

**APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION**  
**UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE**

**APPLICATION NO. A/K20/134**

- Applicant** : Transport Department represented by Townland Consultants Limited
- Site** : Government Land at the Junction of Yen Chow Street West and Tung Chau Street, Sham Shui Po, Kowloon
- Site Area** : About 3,650m<sup>2</sup>
- Land Status** : Government Land
- Plan** : Approved South West Kowloon Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K20/30
- Zoning** : (i) “Open Space” (“O”) – about 1,558m<sup>2</sup> (43%)  
(ii) “Residential (Group A)” (“R(A)”) – about 459m<sup>2</sup> (12%)  
(iii) Area shown as ‘Road’ – about 1,633m<sup>2</sup> (45%)
- Application** : Proposed Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle) and Permitted Open Space

**1. The Proposal**

- 1.1 The applicant, Transport Department (TD), seeks planning permission for a proposed underground public vehicle park (PVP) with public open space (POS) on top (Proposed Development) at a government land at the junction of Yen Chow Street West and Tung Chau Street (the Site). The Site falls within an area partly zoned “O”, partly zoned “R(A)” and partly shown as ‘Road’ on the approved South West Kowloon OZP No. S/K20/30 (**Plan A-1**). According to the Notes of the OZP, the proposed ‘Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)’ use on the Site requires planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board) while the proposed ‘Open Space’ use is always permitted.
- 1.2 The proposed PVP consists of two carpark structures each with an Automated Parking System (APS) in an underground circular shaft, two annex structures for electrical and mechanical (E&M) facilities (one underground and the other at grade) and some at-grade conventional parking spaces (**Drawings A-1** and **A-2**). It will provide a total of 200 parking spaces including 170 underground spaces in the form of APS and 30 at-grade conventional spaces. The APS will be operated by

computerised system with mechanical devices to convey and store vehicles at the vacant parking spaces inside the underground carpark (**Drawing A-3**). The vehicular ingress and egress are at Yen Chow Street West and Sai Chuen Road respectively while pedestrian accesses are also provided at both locations (**Drawing A-5**).

- 1.3 The proposed at-grade POS will have an area of not less than 1,135m<sup>2</sup> provided with a number of facilities including seating areas with shelters, children play area, fitness corner etc. (**Drawings A-5** and **A-6**). A total of 32 trees are found on the Site, all of which are common species, and 28 of them are proposed to be felled and four to be transplanted. A tree compensatory ratio of not less than 1:1 will be adopted. Tree planting is mainly proposed along the northern periphery of the Site to provide a landscaped pedestrian access and green roofs are proposed on the two circular shafts and the at-grade annex building (**Drawing A-5**).
- 1.4 The floor plans, section plan, circular shaft core layout plan, landscape plan, perspective, site constraints plan, vehicular and pedestrian access plan, and major vehicular access route plans of the Proposed Development as submitted by the applicant are at **Drawings A-1** to **A-10**. Major development parameters of the Proposed Development are appended below:

<b>Site Area</b>	About 3,650m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Floor Use and Building Height / Number of Storeys</b>	<p>Circular Shaft Core 1 and Core 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Above-ground structure with roof level at 15.15mPD (9.5m in height) including ground level for car entrance to the APS (transfer cabin) and one level of E&amp;M facilities on top</li> <li>- 9 underground carpark levels for Core 1 and 8 levels for Core 2; each level of about 2.23m headroom providing 10 parking spaces; and lowest level at about -17.81mPD</li> </ul> <p>Annex Building 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 1 underground level at about -0.85mPD for E&amp;M facilities</li> </ul> <p>Annex Building 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 2 above-ground levels of about 12m in height/17.65mPD at roof for E&amp;M facilities</li> </ul>
<b>Number of Car Parking Spaces</b>	<p>200</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Core 1 (underground): 90</li> <li>- Core 2 (underground): 80</li> <li>- At-grade: 30</li> </ul>
<b>Site Coverage</b>	About 15%
<b>Area of POS</b>	Not less than 1,135m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Greenery Ratio</b>	Not less than 31% of the Site Area

- 1.5 The proposed PVP together with the POS will be developed jointly, with a tentative schedule to commence in 2023 for completion in 2026. The POS will be handed over to the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) for management and maintenance. The party to undertake the management and maintenance of the PVP will be identified by TD at a later stage. Both PVP and POS will open to the public 24 hours daily.
- 1.6 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents:
- (a) Application form and supplementary information **(Appendix I)**  
received on 28.7.2021
  - (b) Supplementary Planning Statement and Technical Assessments including tree survey, traffic impact assessment (TIA) and preliminary environmental review (PER) **(Appendix Ia)**
  - (c) Letter dated 6.9.2021 providing responses to departmental and public comments, and revised pages of technical assessments<sup>#</sup> **(Appendix Ib)**
  - (d) Letter dated 17.9.2021 providing clarifications, responses to departmental comments, and revised pages of technical assessments<sup>#</sup> **(Appendix Ic)**
  - (e) Letter dated 20.9.2021 providing clarifications, responses to departmental comments, revised plans and updated tree survey<sup>#</sup> **(Appendix Id)**

