RNTPC Paper No. A/NE-TK/739 For Consideration by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee on 28.1.2022

# APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

# APPLICATION NO. A/NE-TK/739

<u>Applicant</u>	Mr. TSANG Sau Keung
<u>Site</u>	Lots 455 S.H ss.6, 455 S.H RP (Part) and 455 RP (Part) in D.D. 23, Po Sam Pai, Ting Kok, Tai Po
<u>Area</u>	About 1,046 m <sup>2</sup>
<u>Lease</u>	Block Government Lease (demised for agricultural use)
<u>Plan</u>	Approved Ting Kok Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/NE-TK/19
Zoning	"Agriculture" ("AGR")
Application	Temporary Private Vehicle Park (Private Cars Only) with Pedestrian and Vehicular Access for a Period of 3 Years and Filling of Land

## 1. <u>The Proposal</u>

- 1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for a temporary private vehicle park (private cars only) with pedestrian and vehicular access for a period of 3 years and filling of land at the application site (the Site) (**Plan A-1**). According to the Notes of the OZP, temporary use or development of any land or building not exceeding a period of 3 years requires planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board) notwithstanding that the use or development is not provided for in terms of the OZP. Filling of land within the "AGR" zone also requires planning permission from the Board. The Site is currently paved and used for the applied use without planning permission.
- 1.2 According to the applicant, the temporary private vehicle park provides 9 parking spaces for private cars for use by himself and his family. The associated filling of land involved the paving of the whole site by concrete, with a depth of about 0.2m. The Site is accessible via a local track connecting with Tung Tsz Road and Ting Kok Road, with ingress and egress points located at the northwestern and southern boundary respectively. The parking layout submitted by the applicant is at **Drawing A-1**.

- 1.3 In support of the application, the applicant submitted the following documents :
  - (a) an application form with attachments received on (Appendix I) 1.12.2021
  - (b) Further Information (FI) received on 28.12.2021 (Appendix Ia) (accepted and exempted from the publication and recounting requirements)

#### 2. <u>Justifications from the Applicant</u>

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in Part 7 of the application form and the FI at **Appendices I** to **Ia**. They can be summarised as follows:

- (a) the applied use is to satisfy the applicant's personal and family parking needs. No adverse traffic impact is anticipated;
- (b) there are no alternative vehicle parks in the vicinity to meet the applicant's parking needs;
- (c) the paved pedestrian and vehicular access serves to separate the nearby village houses from wild animals. It could also be used by emergency vehicles and facilitate circulation of other local residents' vehicles;
- (d) the applied use will not result in adverse impact on the surrounding environment, drainage facilities, water supplies and slopes;
- (e) the applicant has widely consulted the local residents and received no objection to the application. The paved pedestrian and vehicular access will also provide a flat and safe thoroughfare to residents; and
- (f) the applicant will undertake the maintenance responsibility of the Site.

#### 3. <u>Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements</u>

The applicant is one of the two "current land owners". He has complied with the requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No. 31A) by obtaining consent from the other land owner. Detailed information would be deposited at the meeting for Members' inspection.

#### 4. <u>Background</u>

The Site is part of the subject of a planning enforcement case (No. E/NE-TK/167) against unauthorized development (UD) involving filling of land (**Plan A-2**). Enforcement Notice (EN) was issued on 11.10.2021. Reinstatement Notice (RN) was subsequently issued on 28.10.2021 requiring the owners to remove the leftover, debris

and fill materials (including asphalt and hard paving), and to grass the Site by 28.1.2022. Prosecution may be taken if the RN is not complied with.

## 5. <u>Previous Application</u>

There is no previous application at the Site.

## 6. <u>Similar Applications</u>

- 6.1 There is a similar application No. A/NE-TK/636 for temporary vehicle park (private car and light goods vehicle) within the same "AGR" zone in the vicinity of the Site. The application, proposing 60 parking spaces for private cars and 20 parking spaces for light goods vehicles for a period of 3 years, was rejected by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (the Committee) on 6.4.2018 for the reasons of being not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; failing to demonstrate no adverse landscape and traffic impacts; and setting of undesirable precedent for similar applications.
- 6.2 Details of the application is shown in **Appendix II** and the location is shown on **Plans A-1** and **A-2**.
- 6.3 There is another application for a temporary private vehicle park (private cars and lights goods vehicles only) (No. A/NE-TK/740) in the vicinity of the Site, which will be considered by the Committee at the same meeting with the current application.

