# APPLICATION FOR AMENDMENT OF PLAN UNDER SECTION 12A OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

#### **APPLICATION NO. Y/TWW/7**

<u>Applicant</u>: Leverson Limited represented by Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd.

Site : Tsuen Wan Inland Lot (TWIL) 5 and Lot No. 429 in D.D. 399, Ting

Kau, adjoining Castle Peak Road - Ting Kau and Ting Kau Bridge,

Tsuen Wan

Site Area : About 6,431m<sup>2</sup>

<u>Lease</u> : <u>TWIL 5</u>

(a) held under Government lease dated 7.1.1926 as varied or modified by a No-Objection Letter dated 15.12.2006 subject to a "rate and range" clause

- (b) no user / gross floor area (GFA) / site coverage (SC) / building height (BH) restriction under lease
- (c) five trades or businesses of Sugar-baker, Oilman, Butcher, Victualler, or Tavern-Keeper are permitted

#### Lot No. 429 in D.D. 399

- (a) held under New Grant No. 3650 dated 14.11.1958 as varied or modified by a Modification Letter dated 20.11.2000 for the purpose of garden, open carpark and loading and unloading area ancillary to the use of TWIL 5
- (b) no right of ingress or egress to or from the lot through Government land for the passage of motor vehicles

Plan : Approved Tsuen Wan West Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/TWW/19

**Zonings** : "Comprehensive Development Area (1)" ("CDA(1)") (about 92.2%)

- (a) maximum GFA of 29,400m<sup>2</sup> or the total GFA of the existing building(s), whichever is the greater
- (b) No part of the structures of the development shall exceed the lowest soffit level of the Ting Kau Bridge (i.e. 76.77mPD)
- (c) 'Hotel' use in Column 2 and no provision for 'Flat' and 'Social Welfare Facility' uses

"Green Belt" ("GB") (about 6.2%)

'Flat' and 'Social Welfare Facility' are Column 2 uses

Area shown as 'Road' (about 1.6%)

# **Proposed Amendment**

- : To rezone the application site from "CDA(1)", "GB" and area shown as 'Road' to "Residential (Group B)2" ("R(B)2") subject to the following development restrictions
  - (a) maximum GFA of 29,400m<sup>2</sup> or the GFA of the existing building, whichever is the greater
  - (b) no part of the structures of the development shall exceed the lowest soffit level of the Ting Kau Bridge (i.e. 76.77mPD)
  - (c) 'Flat' and 'Social Welfare Facility' as Column 1 uses

#### 1. The Proposal

- The application site (the Site) (**Plan Z-1**) is mainly zoned "CDA(1)", with minor 1.1 portions falling within areas zoned "GB" and shown as 'Road' on the approved Tsuen Wan West OZP No. S/TWW/19 and is currently occupied by the Royal View Hotel with 691 hotel rooms. The applicant proposes wholesale conversion of the existing 15-storey hotel development into a private residential development with provision of social welfare facility at the Site. As there is no provision under the OZP for submission of planning application under section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance) to the Town Planning Board (the Board) for 'Flat' and 'Social Welfare Facility' uses in the "CDA(1)" zone, the applicant submitted the subject application under section 12A of the Ordinance (s.12A application) to amend the zoning of the Site to a new "R(B)2" zone, subject to a maximum GFA of 29,400m<sup>2</sup> and maximum BH of 76.77mPD (i.e. the lowest soffit level of the Ting Kau Bridge), with 'Flat' and 'Social Welfare Facility' being Column 1 uses; and the provision of social welfare facility as requested by the Government may be disregarded from the GFA calculation (Appendix II).
- 1.2 According to the applicant's indicative scheme (**Drawings Z-1 to Z-9**), all existing 691 hotel rooms would be converted to a total of not more than 661 flats while the building envelope, BH and development bulk of the hotel would remain unchanged. To support the proposed conversion scheme, addition and alteration (A&A) works for extension of the existing basement and minor slope works for site formation would be required. On converting the existing building structure into residential use, the original hotel facilities/back-of-house areas would also be converted for other uses supporting/ancillary to the proposed residential development. A 60-place Day Care Centre for the Elderly (DE) would also be provided.
- 1.3 The major development parameters of the indicative scheme are set out as follows:

<b>Development Parameters</b>	Proposed Development
Site Area	
- Application Site Area <sup>(1)</sup>	About 6,431m <sup>2</sup>
- Development Site Area <sup>(2)</sup>	About 6,066m <sup>2</sup>

Application site area is based on the lot boundary of TWIL 5 and Lot No. 429 in D.D. 399 (Plan Z-2).

Development site area excludes the portion of an access road within TWIL 5 of about 365m<sup>2</sup> (**Plan Z-2**). Based on the approved GBP of the existing hotel development, 6,066m<sup>2</sup> was adopted for the calculation of PR.

