<u>APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION</u> UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/K18/348

Applicant : Hong Kong Baptist Hospital represented by Arup Hong Kong Limited

<u>Site</u>: Blocks A, B and C of Hong Kong Baptist Hospital, 222 Waterloo Road,

Kowloon Tong, Kowloon

Site Area : About 5,648.5m²

Lease : (a) New Kowloon Inland Lot (NKIL) 5906 subject to lease term to be

expired on 30.6.2047; and

(b) Subject to the following main restrictions:

 (i) a non-profit-making hospital together with such staff quarters as may be approved by the then Director of Medical and Health Services;

(ii) a height restriction of 51.82 metres above Principal Datum (mPD); and

(iii) a non-building area (NBA) of 6.1m abutting on Waterloo Road

Plan : Approved Kowloon Tong Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K18/21

Zoning : "Government, Institution or Community (7)" ("G/IC(7)") (about 5,566.3m²/98.54%) and area shown as 'Road' (about 82.2m²/1.46%)¹

(a) maximum building height restriction (BHR) of 10 storeys (excluding basement floor(s)), or the height of the existing building, whichever is the greater; and

(b) based on the individual merits of a development or redevelopment proposal, minor relaxation of the BHR may be considered by the Town Planning Board (the Board) on application.

<u>Application</u>: Proposed Minor Relaxation of BHR for Permitted Hospital

Redevelopment

¹ A minor portion of the Site shown as 'Road' (about 1.46%) can be considered as minor boundary adjustment under the Covering Notes of the OZP.

1 The Proposal

- 1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for proposed minor relaxation of BHR from 10 storeys to 14 to 15 storeys (i.e. +4 to 5 storeys / +40 to 50%), both excluding basement floors, for permitted hospital redevelopment at the application site (the Site), which falls within an area zoned "G/IC(7)" on the OZP (**Plan A-1**). According to the Notes of the OZP, minor relaxation of the BHR may be considered by the Board on application under section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance) based on the individual merits of a development proposal.
- 1.2 The existing Hong Kong Baptist Hospital (HKBH) comprises five blocks of hospital buildings (i.e. Blocks A to E). The proposal involves the redevelopment of the interconnected Blocks A to C (i.e. the Site) into one new block, which will be conducted in two phases to maintain continuous hospital operations. Phase 1 involves redevelopment of the 6-storey Block A built in 1963, and Phase 2 redevelopment of the 7-storey Block B built in 1982 and the 8-storey Block C built in 1987 (Drawings The new block will accommodate clinical and support services, in-A-31 to A-33). patient accommodation, associated supporting facilities and a basement car park. The proposed redevelopment will provide a total of 700 beds representing an addition of 111 beds as compared to the current provision of 589 beds (i.e. an increase of about 18.85%) with larger bed cubicle sizes; additional operation theatres (OTs) and intensive care units (ICU); and additional floor space for upgrading existing aging medical facilities, E&M facilities and plant rooms in meeting the prevailing standards and latest statutory regulations.
- 1.3 The proposed development will provide a 6m-wide setback along Waterloo Road in accordance with the NBA requirement designated on the Kowloon Tong Outline Development Plan (ODP) No. D/K18/1A to enhance the townscape of the area (**Drawings A-4 and A-27 and Plan A-3**), which will be accessible by the public. Fence walls incorporating a water meter cabinet are proposed within the NBA. The proposed new block will also provide setbacks of 6.8m, 16m and 6.2m from the northern, eastern and southern site boundaries from 3/F (**Drawing A-27**).
- 1.4 According to the Tree Preservation and Removal Proposal (TPRP) and Landscape Proposal (LP) (**Appendix If**), for all four existing trees within the site proposed to be felled (**Drawing A-24**), three compensatory trees on G/F and one on 3/F are proposed, and seven other new trees are also proposed on 3/F (**Drawing A-25**). Greenery and planters are proposed on the fence walls on G/F along Waterloo Road and Kam Shing Road; an outdoor landscaped area with seating benches for visitors is proposed on 3/F along eastern and southern site boundaries; a green roof is proposed on the UR/F; and vertical greenings are proposed for the building façade on 1/F to 3/F, 4/F to 13/F and R/F (**Drawings A-28 to A-30**).
- 1.5 According to the proposed access arrangement (**Drawing A-22**), both existing vehicular accesses on Waterloo Road and Kam Shing Road (to the east of the site) shall be converted to egresses only and a new vehicular ingress is proposed on Kam Shing Road (to the south of the Site); for pedestrians, two entrances are proposed respectively along Waterloo Road and Kam Shing Road (to the south of the Site). The Site is connected to Block D via an existing 2-storey link bridge², which

² During Phase 2, a proposed temporary bridge on 2/F of the proposed development will be provided to connect the completed Phase 1 development to the existing link bridge (**Drawing A-31**). Both bridges do not form part of the application.

