evaluate the potential traffic impact of the proposed development on the surrounding areas. The Site can be accessible by road, public transport and on foot. MTR Heng Fa Chuen Station is located within walking distance from the Site (**Drawing A-23**). Junction assessment indicated that all the identified key junctions will operate within its capacity limit even with the operation of the proposed development and the proposed driving training/test routes (**Drawings A-26 to A-31**). Improvement to the junction of Shing Tai Road and Chong Fu Road with signalised pedestrian crossing and footpath widening at Shing Tai Road (**Drawings A-24 to A-25**) are proposed in order to cater for the future pedestrian demand.
- 1.9 In planning the driving training/test routes, the applicant has tried to avoid the route passing through major roads and junctions with heavy traffic as far as possible and most parts of the planned routes are of at least two or more traffic lanes. The driver training hours from Monday to Friday will be restricted from 9:30am to 4:30pm and from 7:30pm to 11:30pm in order to avoid traffic peak hours. No more than five road tests for private cars/light goods vehicles and two road tests for motorcycles would be arranged at a same period. To divert the traffic flow effectively, the test vehicles would also be evenly distributed among the test routes as far as practicable. The test vehicles and training vehicles will make use of two different exits to leave the school premises.
- 1.10 Having reviewed the parking demand arising from the district and the closure of some STT parking sites (including the Site and the nearby sites for future developments), redistribution of the existing parking inventory (in terms of numbers and types of parking spaces) and new temporary on-street parking spaces at Shing Tai Road near Hong Kong Institute of Vocational Education (Chai Wan) and Sheung On Street/Chong Fu Road are proposed. For the APS,

³ The amendment was approved by the Board on 2.12.2016 and subsequently the concerned Aberdeen & Ap Lei Chau OZP (i.e. No. S/H15/31) was gazetted on 3.1.2017.

traffic queue length assessment has been conducted and it is indicated that waiting vehicle is not expected. The TIA concluded that the proposed development is acceptable from traffic engineering perspective.

Conceptual Landscape Design and Tree Proposal

- 1.11 According to the proposal, no less than 10% of at grade greenery and no less than 20% of total greenery will be provided at the proposed development. There are 56 trees identified, with 22 trees within the Site and 34 trees in the vicinity of the Site. Of the 22 trees within the Site, nine of them are recommended to be transplanted within the Site and 13 trees are recommended to be felled⁴. Regarding the 34 trees outside the Site, only 17 trees would be affected due to the proposed run-in/out and footpath widening, among which 4 trees are proposed to be transplanted and 13 trees are proposed to be felled. 24 new trees are proposed to be planted within the proposed development⁵ (**Drawings A-13 to A-18 and A-32**). Tree compensation in a ratio of not less than 1:1 in terms of quantity will be provided.

Visual Aspect

- 1.12 Given that the proposed development conforms to the development restrictions of the OZP and does not fall within the circumstances specified under TPB PG-No. 41, a visual impact assessment is not required. Nevertheless, visual illustrations from selected viewpoints have been prepared which shows that the proposed development is compatible with the surrounding in terms of the development scale and hence acceptable from visual impact perspective (**Drawings A-19 to A-22**).

Other technical assessments

- 1.13 Preliminary Environmental Review (PER), Sewerage and Drainage Impact Assessment (SDIA) and Quantitative Risk Assessments (QRA) have been conducted and concluded that, with appropriate mitigation measures, the proposed development will not induce adverse environmental (in terms of air quality, noise, water quality, waste management and land contamination aspects), sewerage and drainage impact, and the risks associated with the liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) filling stations near the Site are in compliance with Hong Kong Government Risk Guidelines.

Implementation programme

- 1.14 Construction of the proposed development is anticipated to be commenced in 2024 for completion in 2028.

- 1.15 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents:

- (a) Application Form received on 14.9.2022 (**Appendix I**)
- (b) Planning Statement (PS) including Conceptual Landscape Plans, TIA, PER and SDIA (**Appendix Ia**)
- (c) Further Information (FI) dated 15.11.2022 with (**Appendix Ib**)

⁴ No. of trees to be felled included 3 trees which are considered as undesirable species.