Development Parameters	Proposed Development
GFA	110posed Development
- Domestic <sup>3</sup>	- Not more than 29,400m <sup>2</sup>
- Non-domestic	- About 760m <sup>2</sup> for the 60-place DE <sup>(4)</sup>
	(about 2.6% of the total domestic
	GFA)
PR (2)(3)	- /
- Domestic	4.85
- Non-domestic	N/A
Site Coverage	Not more than 44%
No. of Block	1
Maximum BH (to main roof)	Not more than 76.45mPD
No. of Storeys	15
	(from L1 to L19, omitting L3, L4, L13
	and L14)
Main Uses by Floor <sup>5</sup>	
- L1	- Clubhouse, Lobby for residents,
	Carpark
- L2	- Clubhouse, Lobby for DE,
	Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Spaces,
	Flats
- L5	- Clubhouse, DE, Flats
- L6	- Clubhouse, Flats
- L7 to L19	- Flats
No. of Flats	Not more than 661
Flat Mix	
- Studio (about 25m <sup>2</sup> )	554 flats
- 1 Bedroom (about 35m <sup>2</sup> )	79 flats
- 2 Bedrooms (about 45m <sup>2</sup> )	21 flats
- Penthouse (about 78m <sup>2</sup> )	7 flats
Anticipated Population	About 1,785
No. of Car Parking Spaces	
Residential Portion	
- Private Car	75 (including 2 accessible spaces)
- Motorcycle	7
DE Portion	
- Private Car	3
No. of L/UL Spaces	
- Residential	1
- DE	1
- Refuse Collection Vehicle	1
Private Open Space	Not less than 1,785m <sup>2</sup>

The proposed domestic GFA includes 1,685m<sup>2</sup> for residents' clubhouse. The applicant stated that subject to Building Authority (BA)'s approval at building plan submission stage, the clubhouse GFA may not be exempted from GFA calculation since the existing hotel was completed prior to the promulgation of the extant Sustainable Building Design Guidelines (SBDG) and the exemption of clubhouse GFA may not be applicable.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> GFA of the proposed 60-place DE (about 760m<sup>2</sup>), as required by the Social Welfare Department (SWD), shall be disregarded from GFA/PR calculation which has been taken into account in the technical assessments to support the s.12A application.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> L3, L4, L12, L14 are omitted under the existing hotel and proposed development.

<b>Development Parameters</b>	Proposed Development
Tree Felling/Preservation Proposal	
- No. of existing trees	66
- Trees to be felled	66 (including 3 dead trees)
<ul> <li>New trees to be planted</li> </ul>	66
Target Completion Year	20246

## Proposed Access and Traffic Arrangement

- 1.4 The current hotel development is served by a two-way access road branching off from Castle Peak Road Ting Kau. The vehicular access of the proposed residential development will remain the same as that for the existing hotel.
- 1.5 To accommodate the demand of commuting in the Tsuen Wan direction, the applicant proposes a 28-seat shuttle bus service for future residents to/from MTR Tsuen Wan Station / Tsuen Wan West Station for about 7 trips per hour<sup>7</sup>. The service details would be submitted to the Transport Department (TD) separately during the future application of residential shuttle service.

#### Landscape Master Plan (LMP)

- 1.6 There are 66 existing trees within the Site, including 18 trees (about 27%) of native species and 48 trees (about 73%) of exotic species. All of them are proposed to be felled due to the extension of basement car park and for a holistic reconfiguration of the main entrance landscape area (56 trees) and natural decays or in damaged conditions due to previous typhoons or being not suitable for transplanting (10 trees). Existing tree groups in the hillside areas outside of the Site will remain untouched. According to the LMP (**Drawing Z-8**), 66 new trees are proposed to be planted in the open areas within the Site, including about 60% of species native to Hong Kong or Guangdong region (27% at present).
- 1.7 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents:
  - (a) Application form and letters received on 3.6.2021 (Appendix I)
  - (b) Planning Statement including Master Layout Plan (MLP), architectural drawings, Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA), Environmental Assessment (EA), Drainage Impact Assessment (DIA) and Sewerage Impact Assessment (SIA)
  - (c) Supplementary Information received on 7.6.2021 (**Appendix Ia**) enclosing revised MLP and architectural drawings
  - (d) Further Information (FI) 1 to 8 received between (all cover letters

According to the applicant, since the proposed development would only require internal A&A works for reshuffling of the original hotel rooms to residential flats, it could be completed by 2024.

A hotel shuttle service between the Site and MTR Tsuen Wan Station / Tsuen Wan West Station is currently provided, operating 6 trips per hour with a round trip time of about 25 minutes.