2

currently provides both pedestrian/vehicular access on the lower floor (i.e. 1/F of the proposed development) and pedestrian access on the upper floor (i.e. 2/F of the proposed development) (**Plans A-6 and A-7 and Drawing A-14**). The pedestrian/vehicular access of the link bridge is proposed to be converted into a dedicated pedestrian walkway. To enhance the pedestrian connectivity for visitors travelling from public transit stops along Junction Road to the Site, cautionary pedestrian crossings are proposed at Kam Shing Road (to the south of the Site) (**Drawing A-23**). As a result, 10 existing on-street motorcycle parking spaces (**Plan A-5**) are proposed to be relocated to the west of Wai Hang Sports Centre on Kam Shing Road outside the Site. A continuous canopy will also be provided on G/F (**Drawings A-26 and A-29**) along a 24-hour accessible walkway facing Kam Shing Road for visitors of HKBH and students entering Hong Kong Baptist University (HKBU) via Kam Shing Road and a stepped open area called Man Lung Garden of HKBU (**Plans A-2 and A-5**).

- 1.6 A total of 269 parking spaces are proposed for the redevelopment, including the reprovisioning of the 13 existing car parking spaces at Block D due to the proposed conversion of the existing vehicular portion of link bridge.
- 1.7 The proposed floor plans, section plan, landscape plans, photomontages and perspectives of the Proposed Scheme are at **Drawings A-1 to A-21, A-25, A-26 and A-28 to A-30**. The key development parameters are summarised below:

Development Parameters	Proposed Scheme
Site Area	About 5,648.5m ²
Total Gross Floor Area (GFA)	About 61,513m ²
Total Plot Ratio (PR)	About 10.89
Building Height (BH)	14 to 15 storeys ^[1] excluding 3 levels of basement (about 93.5 to 102.5mPD at main roof level) (about 96.5 to 109mPD including all rooftop structures)
Site Coverage (SC)	
- Below 15m	Not more than 100%
- Above 15m	Not more than 62.5%
Floor-to-floor Heights	About 4.2 to 6m
No. of In-patient Bed Spaces	700
No. of OTs	16
Parking Spaces	269
- Private Car Parking	$244^{[2]}$
- Motorcycle Parking	25
Loading/unloading (L/UL) Spaces	11
- Light Goods Vehicles (LGV)	1
Parking	
- Medium/Heavy Goods Vehicles	2
(M/HGV) Parking	
- Taxi/Private Cars	5
- Ambulance ^[3]	2
- Public Light Bus	1
Greenery Coverage	Not less than 20% ^[4]
Tentative Phasing Plan	Phase 1: 2025 to 2028
	Phase 2: 2029 to 2033

Note:

- The existing Blocks A, B and C shall be redeveloped into one block in two phases: 14 storeys for [1] Phase 1 (i.e. existing Block A) and 15 storeys for Phase 2 (i.e. existing Blocks B and C).
- [2] Including 3 accessible parking spaces
- [3] [4] HKBH does not own/hire any ambulances and no ambulance parking space is proposed at the Site.
- 10% will be located in the primary zone of the proposed development.

1.8 The floor uses and floor-to-floor height of the proposed development (Drawing A-14) are as follows:

	Floor height	Floor Uses	
B3/F	5m	Clinical Services / Support Services / E&M facilities	
B2/F	4.2m	Car Park / Support Services / E&M facilities	
B1/F	4.5m	Car Park / Support Services / E&M facilities	
G/F	6m	Clinical Services / Support Services / Ancillary	
		Services / L/UL/Drop-off Areas / Entrance Atrium /	
		Back of House (BOH)	
1/F	5m	Clinical Services / Ancillary Services / Link Bridge /	
		BOH / E&M Facilities	
2/F	5m	Clinical Services / Support Services / Link Bridge /	
		BOH / E&M Facilities	
3/F	4.5m	Clinical Services / Support Services / BOH E&M	
		Facilities / Staff Garden /	
4/F	5m	Clinical Services / Support Services / BOH / E&M	
5/F to 11/F	4.5m	Facilities	
12/F to 14/F	4.5m [#]	Clinical Services / Support Services / BOH / E&M	
		Facilities	
R/F	5m [#]	E&M Facilities	