⁵ 23 of them are for compensating the trees felled (excluding the 3 trees of undesirable species) due to the proposed development.

responses to departmental and public comments as well as QRA*

- (d) FI dated 30.11.2022 with notes of briefing session for the community organized by the applicant on 20.11.2022[#] (**Appendix Ic**)
- (e) FI dated 28.12.2022 with responses to departmental comments[#] (**Appendix Id**)
- (f) FI dated 3.1.2023 with responses to public comments[#] (**Appendix Ie**)
- (g) FI dated 9.1.2023 with supplementary information and revised figures[#] (**Appendix If**)

** not exempted from publication and recounting requirements*

[#] exempted from publication and recounting requirements

- 1.16 At the request of the applicant, the Metro Planning Committee (the Committee) of the Board agreed on 11.11.2022 to defer making a decision on the application for a period of two months in order to allow sufficient time for preparation of FI to address departmental comments.

2. Justifications from the Applicant

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in the PS and FIs at **Appendices Ia to If**. They are summarised as follows:

In line with the Planning Intention of “G/IC(2)” zone

- (a) The proposed driving school use is in line with the planning intention of the “G/IC(2)” zone. It is a GIC facility serving the long-term needs of the public for off-street driver training and driving test on Hong Kong Island.

Compatible with the Surrounding Areas

- (b) The scale and development intensity of the proposed development have taken into account the surrounding context. The maximum building height of the proposed development complies with the building height restriction of the “GIC(2)” zone. The proposed development is visually compatible with the surrounding areas in terms of development scale. The proposed landscape design will also soften the proposed building mass with the view of enhancing visual and landscape amenity of the neighbourhood.

In line with the “Single Site, Multiple Uses” Model to develop GIC facilities

- (c) By integrating the driving school with other facilities under the same development, the proposed development is in line with the “Single Site, Multiple Uses” model of making optimal use of limited land resources.

In line with the Policy of “Two-pronged” approach of Driver Training

- (d) The Government has all along adopted a “two-pronged” approach in respect of driver training in Hong Kong since the 1980s, which promotes off-street driver training through the establishment of designated driving school while maintaining a good supply of private driving instructors for on-street driver training. The proposed development is in line with the approach and will offer a wide range of training facilities, including driving simulators and dedicated off-street training area which enables learner drivers to pick up basic driving skills in a controlled and safe environment before driving on designated training routes outside the school premises. Such off-street training could reduce traffic disruption cause by inexperienced learner drivers.

Needs for Reprovisioning of the existing ALCDS

- (e) The reprovisioning site for the driving school cum test centre has to be located on Hong Kong Island so as to continue the service and to cope with the driving training/test demand thereat. There is strong demand for off-street driving training on Hong Kong Island, at ALCDS, as evidenced by the fact that almost half of driving tests for motorcycle, private car and light goods vehicle were conducted there. ALCDS is also the only place on Hong Kong Island where learner drivers could receive training for the motorcycle competence test under the current legislation.
- (f) Having considered the traffic impact, statutory planning requirement, environmental impact and infrastructural capacity, the Site is deemed appropriate to serve as the reprovisioning site of the ALCDS, as part of the joint-user complex development. The Site is close to the public transport and pedestrian network, making it a suitable location for driving training test facility.

Meet the Local Parking Demand in Eastern District

- (g) The car parking provision in Eastern District is inadequate. The applicant has conducted a parking demand assessment in the vicinity of the Site and concluded that there is a considerable demand for parking spaces in the area that needs to be met. Also, there will be a decrease in parking spaces in the locality due to closure of some temporary parking sites to make way for long term developments. As such, parking spaces in the proposed development is proposed to meet the public demand for car parking and maintain a constant supply of parking spaces in the area.

In line with the Policy of using Government-owned Premises and to meet the Needs for New Office Accommodation Spaces

- (h) The proposed development will provide new office space which allows Government departments to relocate their offices from existing leased accommodation and to accommodate new office space without the need to rent new office space. It will also provide floor space for office relocation arising from the redevelopment of the Wan Chai Government Offices Compound.