*[<sup>#</sup>Accepted and exempted from the publication and recounting requirements.]*

## **2. Justifications from the Applicant**

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in the Supplementary Planning Statement and submissions of further information at **Appendices I to Id**. They are summarised as follows:

### **Government Initiative**

- (a) It is Government's initiative to provide public car parking spaces in suitable government facilities and POS projects under the principle of "Single Site, Multiple Uses" and to alleviate the problem of insufficient public parking spaces through the application of technology. TD commissioned a consultancy study named 'Pilot Study on Automated Parking Systems – Feasibility Study' in 2018 to explore the suitability of different types of APS in Hong Kong at the selected sites. These pilot projects will assist TD to gain experience in building, operating and managing different types of APS. The Site was selected as one of the pilot projects<sup>1</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> Other APS pilot projects include a short term tenancy (STT) site at Hoi Shing Road in Tsuen Wan, the proposed government building on Chung Kong Road in Sheung Wan, and another one on Sheung Mau Street in Chai Wan.

### Site Selection

- (b) Parking demand is the prime factor in selecting suitable site for PVP and the application of APS. The proposed number of parking spaces (i.e. 200) is based on the parking demand assessment and roadside parking surveys conducted by TD, which reveal that there is a shortfall of about 200 public car parking spaces in the Sham Shui Po district.
- (c) The Site is well-connected to major roads which provide direct access to various parts of West Kowloon such as Yau Tsim Mong and Sham Shui Po districts. Besides, the Site is located in the vicinity of a number of open spaces and leisure/recreation facilities including Tung Chau Street Park, Nam Cheong Park, Sham Shui Po Park and residential developments. The proposed PVP at this location will be able to meet the local demand as well as the demand of the users of the surrounding facilities.
- (d) Another “O” site at the junction of Sai Chuen Road and Yen Chow Street West is considered not suitable for development of an underground PVP as it is located very close to the tunnel of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) running underneath. Great technical difficulties are expected for construction of underground PVP.

### Planning Intention and Land Use Compatibility

- (e) The proposed PVP with open space on top is in line with the planning intention of “O” zone and the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses”. The Proposed Development has minimised the impact on the open space and the configuration of the proposed POS allows better integration with the planned open space in the remaining “O” site. Since there was originally no development programme for the Site, the Proposed Development allows early implementation of the POS for public enjoyment and improves the accessibility and connectivity of the POS through a landscaped pedestrian path. A ‘universal play’ concept at the proposed POS will be adopted to promote social inclusion of people of all ages and disability to enjoy the leisure/recreational facilities.

### Site Constraints

- (f) The layout design of the Proposed Development has taken into account the various site constraints, including the transitional housing development in the south and reserved area for road widening of Tung Chau Street in the north. The down ramp of West Kowloon Corridor no longer serves its original purpose and will be demolished due to change in development plans over the years. An existing drainage reserve (DR) falls within the Site and no structure is allowed to be erected on the DR. As such, the vehicular access and at-grade conventional parking spaces are proposed on the DR to utilise the space. This vehicular access will also serve as an emergency vehicular access (EVA) for the adjoining transitional housing development (**Drawing A-7**).
- (g) As the transitional housing blocks will need to set back of not less than 20m from the elevated West Kowloon Corridor for noise abatement and the down ramp of West

Kowloon Corridor will be demolished, the underground circular shafts will fit in the western portion of the Site without above-ground structure in the reserved area for road widening of Tung Chau Street in order not to impose insurmountable constraints to the future road widening works (**Drawing A-7**). An egress point at Sai Chuen Road would allow efficient circulation of vehicles within the Site.