[#] Excluding rooftop structures

In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents: 1.9

(a)	Application Form received on 13.3.2024	(Appendix I)
(b)	Supporting Planning Statement (SPS) received on 13.3.2024	(Appendix Ia)
(c)	Further information (FI) received on 2.4.2024 [1st FI]*	(Appendix Ib)
(d)	FI received on 31.5.2024 and 6.6.2024 [2 nd FI]*	(Appendix Ic)
(e)	FI received on 10.7.2024 and 12.7.2024 [3 rd FI]*	(Appendix Id)
(f)	FI received on 23.7.2024 [4 th FI]	(Appendix Ie)
(g)	Consolidated SPS received on 2.8.2024	(Appendix If)

Remarks:

1.10 On 24.5.2024, the Metro Planning Committee (the Committee) agreed to defer making a decision on the application for two months as requested by the applicant.

2 **Justifications from the Applicant**

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are set out in the consolidated SPS at Appendix If, which are summarised as follows:

^{*} not exempted from publication and recounting requirements

In Line with Government Policy and Meeting Community Need and Territorial Demand of Healthcare Services

- 2.1 The proposed redevelopment will provide additional hospital beds, enhance the existing facilities and the quality of healthcare services, and allow for a more spacious and better ward environment for patients, which is in line with the Government's policy objectives of providing additional healthcare infrastructure and improving the medical services in meeting the increasing demand arising from aging population.
- 2.2 HKBH is committed to contributing to the community by providing private healthcare services when needed. The proposed development will be able to serve more patients, meeting the community's needs and relieving the pressure of the public healthcare system.

In Line with Planning Intention and Compatible with the Surroundings

- 2.3 The proposed minor relaxation of BHR is to expand the service capacity of the Site and upgrade the aging infrastructure of the hospital, which is in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone on the OZP to provide land for uses in support of the work of the Government and social services in serving the needs of the residents and the general public.
- 2.4 The BH of the proposed development shall remain consistent with the surrounding BH profile of the Site, including other developments of HKBU within "G/IC" zones with approved applications for minor relaxation of BHR to 14 to 21 storeys (i.e. Nos. A/K18/137, A/K18/329 and A/K18/343), which are already more than 13 storeys³. There are also other existing residential buildings with similar or higher BH as the proposed development (e.g. One Mayfair (10 storeys/+97.6mPD) and the Palace (37 storeys/+180.75mPD)).

Proposed Floor-to-floor Heights of the Development

2.5 The proposed floor-to-floor heights of 4.2m to 6m (**Drawing A-14**) are necessary to meet the installation requirements of medical equipment for OTs and isolation ward as well as the associated headroom clearance requirements of isolation and typical wards, E&M services and HGV/MGV parking and openings for the existing footbridge. The proposed floor-to-floor heights have been minimized and are considered just adequate to meet these requirements.

Design Constraints and Operational Requirements

2.6 The proposed three levels of basement have already been maximized. Further additional basements will necessitate extra frontage and G/F space for Means of Escape (MoE) staircases, smoke vents, and other fire safety requirements, while the G/F of the proposed development (**Drawing A-4**) is already occupied by other essential facilities, such as the car ramp, L/UL spaces, pedestrian entrances, MoE staircases, E&M facilities etc.

³ According to the Explanatory Statement of the OZP, the BHR for the Kowloon Tong Area should not be more than 13 storeys to preserve the existing townscape.

2.7 The existing vacuum insulated evaporator (VIE) tank currently situated in Block C that is essential for hospital operations will be demolished. Reprovisioning the VIE tank at the proposed location in Block A (**Drawing A-4**) is imperative to ensure the uninterrupted operation of the hospital during the phasing redevelopment. The placement of the VIE tank has already made use of the 6m NBA along Waterloo Road in meeting the regulatory requirements of a 7m clearance from the VIE tank to the openings of the buildings.