Suitable site for the proposed Joint-user Complex

- (i) In view of the relatively low traffic flow in the area, the proposed joint-user complex at Chai Wan will serve as a suitable reprovisioning site for the ALCDS. Parking demand of the area is one of the factors in site selection for the PVP with APS. The PVP in the proposed joint-user complex will help to address the pressing demand for parking spaces in the area. With the considerable site area and allowable BH of the Site, the “Single Site, Multiple Uses” model can be adopted to accommodate various facilities in the Site. The Site, which is being occupied by temporary car park under STT, could be readily available for development.

Compliance with Sustainable Building Design Guidelines

- (j) In enhancing the quality and sustainability of the built environment, the proposed development complies with the guidelines in terms of building separation, building setback and site coverage of greenery requirements.

No Adverse Visual, Traffic, Environmental, Infrastructural and Gas Safety impact

- (k) Technical assessments submitted concluded that there will be no insurmountable impact arising from the proposed development.

Local Consultation and Responses to Public Comments

- (l) The Planning, Works and Housing Committee of the Eastern District Council was consulted on the proposed development on 23.11.2021. The applicant also organised a briefing session for the community on 20.11.2022 to explain the details of the proposed development to the local stakeholders and respond to their enquiries/concerns (**Appendix Ic**).
- (m) In responses to the public comments received, the applicant stated that:
 - (i) a TIA and a PER have been conducted for the proposed development and the results were acceptable. Nearby planned developments have been taken into account in the TIA;
 - (ii) the learner driver will only conduct their on-road training after they received basic driving training inside the driving school premises and they will be accompanied by driving instructors;
 - (iii) the driving training/test routes have avoided passing through major roads and junctions with heavy traffic as far as possible. According to the proposed driving test routes, the learner drivers/candidates will not drive to Heng Fa Chuen. The driver training/test will be restricted to designated periods to avoid peak hours. The test vehicles will also be evenly distributed among the test routes as far as possible;
 - (iv) the learner’s traffic has been taken into account in the TIA. The applicant will closely monitor the operation of the driving school and the traffic condition in the vicinity in the future, and discuss with the driving school for implementing possible measures whenever necessary;
 - (v) the main entrance of the proposed development will only allow left-

in/left-out operation. It is anticipated that motorists would choose Shun Tai Road instead of Shing Tai Road outside Heng Fa Chuen when travelling to Island Eastern Corridor;

- (vi) the existing ALCDS is currently operating under a STT and the site had been rezoned for open space development. The Site is needed for reprovisioning of the facility in order to continue the driving training and test services on Hong Kong Island;
- (vii) electric vehicle chargers will be provided at the parking spaces;
- (viii) the suggestion of shuttle bus to MTR Chai Wan and Heng Fa Chuen Stations is noted and the applicant would consider to adjust the public transport services to suit the operational need upon commissioning of the proposed development;
- (ix) to cope with the loss of parking spaces for medium and heavy vehicles, the applicant will consider designating new on-street parking spaces at Shing Tai Road near Hong Kong Institute of Vocational Education (Chai Wan) and Sheung On Street/Chong Fu Road and converting some of the existing parking spaces of STT parking sites for commercial vehicles. The proportions of various types of parking spaces in other STT carparks near the Site will be reviewed, if necessary;
- (x) the offices in the proposed joint-user complex will stagger lunch times in different time slots to spread out the flow of staff going out for meals so as to minimise the impact on nearby residents;
- (xi) tree transplantation for trees affected under the proposed development will be arranged as far as possible. Where tree felling is required, tree compensation in a ratio of not less than 1:1 will be provided; and
- (xii) the APS will be tower lifting type APS. The parking will be provided above ground taking into consideration of cost, time and sustainability.

3. Compliance with the “Owner’s Consent/Notification” Requirements

As the Site involves Government land only, the “owner’s consent/notification” requirements as set out in the “Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the ‘Owner’s Consent/Notification’ Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance” (TPB PG-No. 31A) are not applicable.

4. Background

The Site falls within an area zoned “Industrial” (“I”) on the Chai Wan OZP No. S/H20/1 gazetted in 1985 and was rezoned to “I”, “G/IC” and an area shown as ‘Road’ on the OZP No. S/H20/3 in 1986. In 2001 and 2011, the Site was rezoned to “Open Space” on the OZP No. S/H20/11 and “G/IC” on the OZP No. S/H20/19 respectively. It was subsequently rezoned to “G/IC(2)” on the OZP No. S/H20/20 in 2012 with stipulation of BH restrictions.

