<u>APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION</u> UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/NE-TK/737

Applicant Mr. LEUNG Kwok Hung represented by Mr LEUNG Pak Keung

<u>Site</u> Lots 644 S.O, 646 S.H RP, 646 S.L, 646 S.M ss.2 and 654 S.AA in D.D. 15 and

adjoining government land, Shan Liu, Tai Po

Site Area About 89.5 m² (including about 18.2 m² of government land)

<u>Lease</u> Block Government Lease demised for agricultural purpose

<u>Plan</u> Approved Ting Kok Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/NE-TK/19

Zoning "Agriculture" ("AGR")

Application Proposed House (New Territories Exempted House (NTEH) - Small House)

1. The Proposal

- 1.1 The applicant, who is an indigenous villager of Shan Liu Village¹ as confirmed by the respective Indigenous Inhabitant Representative (IIR), seeks planning permission to build a NTEH (Small House) on the Site (**Plans A-1** and **A-2a**). The Site falls within "AGR" zone on the approved Ting Kok OZP No. S/NE-TK/19. According to the Notes of the OZP, 'House (NTEH only, other than rebuilding of NTEH or replacement of existing domestic building by NTEH permitted under the covering Notes)' within "AGR" zone is a Column 2 use requiring planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board).
- 1.2 Details of the proposed NTEH (Small House) are as follows:

Total Floor Area : 195.09 m²

Number of Storeys : 3 Building Height : 8.23 m Roofed Over Area : 65.03 m²

1.3 The Site is accessible by a local vehicular track connecting to Shan Liu Road. The uncovered area of the Site is proposed to be used for garden purpose. The applicant proposes to connect the Site with an existing public sewer nearby. The layout of the proposed Small House and connection with the public sewer is shown on **Drawing A-1**.

¹ According to District Lands Officer/Tai Po, Lands Department (DLO/TP, LandsD), the applicant is eligible for Small House grant.

- 1.4 The Site is part of the subject of a previous application No. A/NE-TK/471 (for two NTEHs (Small Houses)) submitted by two applicants including the one of the current application, which was approved with conditions by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (the Committee) on 11.10.2013. The validity period of the planning permission was extended twice for a total period of 4 years until 11.10.2021. The current application covers only one NTEH (Small House) with the same development parameters and footprint as previously approved.
- 1.5 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the application form with attachments (**Appendix I**) received on 26.11.2021.

2. Justifications from the Applicant

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in Part 8 of the application form at **Appendix I**. They can be summarized as follows:

- (a) the current application is part of the subject of a previously approved application (No. A/NE-TK/471) for two Small Houses. The current application only involves one of the two Small Houses as the other house has been granted with Building Licence. As it takes time for LandsD to process Small House grant applications, and the validity period of the planning permission could not be further extended, the applicant submits a fresh planning application to facilitate further processing of the Small House grant application at the Site;
- (b) the site area, development parameters, building disposition and the surrounding environment of the house under application are the same as the previously approved application;
- (c) the submission part of approval condition on drainage proposal under the previously approved application was considered acceptable by Drainage Services Department (DSD). DSD also had no adverse comments on the revised sewerage connection proposal submitted under the Small House grant application at the Site. Should this application be approved, the applicant will continue to undertake the requirements set out by DSD; and
- (d) the proposed Small House will not cause adverse environmental, drainage, sewerage, firefighting and landscape impacts, and will not frustrate the planning intention of the area.

3. Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements

The applicant is the sole "current land owner" of the Site. Detailed information would be deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection. As for the government land, the "owner's consent/notification" requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No. 31A) is not applicable.

4. Assessment Criteria

The set of Interim Criteria for Consideration of Application for NTEH/Small House in New Territories (the Interim Criteria) was first promulgated on 24.11.2000 and had been amended four times. On 23.8.2002, criterion (i) which requires that the application site, if located within water gathering grounds (WGG), should be able to be connected to the existing or planned sewerage system in the area was incorporated. The latest set of Interim Criteria promulgated on 7.9.2007 is at **Appendix II**.

5. Previous Application

- 5.1 The Site is part of the subject of a previous application (No. A/NE-TK/471) covering a larger site for two proposed Small Houses submitted by two applicants including the one of the current application. The previous application was approved with conditions by the Committee on 11.10.2013 mainly on the considerations that the proposed Small House footprints fell entirely within the village 'environs' ('VE'); there was a general shortage of land to meet Small House demand at the time of consideration; and the proposed Small Houses could be connected to the planned public sewerage system. The validity period of the planning permission was extended twice for a total period of 4 years until 11.10.2021. The current application covers only one NTEH (Small House) with the same development parameters and footprint as previously approved.
- 5.2 Details of the previous application are summarised at **Appendix III** and its location is shown on **Plan A-2a**.

