MPC Paper No. A/K4/78 for Consideration by the Metro Planning Committee on 3.3.2023

APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/K4/78

Architectural Services Department (ArchSD) represented by Urban Applicant : Design & Planning Consultants Limited Site Shek Kip Mei Health Centre, 2 Berwick Street, Shek Kip Mei : About 3.282m² : Site Area Land Status : Government Land Government Land Allocation (GLA-NK 478) allocated to the (a) Director of Health (D of Health) for the Shek Kip Mei Polyclinic (about 72%); (b) Vesting Order (VO) No. 32 vested in the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HKHA) for Shek Kip Mei Estate (SKME) (about 27%); (c) unleased/unallocated government land (about 1%) Approved Shek Kip Mei Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K4/31 Plan : **Zoning**¹ "Residential (Group A)1" ("R(A)1") : (a) maximum domestic/total plot ratio (PR) of 7.5/9 (b) maximum building height (BH) of 80 metres above Principal Datum (mPD) a public clinic shall be provided (c) **Application** : Proposed Minor Relaxation of Building Height Restriction (BHR) for Permitted Public Clinic Use (Community Health Centre) and Proposed

1. <u>The Proposal</u>

1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for minor relaxation of BHR from 80mPD to 96mPD (i.e. +16m or +20%) to facilitate the proposed redevelopment of Shek Kip

Public Vehicle Park (excluding Container Vehicle)

¹ An insignificant portion of the application site falls within an area zoned "O" (about 0.1%) on the OZP. According to the covering Notes of the OZP, boundaries between zones may be subject to minor adjustments as detailed planning proceeds. In view of the insignificant encroachment onto the "O" zone, the Site can be regarded as wholly zoned "R(A)1".

Mei Health Centre (SKMHC) into a community health centre (i.e. Shek Kip Mei Community Health Centre (SKMCHC)) with a public vehicle park at the application site (the Site), which falls within an area zoned "R(A)1" on the approved Shek Kip Mei OZP No. S/K4/31 (**Plan A-1**). According to the Notes of the OZP for the "R(A)1" zone, 'Public Clinic' use is always permitted while 'Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)' is a Column 2 use requiring planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board). Minor relaxation of BHR may be considered by the Board based on the individual merits of a development proposal.

- 1.2 The Site of about 3,282m² mainly comprises the existing site of SKMHC and a small portion of the VO No. 32 covering SKME Phase 6 which is currently a vacant land (Site B in Drawing A-1). To enable efficient use of the Site for SKMCHC development, the northern part of the existing SKMHC site (Site A in Drawing A-1) will be swapped with the aforesaid VO portion as previously agreed between the then Food and Health Bureau and HKHA. The resultant site for SKMCHC development (the development site) is about 2,887m² (Plan A-2 and Drawing A-1).
- 1.3 According to the applicant, in view of the increasing demand for medical and public primary healthcare services in the Sham Shui Po District, the Government proposed to redevelop the existing 2-storey SKMHC constructed in 1957 into a 17-storey SKMCHC (about 96mPD) to reprovision and upgrade the current general out-patient clinic (GOPC) operated by the Hospital Authority (HA) and chest clinic operated by the Department of Health (DH) and provide other new healthcare services and facilities as detailed in paragraph 1.9 to cater for the increasing demand for such healthcare services in the district.
- 1.4 According to the applicant, in line with the principle of "single site, multiple uses", a 1-storey public vehicle park with 30 parking spaces is proposed within the development by the Transport Department (TD), taking into account local parking demand, project area, BHR and engineering constraints. In the meeting of the Sham Shui Po District Council (SSPDC) on 6.9.2022, SSPDC supported the proposed redevelopment of the existing SKMHC with a public vehicle park.
- 1.5 Pedestrian and vehicular accesses will be provided at Woh Chai Street (through SKME Phase 6), and universal pedestrian access equipped with lifts, escalators and a link bridge system will be provided at Berwick Street (**Drawing A-15**). A barrier-free pedestrian connection will also be provided between Berwick Street and Woh Chai Street (**Drawing A-15**).
- 1.6 The proposed development will provide landscaped areas at LG1/F and G/F which will be opened for public usage and passage during operating hours of SKMCHC (i.e. 7:30 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.). Sustainable Building Design Guidelines (SBDG) have been taken into account in the building design, with building setback of minimum at about 7.5m from centreline of Berwick Street allowing provision of landscaping and seating to improve users' experience and the pedestrian realm (**Drawing A-17**). The proposed greenery area is about 21.1% of the development site area, which complies with SBDG. While there are 20 existing trees within the Site, most of them are in unavoidable conflict with the proposed development and site formation works and/or in poor form and condition. While there is no rare or protected tree species or Old and Valuable Trees (OVT), two Trees of Particular Interest (TPI) are found within