#### Advantages of Underground PVP in the form of APS

- (h) The APS can increase the number of vehicles to be parked in a given footprint by stacking up vehicles in a compact manner with mechanical installations lifting cars up and down to the corresponding floor. Compared with conventional car parks, APS does not require bulky ramps, driveway and buffer spaces between vehicles, so it can generally provide 30% to 100% more parking spaces within the same footprint. The store and retrieval time is less than 2.5 minutes per vehicle. The design vehicle dimension within the circular shafts is about 5m(L) x 2m(W) x 2m(H) which could accommodate most of the private cars in Hong Kong.
- (i) The proposed 30 at-grade conventional parking spaces are to cater for oversized private cars, to provide barrier free parking, to serve as contingency in case of system failure, to provide electric vehicle (EV) charging facilities, and to meet requirements of LandsD Practice Note No. 2/2000<sup>2</sup>.
- (j) APS is reliable under proper maintenance and regular inspection. In case of malfunctioning of APS, the system will allow properly trained personnel to retrieve vehicles in order to minimise the impact to the car park users. The parking fee will be determined later taking into account the charges of the nearby privately-operated PVP.

#### Measures to Meet Other Parking Demand in Sham Shui Po District

- (k) To address the concerns that no commercial parking is provided in the proposed PVP which is in shortfall in Sham Shui Po, upon the completion of the Proposed Development, TD intends to release some parking spaces in existing car parks covered by the STTs in the vicinity for parking of commercial vehicles and coaches.

#### Technical Aspects

- (l) Various preliminary technical assessments on traffic, environmental, geotechnical, electrical and mechanical, structural, drainage, water supply and utilities aspects have been conducted for the pilot study on APS. A tree survey, TIA and PER have been prepared for the subject application. These technical assessments demonstrate that the Proposed Development will not induce any significant adverse impacts.
- (m) The potential queue length, including the scenario with only one circular shaft in operation, has been assessed and the proposed queueing area (30m in length) together with the buffer area (47m in length) has been provided within the Proposed Development to accommodate the queue length (i.e. 13 vehicles) without causing a

---

<sup>2</sup> LandsD Practice Note No. 2/2000 specifies that in the mechanical car parking system, not less than one-sixth of the total number of spaces provided shall be accommodated in the conventional system.

tailback onto the public roads (**Drawing A-8**). Digital panels at the ingress point will be installed to reflect the vacant parking spaces of the PVP.

- (n) The proposed egress point at Sai Chuen Road allows traffic to take a more direct route to West Kowloon Highway via Lin Cheung Road or Sham Mong Road to other parts of Hong Kong and it can minimise the traffic impact on Yen Chow Street (**Drawings A-9 and A-10**). The TIA demonstrated that the capacity of Sai Chuen Road and its nearby junction would be sufficient to cope with the additional traffic demand.
- (o) Significant environmental impacts during both construction and operation stages on the nearby sensitive uses are not anticipated. The project proponent will adopt environmental control measures recommended in the PER to mitigate the impact on the residents of transitional housing during construction phase, for example, hard paving on open area, regular watering and spraying on dusty areas and materials, vehicle washing facilities to reduce dust emission; the use of quiet powered mechanical equipment, construction method (saw-cut or hydraulic crusher), noise barriers and noise enclosure as far as practical.

#### District Council Consultation

- (p) The Proposed Development was discussed at the meeting of the Transport Affairs Committee (TAC) of the Sham Shui Po District Council (SSPDC) on 2.4.2019, and the meetings of the Planning Development and Transport Affairs Committee (PTAC) of SSPDC on 25.2.2021 and 22.4.2021. Some members welcomed the proposed APS for implementation of the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses”. There are also concerns on the suitability of the Site, ingress/egress point, existing traffic condition on Sai Chuen Road, potential environmental and traffic impacts, operation of the APS, and type of parking spaces to be provided etc. It was suggested that conventional car park might be more cost-effective and able to provide parking spaces for different vehicles.
- (q) An information paper submitted by the applicant was circulated to the PTAC members in July 2021 to provide the details of the Proposed Development prior to the formal submission of the subject application to the Board. It is noted that a discussion paper was submitted by a DC member at SSPDC meeting held on 14.9.2021 and a motion was passed at the meeting objecting to the application. The concerns of the SSPDC members have been addressed in the submission. To further consult the local stakeholders, the applicant was invited to give a briefing on the Proposed Development to the Sham Shui Po Central and South Area Committee to be held on 23.9.2021. The applicant will continue to consult relevant stakeholders as requested.

### **3. Compliance with the “Owner’s Consent/Notification” Requirements**

As the Site involves Government land only, the ‘owner’s consent/notification’ requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the ‘Owner’s Consent/Notification’ Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No. 31A) is not applicable to the application.

#### **4. Previous Application**

There is no previous application covering the Site.

#### **5. Similar Application**

There is no similar application within “O” and “R(A) zones, and area shown as ‘Road’ on the South West Kowloon OZP.