Design Merits

- 2.8 The proposed development provides a 6m building setback from Waterloo Road for better pedestrian environment, which complies with the NBA requirement of the ODP (**Plan A-3**). The 6m-wide setback can improve pedestrian environment and allow landscaping opportunities. Landscape provisions including vertical greenery, planters, outdoor landscaped area and green roof as well as a greenery coverage of not less than 20% in compliance with the Sustainable Building Design Guidelines (SBDG) are proposed to soften the building façade and increase visual amenity to the surroundings. Canopies are also proposed along Kam Shing Road.
- 2.9 Green building design solutions are incorporated into the proposed development, aiming to meet the standards of BEAM Plus New Buildings v2.0, such as the use of low-carbon construction materials, modular design, and precast materials to reduce wastage. This aligns with HKBH's goal of becoming a green and smart hospital.

No Adverse Technical Impacts

2.10 The Visual Impact Assessment (VIA) demonstrated that the proposed scheme is considered to be fully acceptable in terms of visual impact. The Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) demonstrated that the proposed development will not impose adverse traffic impact on the surrounding road network. The Environmental Assessment (EA) demonstrated that no adverse impact on air quality, noise, water quality, waste management and land contamination are anticipated.

3 Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements

The applicant is the sole 'current land owner' of the Site. Detailed information would be deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection.

4 Previous Application

There is no previous application concerning the Site.

5 Similar Applications

There are two similar applications (Nos. A/K18/269 and A/K18/345) within the "G/IC(7)" zone and six applications (Nos. A/K18/236, A/K18/245, A/K18/314, A/K18/316, A/K18/329 and A/K18/343) within the "G/IC", "G/IC(2)", "G/IC(4)" and "G/IC(9)" zones

(Plan A-1) for minor relaxation of BHR for various Government, Institution and Community (GIC) uses. The approvals of seven similar applications are mainly on grounds that the proposals have design merits and shall not create adverse visual and other impacts to the surroundings. The rejection of application No. A/K18/245 within the "G/IC(2)" zone is on grounds that the proposal has insufficient planning and design merits and there is no strong justification as there was scope to provide carpark in the basement of the proposed development. Details of the applications are summarized in **Appendix II**.

6 The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1 to A-3 and site photos on Plans A-4 to A-7)

- 6.1 The Site is
 - (a) the northern portion of the existing HKBH at 222 Waterloo Road;
 - (b) currently occupied by the existing Blocks A, B and C of hospital buildings of HKBH; and
 - (c) accessible via Waterloo Road and Kam Shing Road;
- 6.2 The surrounding areas have the following characteristics:
 - (a) to the immediate north is the Ho Sin Hang Campus of the HKBU and to the northeast is a slope on which the Commercial Radio, Radio Television Hong Kong (RTHK) Television House and the RTHK Broadcasting House, as well as a cluster of low to medium rise, low-density residential developments at the Broadcast Drive are situated;
 - (b) to the immediate east across a pathway to the HKBU and Kam Shing Road is a stepped open area named Man Lung Garden and a medium-rise commercial centre named Franki Centre respectively;
 - (c) to the immediate south is the Telephone Exchange and to the south across Kam Shing Road is Blocks D and E of the existing HKBH; and to the further south is the Kowloon East Barracks; and
 - (d) to the immediate west is the Waterloo Road and Waterloo Road flyover.

7 Planning Intention

- 7.1 The "G/IC" zone is intended primarily for the provision of Government, institution or community facilities serving the needs of the local residents as well as the general public. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.
- 7.2 As stated in the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the OZP, the BHRs are primarily set to maintain the existing character and allow variety in the overall BH profile of Kowloon Tong Area; and the BH concept is to preserve the view corridor along Waterloo Road for the "G/IC" zones. A minor relaxation clause in respect of BHRs

is incorporated into the Notes of the OZP in order to provide incentive for development/redevelopment with design merits/planning gains. Each application for minor relaxation of BHR will be considered on its own merits and the relevant criteria for consideration of such relaxation are as follows:

- (a) amalgamating smaller sites for achieving better urban design and local area improvements;
- (b) accommodating the bonus PR granted under the Buildings Ordinance in relation to surrender/dedication of land/area for use as public passage/street widening;
- (c) providing better streetscape/good quality street level public urban space;
- (d) providing separation between buildings to enhance air and visual permeability;
- (e) accommodating building design to address specific site constraints in achieving the permissible PR under the OZP; and
- (f) other factors, such as the need for tree preservation, innovative building design and planning merits that would bring about improvements to townscape and amenity of the locality, provided that no adverse landscape and visual impacts would be resulted from the innovative building design.

8 Comments from Relevant Government Departments

8.1 The following government departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

Policy Aspect

8.1.1 Comments of the Secretary for Health (S for Health):

in-principle policy support is given for the proposed hospital redevelopment. His detailed comments are at **Appendix IV**.