the Site. One is proposed to be retained and the other is proposed to be felled due to poor condition. A total of two existing trees will be retained and 33 new trees will be planted (including 15 additional trees previously committed to be planted within the Site for SKME Redevelopment Phase 6).

- 1.7 The proposed redevelopment is targeted to commence in 2024 for completion in 2029. For interim arrangement, the existing GOPC has relocated to the retail facilities of SKME Phase 6 temporarily since January 2023, while the existing tuberculosis and chest services will be provided by other neighbouring chest clinics during construction period.
- 1.8 The section and elevation plans, floor plans, landscape layout plans, proposed access plan and photomontages are at **Drawings A-2** to **A-15**. Major development parameters are as follows:

Application Site Area	About 3,282m ² (including an area		
	to be swapped with VO covering		
	SKME)		
Development Site Area	About 2,887m ²		
PR	7.87*		
Total GFA	About 22,732m ²		
including			
- Community Health Centre	21,888.4m ²		
- Public Vehicle Park	843.6m ²		
SC	About 59.7%*		
Greenery Coverage	About 21.1%* (About 609.15m ²)		
Number of Block	1		
Number of Storeys	17		
BH	Not more than 96mPD		
Number of Parking Spaces			
- Public Vehicle Park	30 (including 2 Accessible		
	Parking Spaces)		
- Ancillary Parking Spaces	64 (including 4 Accessible		
	Parking Spaces)		
Number of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays			
- Taxi	1		
- Heavy Goods Vehicle	2		
- Ambulance	2		

* Based on development site area of about 2,887m²

1.9 The main floor uses are summarised below:

Major Floor Uses	
LG1/F	Landscaped area, lift and escalator
G/F	Landscaped area, lift, escalator, loading/unloading bay,
	EVA
1/F	Plant room
2/F	Public vehicle park
3/F to 4/F	Staff carpark

5/F to 15/F	Community health centre (central dispensary; GOPC;
	patient resource centre; multidisciplinary support
	services; community outreach team; day treatment centre;
	maternal and child health centre; social hygiene service
	head office; dermatology clinic; and tuberculosis and
	chest service), landscaped area (on 15/F only)

1.10 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents:

(a)	Application Form received on 11.1.2023	(Appendix I)
(b)	Planning Statement	(Appendix Ia)
(c)	Further Information (FI) received on 17.2.2023 [#]	(Appendix Ib)
(d)	Further Information (FI) received on 24.2.2023 [#]	(Appendix Ic)

<u>*Remarks:*</u> [#] accepted and exempted from publication and recounting requirement

2. <u>Justifications from the Applicant</u>

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in the Planning Statement and FIs at **Appendix Ia**, **Ib** and **Ic**. They are summarised as follows:

- (a) the proposed development is under the first 10-year Hospital Development Plan announced in 2016 Policy Address (PA) for providing primary healthcare services for meeting strong public demand and the incorporation of the public vehicle park is in line with the "single site, multiple uses" model. The Government proposed to redevelop the existing SKMHC for an upgraded community health centre to offer the public with a one-stop, better coordinated, and more comprehensive primary healthcare services through medical, nursing and allied health services, so as to enable patients to lead a healthy life in the community with strengthened community support and to reduce their need for hospitalisation. The services offered by the community health centres include medical consultation services, and health risk assessment and specific care services provided by multidisciplinary teams for chronic patients with diseases such as diabetes, hypertension, etc., with a view to reducing the risk of complications and need for consultation for chronic patients. Facilities to strengthen patients' ability in disease management by making use of community resources are also available at the community health centres;
- (b) the proposed development for permitted public clinic use is in line with the planning intention of the "R(A)1" zone which stipulates the provision of a public clinic. The proposed BH of 96mPD is compatible with the surrounding environment in terms of development intensity and BH, and it could maintain a stepped height descending from SKME Phase 6 in the west towards Bishop Hill in the east;