6. <u>Similar Applications</u>

- 6.1 There have been 43 similar applications in close proximity to the Site (including 22 wholly within "AGR" zone, 11 straddling on "AGR and "GB" zones and 10 straddling on "AGR" and "V" zones) since the first promulgation of the Interim Criteria on 24.11.2000. Of them, 29 cases were approved and 14 were rejected.
- 6.2 Among the 29 approved applications, 26 (No. A/NE-TK/295, 299, 305, 349, 358, 411, 416, 421-423, 428, 431, 434, 439, 452, 463, 467-468, 474, 477, 483, 510, 528, 529, 561 and 562) were approved between 2009 and 2015 before the Board's adoption of a more cautious approach in approving applications for Small House development in recent years. They were approved mainly on the considerations that more than 50% of the proposed Small House footprint fell within the 'VE'; there was a general shortage of land to meet the demand for Small House development in the "V" zone at the time of consideration; the proposed Small House could be connected to the planned/existing public sewerage system in the area; and/or being the subject of a previously approved application. Three applications (No. A/NE-TK/657, 700 and 701) were approved between 2018 and 2021 after the Board's adoption of a more cautious approach in considering Small House applications, mainly on sympathetic considerations of locating entirely within the 'VE' and an area with a new cluster of Small Houses being formed through approved planning applications and Small House grant applications; being the subject of a previously approved

- application; and that the proposed development could be connected to the existing public sewerage system.
- 6.3 A total of 14 applications (No. A/NE-TK/167, 183, 272, 288, 318, 357, 388, 390, 410, 414, 462, 509, 525 and 526) were rejected by the Committee or the Board on review between 2003 and 2015 before the Board's adoption of a more cautious approach in approving applications for Small House development. These applications were rejected mainly on the grounds that the proposed development was unable to connect to the planned/existing public sewerage system; more than 50% of the proposed Small House footprint fell outside the "V" zone/'VE'; the proposed development would cause adverse water quality/ landscape/drainage impacts in the area; and/or setting an undesirable precedent for other similar applications.
- 6.4 There is another application for a NTEH (Small House) (No. A/NE-TK/738), which will be considered by the Committee at the same meeting with the current application.
- 6.5 Details of the similar applications are summarized at **Appendix IV** and their locations are shown on **Plan A-2a**.

7. The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1, A-2a, and photos on Plans A-3 and A-4)

- 7.1 The Site is:
 - (a) currently vacant with no vegetation cover;
 - (b) located entirely within the 'VE' of Shan Liu;
 - (c) within the lower indirect Water Gathering Ground (WGG); and
 - (d) accessible by a local track leading to Shan Liu Road off Ting Kok Road.
- 7.2 The areas in the immediate neighbourhood of the Site are largely vacant, comprising many sites with planning approvals for Small House developments and/or under Small House grant applications approved/being processed by LandsD. Construction works are in progress for some of the approved Small Houses. Further north are the upper foothills of Pat Sin Leng with dense vegetation.

8. Planning Intention

The planning intention of the "AGR" zone is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes.

9. Comments from Relevant Government Departments

9.1 The application has been assessed against the assessment criteria in **Appendix II**. The assessment is summarized in the following table:

	<u>Criteria</u>	Yes	<u>No</u>	<u>Remarks</u>
1.	Within "V" zone? - The Site - Footprint of the proposed Small House	- -	100% 100%	- The Site falls entirely within the "AGR" zone.
2.	Within 'VE'? - The Site - Footprint of the proposed Small House	100% 100%	-	 The Site and the Small House footprints fall entirely within the 'VE' of Shan Liu. (Plans A-1 and A-2) DLO/TP, LandsD has no objection to the application.
3.	Sufficient land in "V" zone to meet Small House demand (outstanding Small House applications plus 10-year Small House demand forecast)? Sufficient land in "V" zone to meet outstanding Small House applications?	√	√	Land Required - Land required to meet Small House demand in Shan Liu: about 6.50 ha (equivalent to 260 Small House sites). The outstanding Small House applications for Shan Liu are 10 ² while the 10-year Small House demand forecast for the same village is 250.
				Land Available - Land available to meet the Small House demand within the "V" zone of Shan Liu: about 0.97 ha (equivalent to 38 Small House sites) (Plan A-2b).
4.	Compatible with the planning intention of "AGR" zone?		✓	- Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC) does not support the application from agriculture point of view as the Site possesses potential for agricultural rehabilitation, with active agricultural activities in the vicinity and agricultural infrastructures such as road access and water source available.