Land Administration

- 8.1.2 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Kowloon East, Lands Department (DLO/KE, LandsD):
 - (a) the Site is located at NKIL No. 5906 (the Lot) with its lease term to be expired on 30.6.2047. Pursuant to the lease conditions, the use is restricted for a non-profit making hospital together with such staff quarters as may be approved by the then Director of Medical and Health Services;
 - (b) the Lot is subject to a height restriction of 51.82mPD and a 6m NBA abutting Waterloo Road. The proposed redevelopment with the proposed BH would be in breach of the existing lease conditions; and

(c) should the application be approved by the Board, the applicant has to apply to LandsD for a lease modification to implement the proposal. However, there is no guarantee that the lease modification would be approved. Such application, if received, will be considered by LandsD acting in its capacity as the landlord at its sole discretion and any approval given will be subject to such terms and conditions, including, inter alia, payment of premium and administrative fee as may be imposed by LandsD.

Building Matters

8.1.3 Comments of the Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department (CBS/K, BD):

no objection in principle to the application subject to his detailed comments at **Appendix V**.

Traffic

8.1.4 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T):

noting that the applicant will provide one public light bus lay-by within the proposed development, no further comments on the revised TIA from traffic engineering viewpoint.

8.1.5 Comments of the Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, Highways Department (CHE/K, HyD):

no adverse comments on the application from highway's maintenance point of view. His advisory comments are at **Appendix V**.

Urban Design, Visual Impact and Landscape Planning Aspects

8.1.6 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):

Urban Design and Visual Aspects

(a) to the immediate north of the Site is the HKBU within the same "G/IC(7)" zone, with the existing BHs ranging from 1 to 10 storeys (about 57.5 to 84.1mPD). The northern portion of the HKBU site is the subject of an approved scheme under application No. A/K18/345 for minor relaxation of BHR from 10 to 11 storeys (94.35mPD at main roof level/106.65mPD at upper roof level (UR/F)) for an academic complex. To the northeast and northwest of the Site are mainly characterized by low to medium-rise residential developments with the existing BHs ranging from 5 to 13 storeys (about 56.8mPD to 103.6mPD). According to Para. 8.3.10 of the ES of the OZP, stepped BH profile with two tiers of BH restrictions, i.e. 13 storeys for the "R(C)6" zone and 10 storeys for the "R(C)10" zone, are adopted to allow smooth transition of BH from the high-rise public housing

estates in Wang Tau Hom to the low-rise developments in the inner Kowloon Tong and to echo the stepped height concept for the area to the north of Cornwall Street. The BH concept for the subject "G/IC(7)" zone (Para. 8.4.3 of the ES refers) and lower BH for the "R(C)10" zone in the vicinity are required to preserve the view corridor along Waterloo Road;

- as illustrated in the photomontages of VP3 (i.e. footbridge near Holy Family Canossian School (Kowloon Tong)) (Drawing A-17), the proposed development with BHs of 14 to 15 storeys (about 93.5 to 102.5mPD at main roof level/about 107.5mPD at UR/F) will obstruct a considerable portion of the view towards the mountain backdrop and border the ridgeline of Lion Rock. The continuity of the mountain backdrop will be disturbed and the intended smooth gradation of BH profile may inevitably be weakened. In this connection, the applicant has proposed a varying height profile at the top four floors (13/F to UR/F) of the proposed development descending from 107.5mPD to 93.5mPD (main roof levels) from the east to west to alleviate the visual impact arising from the proposed development. Nevertheless, as illustrated in the photomontages of VP3A (i.e. footbridge near American International School) (Drawing A-18), portions of the mountain backdrop and ridgeline will largely be maintained when viewing along Waterloo Road at a farther distance. Notwithstanding the above, the proposed development will not encroach onto the 20% building free zone of the ridgelines from Strategic Viewing Points (SVP) 7 – Sun Yat Sen Memorial Park and SVP 8 – Central Pier No. 7 (**Drawings A-20 and A-21**);
- (c) as gathered from the submission, the proposed development has incorporated (i) 6m-wide NBA along the western boundary of the site in accordance with the Kowloon Tong ODP No. D/K18/1A; (ii) building setback at G/F of about 1.3m along Kam Shing Road; (iii) tower setbacks of about 6.8m, 16m and 6.2m at 3/F from the northern, eastern and southern site boundaries respectively; and (iv) a 1m-wide canopy along Kam Shing Road. Landscape treatments in form of 1.1m to 2.5m-wide landscape fence walls abutting Waterloo Road, tree planting on G/F and 3/F, planters on G/F, 1/F to 3/F, green roofs on 3/F and UR/F and vertical greenery/green walls at G/F, 1/F, 3/F, 4/F to 13/F and R/F are proposed. The applicant also undertakes to explore suitable façade treatment and landscaped pavement at the detailed design stage. The above design measures may soften the building bulk, promote visual interest, and enhance pedestrian comfort and connectivity; and
- (d) it is noted that the requirements for the minimum SC of greenery will be met as prescribed under SBDG, while the requirements for building separation and building setback will not be pursued 'due to medical operational need for large continuous floor plate for hospital buildings' (Appendix If);