Planning and Design Merits

- (c) the proposed development is to address the increasing demand for healthcare services resulting from aging population and projected population growth in the local area that cannot be accommodated by existing facilities. The proposed SKMCHC with the expanded capacity and new facilities will provide a coordinated, multi-disciplinary, cross-sectoral and community-based primary care system;
- (d) it is Government's initiative to provide public car parking spaces in suitable government facilities under the principle of "single site, multiple uses". In line with this initiative, the proposed public vehicle park with 30 parking spaces initiated by TD taking into account local parking demand, project area, BHR and engineering constraints will help reduce on-street illegal parking and alleviate traffic congestion;
- minor relaxation of BH from 80mPD to the proposed 96mPD is required to (e) accommodate the range of healthcare facilities as mentioned in paragraph 1.9 and the public vehicle park. The Site is bounded by Bishop Hill, Berwick Street and SKME Phase 6 with limited scope for horizontal expansion. The SC of the proposed development has also already reached the maximum permissible SC for a Class A Site under the Building (Planning) Regulations. Furthermore, floor-tofloor height (FTFH) of 4.7m has been adopted for the healthcare floors taking into account operational flexibility and for Modular Integrated Construction Method (MiC) consideration. Vertical expansion is therefore the most feasible option to provide more floor spaces. There are however several site constraints rendering excavation and/or basement construction undesirable, including geotechnical constraint due to proximity to Bishop Hill and limited vehicular access to the Site rendering difficulties for soil removal and delivery of machinery necessary for excavation works, in which consequently, additional construction cost (about 1.3 to 1.5 times unit costs), longer construction period with additional potential nuisances such as noise and vibration will be resulted. Given the above, relaxation of BH is a preferred solution;
- (f) the proposed landscaped areas allowing public usage and passage on LG1/F and G/F during operating hours of SKMCHC (i.e. 7:30 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.) with tree shading and seating will provide public access as well as a calm and green environment for users' social interaction and relaxation. The redesigned landscape of the Site with compensatory and additional trees as well as building overhang will also improve the quality of the surrounding environment and walking environment (Drawings A-12 to A-14, and A-17);
- (g) barrier-free pedestrian connection between Berwick Street and Woh Chai Street (through SKME Phase 6) will be available during operating hours of SKMCHC (**Drawing A-15**);
- (h) the proposed development has taken into account the relevant SBDG requirements, with sufficient building setback from Berwick Street (minimum at about 7.5m from centreline of Berwick Street) and greenery provision (not less than 20% of the total development site area) (Drawing A-17);

Technical Aspects

- (i) according to the technical assessments, including visual impact assessment (VIA), traffic impact assessment (TIA), preliminary environmental review (PER), drainage impact assessment (DIA), sewerage impact assessment (SIA), water supply impact assessment (WSIA) and geotechnical assessment report (GAR), with the adoption of appropriate mitigation measures, the proposed development will not result in adverse impacts to the surrounding environment during the construction and operation stages; and
- (j) although the existing SKMHC is not a graded historic building, the applicant will preserve SKMHC heritage by various types of records in consultation with the Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) before commencement of site works.

3. <u>Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements</u>

The Site is currently Government Land, the "owner's consent/notification" requirements as set out in the "Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the 'Owner's Consent/Notification' Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance" (TPB PG-No. 31A) are not applicable.

4. <u>Previous Application</u>

There is no previous application at the Site.