5. Previous Application

There is no previous application at the Site.

6. Similar Application

There is no similar application for proposed driving school within the Chai Wan OZP.

7. The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1 and A-2, aerial photo on Plan A-3 and site photos on Plans A-4 to A-7)

7.1 The Site is:

- (a) located at the junction of Shing Tai Road, Sheung Mau Street and Sheung Tat Street in Chai Wan area;
- (b) paved and currently used as temporary car park for medium goods vehicles, heavy goods vehicles, buses and light buses under STT; and
- (c) accessible from Sheung Tat Street.

7.2 The surrounding areas have the following characteristics:

- (a) to the east across Sheung Tat Street is the construction site for Chai Wan Government Complex and Vehicle Depot, New World First Bus Chong Fu Road Permanent Depot; to the further east is the Chai Wan Public Cargo Working Area;
- (b) to the south across Sheung Mau Street is a petrol filling station and Citybus Chai Wan Depot;
- (c) to the west across Shing Tai Road is the railway tracks of MTR Island Line, Hong Kong Institute of Vocational Education (Chai Wan) and Knight Court;
- (d) to the north is Heng Fa Chuen Electricity Substation Building and the construction site for Water Supplies Department and Correctional Services Department Headquarters Building. To the further northwest is an existing residential development, Heng Fa Chuen; and
- (e) the MTR Heng Fa Chuen Station is about 380m to the northwest of the Site.

8. Planning Intention

The planning intention of the “G/IC(2)” zone is primarily for the provision of Government, institution or community facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.

9. Comments from Relevant Government Departments

9.1 The following Government departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

Land Administration

9.1.1 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Hong Kong East, Lands Department (DLO/HKE, LandsD):

- (a) the Site falls within land let by way of STT (STT No. EHX-503 running on quarterly basis) for the purposes of a fee-paying public carpark;
- (b) the implementation of the proposed joint-user complex by the applicant requires a Permanent Government Land Allocation. The applicant should make a timely application for the proposed land allocation. If the allocatee allows third parties (e.g. the proposed reprovisioning of the existing ALCDS) to occupy the land/building, it is the allocatee's responsibility to handle, supervise and monitor the use and occupation of the land/building by third parties to ensure the agreed aims and objectives are achieved, and to recover the land in case the allocatee considers there is under-utilisation or abuse;
- (c) the western part of the Site along Shing Tai Road encroaches onto the MTR Protection Boundary;
- (d) a significant part of the Site encroaches onto Drainage Services Department (DSD)'s Sewage Tunnel Outer Protection Area for Construction Works and Sewage Tunnel Protection Area for Ground Investigation Works, comments from DSD should be sought;
- (e) the eastern part of the Site along Sheung Tat Street encroaches onto a 132kV Cable Reserve. According to paragraph 2.2.2 of the PS, there are existing reserved cables and ducts within the Site, which has been de-energised as advised by Hong Kong Electric Co. Ltd (HKE) and will be removed for the construction of the proposed development;
- (f) the applicant's responses to address Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (DLCS)'s comments on the tree felling and compensatory proposal and public concern (i.e. Item PC-20 in **Appendix Ib**) on the trees matter would be handled by the Tree Works Vetting Panel of the project department (i.e. Architectural Services Department) in accordance with DEVB Technical Circular (Works) No. 4/2020 is noted; and
- (g) he shall defer the relevant departments to consider and comment on the applicant's Conceptual Landscape Plans, TIA, PER and SDIA as well as the responses in the responses-to-comments

table.

Traffic Aspect

9.1.2 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T) (Traffic Engineering (Hong Kong) Division):

the TIA submitted by the applicant has assessed the traffic impact from the PVP, the Government offices and the driving school to the nearby road network and proposed suitable improvement schemes. He has no comment on the TIA submitted and the application from traffic engineering viewpoint.