12.8.2021 and 13.5.2022 providing revised MLP, architectural drawings, LMP, Tree Survey and Presentation Proposal (TSPP), TIA, SIA, DIA, Air Quality Impact Assessment (AQIA), Noise Impact Assessment (NIA), Geotechnical Planning Review Report (GPRR), and responses to departmental and public comments

of the GIs attached in **Appendix Ib**)

(1) FI 9 received on 23.5.2022 enclosing a consolidated (**Appendix Ic**) report with an updated Planning Statement and revised technical assessments as contained in FI 1 to 8

Remarks:

\* FI 5 to 8 were accepted and exempted from publication and recounting requirement

1.8 Upon receipt of the last FI received on 21.12.2021 that required publication for public comments, the application was scheduled for consideration by the Committee on 18.3.2022. In view of the critical epidemic situation and tightened social distancing measures announced by the Government at that time, the Committee agreed to adjourn consideration of the subject application to another date under section 12A(20) of the Ordinance. The application is now rescheduled for consideration by the Committee at this meeting.

#### 2. Justifications from the Applicant

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in the Planning Statement and technical assessments at **Appendix Ic**, which are summarised below:

#### Ample Supply of Hotels in Tsuen Wan and Wider Area

(a) the "CDA(1)" zoning of the Site for hotel development has been designated for over decades. With new hotels in Lantau to be completed in the coming 5 years<sup>8</sup> and the existing ample hotel supply in Tsuen Wan area<sup>9</sup>, the proposed wholesale conversion of the existing hotel would not result in hotel shortage in the locality. Given the changing planning context of the Site and its surrounding area, the Site is proposed to be rezoned to meet more imminent need for residential use;

# Proposed Rezoning Helps Expedite Housing Supply and Reflect Planning Intention

(b) one of the housing initiatives launched by the Government is to adopt a multi-pronged approach in developing short to long term land supply, in particularly for housing development. The proposed rezoning would provide an opportunity to allow housing supply of not more than 661 units available in the

According to the applicant, new hotels in Lantau area include Regala Skycity Hotel (1,210 rooms) and The Silveri Hong Kong – MGallery Hotel (206 rooms).

According to the applicant, there are in total six hotels (excluding the Site) providing about 3,786 hotel rooms. These include L'hotel Nina et Convention Centre (1,608 rooms), Panda Hotel (911 rooms), Dorsett Tsuen Wan (546 rooms) and Silka Far East Hotel Hong Kong (240 rooms) located in the Tsuen Wan Town Centre area; Bay Bridge Hong Kong / Bay Bridge Lifestyle Retreat (438 rooms) in Tsuen Wan West; and Noah's Ark Resort (43 rooms) in Ma Wan.

- short term, and the proposed wholesale conversion is a quick and viable option in providing more private housing units and should warrant favourable consideration of the Board;
- (c) given the Site is in close proximity to other existing residential developments to its east and southeast, the proposed residential use would be compatible with its surrounding land uses, and the proposed "R(B)2" zone is considered appropriate;

## Provision of Social Welfare Facility Meets Community Needs

(d) in view of the anticipated shortfall in elderly services in Tsuen Wan area, a 60-place DE would be provided within the proposed development. The proposed DE intends to provide a range of care and support services during daytime to the frail elderly aged 60 or above, and to provide support and assistance to the carers of the elderly persons. It has met the relevant Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) locational requirements for being "located on the ground floor or lower floor of a building" and being in proximity to open space or playground" (e.g. the nearby Ting Kau Sitting-out Area) (**Plan Z-2**);

# Acceptable in Planning and Visual Terms

the proposed wholesale conversion only involves A&A works to the existing hotel and there will be no significant change to the building bulk. The proposed "R(B)2" zone would be subject to the same GFA and BH restrictions as currently set out in the subject "CDA(1)" zone. As such, no visual impact is anticipated;

#### No Adverse Technical Impacts

- (f) in terms of traffic, the TIA (Appendix C in **Appendix Ic**) demonstrated that all critical junctions in the vicinity will continue to be operating with ample capacity after the completion of the proposed development. In view of the minimal demand of community in the Tuen Mun direction, the existing public transport services in the vicinity would be sufficient to handle the demand;
- (g) in terms of landscape (**Drawing Z-8**), the proposal represents an upgrade to the existing landscape amenity and quality of the Site;
- (h) in terms of air quality, the AQIA (Appendix D in **Appendix Ic**) indicated that the existing practice for the existing hotel relying on openable window for ventilation would remain unchanged after the proposed conversion. Given no changes to the location of ventilation openings and the air sensitive portion of the subject building, it is anticipated that the proposed residential development would be acceptable in air quality terms;
- in terms of road traffic noise, the NIA (Appendix E in **Appendix Ic**) demonstrated that with the provision of acoustic window (baffle type), enhanced acoustic balcony (baffle type) and fixed glazing, the predicted road traffic noise level at all noise sensitive receivers would comply with HKPSG's Guideline of 70 dB(A). As a result, the compliance rate of the proposed development is 100%;

(j) both DIA and SIA (Appendices F and G in **Appendix Ic**) demonstrated that the existing infrastructure has adequate capacity to cater the runoff and sewage generated by the proposed development;

#### Not Setting an Undesirable Precedent

- (k) it is appropriate in planning terms to review the subject "CDA(1)" zoning, which has been designated for a long time ago and restrictive in use, and to propose more appropriate zoning in view of the changing planning circumstances and to facilitate residential use which is more in line with the latest planning direction and societal needs; and
- (l) a s.16 application (No. A/TSW/72) for redeveloping the existing hotel site of Harbour Plaza Resort City in Tin Shui Wai for flats with permitted commercial uses was approved by the Board in late 2020. A s.12A application (No. Y/MOS/6) for rezoning a hotel site in Ma On Shan to facilitate a proposed residential development through wholesale conversion of the existing Horizon Suite Hotel was also agreed by the Board in early 2021. These two applications demonstrated that the intention to facilitate residential development by redeveloping/converting an existing hotel is supported by the Board especially against the background of acute housing demand in Hong Kong.