5. <u>Similar Applications</u>

Minor Relaxation of BHR

5.1 There are three applications (Nos. A/K4/63, A/K4/65 and A/K4/70) for proposed minor relaxation of BHR within the "R(A)" zone considered by the Committee (**Plan A-1**). The respective application details are summarised below:

Applications for minor relaxation of BHR within "R(A)" zone				
Application No.	Location	Zone	BH relaxation	Decision (date of decision by the Committee)
A/K4/63	Pak Tin Estate Redevelopment Phases 7, 8, 10, 11 and 13	"R(A)"	from 100mPD to 122mPD (+22%); and from 120mPD to 130mPD (+8.3%)	Approved with conditions (13.12.2013)

A/K4/65	SKME Redevelopment Phase 6	"R(A)1"	from 110mPD to 121mPD (+10%)	Approved with conditions (8.5.2015)
A/K4/70	Pak Tin Estate Redevelopment Phases 7, 8, 10, 11 and 13	"R(A)"	from 100mPD to 122mPD (+22%); from 100mPD/130mPD to 132mPD (+1.5% and +32%); from 120mPD to 130mPD (+8.3%); and from 120mPD to 157mPD (+30.8%)	Approved with conditions (12.4.2019)

5.2 The three applications for proposed relaxation of BH restrictions for redevelopment of public housing estates were approved with conditions by the Committee mainly on grounds of compatibility with the planning intention and the surrounding areas, no significant adverse impacts to the surrounding areas, building design to facilitate air ventilation and visual permeability and/or increase in housing supply.

Public Vehicle Park

5.3 Similar applications for temporary public vehicle parks involving the letting of surplus monthly parking spaces to non-residents in HKHA's public housing estates in the Shek Kip Mei area within the "R(A)" zone were considered by the Committee. However, these applications are considered not having direct relevance to the subject application for provision of new public vehicle park.

6. <u>The Site and Its Surrounding Areas</u> (Plans A-1 to A-3 and Photos on Plans A-4 to A-7)

6.1 The Site is:

- (a) bounded by SKME Phase 6 to the north, slopes of a green knoll (Bishop Hill) to the east and Berwick Street to the southwest;
- (b) irregular in shape. It is mainly a platform at about 18mPD, partly occupied by the 2-storey clinic building, with slopes descending towards Berwick Street to the southwest, and slopes ascending towards Bishop Hill to the east (Plan A-2); and
- (c) accessible via Berwick Street. It is well served by various public transport services, including bus and green mini-bus services, and near MTR Shek Kip Mei Station exit at Woh Chai Street (about 110m away) (**Plan A-2**).

- 6.2 The surrounding areas have the following characteristics:
 - (a) the surrounding areas are predominantly residential in nature with several high-rise high-density public housing estates and private residential developments with BHRs generally ranging from 90mPD to 130mPD intermixed with Government, institution and community (GIC) uses including schools and government facilities as well as open spaces (Plan A-1);
 - (b) SKME Phase 6 with a height of about 120.7mPD is immediately adjacent to the Site in the north. To the further north and northeast across Woh Chai Street are the redeveloped housing blocks of SKME Phase 2 with a height of about 126.8mPD (Plan A-2);
 - (c) to the further northwest across Shek Kip Mei Street and extending to Pak Tin Street are the old housing blocks of SKME (including the SKME Shopping Centre) (Plan A-2);
 - (d) to the southwest across Berwick Street is the St. Francis of Assisi's English Primary School, beyond which lie the residential developments within "R(A)7" zone with heights generally ranging from about 44.7mPD to 133.3mPD on the approved Cheung Sha Wan OZP No. S/K5/39 (Plan A-2); and
 - (e) to the east and southeast is the vegetated Bishop Hill with a height of about 78.9mPD, where the Ex-Sham Shui Po Service Reservoir (Grade I historic building) is located (**Plan A-2**).