#### **6. The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1 to A-3 and site photos on Plans A-4 to A-7)**

6.1 The Site is:

- (a) elongated with an irregular shape and is partly occupied by the down ramp of West Kowloon Corridor along the northern boundary which will be demolished by the Highways Department (HyD) prior to the construction of the Proposed Development;
- (b) partly used as works area for the adjoining transitional housing development;
- (c) partly within the “R(A)” zone which is small in size; in triangular shape and outside of vesting order of any housing estate;
- (d) accessible from Yen Chow Street West and Sai Chuen Road; and
- (e) at about 650m northeast of the Mass Transit Railway (MTR) Sham Shui Po Station and 350m southwest of the MTR Nam Cheong Station.

6.2 The surrounding areas have the following characteristics:

- (a) to the immediate south within the same “O” site is the transitional housing development which is under construction. To the further south is the Drainage Services Department Sham Shui Po Screening Plant;
- (b) to the west and northwest are two public housing developments namely Fu Cheong Estate and Wing Cheong Estate respectively;
- (c) to the north, northwest and northeast across West Kowloon Corridor is predominantly residential in nature with a number of medium to high-rise private residential developments and a primary school; and
- (d) to the south across Yen Chow Street West is a public housing development namely Nam Cheong Estate. The Site is adjacent to a number of open spaces including Sham Shui Po Park, Tung Chau Street Park and Nam Cheong Park (**PlanA-1**).

## **7. Planning Intentions**

- 7.1 The “O” zone is intended primarily for the provision of outdoor open-air public space for active and/or passive recreational uses serving needs of the local residents as well as the general public.
- 7.2 The “R(A)” zone is intended primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building.
- 7.3 The area shown as ‘Road’ is intended for road use.

## **8. Comments from Relevant Government Bureau/Departments**

- 8.1 The following Government bureau/departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

### **Policy Perspective**

- 8.1.1 The Secretary for Transport and Housing (STH) advised that policy support for the Proposed Development is given as a PVP with open space will be provided under the subject application; the PVP will also have APS installed; and the Proposed Development will increase parking provision under the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses”.

### **Land Administration**

- 8.1.2 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Kowloon West, Lands Department (DLO/KW, LandsD):
  - (a) no objection to the application;
  - (b) the applicant is reminded to apply to this Office for permanent government land allocation for the proposed PVP and should allow sufficient time in advance of the land requirement date for this Office to process the application; and
  - (c) detailed comments on land status of the Site at **Appendix II**.

### **Traffic**

- 8.1.3 Comments of the Commissioner of Police:
  - (a) no specific comment on the proposed PVP; and
  - (b) attention is drawn to the possible traffic impact caused during the construction stage of proposed works. The queuing of vehicles for the PVP should be within the perimeter of the parking building

blocks. Should the queuing of vehicles proliferate to Yen Chow Street West, it may exacerbate the vehicular traffic volume thereat.

### **Environment**

#### 8.1.4 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):

- (a) no in-principle objection to the application from the environmental perspective and the Proposed Development would not cause insurmountable environmental impact;
- (b) on air quality, the assessment has demonstrated that sufficient buffer distance as stipulated under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) would be provided. Hence, adverse air quality impact on the Proposed Development is not anticipated;
- (c) on sewerage, insurmountable sewerage impact arising from the Proposed Development is not anticipated; and
- (d) on noise, insurmountable road traffic noise and fixed noise impact associated with the Proposed Development are not anticipated with proper noise mitigation measures in place. To ensure the use of quiet construction methods, equipment and appropriate noise mitigation measures, an approval condition requesting the applicant to submit a Construction Noise Impact Assessment (CINA) prior to development of the Site should be imposed:

the submission of a CNIA prior to development of the site and the implementation of noise mitigation measures identified therein for the construction phase of the Proposed Development to the satisfaction of the DEP or of the Board.

### **Urban Design, Visual and Landscape**

#### 8.1.5 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):

##### **Urban Design and Visual Aspects**

- (a) the subject elongated Site with an area of about 3,650m<sup>2</sup> is bounded by the elevated West Kowloon Corridor to its immediate north, public housing estates (Wing Cheong Estate and Fu Cheong Estate) to its northwest and west, an area zoned "O" to its immediate south (being developed as Yen Chow Street Transitional Housing), and Yen Chow Street West to the southeast. Across Yen Chow Street West to the further southeast is Tung Chau Street Park, which is a large open space. Given the context and that the proposed car parking facilities are mainly located underground with only modest scale aboveground structures (mainly for two underground circular shaft cores of 9.5m in height and annex building of 12m in height),

it is unlikely that the proposal will induce significant adverse visual impact to the surroundings;

- (b) the POS will provide passive landscape area and recreational uses, and will be open to public on a 24-hour basis. Also, landscape area with tree planting is provided along the pedestrian path at the northern boundary of the Site. The applicant has also indicated that measures such as edge planting and facades treatments for the underground circular shafts will be further considered during detailed design stage. These measures may promote visual interest and pedestrian comfort;