## 3. <u>Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements</u>

The applicant is the sole "current land owner" of the Site. Detailed information would be deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection.

#### 4. Background of the Site

The Site was zoned "GB"<sup>10</sup> on the first Tsuen Wan West OZP No. S/TWW/1 exhibited on 3.2.1989. The draft Tsuen Wan West OZP No. S/TWW/4 was gazetted on 28.10.1994 under s.5 of the Ordinance, with the incorporation of the revised alignments of Ting Kau Bridge and associated road works being one of the amendments as shown on the Plan. On 27.10.1995, in considering an objection to the "GB" zone of the Site submitted by an objector, i.e. the current applicant, to facilitate a proposed hotel development, the Board decided to amend the Site to "CDA", as proposed by the objector, to meet the objection. The Site was then rezoned to "CDA(1)" with the current development restrictions. The Occupation Permit for the existing hotel was issued on 10.10.2006.

## 5. <u>Previous Applications</u>

The Site is the subject of nine previous s.16 applications, which were all submitted for approval of MLP under the existing "CDA(1)" zone for hotel development in accordance with the stipulated development restrictions. They were all approved with conditions by

The then planning intention of the "GB" zone was for protecting the alignment of Route 3, i.e. Ting Kau Bridge in the concerned section.

the Committee from 1998 to 2005 (**Plan Z-1**).

#### 6. Similar Application

There is no similar s.12A application on the Tsuen Wan West OZP.

## 7. The Site and Its Surrounding Area

- 7.1 The Site is (**Plans Z-1** to **Z-3**):
  - (a) located in a gateway position on Ting Kau headland fronting the Rambler Channel and to the east of Ting Kau Bridge at a site level of about 46m below the lowest soffit level of the bridge;
  - (b) sandwiched between Ting Kau Beach to the east and Lido Beach to the west;
  - (c) accessible from an access road branching off from Castle Peak Road Ting Kau; and
  - (d) currently occupied by the Royal View Hotel.
- 7.2 The surrounding area has the following characteristics:
  - (a) to the east are vegetated slopes (zoned "GB"), low-rise and low-density villa type developments (zoned "R(C)"), Ting Kau Village (zoned "V") and Ting Kau Beach (zoned "Open Space"("O")) (**Plans Z-1 and Z-3**);
  - (b) to the south are vegetated slopes (zoned "GB"), low-rise and low-density villa type developments (namely Sea Cliff Lodge and Aztec Lodge which are zoned "R(C)1") and the Ting Kau Sitting-out Area (zoned "O" and with pedestrian access to Lido Beach) (**Plans Z-2 and Z-3**);
  - (c) to the west is Ting Kau Bridge. To the further west is Lido Beach, Casam Beach and Hoi Mei Beach (which are zoned "O") (**Plan Z-1**);
  - (d) to the north is Castle Peak Road Ting Kau and Ting Kau Carpark (**Plan Z-2**). To the further northwest is a low-rise and low-density villa type developments, including Grand Riviera (which is zoned "R(C)2") and Deauville (which is zoned "R(C)3") (**Plan Z-1**); and
  - (e) there are bus stops and GMB stands at Castle Peak Road (both Ting Kau and New Ting Kau sections) within 400m walking distance from the Site.

#### 8. Planning Intention

8.1 The planning intention of the relevant zonings are as follows:

- (a) "CDA(1)" for comprehensive development/redevelopment of the area hotel use with the provision of supporting facilities. The zoning is to facilitate appropriate planning control over the scale, design and layout of development, taking account of various environmental, traffic, infrastructure and other constraints;
- (b) "GB" for the conservation of the existing natural environment amid the built-up areas/at the urban fringe, to safeguard it from encroachment by urban type development, and to provide additional outlets for passive recreational activities. There is a general presumption against development within this zone; and
- (c) <u>"R(B)"</u> for medium-density residential developments where commercial uses serving the residential neighbourhood may be permitted on application to the Board.
- 8.2 According to the Explanatory Statement of the OZP for "CDA(1)" zone, to avoid adverse visual impact on the Ting Kau Bridge, the development is restricted to a maximum total GFA of 29,400m<sup>2</sup> and a maximum BH of 76.77mPD which is the lowest soffit level of the Ting Kau Bridge.