Landscape Planning

(e) with reference to the aerial photo of 2022, the Site is situated in an area

- of institutional landscape character dominated by educational institutes and residential developments. The proposed hospital redevelopment is considered not incompatible with the surrounding environment;
- (f) according to the submitted SPS, 4 existing trees are identified within the Site and they are all proposed to be felled. Total 11 trees (4 compensatory trees and 7 new trees) are proposed within the Site on G/F and 3/F. Landscape area at 3/F, green roof on UR/F, and vertical green walls at G/F, the building façade from 1/F to 3/F, 4/F to 13/F and R/F at south side of the building are proposed. Significant adverse landscape impact arising from the proposed development is not anticipated; and
- (g) her advisory comments are at **Appendix V**.
- 8.1.7 Comments of the Chief Architect/Advisory and Statutory Compliance Division, Architectural Services Department (CA/ASC, ArchSD):

the proposed development appears to be compatible with the developments in the surrounding environment. She has no particular comment from architectural and visual impact point of view.

Environmental

- 8.1.8 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):
 - (a) having reviewed the revised EA and Sewerage Impact Assessment (SIA), his detailed comments are at **Appendix IV**. Nevertheless, insurmountable environmental impacts arising from the proposed development are not anticipated and he has no in-principle objection to the application;
 - (b) in view of the manhole survey to be conducted at later detailed design stage, and to address the potential land contamination issue of the proposed development and detailed comments provided at **Appendix IV**, relevant approval conditions in paragraph 11 are suggested to be imposed should the Board decide to approve the application; and
 - (c) his other advisory comments are at **Appendix V**.
- 8.2 The following government departments have no adverse comments to the application and their detailed and advisory comments, if any, are at **Appendices IV and V** respectively:
 - (a) Commissioner of Police (C of P);
 - (b) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department (CE/MS of DSD);
 - (c) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C of WSD);
 - (d) Project Manager (East), Civil Engineering and Development Department;
 - (e) Director of Fire Services (D of FS);
 - (f) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (DEMS);
 - (g) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (DFEH); and

(h) District Officer (Kowloon City), Home Affairs Department (DO(KC), HAD).

9 Public Comments Received During the Statutory Publication Period

9.1 On 19.3.2024, 12.4.2024, 11.6.2024 and 16.7.2024, the application and FIs were published respectively for public inspection. During the statutory public inspection periods, 26 public comments from individuals were received, including two objecting to the application from the same individual and the others supporting the application (**Appendix III**). The major grounds of public views are summarised below:

Supporting Views (24)

- (a) there is an increasing demand for medical services in the community and the proposed development can reduce pressure of public medical services;
- (b) the existing hospital has a history of over 60 years and its facilities are aging, which should be upgraded to keep up with international medical standards of other hospitals in Hong Kong. The proposal provides opportunities to add new medical equipment and facilities;
- (c) the proposal increases the capability of the hospital in infection prevention and in handling potential challenges in case of new waves of pandemics;
- (d) the expansion offers more space for installing advanced equipment in the hospital, enhancing patient comfort, improving the quality of medical services, all without compromising the number of beds;
- (e) to attract and retain medical professionals to ensure the delivery of high-quality healthcare services;
- (f) to align with the Government policy in advancing the health services in Hong Kong;
- (g) HKBH is a private hospital that offers reasonably priced services and prioritizes the mental wellness of patients. The proposal stands to benefit public interest; and
- (h) the proposed development takes into account SBDG and environmental consideration, creating a more sustainable urban environment.