# 7. <u>The Site and Its Surrounding Areas</u> (Plans A-1, A-2 and photos on Plans A-3, A-4)

- 7.1 The Site is:
  - (a) hard-paved with concrete and currently used for the applied use without valid planning permission;
  - (b) situated near the northern fringe of San Tau Kok Village; and
  - (c) accessible via a local track connecting with Tung Tsz Road and Ting Kok Road.
- 7.2 The surrounding areas are predominantly rural in character with vacant land, vegetated areas, village houses and temporary structures. To its immediate south and about 40m to its southeast are the village proper of San Tau Kok and Po Sam Pai respectively. An area previously used for vehicle parking with no planning permission (partly under Application No. A/NE-TK/740 mentioned at paragraph 6.3) is found to the immediate northwest of the Site (**Plan A-3**). Dense woodland with burial grounds is found at the west of the Site within the "Green Belt" ("GB") zone on the same OZP. Active and fallow agricultural land are found at the northeast of the Site.

## 8. <u>Planning Intention</u>

The planning intention of the "AGR" zone is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes.

## 9. <u>Comments from Relevant Government Departments</u>

9.1 The following government departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarized as follows:

## Land Administration

- 9.1.1 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Tai Po, Lands Department (DLO/TP, LandsD):
  - (a) no objection to the application;
  - (b) the Site consists of three private lots in D.D. 29. The private lots are held under the Block Government Lease demised for agricultural purpose. No structure shall be erected on the lots without the prior approval from LandsD;
  - (c) a recent site inspection revealed that there were some vehicles parking at the Site;
  - (d) should the application be approved by the Board, the lot owners are required to submit an application for short term waiver (STW) to LandsD if they wish to erect any structures on the lot. However, there is no guarantee at this stage that the STW application would be approved. If the STW application is approved by LandsD acting in the capacity as landlord at its sole discretion, such approval will be subject to such terms and conditions as may be imposed by LandsD including the payment of waiver fee and administrative fee as considered appropriate;
  - (e) the applicant will likely make use of the adjoining government land for access to the Site. As such, no trees thereon shall be interfered with unless prior approval is obtained from LandsD. The maintenance and management responsibility of the said government land and any other government land connecting to the Site should be sorted out with the relevant government departments, prior to making use of them for ingress/egress purpose. Neither occupation nor works of any kind thereon is allowed without the prior approval from LandsD. Moreover, the ingress may fall on adjoining private lots. The applicant should sort out the relevant issues with the lots owners concerned; and

(f) there is no guarantee to the grant of a right of way to the Site or approval of the emergency vehicular access (EVA) thereto.

## **Traffic**

- 9.1.2 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T):
  - (a) no in-principle objection to the application from traffic engineering point of view; and
  - (b) the village access road connecting the Site with Tung Tsz Road is not under management by Transport Department (TD). Its land status, management, maintenance responsibilities should be clarified with the relevant lands and maintenance authorities accordingly in order to avoid potential land disputes.

## Agriculture

- 9.1.3 Comments of the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC):
  - the Site falls within an "AGR" zone and is currently a piece of formed land. There are active agricultural activities in the vicinity, and agricultural infrastructure such as road access and water source is available. The Site can be used for agricultural activities such as open-field cultivation, greenhouses, plant nurseries etc. As the Site possesses potential for agricultural rehabilitation, the application is not supported from agricultural point of view.

## **Environment**

- 9.1.4 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):
  - (a) no in-principle objection to the application; and
  - (b) the applicant is advised to follow the relevant mitigation measures and requirements in the latest "Code of Practice on Handling Environmental Aspects of Temporary Uses and Open Storage Sites" issued by the DEP to minimize any potential environmental nuisance.

## Landscape

- 9.1.5 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):
  - (a) some reservations to the application from landscape planning perspective;
  - (b) the Site is hard-paved and currently used as vehicle park. No existing tree is observed within the Site. Based on the aerial

photos taken in 2015 to 2021, vegetation within the Site and its immediate surroundings were gradually cleared and site formation works had been carried out since 2016 (**Plan A-3**);

- (c) the Site is located in an area of rural inland plains landscape character comprising mainly of vacant land, vegetated areas, village houses and temporary structures, with dense woodland found at its west within the "GB" zone on the same OZP. The applied use is considered not entirely incompatible with the surrounding environment. Nevertheless, there is concern that approval of the application may encourage similar applications within the area. The cumulative impact of approval of such applications may further alter the landscape character and degrade the landscape quality of the "AGR" zone; and
- (d) given that the Site is not bounded by prominent public frontage, should the application be approved by the Board, it is considered unnecessary to impose landscape condition as the effect of additional landscaping on enhancing the quality of public realm is not apparent.

## <u>Drainage</u>

- 9.1.6 Comments of the Chief Engineer/Mainland North, Drainage Services Department (CE/MN, DSD):
  - (a) no in-principle objection to the application from public drainage viewpoint;
  - (b) if the application is approved, an approval condition on submission and implementation of drainage proposal for the Site is recommended to ensure that it will not cause adverse drainage impact to the adjacent areas; and
  - (c) advisory comments are provided at paragraph (e) of **Appendix IV**.