7. <u>Planning Intention</u>

- 7.1 The planning intention of "R(A)1" zone is primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building. In addition, a public clinic shall be provided within the "R(A)1" zone.
- 7.2 As stipulated in the ES of the OZP, the "R(A)1" zone comprises SKME Redevelopment Phase 6 and the existing SKMHC subject to redevelopment in due course. It is also stipulated that the "R(A)1" zone has taken due regard to the green knoll in the east (i.e. Bishop Hill with a height of about 78.9mPD) by creating a stepped height profile with the eastern part of the zone restricted to a maximum BH of 80mPD (i.e. the portion that the Site and part of SKME Phase 6 is located) and the western part to 110mPD (i.e. the portion that the remaining of SKME Phase 6 is located) (**Plan A-1**).
- 7.3 According to the ES of the OZP, a minor relaxation clause in respect of BH restrictions is incorporated into the Notes in order to provide incentive for developments/redevelopments with planning and design merits. Each application for minor relaxation of BH restriction will be considered on its own merits and the relevant criteria for consideration of such relaxation are as follows:

- (a) amalgamating smaller sites for achieving better urban design and local area improvements;
- (b) accommodating the bonus PR granted under the Buildings Ordinance (BO) in relation to surrender/dedication of land/area for use as public passage/street widening;
- (c) providing better streetscape/good quality street level public urban space;
- (d) providing separation between buildings to enhance air ventilation and visual permeability; and
- (e) other factors such as site constraints, need for tree preservation, innovative building design and planning merits that would bring about improvements to townscape and amenity of the locality, provided that no adverse landscape and visual impacts would be resulted from the innovative building design.

8. <u>Comments from Relevant Government Bureaux/Departments</u>

8.1 The following Government bureaux/departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

Policy Perspective

- 8.1.1 Comments of the Secretary for Health (S for Health):
 - (a) policy support to the application is provided; and
 - (b) as mentioned in paragraph 1.4, SSPDC was consulted on the redevelopment proposal on 6.9.2022.

Land Administration

- 8.1.2 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Kowloon West, Lands Department (DLO/KW, LandsD):
 - (a) the application site falls partly within a Government Land Allocation (GLA-NK 478) which is allocated to D of Health for Shek Kip Mei Polyclinic, partly within VO No. 32 vested in the HKHA for SKME and unleased/unallocated government land. As such, the proposed development of SKMCHC shall be subject to agreement of HKHA; and
 - (b) it is noted that the eastern boundary of the application site is not consistent with that of the existing VO No. 32. If the planning application is approved by the Board, the allocatee shall apply to LandsD for revision of the Government Land Allocation as appropriate. In the event any such application is approved, it would

be subject to such conditions and such boundary for the Government Land Allocation as considered appropriate by LandsD.

Traffic

- 8.1.3 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T):
 - (a) no adverse comment on the application from traffic engineering point of view; and
 - (b) should the application be approved, it is recommended to impose the following approval condition:

the design and provision of parking facilities, L/UL spaces and vehicular access for the proposed development to the satisfaction of C for T or of the Board.

Environment

- 8.1.4 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):
 - (a) it is noted that the applicant has committed to update the PER to assess and demonstrate no adverse air quality impact to the surrounding air sensitive receivers, inlcuding the potential impact of the proposed town gas boiler;
 - (b) given the above and that the sewerage impact is considered not insurmountable, he has no in-principle objection to the application; and
 - (c) should the application be approved, it is recommended to impose the following approval conditions:
 - (i) the submission of an updated SIA for the proposed development to the satisfaction of DEP or of the Board; and
 - (ii) the implementation of the local sewerage upgrading/sewerage connection works as identified in the updated SIA for the proposed development to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services (DDS) or of the Board.
- 8.1.5 Comments of the Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department (CE/MS, DSD):
 - (a) no in-principle objection to the application; and
 - (b) detailed comments on the SIA are set out in Appendix III.