-

² Among the 10 outstanding Small House applications, 5 of them fall entirely within the "V" zone and 5 of them straddle or fall outside the "V" zone. For those 5 applications straddling or being outside the "V" zone, one of them (Application No. A/NE-TK/657) has obtained valid planning approval from the Board.

- 6 -

	<u>Criteria</u>	Yes	<u>No</u>	<u>Remarks</u>
5.	Compatible with surrounding area/ development?	√		- The proposed Small House is not incompatible with the surrounding areas which are mainly vacant land and vegetated areas. The areas in the immediate neighbourhood of the Site comprise many sites with planning approvals for Small House development and/or under Small House grant applications approved/being processed by LandsD.
6.	Within Water Gathering Grounds (WGGs)?	✓		- Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C, WSD) has no objection to the application provided that the applicant will connect the whole of the foul water drainage systems to a public sewerage system. The applicant should be required to provide protective measures to ensure that no pollution and siltation occurs to the WGG.
7.	Environmental and Sewerage impact?		√	- Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) has no in-principle objection to the application provided that the applicant will connect the Small House to the existing public sewer at his own costs and reserve adequate land for the sewer connection work.
8.	Encroachment onto planned road networks and public works boundaries?		√	
9.	Need for provision of fire service installations and emergency vehicular access (EVA)?		√	- Director of Fire Services (D of FS) has no in-principle objection to the application.
10.	Traffic impact?	√		- Commissioner for Transport (C for T) has reservation on the application and advises that Small House development should be confined within the "V" zone as far as possible. Notwithstanding the above, the application involving only development of a Small House can

	<u>Criteria</u>	Yes	No	<u>Remarks</u>
				be tolerated unless being rejected on other grounds.
11.	Drainage impact?	√		- Chief Engineer/Mainland North, Drainage Services Department (CE/MN, DSD) has no in-principle objection to the application subject to the incorporation of an approval condition requiring the submission and implementation of a drainage proposal.
12.	Landscape impact?		√	- Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD) has no objection to the application as significant adverse landscape impact arising from the proposed development is not anticipated, and the proposed development is considered not incompatible with the surrounding environment of the Site.
13.	Local objections received from DO?		√	

- 9.2 Comments from the following government departments have been incorporated in paragraph 9.1 above. Other detailed comments are at **Appendix V**.
 - (a) DLO/TP, LandsD;
 - (b) DAFC;
 - (c) CE/C, WSD;
 - (d) DEP;
 - (e) D of FS;
 - (f) C for T;
 - (g) CE/MN, DSD; and
 - (h) CTP/UD&L, PlanD.
- 9.3 The following government departments have no objection to/no comment on the application:
 - (a) Chief Highway Engineer/New Territories East, Highways Department (CHE/NTE, HyD);
 - (b) Project Manager/North, Civil Engineering and Development Department (PM/N, CEDD);
 - (c) Head of Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (H(GEO), CEDD); and
 - (d) District Officer/Tai Po, Home Affairs Department (DO/TP, HAD).

10. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Period

On 3.12.2021, the application was published for public inspection. During the statutory public inspection period, no public comment was received.

11. Planning Considerations and Assessments

- 11.1 This application is for a proposed Small House at the Site zoned "AGR" on the OZP. The proposed development is not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone, which is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes, and also to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes. DAFC does not support the application from the agricultural point of view as the Site possesses potential for agricultural rehabilitation.
- 11.2 According to DLO/TP, LandsD's record, the total number of outstanding Small House applications for Shan Liu Village is 10 while the 10-year Small House demand forecast is 250. Based on the latest estimate by PlanD, about 0.97 ha of land (or equivalent to about 38 Small House sites) is available within the "V" zone of Shan Liu. DLO/TP of LandsD has no objection to the application.
- 11.3 The Site is currently vacant with no vegetation cover, and is located in an area comprising mainly vacant land and vegetated areas. Many sites in close proximity are subject of planning approvals for Small House development and/or Small House grants approved/being processed by LandsD (**Plan A-2a**). The proposed Small House under the current application is not incompatible with the surrounding landscape character (**Plan A-3**). CTP/UD&L of PlanD has no objection to the application from landscape planning perspective as significant adverse landscape impact arising from the proposed Small House is not anticipated.
- 11.4 The Site is located within the lower indirect WGG and the applicant has proposed to connect the proposed Small House with the existing public sewerage system nearby (Plan A-2a). DEP has no in-principle objection to the application provided that the applicant will connect the house to the existing public sewer at his own costs and reserve adequate land for the sewer connection work. CE/C of WSD has no objection to the application and advises that the applicant should provide adequate protective measures to ensure no pollution or siltation occurs to the WGG. CE/MN of DSD also has no in-principle objection to the application subject to the incorporation of an approval condition requiring the submission and implementation of a drainage proposal. To address these technical concerns, relevant approval conditions are recommended in paragraphs 12.2 (a) to (c) below should the application be approved by the Committee. C for T advises that the application involving only development of a Small House can be tolerated on traffic grounds. Other relevant Government departments including D of FS, CHE/NTE of HyD, PM/N and H(GEO) of CEDD and DO/TP of HAD have no objection to nor adverse comment on the application.