#### Landscape Aspect

- (c) no objection to the application from landscape planning perspective;
- (d) with reference to the aerial photo of 2020, the Site is situated in an area of residential urban landscape character, dominated by residential buildings and open spaces. The proposed PVP consists of two underground circular shafts and two annex buildings, and it will provide 200 parking spaces in the form of APS and conventional at-grade parking spaces and a POS with an area not less than 1,135m<sup>2</sup>. The Proposed Development is considered not incompatible with the surrounding environment;
- (e) according to the applicant, 32 existing trees of common species are identified within the Site, in which four trees are proposed to be transplanted and 28 trees are proposed to be felled. With reference to the Landscape Plan, 28 trees are proposed to be planted at the proposed POS and along the north-eastern periphery within the Site, while landscape areas with seating, children play area, fitness corner, etc. are proposed for public enjoyment. Moreover, edge planting is proposed on the green roofs of transfer cabins and annex buildings to enhance the overall landscape quality of the development; and
- (f) the applicant is reminded to seek comments and approval from the relevant authority on the proposed tree preservation/removal scheme and compensatory planting proposal as appropriate.

#### 8.1.6 Comments of the Chief Architect/Central Management Division 2, Architectural Services Department (CA/CMD2, ArchSD):

- (a) it is noted that the proposed PVP with POS consists of two underground circular shafts and two annex buildings (of -0.85mPD and 17.65mPD). It may not be incompatible with adjacent developments; and
- (b) for the proposed POS at grade, the applicant is encouraged to provide a pedestrian-friendly environment such as provision of

weather canopy, barrier-free access/facilities, more seating areas and greening/planters etc. for enhancing public enjoyment.

### **Provision of Open Space**

#### 8.1.7 Comments of the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (DLCS):

- (a) no specific comment on the application; and
- (b) it is known that part of the Site has been zoned “O” for open space development for a long time and there is no programme to implement the Site for open space development in the near future. The Proposed Development could provide underground parking spaces to meet the local demand and also allow early implementation of the open space for public enjoyment. Upon the completion of the Proposed Development, the POS will be handed over to LCSD for management and maintenance; and
- (c) a ‘universal play’ concept will be adopted in planning for play equipment with a view to providing inclusive, interesting and innovative play equipment to cater for the needs of children of different ages and abilities and their parents. In designing facilities for individual venues, the LCSD and the relevant works department(s) will consider topographic features, site area and circumstances and views of the District Councils concerned, etc., and review the utilisation of children’s play equipment in due course for improvement works.

### **Building Matters**

#### 8.1.8 Comments of the Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department (CBS/K, BD):

- (a) no objection to the application;
- (b) all building works should comply with the Buildings Ordinance (BO) and its allied regulations;
- (c) Authorised Person must be appointed to coordinate all building works; and
- (d) detailed comments under the BO will be formulated at the building plan submission stage.

### **Fire Safety**

#### 8.1.9 Comments of the Director of Fire Services (D of FS):

- (a) no specific comment on the proposal subject to fire service installations and water supplies for fire-fighting being provided to the

satisfaction of the Fire Services Department; and

- (b) the EVA shall comply with Section 6, Part D of the *Code of Practice for Fire Safety in Buildings 2011* which is administered by the Buildings Department.

### **Electricity Supply Safety**

8.1.10 Comments of the Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (DEMS):

- (a) no comment from electricity supply safety aspect; and
- (b) in the interests of public safety and ensuring the continuity of electricity supply, the parties concerned with planning, designing, organising, supervising and conducting any activity near the underground cable or overhead line under the application should approach the electricity supplier (i.e. CLP Power) for the requisition of cable plans (and overhead line alignment drawings, where applicable) to find out whether there is any underground cable and/or overhead line within and/or in the vicinity of the concerned site. They should also be reminded to observe the Electricity Supply Lines (Protection) Regulation and the “Code of Practice on Working near Electricity Supply Lines” established under the Regulation when carrying out works in the vicinity of the electricity supply lines.

### **Other Aspects**

8.1.11 Comments of the Chief Highway Engineer/Works (CHE/Works), HyD:

- (a) no comment on the application; and
- (b) the demolition works of the down ramp of West Kowloon Corridor is being conducted by HyD and it would be completed prior to the construction of the Proposed Development.