Urban Design, Visual and Landscape

8.1.6 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):

Urban Design

- (a) while the proposed SKMCHC with a BH of 96mPD is taller than Bishop Hill, the intended stepped height profile would be generally maintained with SKME Phase 6 (120.7mPD) descending from the west to the proposed SKMCHC and further to Bishop Hill (78.9mPD) in the east. Given the site context and as illustrated in the VIA, the proposed SKMCHC would unlikely induce significant adverse effect on the visual character of the surrounding townscape;
- (b) escalators, lifts and link bridge system are proposed at Berwick Street entrance for universal access to SKMCHC which is located at an elevated site platform. The building mass at G/F is recessed from the northwestern corner to provide covered void area off the main entrance of SKMCHC for pedestrian circulation. Landscape treatments in the form of landscaped area including trees and planters on LG1/F and G/F along Berwick Street as well as landscaped area at the roof on 15/F have been incorporated. Public usage in the proposed landscaped area on LG1/F and G/F, and public access between Berwick Street and Woh Chai Street through the Site via the covered void area would be allowed during operating hours of the The above design measures may promote visual development. permeability and interest, pedestrian comfort and connectivity, and contribute to the public realm;

Landscape

- (c) no objection to the application from landscape planning point of view;
- (d) with reference to the aerial photo of 2021, the Site is located in an area of medium/high-rise residential urban landscape character, dominated by public and private residential development, school and open space. The Site is currently occupied by the existing SKMHC building. The proposed development is not incompatible with the surrounding environment;
- (e) with reference to the Planning Statement and Landscape Proposal (Appendix B), 20 existing trees of common species are identified including 2 TPIs (i.e. T018 and T021) within the application site boundary. T018 is proposed to be retained while T021 is proposed to be felled. ArchSD conducted a sensitivity analysis in accordance with the Guidelines for Tree Risk Assessment and Management Arrangement and the proposed removal of T021 was presented to SSPDC on 6.9.2022 and Greening Landscape and Tree Management Section of the Development Bureau on 14.10.2022 with no adverse

comment. No rare or protected tree species or OVT are found within the Site; and

- (f) two existing trees are proposed to be retained and 18 existing trees are proposed to be felled within the application site. Landscape provisions, including a total of 33 new trees are proposed on LG1/F and G/F; and a landscaped area is proposed on 15/F.
- 8.1.7 Comments of the Chief Architect/Central Management Division 2, Architectural Services Department (CA/CMD2, ArchSD):

no comment from the architectural and visual impact point of view since the adjacent "R(A)", R(A)1" and "R(A)7" zones are subject to BHRs ranging from 90mPD to 110mPD.

Other Comments

- 8.1.8 Comments of the Director of Housing, HD (D of Housing, HD):
 - (a) no comment on the application; and
 - (b) the share-used arrangement of access road/EVA at SKME Phase 6 with the proposed SKMCHC as indicated in the approved planning application No. A/K4/65 is still valid.
- 8.1.9 Comments of the Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments), AMO (ES(AM), AMO):
 - (a) no comment on the applicant; and
 - (b) she welcomes the applicant's agreement to look into ways of salvaging and preserving the character-defining elements of the SKMHC for possible display in the future development and to carry out a comprehensive recording of the SKMHC and submit such record to AMO for heritage preservation and promotional uses.
- 8.2 The following Government departments have no objection to or no comment on the application:
 - (a) Director of Fire Services (D of FS);
 - (b) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C, WSD);
 - (c) Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department (CBS/K, BD);
 - (d) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department (CE/MS, DSD);
 - (e) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, Highways Department (CHE/K, HyD);
 - (f) Commissioner of Police (C of P);
 - (g) District Officer (Sham Shui Po), Home Affairs Department (DO(SSP), HAD);
 - (h) Project Manager (South), Civil Engineering and Development Department (PM(S), CEDD);

- (i) Head of the Geotechnical Engineering Office, CEDD (Head of GEO, CEDD);
- (j) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (DEMS); and
- (k) D of Health, Department of Health (D of Health, DH).

9. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Period

- 9.1 During the statutory public inspection period, two public comments, including one from a member of HAD Area Committee (Sham Shui Po East), were received (**Appendix II**).
- 9.2 Among the two public comments, the one from the member of HAD Area Committee supported the application on the consideration that the proposed redevelopment of SKMHC with public vehicle park could address the healthcare and parking demand in the Sham Shui Po area. The other public comment from an individual indicated strong objection to the application. While she welcomed the provision of healthcare facilities, she raised objection to the proposal on grounds of excessive development scale, blockage of views towards the hillsides, removal of an existing playground and unnecessary provision of additional public vehicle park.