#### 9. Comments from Relevant Government Departments

9.1 The following Government departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

#### **Land Administration**

- 9.1.1 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing, LandsD (DLO/TW&KT, LandsD):
  - (a) reserves comments on the proposed schematic design which would only be examined in detail during the building plan submission stage. There is no guarantee that the schematic design as presently proposed in the subject s.12A application if reflected in future building plan submission(s) will be acceptable under lease; and
  - (b) it is noted that portion of the existing access road leading from Castle Peak Road Ting Kau serving the private lots lying to the southeast of the Site, namely Lots No. 424, 425 and 426 in D.D. 399, passes through TWIL 5.

#### **Social Welfare Aspect**

- 9.1.2 Comments of the Director of Social Welfare (DSW):
  - (a) has no objection to include a 60-place DE within the proposed development;
  - (b) subject to the agreement of the incorporation of the DE in the

proposed development, the premises for the agreed DE should be provided as an integral part of the development and will be assigned back to the Financial Secretary Incorporated as a Government Accommodation (GA) upon construction completion. Funding arrangement for the GA is to be discussed between the applicant and the Government at a suitable juncture;

- (c) LandsD's advice should be sought on the implementation mechanism in respect of lease matters in requesting developer(s) to construct the welfare premises as proposed; and
- (d) comments on the disposition of the function rooms of DE would be addressed by the applicant in the detailed design stage.

## **Traffic Aspect**

- 9.1.3 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T):
  - (a) has no in-principle objection to the application from traffic management and transport operation viewpoints;
  - (b) KMB Routes 53, 234B and GMB Routes 96, 96C, 96M and 302 could all serve the passenger demand from the proposed development to Tsuen Wan Town Centre. The services shall be able to meet the demand as a whole; and
  - (c) the applicant proposed shuttle bus service to/from MTR Tsuen Wan Station / Tsuen Wan West Station. The applicant is reminded that TD will vet new Residents' Service applications thoroughly according to the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374) and relevant factors. TD may not approve new Residents' Service serving the proposed development given the general adequacy of parallel public transport services in the vicinity.
- 9.1.4 Comments of the Commissioner of Police (C of P):
  - (a) has no objection in principle to the application; and
  - (b) a shuttle bus service serving the Site is highly recommended as it can help reduce the traffic generated from the proposed residential use.

#### Urban Design, Visual and Landscape Aspects

## **Urban Design and Visual**

- 9.1.5 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):
  - (a) the Site is situated at the top of the headland generally zoned "GB" between Ting Kau Beach to the east and Lido Beach to the west.

The Site is bordering Ting Kau Bridge and Castle Peak Road to its west and north respectively. To the east is a cluster of low-density residential developments zoned "R(C)" and "V" and BH generally ranging from 1 to 3-storey. To the west and north across Ting Kau Bridge and Castle Peak Road are areas generally zoned "GB" scattered with some low-density residential developments zoned "R(C)" with BH generally ranging from 1 to 6-storey. Given that the proposal does not involve increase in development intensity nor change in building bulk, it will unlikely have significant adverse effects on the visual character of the surrounding townscape;

- (b) according to the proposed scheme, the proposed residential development is largely the same as the existing hotel in terms of layout and building bulk, except that some floor spaces have been converted to private open spaces and roof gardens, which may offer opportunity for landscape treatments;
- (c) the applicant has indicated that buffer planting with a combination of trees, shrubs and climbers are proposed along the site boundary to enhance the interface of the proposed development with its surroundings. There is no further comments on the application from the urban design and visual perspectives;

## <u>Landscape</u>

- (d) the Site is situated in an area of residential urban fringe landscape character, dominated by residential buildings, clustered tree groups, vegetated slopes and village houses. Given that large portion of the proposed development involves an in-situ conversion of the existing hotel, the proposed residential use is not incompatible with the surrounding environment on landscape aspect;
- (e) it is noted that 66 existing trees of common species within the Site are proposed to be felled, and 66 new tree planting and landscape provisions on L1, L2, L5 and L18 are proposed. Not less than 20% total greenery area will be provided. An open space provision of no less than 1,785m² for a design population 1,785 is proposed, including recreational facilities such as swimming pool, children play area, maze garden, arrival garden, herbal garden, viewing garden and pocket gardens; and
- (f) the applicant clarified in the revised LMP that "should there be any trees located adjacent to but outside the Application Site being affected by site formation and newly formed slope/retaining structures, relevant authority/ government department(s) will be approached to obtain necessary approval on tree works directly" in R-to-C table. The applicant is reminded that approval of s.12A application under the Ordinance does not imply approval of the site coverage of greenery requirements under PNAP APP-152 and/or under the lease. The SC of greenery calculation should be

submitted separately to the Buildings Department (BD) for approval. Similarly for any proposed tree preservation/removal scheme and compensatory planting proposal, the applicant is reminded to approach relevant authority direct to obtain the necessary approval, where appropriate.