9.1.3 Comments of the Commissioner of Police (C of P):

- (a) no objection in principle to the proposed development. However, the proposed location is right next to the new Chai Wan Government Complex and Vehicle Depot, which targets to commission in 2024. The traffic impact caused to the area during and after the construction period should be noted; and
- (b) no comment at present stage from a quantitative view judging from the TIA. However, long/wide vehicles would be anticipated and the run-in/out of proposed development should take this into account since there are bus depots and warehouses/godowns in the vicinity.

Urban Design and Visual Aspect

9.1.4 Comments of Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):

- (a) the Site is located to the northwest of the cargo handling area in Chai Wan East and is mainly surrounded by existing/planned medium-rise “G/IC” developments (with BH restriction up to 70mPD) and open spaces to its immediate surroundings. To its further north and further south are existing high-rise industrial and residential developments (with BH up to about 110mPD); and
- (b) judging from the photomontages of the Visual Appraisal, the proposed development without exceeding the BH restriction is considered compatible with the existing/planned developments in terms of visual character. As claimed by the applicant, the proposed landscape design will soften the building masses with a view to enhancing the visual and landscape amenity of the neighbourhood. As such, it is unlikely that the proposed development would induce significant adverse visual impact to the surroundings.

Landscape Aspect

9.1.5 Comments of CTP/UD&L, PlanD:

- (a) no objection to the application from landscape planning perspective;
- (b) based on aerial photo of 2022 and Section 2 of the applicant's PS, the Site is hard paved and currently occupied by a temporary public fee-paying car park, situated in an area of industrial urban landscape character surrounded by roads and existing buildings for GIC use. The proposed development of driving school, driving test centre & Government offices and PVP is considered not incompatible with the landscape character of its surroundings. With reference to Appendix 2 - Conceptual Landscape Plans, approx. 56 existing trees of common species have been surveyed within and in close proximity to the Site, no Old and Valuable Tree/tree of particular interest/rare protected species is found. According to Figure 8, a total of 26 existing trees (including 3 nos. of *Leucaena leucocephala*) will be affected by the proposed development and are proposed to be removed. Landscape mitigation measures such as planting of approximately 24 new trees and provision of planting areas as shown in Figures 1 to 5 have been proposed to mitigate landscape impact arising from the proposed development; and
- (c) the applicant should be advised that approval of this application does not imply approval of tree works such as pruning, transplanting and felling under lease. The applicant is reminded to seek approval for any proposed tree works from relevant departments prior to commencement of the works.

9.1.6 Comments of DLCS:

- (a) Leisure and Cultural Services Department is the maintenance department of 34 surveyed trees outside the Site. Among them, it is noted that four trees are proposed to be transplanted, while 13 trees are proposed to be felled since the applicant claimed that they are either in conflict with the proposed run-in/out and footpath widening work or their poor form/health and low amenity value. The applicant is reminded that the felling of trees will only be the last resort when retaining and transplanting the affected trees are not practical or due to the intrinsic condition of the trees. The applicant should make every possible measure to preserve and protect the existing trees from being adversely affected through careful and proper planning, design, working out and implementation of protective measures and site monitoring in all stages of the project. The applicant should also adhere to the requirement and procedure stipulated in Development Bureau Technical Circular (Works) No. 4/2020 and relevant guidelines promulgated by the Greening, Landscape and Tree Management Section of the Development Bureau on tree preservation if these

trees are inevitably be affected by the works; and

- (b) since detailed information on trees to be affected has not yet been provided (e.g. Tree Preservation and Removal Proposal, the relationship between the affected trees and proposed run-in/out and footpath widening), he would reserve to provide his comments until more details of the impact on trees are available.

Fire Safety

9.1.7 Comments of the Director of Fire Services (D of FS):

- (a) no objection in principle to the application subject to water supplies and fire service installations being provided to the satisfaction of the D of FS;
- (b) detailed fire safety requirements will be formulated upon receipt of formal submission of general building plans; and
- (c) nevertheless, the project proponent is advised to observe the requirements of emergency vehicular access as stipulated in Section 6, Part D of the Code of Practice for Fire Safety in Buildings 2011, which is administered by the Buildings Department (BD).