10. <u>Planning Considerations and Assessments</u>

- 10.1 The application is to seek planning permission for minor relaxation of BHR from 80mPD to 96mPD (i.e. +20%) to facilitate the redevelopment of the existing SKMHC into a permitted public clinic (SKMCHC) and for the proposed public vehicle park at the Site zoned "R(A)1". The proposed development mainly comprises a 17-storey building with a BH of about 96mPD which exceeds the BHR of 80mPD on the OZP, while 'Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)' is a Column 2 use under the Notes of the "R(A)1" zone. Planning permission for minor relaxation of BHR and for the proposed public vehicle park is required.
- 10.2 The proposed development is generally in line with the planning intention of "R(A)1" zone, which stipulates that a public clinic shall be provided within the zone.

Policy Aspect and Land Use Compatibility

- 10.3 The proposed development is under the first 10-year Hospital Development Plan announced in the 2016 PA. The proposed development could address the increasing demand for healthcare services by its expanded capacity and new facilities, and provides a coordinated, multi-disciplinary, cross-sectoral and community-based primary care system. S for Health has provided policy support to the application.
- 10.4 The proposed public vehicle park is in line with the principle of "single site, multiple uses" to make better use of the land resource and to cater for the local parking demand and to help alleviate the on-street illegal parking and traffic congestion problems. TD has initiated the public vehicle park taking into account local parking demand, project area, BHR and engineering constraints.

10.5 The Site is currently occupied by the existing SKMHC providing healthcare services to the Sham Shui Po area. It is located in a residential neighbourhood intermixed with GIC uses including schools and government facilities. In view of the various residential and GIC developments surrounding the Site, the public vehicle park could serve the area and is considered not incompatible with the clinic use of the Site and the existing uses of the surrounding areas.

Requirement for Additional BH

- 10.6 According to the applicant, there is increasing demand for medical and public primary healthcare services in the Sham Shui Po District, which cannot be accommodated by existing facilities. The proposed SKMCHC would reprovision the existing GOPC and chest clinic with expanded capacity and other new healthcare services as listed out in paragraph 1.9 above to cater for the increasing demand for such healthcare services for the aging population in the district. In order to accommodate the healthcare facilities and public vehicle park, the applicant considered that the proposed development scale, i.e. a 17-storey building with a BH of 96mPD, is necessary.
- 10.7 The applicant also examined whether there is scope to reduce the proposed BH. However, taking into account the site constraints, i.e. geotechnical constraint due to proximity to Bishop Hill and limited vehicular access to the Site rendering difficulties for soil removal and delivery of machinery necessary for excavation works, excavation or basement construction is considered not desirable. Furthermore, the FTFH of 4.7m is adopted for the healthcare floors taking into account operational flexibility and for MiC consideration. The proposed BH of 96mPD has taken into account the needs for healthcare facilities, the need to optimise the site utilisation by incorporating the public vehicle park while respecting the stepped height profile intended for the "R(A)" zone.
- 10.8 While the proposed development with a BH of 96mPD is taller than Bishop Hill, the intended stepped height profile would be generally maintained with SKME Phase 6 (120.7mPD) descending from the west to the proposed SKMCHC and further to Bishop Hill (78.9mPD) in the east. CTP/UD&L, PlanD considers that given the site context and as illustrated in the VIA, the proposed development would unlikely induce significant adverse effect on the visual character of the surrounding townscape and the proposed development is not incompatible with the surrounding environment. CA/CMD2, ArchSD has no comment from the architectural and visual impact point of view.

Planning and Design Merits

10.9 The proposed development has incorporated various measures to provide universal access such as escalators, lifts and link bridge system at Berwick Street entrance. Other design measures include building recess at G/F at the northwestern corner to provide covered void area off the main entrance of SKMCHC for better pedestrian circulation, landscape treatments with trees and planters on LG1/F and G/F along Berwick Street to enhance the public realm, public pedestrian connection between Berwick Street and Woh Chai Street through the Site via the covered void area

during operating hours of the development (i.e. 7:30 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.) is also made

- 15 -

available. CTP/UD&L, PlanD considers that the above design measures may promote visual permeability and interest, pedestrian comfort and connectivity, and contribute to the public realm.