#### **Environment**

- 9.1.6 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):
  - (a) has no objection to the application;
  - (b) with the provision of acoustic window (baffle type), fixed glazing with maintenance window and enhanced acoustic balcony (baffle type) at relevant Noise Sensitive Receivers (NSRs) of the development, the applicant's NIA predicts that road traffic noise levels at all NSRs would comply with the HKPSG's noise standard. The applicant has also provided an undertaking letter on 6 April 2022 (Appendix 3.1 of Appendix E in **Appendix Ic**) for the implementation of noise mitigation measures recommended in the NIA;
  - (c) the applicant's AQIA has assessed surrounding vehicular and industrial emissions impact on the proposed development. While there is a small exceedance zone of annual NO<sub>2</sub>, the applicant confirms in the AQIA that no air sensitive uses would be located within the exceedance zone. As such, future occupants of the proposed development would not be subject to insurmountable air quality impact; and
  - (d) according to the applicant's SIA, it is anticipated that there would be no adverse impact nor adverse cumulative impact on the existing sewerage.

#### **Geotechnical Aspect**

- 9.1.7 Comments of the Head of Geotechnical Engineering Office, CEDD (H(GEO) CEDD):
  - (a) has no comment on the GPRR;
  - (b) it is noted from the GPRR that a detailed assessment, and if necessary, stabilisation / upgrading / preventive works of all existing slopes in the vicinity to the Site will be carried out in the detailed design stage to ensure that the proposed development would not adversely affect or be affected by the existing slopes / retaining walls; and
  - (c) the applicant is reminded that all geotechnical submissions regarding the proposed development shall be submitted to BD for approval

according to the Buildings Ordinance (BO).

#### **Building Matters**

- 9.1.8 Comments of the Chief Building Surveyor/New Territories West (CBS/NTW), BD:
  - (a) no objection to the application;
  - (b) the proposed PR and SC should not exceed the permissible limits under First Schedule of Building (Planning) Regulation (B(P)R) unless modification is granted by BA;
  - (c) the proposed day care centre for the elderly should be GFA accountable under BO;
  - (d) the discharge values of the existing stairs should be demonstrated sufficient for discharging occupants of the converted flats in case of fire after conversion;
  - (e) requirements under PNAP APP-151 and APP-152 shall be complied with if GFA concession is claimed in new building(s); and
  - (f) detailed comments will be given in the building plan submission stage.

#### **Fire Safety**

- 9.1.9 Comments of the Director of Fire Services (D of FS):
  - (a) no in-principle objection to the application subject to water supplies for fire-fighting and fire service installations being provided to the satisfaction of D of FS;
  - (b) detailed fire safety requirements will be formulated upon receipt of formal submission of general building plans; and
  - (c) the emergency vehicular access provision in the Site shall comply with the standard as stipulated in Section 6, Part D of the Code of Practice for Fire Safety in Buildings 2011 under the B(P)R 41D which is administered by BD.
- 9.2 The following Government departments have no comment on the application:
  - (a) Chief Architect/CMD2, Architectural Services Department;
  - (b) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department;
  - (c) Chief Highway Engineer/New Territories West, Highways Department;
  - (d) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Service Department;
  - (e) District Officer (Tsuen Wan), Home Affairs Department; and
  - (f) Project Manager (West), CEDD.

#### 10. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Periods

- 10.1 During the public inspection periods, a total of 243 public comments were received. A full set of the public comments is deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection.
- Among the 243 public comments (of which 36 comments were submitted in 8 standard formats), 182 supported the application (samples at **Appendix III-a**), 36 objected the application (samples at **Appendix III-b**), 25 provided comments/had reservation on the application (samples at **Appendix III-c**). These public comments were submitted by the following parties:
  - (a) two comments were submitted by a member of the Tsuen Wan West Area Committee in support of the application;
  - (b) 10 comments were submitted by the village representatives of Ting Kau Village, villagers of Ting Kau Village and the incorporated owners of Sea Cliff Lodge, all objecting to the application;
  - (c) one comment was from the Tsuen Wan District Council (TWDC) Member of Ting Shum Constituency expressing concerns in traffic, and another comment was from the Tsuen Wan Rural Committee conveying the objecting comments from Ting Kau Village; and
  - (d) the remaining 229 public comments were submitted by individuals with different views.

#### Supporting Views (Appendix III-a)

- 10.3 The supporting grounds are summarised as follows:
  - (a) the location of the Site is not favourable for tourists, resulting in a low demand for hotel rooms. It is sensible to convert the hotel for residential use to increase housing supply;
  - (b) the proposed wholesale conversion is an environmental-friendly and economical option to increase housing supply; and
  - (c) the provision of the social welfare facility (DE) is favourable to the local community.