Objecting Views (2)

- (i) the proposed development is likely to create a wall effect, negatively affecting light and ventilation penetration to HKBU campus situated north of the Site. Relocating HKBU to the Northern Metropolis will pave the way for the hospital's expansion, preventing adverse effects resulting from minor relaxation of BHR. The Board should consider the proposal in a comprehensive and holistic manner; and
- (j) as indicated on the photomontages, the proposed development will impact the view of the Lion Rock for the enjoyment by the community.

10 Planning Considerations and Assessments

10.1 The application is to seek planning permission for minor relaxation of BHR from 10 storeys to 14 to 15 storeys (i.e. +4 to 5 storeys / +40 to 50%) for permitted hospital redevelopment. The Site is zoned "G/IC(7)" which is intended primarily for the provision of GIC facilities serving the needs of the local residents as well as the general public. As mentioned in paragraph 1.2, the proposed redevelopment is mainly to provide additional in-patient accommodation with larger cubicle sizes, additional OTs and ICUs, and additional floor space for upgrading the aging medical facilities and associated E&M facilities. 'Hospital' is an always permitted use of the "G/IC" zone, the proposed hospital redevelopment is in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone.

Policy Aspect

10.2 With the minor relaxation of BHR, HKBH can make effective use of the Site for enhancing service provision in order to increase overall capacity of healthcare system in Hong Kong without reliance on additional Government land. Upon redevelopment, the hospital could provide 111 extra beds (+18.85%) and three additional OTs (+23.08%). S for Health provides in-principle support to the application.

Minor Relaxation of BHR and Visual Impact

- 10.3 The proposed development is situated within a cluster of other sub-areas of "G/IC" zones i.e. "G/IC(1)", "G/IC(3)" and "G/IC(11)", which are subject to BHRs ranging from 1 to 13 storeys (excluding basement floor(s)) (**Plan A-2**). According to the ES of the OZP, while the BH concept is to preserve the view corridor along Waterloo Road for the "G/IC" zones, there is provision for minor relaxation of the BHR for development with constraints or merits. In this respect, the proposal has satisfied the criteria in the ES.
- 10.4 As explained in paragraphs 2.5 to 2.7 above, the Site is subject to various operational requirements (regulatory requirement for the VIE tank, phasing needs, alignment with Hospital Authority standards and E&M requirements). According to the applicant, the proposed BH is already minimized by providing three levels of basement, maximizing the building footprint and minimizing the floor-to-floor heights.
- 10.5 Having reviewed the VIA submitted by the applicant, CTP/UD&L of PlanD comments that the proposed development will not encroach onto the 20% building free zone of the ridgelines when viewed from SVPs (i.e. SVP 7 Sun Yat Sen Memorial Park and SVP 8 Central Pier No. 7 on **Drawings A-20 and A-21**); yet the proposed development will disturb and weaken the ridgeline of Lion Rock when viewed from the footbridge near Holy Family Canossian School (Kowloon Tong) (i.e. VP3 on **Drawing A-17**). That said, the proposed height profile of the 14 to 15-storey hospital building adopting a cascading building top arrangement has created a stepped height profile. Taking into account all the rooftop ancillary structures (**Drawings A-14 and A-34**), the resultant BH profile descends from Phase 2 (109mPD including rooftop structures) in the east to Phase 1 of the proposed development (96.5mPD including rooftop structures) in the west (**Drawing A-34**), respecting the ridgeline of Lion Rock as a mountain backdrop and striving to preserve the view corridor along Waterloo Road immediately to the west of the Site.

- 10.6 The subject application with the proposed BH ranging from 96.5mPD to 109mPD including all rooftop ancillary structures is considered not incompatible with the adjacent academic complex of the HKBU within the same "G/IC(7)" zone, which is the subject of an approved application No. A/K18/345 for minor relaxation of BHR from 10 to 11 storeys (106.65mPD at upper roof level). CA/ASC of ArchSD concurs and has no comment from architectural and visual impact point of view.
- 10.7 The BH profile including rooftop structures (96.5mPD to 109mPD) runs with the ridgeline of Lion Rock at VP3. Subject to the Board's decision, for clarity and certainty, it is considered prudent to set the control of the Site in terms of mPD by sub-areas in accordance with the rooftop layout plan submitted by the applicant (**Drawing A-34**), on which the visual effect has been illustrated (**Drawing A-17**).

