APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/K/23

Applicant The Hong Kong Housing Authority (HKHA)

Carparks at Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Tong, Kowloon (Carpark (a)); **Premises**

Carparks at Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, Yau Tong, Kowloon

(Carpark (b)); and

Carparks at Wo Lok Estate, Kwun Tong, Kowloon (Carpark (c))

Lease :

	Land Status
Carpark (a)	Lei Yue Mun Estate
	• Government land vested into the HKHA under the Vesting Order (VO) No. 206
Carpark (b)	Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate ^[1]
	New Kowloon Inland Lot (NKIL) No. 6414
Carpark (c)	Wo Lok Estate
	• Kwun Tong Inland Lot (KTIL) No. 322 R.P., KTIL No. 600 R.P. and Extension to KTIL 600 RP

Plans :

	Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No.		
	Draft Cha Kwo Ling, Yau Tong, Lei Yue Mun Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K15/26		
Carpark (c)	Draft Kwun Tong (South) OZP No. S/K14S/23		

"Residential (Group A)" ("R(A)") **Zoning**

> [Subject to a maximum plot ratio (PR) of 7.5 for a domestic building or 9 for a building that is partly domestic and partly non-domestic, or the PR of the existing building, whichever is the greater.]

Application: Temporary Public Vehicle Park (excluding Container Vehicle) for Letting

^[1] Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, comprises mainly a Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) development and public rental housing (PRH) estate, are held by HKHA under a single Government lease (i.e. NKIL No. 6414).

of Surplus Monthly Parking Spaces to Non-residents for a Period of 5 Years

1. The Proposal

- 1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for temporary public vehicle park (excluding container vehicle) use at Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, and Wo Lok Estate (the Estates and the Court) (**Plan A-1**) for a period of 5 years for letting of the surplus monthly vehicle parking spaces to non-residents.
- 1.2 The Estates and the Court fall within areas zoned "R(A)" on the draft Cha Kwo Ling, Yau Tong, Lei Yue Mun OZP No. S/K15/26 and the draft Kwun Tong (South) OZP No. S/K14S/23 respectively. According to the Notes of the respective OZPs for "R(A)" zone, 'Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)' is a Column 2 use. As the letting of vehicle parking spaces to non-residents would involve a change of use from the existing ancillary car park use to 'Public Vehicle Park (excluding container vehicle)' use, planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board) is required.
- 1.3 The Estates and the Courts are the subject of six previous applications each (Nos. A/K/2, A/K/6, A/K/10, A/K15/110, A/K15/118 and A/K/20 at Lei Yue Mun Estate; Nos. A/K/2, A/K15/78, A/K15/95, A/K15/109, A/K15/117 and A/K/20 at Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate; and Nos. A/K/2, A/K/6, A/K/10, A/K/13, A/K/15 and A/K/20 at Wo Lok Estate) [2] submitted by HKHA for the same use (**Plan A-1** and **Appendix II**). All were approved with or without conditions by the Metro Planning Committee (the Committee) of the Board between 2004 and 2019. The latest planning permission under application of No. A/K/20 will expire on 3.5.2022.
- 1.4 The locations and site plans of the Estates and the Court and the carparks concerned are shown on **Plans A-2** and **A-3** (for Carpark (a)), **A-5** and **A-6** (for Carpark (b)), **A-8** and **A-9** (for Carpark (c)). According to the applicant's submission, from November 2020 to October 2021, the overall vacancy rates for all types of parking spaces (if not let to non-residents) were 16% (42 nos.), 0.5% (2 nos.) and 16% (7 nos.) for Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, and Wo Lok Estate respectively. A comparison of the total monthly parking spaces and the average number of monthly parking spaces let to residents of the Estates and the Court under the previous approved application (No. A/K/20) and the current application is as follows:

[2] Amongst all the previous applications, two of them (Nos. A/K/2 and A/K/20) covered the three Carparks under the current application.