# Objecting Views (Appendix III-b)

- 10.4 The objecting grounds are summarised as follows:
  - (a) the proposed development will further intensify the traffic congestion of Castle Peak Road Ting Kau, especially during peak hours. The illegal parking situation in the area will also be worsened;

- (b) there are limited public transport access to the Site. Existing bus and GMB services are already overcrowded and may not support any further increase of passengers generated by the proposal, especially during peak hours;
- (c) the proposed development intensity is incompatible with the surrounding low-rise residential developments and village houses;
- (d) the Site is located on a slope, and thus accessibility to the proposed social welfare facility is in doubt;
- (e) the proposed development will further increase discharge of sewage that could overwhelm the sewerage system due to higher constant output from domestic dwellings than hotel; and
- (f) there is still high demand of hotel rooms in the area, and closure of the existing hotel would significantly reduce job opportunities in the district.

#### Other Views (Appendix III-c)

- 10.5 Other comments on the application include:
  - (a) the area is lack of shops and services. The demand for shops and services will be increased with the population growth by the proposed residential development. It is undesirable that no shops and services will be provided within the proposed development; and
  - (b) studio flats are over-supplied in the market. At least half of the hotel rooms should be converted to two-bedroom flats for the needs of family groups.

#### 11. Planning Considerations and Assessments

- The application is for rezoning the Site mainly from "CDA(1)" (with minor portions in areas zoned "GB" and shown as 'Road') (**Plans Z-1 to Z-3**) to "R(B)2" for the proposed wholesale conversion of the Royal View Hotel to a residential development with provision of social welfare facility. The applicant proposes the new "R(B)2" zone to be subject to a maximum GFA of 29,400m² and maximum BH of 76.77mPD (i.e. the lowest soffit level of the Ting Kau Bridge), which are the same of the current "CDA(1)" zone, and includes 'Flat' and 'Social Welfare Facility' as Column 1 uses, which are always permitted. The proposed Notes for the "R(B)2" zone submitted by the applicant is at **Appendix II**.
- 11.2 According to the applicant's indicative scheme (**Drawings Z-1 to Z-9**), not more than 661 flats will be provided, and the BH and development intensity as stipulated under the existing zoning would remain unchanged. A 60-place DE would also be provided on the lower floors of the building.

#### Land Use Compatibility

The Site is situated at the top of the headland generally surrounded by "GB" zone with some clusters of low-rise, low-density residential developments zoned "R(C)" and "V" in the vicinity (**Plans Z-1 and Z-3**). BHs of these residential developments generally range from 1 to 6-storey. The Site is bordering Ting Kau Bridge and Castle Peak Road – Ting Kau to its west and north respectively. The proposed residential use with social welfare facility is considered not incompatible with the surrounding area which is of residential urban fringe character in the seaside setting comprising beaches and green spaces.

## Development Intensity, Building Bulk, Building Height and Visual Aspect

- 11.4 In terms of development intensity, the proposed "R(B)2" zone with a PR of 4.85 (based on the existing building bulk of the hotel building), is on the high side as compared with the PR of other "R(B)" sites in the Tsuen Wan West Planning Scheme Area mainly ranging from 0.6 to 2.1. Currently, there is no other "R(B)" development in the vicinity of the Site (**Plan Z-1a**). These residential developments surrounding the Site are zoned "V" subject to BH restriction of 3 storeys, and "R(C)" or its sub-zones with PR restriction ranging from of 0.4 to 1.2 and BH restriction ranging from 3 to 5 storeys (**Plan Z-3**). Taking into account that the proposed residential development is situated at a location being adjoining to the massive superstructure of Ting Kau Bridge, maintaining the same GFA and BH restrictions of the current "CDA(1)" zone for the proposed "R(B)2" zone is considered not unacceptable.
- Given the proposed development would not involve increase in development intensity, it will unlikely have significant adverse effects on the visual character of the surrounding townscape. CTP/UD&L, PlanD has no adverse comment on the proposed rezoning from the urban design and visual perspectives.

## Provision of Social Welfare Facility

11.6 According to the applicant's indicative scheme, a 60-place DE will be provided on L2 and L5 (i.e. the second and third floors) of the proposed residential development. According to the HKPSG provision requirement 11, there is deficit of 78 planned DE in the Tsuen Wan West planning scheme area. DSW has no objection to the proposal to include a social welfare facility (DE) within the proposed development. To ensure the adequate provision of GIC facility, the minimum GFA requirement of 760m² for Government, Institution and Community (GIC) facility should be specified in the Notes of the OZP.

# **Technical Aspects**

In support of the proposed development, the applicant submitted technical assessments including LMP, TSPP, TIA, EA, NIA, AQIA, SIA, DIA and GPRR.

According to HKPSG, the standard provision of Community Care Service (CCS) Facilities is 17.2 subsidised places per 1,000 elderly persons aged 65 or above. In general, 60% of CCS demand will be provided by home-based CCS and the remaining 40% will be provided by centre-based CCS (i.e. DE).

Relevant B/Ds have been consulted in terms of the potential landscape, traffic, noise, air quality, sewerage, drainage and geotechnical impacts.