Design Merits

10.8 The proposed development will provide a 6m-wide building setback along Waterloo Road to comply with the NBA requirement of the ODP to enhance the townscape of the Kowloon Tong Area. Boundary, fence walls or minor structures are generally allowed within the NBA with reference to the concerned Frequently-asked Questions promulgated on the Development Bureau's website. Setbacks of 6.8m, 16m and 6.2m from the northern, eastern and southern site boundaries from 3/F of the proposed building will also be provided to break down the visual bulk. Landscape treatments such as greenery on the fence walls and building façade on G/F and other various floors to soften the building mass, cautionary pedestrian crossings and a canopy along a 24-hour accessible public walkway along Kam Shing Road for pedestrian safety and comfort are proposed, which may improve streetscape and pedestrian walking environment. Having considered the primary purpose of application to increase the floor space required for medical and healthcare facilities and the above special circumstances and design merits, the proposed minor relaxation of BHR is considered not unreasonable.

Technical Aspects

10.9 On environmental aspect, DEP has no in-principle objection to the application and is of the view that the proponent should be required to submit SIA and Land Contamination Assessment and implement the relevant sewerage works identified and measures recommended in the assessments. Relevant approval conditions are suggested to be imposed (paragraph 11.2 refers). DEMS, D of FS, CBS/K of BD, CE/MS of DSD, CE/C of WSD and DFEH have no comments on the proposed redevelopment from technical points of view. C for T has no comments on the application from traffic engineering viewpoint.

Similar Application

10.10 The Committee had previously approved a similar application (No. A/K18/329) for minor relaxation of BHR from 13 to 17 storeys (i.e. +4storeys/+30.77%) for a proposed Education Institution (University Hostel and Academic Building Complex) (Plan A-1 and Appendix II) on grounds that the proposal has design merits, will bring improvements to townscape and amenity to the locality and is unlikely to create significant adverse effects on the visual character of the area. Approval of the

application is in line with the previous decision of the Committee on the similar application.

Public Comments

10.11 The supporting comments are noted. Regarding the concern of the opposing public comment on the potential adverse impacts brought about by the minor relaxation of the BHR, justifications provided by the applicant in paragraph 2 and the planning assessments in paragraph 10 above are relevant.

11 Planning Department's Views

- 11.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 10 above and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 9, the Planning Department has <u>no objection to</u> the application.
- 11.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid until 16.8.2028, and after the said date, the permission shall cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted is commenced or the permission is renewed. The following approval conditions are suggested for Members' reference:

Approval Conditions

- (a) the building heights for the proposed development (in terms of mPD including all rooftop structures) should not exceed the maximum building heights as proposed by the applicant on the rooftop layout plan;
- (b) the submission of a revised sewerage impact assessment (SIA) to the satisfaction of the Director of Environmental Protection or of the Town Planning Board;
- (c) the implementation of the local sewerage upgrading/sewerage connection works identified in the revised SIA to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board; and
- (d) the submission of a land contamination assessment in accordance with the prevailing guidelines and the implementation of the remedial measures identified therein prior to development of the site to the satisfaction of the Director of Environmental Protection or of the Town Planning Board.

Advisory Clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at **Appendix V**.

11.3 There is no strong reason to recommend rejection of the application.

12 Decision Sought

12.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or

refuse to grant permission.

- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the date when the validity of the permission should expire.
- 12.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

13 Attachments

Appendix I Application Form received on 13.3.2024

Appendix Ia Supporting Planning Statement received on 13.3.2024

Appendix Ib FI received on 2.4.2024

Appendix Ic FI received on 31.5.2024 and 6.6.2024 Appendix Id FI received on 10.7.2024 and 12.7.2024

Appendix Ie FI received on 23.7.2024

Appendix If Consolidated SPS received on 2.8.2024

Appendix II Similar Applications **Appendix III** Public Comments

Appendix IV Detailed Comments of Government Departments

Appendix V Recommended Advisory Clauses

Drawings A-1 to A-14 Floor and Section Plans

Drawings A-15 to A-21 Photomontages of the Proposed Development
Drawing A-22 Proposed Vehicular and Pedestrian Accesses
Drawing A-23 Proposed Cautionary Pedestrian Crossing

Drawing A-24 Tree Survey

Drawings A-25 to A-26 Landscape Proposal Drawings A-27 to A-30 Design Merits Drawings A-31 to A-33 Phasing Plans

Drawing A-34 Rooftop Layout Plan

Plan A-1 Location Plan

Plan A-2 Site Plan with Existing BH and BHR

Plan A-3 Outline Development Plan

Plans A-4 to A-7 Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT AUGUST 2024