-

	Total no. of monthly parking spaces		Average no. of monthly parking spaces let to residents		Surplus vehicle parking spaces that could be let to non-residents (vacancy rate of monthly vehicle parking spaces)	
	Previous Scheme	Current Scheme	Previous Scheme	Current Scheme	Previous Scheme	Current Scheme
	A/K/20	A/K/23 ^[^]	A/K/20	A/K/23	A/K/20	A/K/23
	(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)	(a)-(c)	(b)-(d)
Lei Yue Mun Estate						
(Carpark (a))						
Private Car (PC)	166	166	155	164	11 (7%)	2 (1%)
Light Goods Vehicle (LGV)	32	32	12	29	20 (63%)	3 (9%)
Motorcycle (MC)	72	72	32	35	40 (56%)	37 (51%)
Total	270	270	199	228	71 (26%)	42 (16%)
Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate ^[%] (Carpark (b))						
PC	234	234	234	234	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
LGV	39	39	39	39	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
MC	134	134	115	132	19 (14%)	(1.5%)
Total	407	407	388	405	19 (5%)	(0.5%)
Wo Lok Estate (Carpark (c))						
PC	38	39[*]	29	33	9 (24%)	6 (15%)
LGV	0	0	0	0	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
MC	5	5	4	4	1 (20%)	1 (20%)
Total	43	44	33	37	10 (23%)	7 (16%)

^[^] Figures exclude hourly parking spaces and parking facilities reserved for the estate management.

^[%] It is required under the lease governing Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate that parking spaces should also be provided for use by the residents of Yau Lai Estate. Figures above include no. of parking spaces let out to the residents of Yau Chui Court, Yau Tong Estate and Yau Lai Estate.

^[*] Compared with the previous application no. A/K/20, the total number of monthly PC parking spaces had increased from 38 to 39 due to the release of 1 reserved parking space to monthly use.

- 1.5 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents:
 - (a) Application form with attachments received on 19.1.2022 (Appendix I)
 - (b) Further information (FI) received on 24.2.2022 providing (**Appendix Ia**) responses to public comment^[*]
 - (c) 2nd (FI) received on 9.3.2022 providing responses to (**Appendix Ib**) public comment^[*]

2. <u>Justifications from the Applicant</u>

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are set out in **Appendices I** to **Ib**. They are summarized as follows:

- (a) The applicant monitors from time to time the demand from the residents of the Estates and the Court for renting monthly parking spaces. As revealed by surveys of utilization rates of monthly parking spaces in the Carparks (a), (b) and (c) from November 2020 to October 2021, there were surplus in parking spaces after allocation of parking spaces to the residents of the Estates and the Court. In order to optimize the use of public resources, the applicant proposes to let all surplus parking spaces in the Estates and the Court to non-residents.
- (b) The proposed letting of surplus parking spaces will not result in any increase in parking facilities and therefore will not generate additional traffic flow. No adverse traffic and environmental impact is envisaged.
- (c) The proposed letting of surplus parking spaces does not involve any physical changes nor changes in land use character. It is considered compatible with other uses in the surrounding areas. With the proposed conversion from ancillary parking to public parking, the resultant non-domestic PRs would still be within the statutory restrictions under the OZP.
- (d) Entrances to individual residential towers in the Estates and the Court are separated from the parking spaces. Moreover, security guards are stationed at each residential tower and will patrol within the Estates and the Court from time to time. No management or security problems should be created.
- (e) For similar applications submitted by the applicant that have been approved since 2004, relevant approval conditions had been imposed in that residents of the Estates and the Court should be accorded with the highest priority in letting of parking spaces, and only surplus monthly parking spaces (with proposed number to be agreed with the Commissioner for Transport) to be let to non-residents. So far, no undue difficulties have been encountered to implement the proposal and fulfill the abovementioned approval conditions. Same monthly rates are charged on the parking spaces rented to the residents and non-residents. In this regard, the interests of the residents would not be compromised. Also, no complaints

^[*] exempted from publication and recounting requirements

- regarding letting of surplus parking spaces to non-residents from the residents of the Estates and the Court have been received since last approval granted in 2019.
- (f) Members of the Estate Management Advisory Committees of Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Tong Estate, Yau Lai Estate and Wo Lok Estate as well as the Incorporated Owners of Yau Chui Court have been consulted, and they have no objection to the current application.
- (g) In response to the suggestion from a public comment (at **Appendix V(3)**) to convert the Speedpost Operation Centre of the Hong Kong Post at Lei Yue Mun Estate back to parking spaces, the applicant responded that upon obtaining agreements from relevant government departments, 51 PC parking spaces have been converted to the Speedpost Operation Centre since 2010. Upon conversion, there are still about 180 PC parking spaces at Lei Yue Mun Estate which are higher than the required provision under the then Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines.

3. Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements

Lei Yue Mun Estate

3.1 As the Estate (including the carpark) involves Government land only, the "owner's consent/notification" requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No.31A) are not applicable to the application.

Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, and Wo Lok Estate

3.2 The applicant is the sole "current land owner". Detailed information would be deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection.

4. Previous Applications

- 4.1 Carpark (a) is the subject of six previous applications for a period of 3 years (Nos. A/K/2, A/K/6, A/K/10, A/K15/110, A/K15/118 and A/K/20) for the same use approved with condition by the Committee of the Board for a period of 3 years on 28.5.2004, 25.5.2007, 28.5.2010, 3.5.2013, 8.4.2016 and 3.5.2019 respectively (**Plan A-1**).
- 4.2 Carpark (b) is the subject of six previous applications for a period of 3 years (Nos. A/K/2, A/K15/78, A/K15/95, A/K15/109, A/K15/117 and A/K/20) for the same use approved with condition by the Committee of the Board on 28.5.2004, 25.5.2007, 7.5.2010, 3.5.2013, 18.3.2016 and 3.5.2019 respectively (**Plan A-1**).
- 4.3 Carpark (c) is the subject of six previous applications for a period of 3 years (Nos. A/K/2, A/K/6, A/K/10, A/K/13, A/K/15 and A/K/20) for the same use approved

- with condition by the Committee of the Board on 28.5.2004, 25.5.2007, 28.5.2010, 3.5.2013, 18.3.2016 and 3.5.2019 respectively (**Plan A-1**).
- 4.4 The planning permission of the latest renewal application No. A/K/20 for Carparks (a), (b) and (c) will expire on 3.5.2022. A summary of the approval conditions for all the previous applications is at **Appendix II**.

5. Similar Applications

- 5.1 There are 21 similar applications for letting the surplus monthly vehicle parking spaces to non-residents on a temporary basis for other PRH estates/HOS developments in Kwun Tong district. All of them (Nos. A/K/2, A/K/6, A/K/10, A/K/13, A/K/15, A/K/17, A/K/19, A/K/22, A/K13/219, A/K13/246, A/K13/253, A/K13/287, A/K13/297, A/K13/300, A/K13/302, A/K14/384, A/K15/77, A/K15/84, A/K15/92, A/K15/108 and A/K15/116) were approved by the Committee with or without conditions (**Plan A-1**).
- 5.2 A summary of the approval conditions for the similar applications is at **Appendix III**.

6. The Sites and their Surrounding Areas (Plans A-2 to A-11)

Existing car parks under the current application are located within residential areas in Kwun Tong district with good vehicular access. A table summarizing the surrounding developments and the access roads is as follows:

Estates/Court	Types of Existing Car Park	Adjacent Developments	Vehicular Access
Lei Yue Mun Estate (Plans A-2 to A-4)	Car parking floors under the podium of Lei Yue Mun Estate and its adjoining open air car park	 to the north across Ko Chiu Road are Yau Mei Court and Ko Cheung Court; to the east and south are residential blocks of Lei Yue Mun Estate to the west is a bus terminus and further west across Yan Wing Street is Yau Tong Centre; and the MTR Yau Tong Station is approximately 450m to the northwest 	Ko Chiu Road
Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate (Plans A-5 to A-7)	Car parking floors under the podium of Yau Chui Court	 to the north, west and south, and to the east across Lei Yue Mun Road are four schools respectively; to the further south is Yau Mei Court; to the further west and northwest are Yau Lai Estate; and 	An internal road leading to Lei Yue Mun Road

Estates/Court	Types of Existing Car Park	ing Car Adjacent Developments	
	Tark	- the MTR Yau Tong Station is approximately 250m to the southwest	Access
Wo Lok Estate (Plans A-8 to A-11)	Open air car parks of Wo Lok Estate	 surrounded by residential blocks of Wo Lok Estate; to the south and west are private residential buildings along Yuet Wah Street; and to the east are Tsui Ping (North) Estate and Po Pui Court 	Hip Wo Street and Yuet Wah Street

7. Planning Intention

The planning intention of "R(A)" zone is primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building.

8. Comments from Relevant Government Departments

8.1 The following Government departments have been consulted and their views on the application and/or public comments are summarized as follows:

Land Administration

- 8.1.1 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Kowloon East, Lands Department (DLO/KE, LandsD):
 - (a) no objection to the application.