- 10.10 The proposed development has taken into account the relevant SBDG requirements, with sufficient building setback from Berwick Street (minimum at about 7.5m from centreline of Berwick Street) and greenery provision (not less than 20% of the total site area).
- 10.11 In view of the above design measures together with the justifications in paragraph 10.7, it is considered that the proposed minor relaxation of BHR has met the relevant criteria under the ES of the OZP as stated in paragraphs 7.3(c) and (e).

Technical Aspects

10.12 Relevant technical assessments including TIA, PER, DIA, SIA, WSIA, VIA and GAR have demonstrated that the proposed development would not induce adverse impacts to the surrounding environment in terms of traffic, environmental, sewerage, drainage and water supply aspects during the construction and operation stages. In particular, the TIA had taken into account the traffic generation for the proposed public vehicle park and concluded that the proposed development will not induce adverse traffic impact on the road and pedestrian networks in the area. C for T has no adverse comment on the application from traffic engineering point of view. Other relevant Government departments, including FSD, DSD, EPD, CTP/UD&L of PlanD and WSD have no objection to/adverse comment on the application. The applicant will also preserve SKMHC heritage by various types of record and will salvage and preserve the character-defining elements of the SKMHC for possible display in the future development in consultation with AMO.

Similar Applications

10.13 The Committee has previously approved three applications for minor relaxation of BH for public housing developments within the "R(A)" zone in the Shek Kip Mei area on grounds of compliance with the planning intention and/or that the proposed BHs were not incompatible with the surroundings. The relaxed BHs of the concerned public housing developments ranging from 121mPD to 157mPD (i.e. about +8.3% to +30.8% above the BHR) are considered comparable to the proposed BH of 96mPD (+20% above the BHR) under the current application. Approval of the current application is consistent with the previous decision of the Committee on the similar applications.

Public Comments

10.14 Regarding the public comments received, the departmental comments in paragraph 8 and the planning assessments above are relevant. Besides, no existing playground will be affected by the proposed development.

11. <u>Planning Department's Views</u>

- 11.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 10 and having taken into account the public comment mentioned in paragraph 9 above, the Planning Department has <u>no</u> <u>objection</u> to the application.
- 11.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid until <u>3.3.2027</u>, and after the said date, the permission shall cease to have effect unless prior to the said date either the development hereby permitted is commenced or the permission is renewed. The following conditions of approval and advisory clauses are suggested for Members' reference:

Approval conditions

- (a) the design and provision of parking facilities, L/UL spaces and vehicular access for the proposed development to the satisfaction of C for T or of the Board;
- (b) the submission of an updated SIA for the proposed development to the satisfaction of DEP or of the Board; and
- (c) the implementation of the local sewerage upgrading/sewerage connection works as identified in the updated SIA for the proposed development to the satisfaction of DDS or of the Board.

Advisory clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at Appendix IV.

11.3 There is no strong planning reason to recommend rejection of the application.

12. Decision Sought

- 12.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission.
- 12.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

13. <u>Attachments</u>

Appendix I	Application form received on 11.1.2023
Appendix Ia	Planning Statement
Appendix Ib	FI received on 17.2.2023

Appendix Ic	FI received on 24.2.2023
Appendix II	Public Comments
Appendix III	Detailed Comments of Government Departments
Appendix IV	Recommended Advisory Clauses
Drawing A-1	Land Swap Plan
Drawings A-2 and A-3	Section and Elevation Plans
Drawings A-4 to A-11	Floor Plans
Drawings A-12 to A-14	Landscape Layout Plans
Drawing A-15	Proposed Access Plan
Drawing A-16	Rendering Drawing
Drawing A-17	SBDG Plan
Drawings A-18 to 22	Photomontages
Plan A-1	Location Plan
Plan A-2	Site Plan
Plan A-3	Aerial Photo
Plans A-4 to A-7	Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT MARCH 2023