Buildings Matters

9.1.8 Comments of the Chief Building Surveyor/Hong Kong East and Heritage, BD (CBS/HKE&H, BD):

- (a) as the proposed PR does not exceed limits as specified in the First Schedule of the Building (Planning) Regulations (B(P)R), he has no objection in principle to the application;
- (b) GFA concessions (i.e. excluding/disregarding green/amenity features and non-mandatory/non-essential plant rooms and services from GFA and/or SC calculation) under Practice Notes for Authorized Persons, Registered Structural Engineers and Registered Geotechnical Engineers (PNAP) APP-151 will only be considered when the pre-requisites in paragraph 6 of PNAP APP-151, including Sustainable Building Design Guidelines as stated in PNAP APP-152, have been complied with;
- (c) areas of above ground public car park will be included in GFA calculation;
- (d) 50% GFA concession for above ground private car parking spaces and loading/unloading areas may be considered when the relevant requirements as laid down in PNAP APP-2 have been complied with;
- (e) justification on high headroom of the driving school & test

centre on G/F and electrical and mechanical facilities (E&M) on B/F and R/F should be provided for consideration; and

- (f) detailed comments under the Buildings Ordinance will be made at building plan submission stage.

Others

- 9.1.9 Comments of the Director of Electricity and Mechanical Services (DEMS):

Electricity Safety

- (a) no particular comment on the application from electricity supply safety aspect at this stage; and

LPG Safety

- (b) there are two LPG cum petrol filling stations at Sheung Mau Street and Chong Fu Road respectively, which are in close vicinity of the concerned development. He has no comment on the submitted QRA from auto-LPG safety perspective. Should there be any amendment to the parameters of the development adopted in the aforesaid QRA reports, the project proponent is reminded to inform him of the amendments and updates to the aforesaid QRA reports may be required.

- 9.1.10 Comments of the Controller, Government Flying Service:

- (a) with reference to the submitted information, it is estimated that the development will bring no significant conflict or safety concern with his flight operation at Eastern Hospital helipad. Therefore, his department has no comment on the application; and
- (b) however, to enhance aircrew situation awareness and flight safety during construction phase, the construction company should set up obstacle lights and/or adequate illumination on all rooftop cranes (highest obstacles) and provide a 24/7 contact point in case of urgent matters.

District Officer's Views

- 9.1.11 Comments of the District Officer (Eastern), Home Affairs Department (DO(E), HAD):

- (a) his office notices that the proposed development is concerned by local community and the locals. The main concern raised by locals is that the driving school may cause traffic congestion in Heng Fa Chuen and Chai Wan; and
- (b) In this regard, his office provided assistance to TD to hold a briefing session of the proposed development on 20.11.2022 in Yue Wan Community Hall to explain the proposal and answer

local stakeholders' questions. Major stakeholders attended the session, including representatives of Wan Tai Area Committee, Heng Fa Chuen, Heng Fa Villa and Citybus Chai Wan Depot. The applicant has taken into account the opinions raised by members of public.

9.2 The following Government departments have no objection to/no comment on the application:

- (a) Chief Highway Engineer/Hong Kong, Highways Department (CHE/HK, HyD);
- (b) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C, WSD);
- (c) Chief Engineer/Hong Kong & Islands, DSD (CE/HK&I, DSD);
- (d) Director of Environmental Protection (DEP)
- (e) Government Property Administrator (GPA);
- (f) Head of the Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (H(GEO), CEDD)
- (g) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (DFEH); and
- (h) Project Manager (South), CEDD.

10. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Periods

10.1 The application and the FI were published for public inspection. During the first three weeks of the statutory public inspection periods ended on 14.10.2022 and 13.12.2022 respectively, a total of 44 public comments were received (**Appendix II**). Out of the public comments, 38 public comments were objecting to the application and 6 comments provide views on the application.

Objecting comments

10.2 The objecting comments are submitted by individuals, two members of the Legislative Council, Heng Fa Chuen Owners' Committee (Residential), Sun Kwong Tourist Bus Company Limited and Kin Woo Transportation Company Limited. The major views of the public comments are summarised as follows:

- (a) there are different uses near the Site causing a large number of medium and heavy vehicles, public buses and school buses running through local roads during peak hours and there is only one main road connecting Heng Fa Chuen to nearby areas. The proposed development will increase traffic flow, leading to traffic congestion of the surrounding areas including Heng Fa Chuen. The TIA has failed to take into account the on-site traffic condition of Heng Fa Chuen and nearby roads.
- (b) the learner drivers who are inexperienced in driving will pose road safety risk to other drivers and pedestrians during their on-road training.
- (c) the proposed driving training and test routes should not pass through the roads near Heng Fa Chuen. Instead, it should be directed towards Chai Wan and Siu Sai Wan areas.