8.1.12 Comments of the Chief Engineer/Railway Development 2-2, Railway Development Office (CE/RD 2-2, RDO), HyD:

- (a) no comment from railway development point of view; and
- (b) the Site falls within or is close to the railway protection boundary and/or gazette railway scheme boundary of the existing railways. The Mass Transit Railway Corporation Limited should be consulted with respect to their comments or concerns on any potential/possible impact of the Proposed Development on operation, maintenance and safety of the existing railways.

### **District Officer's Comments**

#### **8.1.13 Comments of the District Officer (Sham Shui Po), Home Affairs Department (DO(SSP), HAD):**

- (a) the Proposed Development was discussed at the meeting of TAC of SSPDC on 2.4.2019. While some of the TAC members welcomed the APS for implementation of “Single Site, Multiple Use”, a few of them have expressed their concerns on the location which is adjacent to the residential area, including the transitional housing under construction as well as Fu Cheong Estate and Wing Cheong Estate. Nuisances such as traffic impact, noise and air pollution etc. will inevitably be posed to the residents nearby. Besides, some members were of the view that conventional car park might be more cost-effective and provide more parking spaces for not only private vehicles, but also commercial vehicles in meeting the public needs;
- (b) PTAC members expressed their concerns on the Proposed Development at its meeting on 25.2.2021. A discussion paper concerning the Proposed Development was submitted by PTAC members and two motions were passed at its meeting on 22.4.2021, including (i) requesting TD to conduct a thorough consultation exercise on the Proposed Development to meet the expectations of residents in the district; and (ii) objection to the ingress/egress point of the PVP to be located at Sai Chuen Road to prevent further aggravating the traffic load there;
- (c) an information paper was submitted by TD for circulation to PTAC members in July 2021 to provide details of the Proposed Development before formal submission of the subject application to the Board;
- (d) a discussion paper was submitted by a DC member at SSPDC meeting held on 14.9.2021 and the following motion (translation of original Chinese version)<sup>3</sup> was passed at the meeting:

‘SSPDC objects the Proposed Development under planning application No. A/K20/134 if the applicant could not provide sufficient information to address their concerns on the egress point at Sai Chuen Road and insufficient parking provision for commercial vehicles and motorcycles, and their views should be considered by the Board’; and
- (e) the applicant is advised to consult the local stakeholders as and when necessary.

---

<sup>3</sup> Original motion in Chinese: 「如申請人無法提供充足資料處理對西邨路作停車場出口造成阻塞問題、商用車位和電單車位不足等質疑，本會將在城規會上反對深水埗地下智能停車場的規劃申請(申請編號：A/K20/134)，並希望規劃署及城規會考慮上述意見，要求申請人提供相關資料。」

8.2 The following government departments have no objection to or no comment on the application:

- (a) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (DFEH);
- (b) Director of Housing (D of H);
- (c) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C, WSD);
- (d) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department (CE/MS, DSD);
- (e) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon (CHE/K), HyD;
- (f) Head of the Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (H(GEO), CEDD); and
- (g) Project Manager (South), CEDD.

## **9. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Periods**

9.1 During the statutory public inspection period, a total of 14 public comments including four supporting the application, one objecting to the application and nine expressing concerns/comments on the application were received (**Appendix III**). The four supportive comments are submitted by individuals without specific grounds.

9.2 The objecting comment is submitted by the Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood<sup>4</sup> and nine expressing concerns are submitted by the individuals. The major objection grounds/concerns are summarised as follows:

- (a) the egress point should not be located at Sai Chuen Road. The traffic flow induced by the proposed PVP would worsen the traffic condition and cause pedestrian safety issue. There would be potential tailback at Yen Chow Street West;
- (b) the queuing area/access road occupies too much space. The layout should be revised to free up more spaces for more leisure/recreational facilities;
- (c) there is a lack of car parking spaces for commercial vehicles in the area. The details of the existing temporary car parks covered by STTs are not provided;
- (d) the provision of the car parking spaces at the Site should be increased. Parking spaces for motorcycles, goods vehicles, and coach buses should be provided. EV charging facilities should be installed at at-grade parking spaces;
- (e) there are concerns on the cost-efficiency, parking rate, operation of the PVP, risk management on APS failure, and time required for retrieving the vehicles;

---

<sup>4</sup> The objecting comment is same as the discussion paper submitted by a DC member of SSPDC mentioned in paragraph 8.1.13 (d).

- (f) the Proposed Development would worsen the air quality and cause adverse noise impact to the surrounding areas;
- (g) an alternative “O” site at the junction of Sai Chuen Road and Yen Chow Street West was proposed for multi-storey car parking building at SSPDC meeting in February 2019. However, this proposal was not an option to be considered by the relevant departments;
- (h) the proposed POS would be reduced in size and not in good quality as the annex building will cause shadow projection in the POS, and green roofs are not accessible. Green walls on the building facades could be explored; and
- (i) there is insufficient local consultation. SSPDC was first consulted on the Proposed Development in April 2019 without detailed information on the design and technical assessments conducted. SSPDC was not consulted again prior to submission of the subject application.