- In terms of landscape, the Site is situated in an area of residential urban fringe landscape character, dominated by residential buildings, clustered tree groups, vegetated slopes and village houses. According to the LMP and TSPP, all the 66 existing trees of common species within the Site are proposed to be felled due to the proposed A&A works at basement level / main entrance to increase car park provision and natural decays/damaged in previous typhoons. 66 new trees are proposed to be planted in the open space areas within the development (**Drawing Z-8**). CTP/UD&L, PlanD has no adverse comment on the proposed rezoning from landscape planning perspective.
- 11.9 On traffic, the Site is served by a two-way access road branched off from Castle Peak Road Ting Kau. The access road is also serving existing residential developments to the immediate south of the Site. The vehicular access of the proposed development will remain at same location. As advised by C for T, the existing public transport services in the vicinity could also serve the passenger demand from the proposed development to/from Tsuen Wan Town Centre. Bus stops and GMB stands are located within 400m walking distance from the Site. As demonstrated in the revised TIA, all road junctions will operate with ample capacity in design year 2027, and no insurmountable traffic impact would be imposed onto the local road network due to the proposed residential use. C for T has no in-principle objection to the application considering that the proposed residential use would not induce insurmountable traffic impact.
- 11.10 On air quality, the AQIA has assessed surrounding vehicular and industrial emissions impact on the proposed development and confirmed that future occupants would not be subject to insurmountable air quality impact. On noise, the NIA demonstrated that with the provision of acoustic window (baffle type), fixed glazing with maintenance window and enhanced acoustic balcony (baffle type) at relevant NSRs of the development, the predicted road traffic noise level at all NSRs would comply with HKPSG's noise standard. The applicant has also provided an undertaking letter for the implementation of noise mitigation measures recommended in the NIA. The SIA and DIA demonstrated that the existing infrastructure has adequate capacity to support the proposed residential development. Taking into account the above, DEP has no objection to the application from environmental and sewerage perspectives. CE/MS of DSD and H(GEO) of CEDD have no objection to the application from the drainage and geotechnical perspectives.

## Implication on GIC Provision within OZP Area

11.11 According to the indicative scheme, the proposed development will convert the existing 691 hotel rooms to about 661 flats with an estimated population of about 1,785 persons. Based on HKPSG, the overall planned provision of open space and GIC facilities will be generally adequate to serve the need of existing and planned population in TWDC area, except there will be deficit in the provision of child care centre (deficit of 636 places) and DE (deficit of 141 places). As the HKPSG requirements for these facilities are a long-term goal, SWD will

work closely with relevant government departments to ensure that additional GIC facilities will be included in new and redevelopment proposals in TWDC area, where appropriate. Under the current proposal, a 60-place DE is proposed to meeting the need of elderly facilities.

#### **Public Comments**

11.12 Among the 243 public comments received, there are 182 supportive, 36 opposing and 25 providing comments/having reservation. As for the adverse public comments, the planning assessment above and the departmental comments in paragraph 9 above are relevant. Regarding the concern on the demand for hotel rooms in the area, the applicant has provided information about the existing supply of hotels in Tsuen Wan area of about 3,800 rooms and new hotels in Lantau of about 1,400 rooms (paragraph 2(a) above refers).

## 12. Planning Department's Views

- 12.1 Based on the assessment made in paragraph 11 above and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 10 above, the Planning Department <u>has no objection</u> to the application.
- Should the Committee decide to agree to the application, the Chief Executive in Council would be requested to refer the approved Tsuen Wan West OZP No. S/TWW/19 to the Board for amendment. Details of the amendments to the approved OZP would be submitted to the Committee for approval prior to gazetting under section 5 of the Ordinance.
- 12.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide not to agree to the application for amendment, the following reason is suggested for Members' reference:

The Site is considered appropriate for hotel use. There is no strong planning justification for permitting residential development at this location.

#### 13. <u>Decision Sought</u>

- The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to agree, partially agree, or not to agree to the application.
- 13.2 Should the Committee decide not to agree to the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for the decision should be given to the applicant.

## 14. Attachments

Appendix I
Appendix Ia
Supplementary information received on 7.6.2021

Contact Supplementary information received on 7.6.2021

**Appendix Ib** Cover letters of FI 1 to 8

**Appendix Ic** FI 9 received on 23.5.2022 with consolidated report of

updated Planning Statement and revised technical

assessments

**Appendix II** Notes of OZP for "R(B)2" zone proposed by the applicant

**Appendix III** Samples of Public Comments

Drawings Z-1 to Z-6 Floor Plans
Drawing Z-7 Section Plan

Drawing Z-8 Landscape Master Plan

**Drawing Z-9** Private Open Space Demarcation Plan

Plan Z-1 Location Plan

**Plan Z-1a** Location Plan of "R(B)" Sites in Tsuen Wan West Area

Plan Z-2 Site Plan
Plan Z-3 Aerial Photo
Plans Z-4 to Z-6 Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT JUNE 2022