- (d) it is not necessary to relocate the driving school in Ap Lei Chau to the Site.
- (e) there is no information on the APS and it is wondered why underground parking is not provided.
- (f) there are other new Government developments and private/public housing developments nearby, which will overload the shopping mall and transport facilities in Heng Fa Chuen and affect local residents' daily lives.
- (g) the Site is currently used for parking of coaches and school buses serving residents and schools in the Eastern District. There is no more place for parking of such vehicles if the Site is used for the proposed development. It will lead to illegal parking in the area.
- (h) more than half of the trees related to the Site will be felled.
- (i) the proposed development has not provided the community facilities needed by the nearby communities such as library and recreation/sports centre.

Providing views

10.3 The public comments providing views are submitted by individuals. The major views of the public comments are summarised as follows:

- (a) the traffic of the road leading to Heng Fa Chuen is busy and it is hoped that the proposed development would not further worsen the traffic condition in the area.
- (b) the area of influence of the TIA should include the section of Shing Tai Road near Heng Fa Chuen and the traffic impact to this road section should be studied.
- (c) it is suggested to increase the number of parking spaces in the proposed development by increasing the proposed BH of the building so as to meet the imminent need of parking spaces in the area.
- (d) multi-storey parking facilities should be provided. It is suggested that more electric vehicle charging facilities should be provided in the proposed PVP. Day/night parking fee package should also be offered.
- (e) there should also be shuttle bus service between the proposed development and the nearby MTR stations (i.e. MTR Heng Fa Chuen and Chai Wan Stations).

11. Planning Considerations and Assessment

11.1 The application is to seek planning permission for proposed driving school

with permitted Government use (driving test centre & Government offices) and public vehicle park (excluding container vehicle) at the Site zoned “G/IC(2)” on the OZP. The proposed development is a joint-user complex with a driving school cum driving test centre for reprovisioning of the current ALCDS, a PVP by means of conventional parking and APS, and office accommodation for TD and HyD. The proposed development has a GFA of about 33,930m², a PR of 6.8 and a BH of not more than 70mPD (including roof-top structures) in compliance with the BH restriction.

Planning Intention

- 11.2 The Site zoned “G/IC(2)” is intended primarily for the provision of GIC facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments. The proposed development including the driving school is in line with the planning intention of “G/IC(2)” in which it provides parking facilities serving the needs of local residents, district and region. The applicant has conducted relevant technical assessments in demonstrating the technical feasibility of the proposed development including the driving school.

Site Selection

- 11.3 Regarding the site selection, the applicant stated that the Site is suitable for the proposed development. In view of the relatively low traffic flow in the area and the pressing demand for driving training/tests on Hong Kong Island, the Site is suitable to serve as the reprovisioning site for the ALCDS. In view of the strong local parking demand in Eastern District, the PVP with APS at the Site in Chai Wan will help to address such demand. With the considerable site area and allowable BH of the Site, the “Single Site, Multiple Uses” model can be adopted to accommodate various facilities serving the public. The Site could be readily available for development. In this regard, concerned departments including C for T have no objection to/no adverse comment on the application.

Land Use Compatibility and Visual Aspect

- 11.4 The Site is located in Chai Wan area to the west of the Chai Wan Public Cargo Working Area and to the southeast of Heng Fa Chuen. The surrounding areas are predominated by existing uses including bus depots, petrol filling stations, electricity substation, public cargo working area and schools as well as planned Government complexes. The proposed development is not incompatible with the surrounding land uses.
- 11.5 Development in the “G/IC(2)” zone is subject to a BH restriction of 70mPD (including roof-top structures) to safeguard the operation of helicopters and to facilitate the penetration of sea breeze into the inland area. The proposed BH of the proposed development complies with the BH restriction of the OZP. CTP/UD&L, PlanD commented that the proposed development without exceeding the BH restriction is considered compatible with the existing/planned developments in terms of visual character. GFS has no

comment on the application and indicated that the proposed development will bring no significant conflict or safety concern with his flight operation at Eastern Hospital helipad.