## **10. Planning Considerations and Assessments**

- 10.1 The application is to seek planning permission for a PVP in the form of an underground APS and conventional parking areas and a POS at the Site which straddles “O” and “R(A)” zones and area shown as ‘Road’ (**Plan A-1**). ‘Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)’ use within the Site requires planning permission from the Board whereas ‘Open Space’ use is always permitted. While the area shown as ‘Road’ in the vicinity is reserved for road widening of Tung Chau Street, according to TD, there is no development programme at this road portion. The small irregular pocket of land within the “R(A)” zone is outside the vesting order of any housing estate. D of H has no objection to the application. The Proposed Development will not affect any road or housing development.
- 10.2 While the Proposed Development will provide a total of 200 public car parking spaces for private vehicles, the proposed POS at grade on top of the underground APS will provide not less than 1,135m<sup>2</sup> of local open space with leisure/recreational facilities based on the ‘universal play’ concept to be implemented together with the PVP. The Proposed Development will help address the parking demand in the Sham Shui Po district and enable early implementation of the POS.

### **Policy Aspect**

- 10.3 The Proposed Development is initiated by TD in accordance with Government’s initiative to provide public car parking spaces in suitable government facilities and POS projects and to take forward the recommendations of TD’s consultancy study on ‘Pilot Study on Automated Parking Systems – Feasibility Study’ commissioned in 2018.
- 10.4 Given that the Proposed Development would increase parking provision and provide a POS under the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses”, STH has given policy support to the Proposed Development.

### Land Use Compatibility

- 10.5 The Site is located in a predominantly residential area intermixed with government, institution and community, and open space developments. It is connected to major roads and pedestrian network and is easily accessible by public transportation. The Proposed Development with low-rise structures is considered not incompatible with the surrounding areas.

### Site Utilisation

- 10.6 The Site is elongated with an irregular shape as the southern part of the same “O” site has been reserved for transitional housing development. The layout design of the PVP has paid due regards to the site constraints and has optimised the site characters by integrating two underground circular shafts for parking within a POS development. Compared with conventional car parks, the proposed PVP in the form of underground APS will provide 30% to 100% more parking spaces within the same footprint. The Proposed Development will provide a total of 200 car parking spaces for private cars to meet the local parking demand in the Sham Shui Po district.
- 10.7 A POS of not less than 1,135m<sup>2</sup> on the ground level will be provided. As some land area originally reserved for open space development will be taken up by the structures of the PVP, the Proposed Development has minimised the impact on the open space and the configuration of the proposed POS has make provision for future integration with the planned open space in the remaining “O” site. The Proposed Development is in line with the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses”. DLCS has no objection to the Proposed Development with the provision of open space, management and maintenance arrangement, and the adoption of ‘universal play’ concept of the POS.
- 10.8 Based on the requirements in the HKPSG, there is a surplus of about 7ha of local open space in the South West Kowloon OZP area. On the basis of Sham Shui Po district, there is a surplus of about 21ha local open space and about 11.8ha district open space upon full development. Although the Proposed Development will lead to net loss of about 423m<sup>2</sup> of open space at the Site, there are surplus of local open space in both South West Kowloon OZP area and Sham Shui Po district. The Proposed Development could utilise the Site to provide much needed parking facilities and will allow early implementation of the POS.

### Urban Design, Visual and Landscape Aspects

- 10.9 The Proposed Development comprises mainly underground structures with a modest scale aboveground structures (mainly for two underground circular shaft cores of 9.5m in height and annex building of 12m in height), it is unlikely that the proposal will induce significant adverse visual impact to the surroundings. CTP/UD&L of PlanD and CA/CMD2 of ArchSD have no adverse comment on the proposed BH and the visual aspects.
- 10.10 Among the 32 existing trees, 28 trees are proposed to be felled and four would be transplanted. A compensatory ratio of not less than 1:1 would be adopted. Tree planting is provided along the pedestrian path at the northern periphery of the Site

while landscape areas with seating, children play area, fitness corner, etc. are proposed for public enjoyment. Moreover, edge planting is proposed on the green roofs of circular shafts and annex building to enhance the overall landscape quality of the development. The Proposed Development could achieve a site coverage of greenery of not less than 31%. CTP/UD&L of PlanD considers that these measures may promote visual interest and pedestrian comfort and has no objection to the application from landscape planning perspective.