Lei Yue Mun Estate

(b) the subject Estate has been vested into HKHA under VO No. 206 for control and management of the estate.

Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate

- (c) the Court and Estate concerned fall within NKIL No. 6414 and is governed by a Government Lease, inter alia, that the lot is restricted to non-industrial (excluding godown, hotel and petrol filling station) purposes.
- (d) By virtue of a waiver letter dated 9.9.2009 issued to the lot owner, i.e. the HKHA, the surplus car parking spaces of Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate are permitted to be underleted to members of the public subject to obtaining relevant planning permission (if required) by the HKHA.

8

Replacement Page 8 for MPC Paper No. A/K/23 For Consideration by the MPC on 18.3.2022

Wo Lok Estate

- the subject estate falls within KTIL 322 RP, KTIL 600 RP & (e) Extension to KTIL 600 RP restricted to be used of developing flats for persons of small means in accordance with Housing Ordinance and such offices, shops and kindergarten as may be approved.
- (f) The proposed renewal of planning approval for temporary 'public vehicle park' use for letting of surplus car parking spaces to non-residents at Wo Lok Estate is in breach of the lease conditions of HKHA has submitted a temporary waiver the above lots. application to LandsD to implement the proposal which is under If the application is approved by LandsD in the capacity of a landlord at its sole discretion, the waiver will be subject to those terms and conditions as to be imposed by LandsD.
- His other detailed comments are at **Appendix IV**. (g)

Traffic Aspect

- 8.1.2 The Commissioner for Transport (C for T):
 - he has no in-principle objection to the application for letting out the surplus parking spaces to non-residents at Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, and Wo Lok Estate from district traffic engineering point of view, subject to an approval condition that priority should be accorded to the residents of the Estates and the Court; and
 - (b) the applicant is advised to review the residents' parking demand from time to time and allocate the parking spaces to the residents of the Estates and the Courts in priority.

Environmental Aspect

8.1.3 The Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):

> as gathered from the submission, it is noted that the container vehicle is excluded in the application and there will be no net increase in the number of parking spaces within the three Estates and the Court, and that only the surplus car parking spaces will be let to non-residents. In view of the above, he does not anticipate the application will have any adverse environmental impacts and has no objection to the current application from environmental planning perspective;

Other Aspect

8.1.4 The Postmaster General:

> for the public comment regarding the Speedpost Operation Centre at Lei Yue Mun Estate (Appendix V(3)), he advises that Hong Kong Post has rented the office space cum 2 PC and 14 LGV parking spaces at the estate with the Housing Department to run the Centre for meeting its operational To cope with the operational needs of the center while avoiding unnecessary nuisance to residents, operating vehicles entering and leaving

the center are restricted between 7:00 a.m. and 8:30 p.m. only, and all trucks are required to leave immediately after loading and unloading mail.

- 8.2 The following Government departments have no comment on/ no objection to the application:
 - (a) Chief Highway Engineer/Kowloon, Highways Department;
 - (b) Commissioner of Police;
 - (c) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department;
 - (d) Chief Building Surveyor/Kowloon, Buildings Department;
 - (e) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department;
 - (f) Director of Fire Services;
 - (g) Chief Architect/CMB2, Architectural Services Department; and
 - (h) District Officer (Kwun Tong), Home Affairs Department.

9. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Period

On 28.1.2022, the application was published for public inspection. During the first 3 weeks of the statutory public inspection period, which ended on 18.2.2022, 4 public comments were received. Among them, two public comments from a member of the Kwun Tong Centre Area Committee of the Kwun Tong District Council (KTDC) and the Owners' Corporation of Kai Tak House respectively, support the application. The latter states that it may fully utilize resources (**Appendices V(1)** to (**2)**). A member of KTDC comments that she has received complaints from many local residents on the noise nuisance generated by the operation of the Speedpost Operation Centre at Lei Yue Mun Estate, and there is acute shortfall of parking spaces in the area. She thus suggests converting the subject centre back for car parking use to meet residents' need (**Appendix V(3)**). An individual states that there was/would be a significant decrease in the number of spaces to be rented out at Lei Yue Mun Estate (**Appendix V(4)**).