- Regarding the Interim Criteria (Appendix II), the proposed Small House 11.5 footprint falls entirely within the 'VE' of Shan Liu and the proposed development located within WGG would be able to be connected to the existing public sewerage system (Plan A-2a). While land available within the "V" zone (about 0.97 ha or equivalent to about 38 Small House sites) is insufficient to fully meet the future Small House demand (about 6.50 ha or equivalent to about 260 Small House sites), such available land is capable to meet the outstanding 10 Small House applications. The Board has adopted a more cautious approach in approving applications for Small House development in August 2015. Amongst others, in considering whether there is a general shortage of land in meeting Small House demand, more weighting has been put on the number of outstanding Small House applications provided by LandsD. Nevertheless, the Site is part of the subject of a previous planning approval (No. A/NE-TK/471) given in 2013 to two applicants including the one of the current application for development of two Small Houses. While this previous planning approval has lapsed on 12.10.2021, DLO/TP, LandsD advises that the Small House grant application for the Site has been approved pending execution. Compared with the previously approved scheme, the current application covers only one house which is of the same development parameters and footprint as previously approved. Furthermore, the Site is surrounded in the immediate neighbourhood by areas with planning approvals for Small House development and under Small House grant applications approved by LandsD, which will form a new cluster of Small Houses within the 'VE' (Plan A-2a). In view of the above, sympathetic consideration might be given to the current application.
- 11.6 There are 43 similar applications located in close proximity to the Site within/partly within the same "AGR" zone (**Plan A-2a**), with 29 cases approved and 14 rejected. Among the approved cases, 26 (No. A/NE-TK/295, 299, 305, 349, 358, 411, 416, 421-423, 428, 431, 434, 439, 452, 463, 467-468, 474, 477, 483, 510, 528, 529, 561 and 562) were approved before the Board's adoption of a more cautious approach. For the three applications (No. A/NE-TK/657, 700 and 701) after the adoption of a more cautious approach, they were approved mainly on sympathetic considerations of locating entirely within the 'VE' and an area with a new cluster of Small Houses being formed through approved planning applications and Small House grant applications; being the subject of a previously approved application; and that the proposed development could be connected to the existing public sewerage system. The circumstances of the subject application are similar to these approved cases.
- 11.7 No public comment was received during statutory publication period.

12. Planning Department's Views

- 12.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 11, Planning Department has <u>no</u> objection to this application.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid until 14.1.2026, and after the said date, the permission shall cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted

is commenced or the permission is renewed. The following conditions of approval and advisory clauses are also suggested for Members' reference:

Approval Conditions

- (a) the submission and implementation of drainage proposal to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board:
- (b) the connection of the foul water drainage system to the public sewers to the satisfaction of the Director of Water Supplies or of the Town Planning Board: and
- (c) the provision of protective measures to ensure no pollution or siltation occurs to the water gathering grounds to the satisfaction of the Director of Water Supplies or of the Town Planning Board.

Advisory Clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at **Appendix VI**.

- 12.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, the following reasons for rejection are suggested for Members' reference:
 - (a) the proposed development is not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone which is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes. There is no strong planning justification in the current submission for a departure from the planning intention; and
 - (b) land is still available within the "V" zone of Shan Liu which is primarily intended for Small House development. It is considered more appropriate to concentrate the proposed Small House development within the "V" zone for more orderly development pattern, efficient use of land and provision of infrastructure and services.

13. <u>Decision Sought</u>

- 13.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant the permission.
- 13.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the date when the validity of the permission should expire.

13.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

14. Attachments

Appendix IApplication form and attachments received on 26.11.2021Appendix IIRelevant Interim Criteria for Assessing Planning Applications

NTEH/Small House in New Territories

Appendix IIIPrevious applicationAppendix IVSimilar applications

Appendix V Detailed comments from relevant government departments

Appendix VI Recommended advisory clauses

Drawing A-1 Layout Plan Submitted by the Applicant

Plan A-1 Location Plan Plan A-2a Site Plan

Plan A-2b Estimated Amount of Land Available within the "V" zone of

Shan Liu for Small House Development

Plan A-3 Aerial Photo
Plan A-4 Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT JANUARY 2022