#### Technical Aspects

- 10.11 The Proposed Development will not create adverse impacts during construction or operational stages on environmental, geotechnical, electrical and mechanical, structural, drainage, water supply and utilities aspects according to the various technical assessments. Concerned Government departments consulted including DEP, H(GEO) of CEDD, DEMS, CE/MS of DSD, CE/C of WSD and D of FS have no objection to/no adverse comment on the application. To address DEP's concern on construction noise impact, an approval condition in paragraph 11.2 below is recommended.
- 10.12 According to the applicant, the proposed egress point at Sai Chuen Road allows traffic to take a more direct route to West Kowloon Highway via Lin Cheung Road or Sham Mong Road to other parts of Hong Kong and it can minimise the traffic impact on Yen Chow Street (**Drawings A-9 and A-10**). The potential queue length has been assessed in the TIA and sufficient queuing area together with buffer area (a total of 77m in length) has been provided within the Proposed Development (**Drawing A-8**). The TIA submitted by the applicant demonstrated that the capacity of Sai Chuen Road and its nearby junction would be sufficient to cope with the additional traffic demand.
- 10.13 According to the applicant, another "O" site at the junction of Sai Chuen Road and Yen Chow Street West is considered not suitable for development of an underground PVP as it is located very close to the tunnel of the XRL running underneath (**Plan A-1**). Great technical difficulties are expected for construction of underground PVP.

#### Public Comments

- 10.14 Regarding the public comments received and the comments conveyed by DO(SSP), the planning assessments above and departmental comments in paragraph 9 are relevant. Regarding the request for parking spaces for commercial vehicles other than private cars, the design vehicle dimension within the circular shafts could accommodate most of the types of private cars in Hong Kong. The remaining oversized private cars and light goods vehicles would be accommodated at the at-grade conventional parking spaces. TD would also request the inclusion of additional conditions stipulating the minimum number of parking spaces for commercial vehicles when re-tendering the existing car parks covered by STTs.
- 10.15 Regarding SSPDC's concerns on insufficient consultation, DO(SSP) advised that the SSPDC was first consulted on the Proposed Development in April 2019 and an information paper setting out the details of the Proposed Development was submitted by the applicant for circulation to the members in July 2021 prior to the

submission of the subject planning application. The applicant was invited to give a briefing on the Proposed Development to the Sham Shui Po Central and South Area Committee on 23.9.2021. The applicant will continue to consult relevant stakeholders when necessary.

## **11. Planning Department's Views**

- 11.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 10 above and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 9 above, the Planning Department has no objection to the application.
- 11.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid until 24.9.2025, and after the said date, the permission shall cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted is commenced or the permission is renewed. The following condition of approval and advisory clauses are suggested for Members' reference:

### Approval condition

The submission of a Construction Noise Impact Assessment prior to development of the site and the implementation of noise mitigation measures identified therein for the construction phase of the proposed development to the satisfaction of the Director of Environmental Protection or of the Town Planning Board.

### Advisory clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at **Appendix IV**.

- 11.3 There is no strong reason to recommend rejection of the application.

## **12. Decision Sought**

- 12.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the date when the validity of the permission should expire.
- 12.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

### **13. Attachments**

<b>Appendix I</b>	Application form and supplementary information received on 28.7.2021
<b>Appendix Ia</b>	Supplementary Planning Statement and Technical Assessments
<b>Appendix Ib</b>	Letter dated 6.9.2021 providing responses to departmental and public comments, and revised pages of technical assessments
<b>Appendix Ic</b>	Letter dated 17.9.2021 providing clarifications, responses to departmental comments, and revised pages of technical assessments
<b>Appendix Id</b>	Letter dated 20.9.2021 providing clarifications, responses to departmental comments, revised plans and updated tree survey
<b>Appendix II</b>	Detailed Comments from Government Departments
<b>Appendix III</b>	Public Comments
<b>Appendix IV</b>	Advisory Clauses
<b>Drawings A-1 and A-2</b>	Floor Plans
<b>Drawing A-3</b>	Section Plan
<b>Drawing A-4</b>	Circular Shaft Core Layout Plan
<b>Drawing A-5</b>	Landscape Plan
<b>Drawing A-6</b>	Perspective
<b>Drawing A-7</b>	Site Constraints Plan
<b>Drawing A-8</b>	Vehicular and Pedestrian Access Plan
<b>Drawings A-9 and A-10</b>	Major Vehicular Access Route Plans
<b>Plan A-1</b>	Location Plan
<b>Plan A-2</b>	Site Plan
<b>Plan A-3</b>	Aerial Photo
<b>Plans A-4 to A-7</b>	Site Photos

**PLANNING DEPARTMENT  
SEPTEMBER 2021**