Traffic and Other Technical Considerations

- 11.6 On traffic aspect, the applicant has submitted a TIA in support of the proposed development. The TIA concluded that all the identified key junctions will operate within its capacity limit with the proposed development. Improvement to the junction of Shing Tai Road and Chong Fu Road with signalized pedestrian crossing and footpath widening at Shing Tai Road are proposed in order to cater for the future pedestrian demand. The driving training/test routes are planned with a view to avoiding roads and junctions with heavy traffic and existing residential area in Heng Fa Chuen, and the driving training would avoid traffic peak hours. The number of driving tests conducted at the same period would be controlled and the test vehicles would also be evenly distributed among the test routes. On parking provision of the area, redistribution of the existing parking inventory and new temporary on-street parking spaces are proposed. C for T, C of P and CHE/HK, HyD have no objection to/no comment on the application.
- 11.7 The applicant has also submitted a Conceptual Landscape Proposal, PER, SDIA and QRA in supporting the application. On landscape aspect, greenery will be provided at the proposed development and the trees felled due to the proposed development will be compensated in a ratio of not less than 1:1 in terms of quantity. CTP/UD&L, PlanD has no objection to the application from landscape planning perspective and DLCS has no adverse comment on the Conceptual Landscape Proposal submitted. DEP has no objection to the application from environmental planning perspective and has no comment on the PER and SIA submitted. CE/HK&I, DSD and DEMS has no comment on the DIA and QRA submitted respectively. Other concerned departments including CBS/HKE&H of BD, D of FS, CE/C of WSD have no objection to/no comment on the application from building, fire safety and water supplies perspectives.

Public Comments

- 11.8 There are 44 public comments received, of which 38 comments objecting to the application whereas 6 comments providing views on the application. The assessment and the applicant's responses to the public comments in paragraphs 11.1 to 11.6 and paragraph 2(l) above respectively are relevant.

12. Planning Department's Views

- 12.1 Based on the assessment made in paragraph 11 and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 10 above, PlanD has no objection to the application.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid until 13.1.2027, and after the said date, the permission shall cease to have effect unless, before the said date, the

development permitted is commenced or the permission is renewed. The following conditions of approval and advisory clauses are also suggested for Members' reference:

Approval Conditions

- (a) the design and provision of car parking spaces, loading/unloading spaces and vehicular access for the development to the satisfaction of Commissioner for Transport or of the Town Planning Board; and
- (b) the provision of fire service installations and water supplies for fire fighting to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board.

Advisory Clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at **Appendix III**.

- 12.3 There is no strong reason to recommend rejection of the application.

13. Decision Sought

- 13.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.
- 13.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the date when the validity of the permission should expire.
- 13.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

Attachments

Appendix I	Application form received on 14.9.2022
Appendix Ia	Planning Statement
Appendix Ib	Further Information dated 15.11.2022
Appendix Ic	Further Information dated 30.11.2022
Appendix Id	Further Information dated 28.12.2022
Appendix Ie	Further Information dated 3.1.2023
Appendix If	Further Information dated 9.1.2023
Appendix II	Public comments received during statutory publication periods
Appendix III	Recommended advisory clauses
Drawings A-1 to A-12	Floor plans and sectional plan of the proposed development
Drawings A-13 to A-18	Conceptual Landscape Proposal
Drawings A-19 to A-22	Photomontages of the proposed development
Drawing A-23	Existing public transport services and pedestrian walkway network
Drawing A-24	Proposed junction improvement at the junction of Shing Tai Road

	and Chong Fu Road
Drawing A-25	Proposed footpath widening scheme at Shing Tai Road
Drawings A-26 to A-29	Proposed driving test routes for private car and light goods vehicle
Drawings A-30 to A-31	Proposed driving test routes for motorcycle
Drawing A-32	Tree planting plan
Plan A-1	Location plan
Plan A-2	Site plan
Plan A-3	Aerial photo
Plans A-4 to A-7	Site photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT
JANUARY 2023