10. Planning Considerations and Assessments

- 10.1 The application seeks planning permission for temporary public vehicle park (excluding container vehicle) use for letting of surplus vehicle parking spaces in the existing carparks of Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, and Wo Lok Estate to non-residents for a period of 5 years. According to the applicant, the average vacancy rates of the vehicle parking spaces in Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Chui Court and Yau Tong Estate, and Wo Lok Estate were about 16%, 0.5% and 16% respectively from November 2020 to October 2021. The letting of the surplus parking spaces to non-residents as proposed in the application would help utilise resources more efficiently.
- 10.2 According to the submission, the applicant has been reviewing the occupancy rate and the demand for parking spaces in individual carparks from time to time so as to optimize the use of resources and help meet the needs of residents and local communities. In this regard, with ongoing monitoring, the proposed temporary period of 5 years is considered acceptable as only the surplus parking spaces will

- be let to the non-residents and the parking need of the residents would not be compromised.
- 10.3 According to the applicant, the proposal would not attract additional traffic flow to the surrounding areas. The C for T has no in-principle objection to the application from district traffic engineering viewpoint provided that the applicant would review the residents' parking demand regularly and allocate the parking spaces to the residents of the Estates and the Court in priority. In this regard, an approval condition is recommended as in paragraph 11.2 below should the application be approved by the Committee.
- The Estates and the Court were previously approved for the same use by the Committee in 2004, 2007, 2010, 2013, 2016 and 2019 (Application Nos. A/K/2, A/K/6, A/K/10, A/K/13, A/K/15, A/K/20, A/K15/78, A/K15/95, A/K15/109, A/K15/110, A/K15/117 and A/K15/118 at **Appendix II**) respectively. There are also 21 similar applications at various HOS/PRH developments in Kwun Tong District approved by the Committee with or without condition(s) between 2001 and 2022 (see paragraph 5 and **Appendix III** for details). There is no change in planning circumstances and the approval of the application is consistent with the previous decisions of the Committee on the previous and similar applications.
- Regarding the public comment suggesting to convert the Speedpost Operation 10.5 Centre at Lei Yue Mun Estate back for parking purposes, the office space currently occupied by the centre was converted in 2010 from surplus parking spaces that was agreeable among relevant departments. According to the applicant, even with the centre in use, provision of parking space would still meet the requirement under the then HKPSG and there are still surplus parking spaces according to survey. The Postmaster General advises that there is a need to operate the Speedpost Operation Centre and rent 2 PC and 14 LGV parking spaces at the estate to serve the postal demand in the area, and all operating vehicles are restricted to enter the centre between 7:00 a.m. and 8:30 p.m. only and all trucks are required to leave immediately after loading/unloading mail in order to avoid unnecessary nuisance to the residents. Besides, the applicant commits that the management team of Lei Yue Mun Estate would liaise with the Hong Kong Post to follow up the noise nuisance issue, if any. Regarding the public comment stating that there was/would be a significant decrease in the number of spaces to be rented out at Lei Yue Mun Estate, the applicant would regularly monitor the number of parking spaces rented out to the residents and would let out those surplus parking spaces to non-residents with proposed number to be agreed with C for T.

11 Planning Department's Views

- 11.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 10 and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 9, the Planning Department <u>has no objection</u> to the application.
- 11.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid on a temporary basis for a period of five years up to 18.3.2027. The following condition of approval is suggested for Members'

reference:

Approval Condition

Priority should be accorded to the respective residents of Lei Yue Mun Estate, Yau Chui Court, Yau Tong Estate, Yau Lai Estate and Wo Lok Estate in the letting of the surplus vehicle parking spaces and the proposed number of vehicle parking spaces to be let to non-residents should be agreed with the Commissioner for Transport.

Advisory clause

- 11.3 The recommended advisory clauses are attached at **Appendix VI**.
- 11.4 There is no strong planning reason to recommend rejection of the application.

12. <u>Decision Sought</u>

- 12.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the period of which the permission should be valid on a temporary basis.
- 12.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

13. Attachments

Appendix IApplication form with attachments received on 19.1.2022Appendix IaFurther Information submitted by the applicant received

on 24.2.2022

Appendix Ib Further Information submitted by the applicant received

on 9.3.2022

Appendix IIPrevious ApplicationsAppendix IIISimilar Applications

Appendix IV Other Detailed Departmental Comments

Appendices V(1) to V(4) Public comments

Appendix VI Recommended Advisory clause Plans A-1 to A-11 Location Plans and Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT MARCH 2022