## Fire Safety

- 9.1.7 Comments of the Director of Fire Services (D of FS):
  - (a) no in-principle objection to the application subject to the fire service installations (FSIs) being provided to his satisfaction; and
  - (b) the applicant is advised to submit relevant layout plans incorporated with the proposed FSIs for approval. The layout plans should be drawn to scale and depicted with dimensions and nature of occupancy and the location of the proposed FSIs to be installed should be clearly marked.

- 9.2 The following Government departments have no objection to/comment on the application:
  - (a) Chief Engineer/New Territories East, Highways Department (CHE/NTE, HyD);
  - (b) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C, WSD);
  - (c) Head of Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (H(GEO), CEDD);
  - (d) Project Manager/North, Civil Engineering and Development Department (PM/N, CEDD);
  - (e) Commissioner of Police (C of P); and
  - (f) District Officer/Tai Po, Home Affairs Department (DO/TP, HAD).

## 10. <u>Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Period</u> (Appendix III)

On 10.12.2021, the application was published for public inspection. During the statutory public inspection period, a total of seven public comments were received. Amongst them, five from Tai Po Rural Committee, Joint Village Office for Villages in Shuen Wan, 汀角路民生關注組 and two groups of individuals support the application mainly on the grounds of no adverse impacts on the traffic, environment, drainage facilities, water supplies and slopes; not involving any government land; facilitating access for emergency vehicles; and no objection from local residents. The remaining two public comments from individuals object to the application mainly for concerns on traffic congestion, environmental pollution and fire risks; and being a "destroy first, build later" case.

## 11. <u>Planning Considerations and Assessments</u>

- 11.1 This application is for a temporary private vehicle park (private cars only) with pedestrian and vehicular access for a period of 3 years with filling of land in an area zoned "AGR" on the OZP (**Plan A-1**). The applied use involves 9 parking spaces for private cars for use by the applicant and his family and the paving of the Site by concrete with a depth of about 0.2m. The applied use is not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone, which is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes and to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purpose. DAFC does not support the application from agricultural point of view as the Site possesses potential for agricultural rehabilitation. There is no strong planning justification in the submission to justify a departure from the planning intention of "AGR" zone, even on a temporary basis.
- 11.2 The Site, situated at the northern fringe of San Tau Kok Village, is hard-paved with concrete and currently used as vehicle park without planning permission. Past aerial photos reveal that vegetation within the Site and its immediate surroundings was cleared and site formation works had been carried out since 2016 (**Plan A-3**). CTP/UD&L of PlanD advises that the applied use is not entirely incompatible with the surrounding environment which are predominantly vegetated areas, dense woodland and village houses.

Nevertheless, she has some reservations on the application from landscape planning perspective as approval of the application may encourage similar applications, the cumulative impact of which would further alter the landscape character and degrade the landscape quality of the "AGR" zone.

- 11.3 The applied use involves 9 parking spaces for private cars with pedestrian and vehicular access. The applicant indicates that the parking spaces are for his personal and family use. The pedestrian and vehicular access may also be used by emergency vehicles and to facilitate circulation of other local residents' vehicles. The Site is accessible via a local track connecting with Tung Tsz Road and Ting Kok Road. C for T has no in-principle objection to the application from traffic engineering point of view. Other relevant government departments consulted have no objection to/no adverse comment on the application from technical aspects.
- 11.4 The Site is not subject of any previous planning application. There is a similar application No. A/NE-TK/636 for temporary vehicle park (private car and light goods vehicle) within the same "AGR" zone in the vicinity of the Site. The application, proposing 60 parking spaces for private cars and 20 parking spaces for light goods vehicles for a period of 3 years, was rejected by the Committee on 6.4.2018 for the reasons of being not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone; failing to demonstrate no adverse landscape and traffic impacts; and setting of undesirable precedent for similar applications. The circumstances for rejecting this application are largely applicable to the current one.
- 11.5 Regarding the public comments on the application as detailed in paragraph 10, government departments' comments and the planning assessments in above paragraphs are relevant.

## 12. <u>Planning Department's Views</u>

- 12.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 11 and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 10 above, Planning Department <u>does not support</u> the application for the following reasons:
  - (a) the development is not in line with the planning intention of the "AGR" zone which is primarily to retain and safeguard good quality agricultural land/farm/fish ponds for agricultural purposes. It is also intended to retain fallow arable land with good potential for rehabilitation for cultivation and other agricultural purposes. There is no strong planning justification in the current submission for a departure from the planning intention, even on a temporary basis; and
  - (b) the applicant fails to demonstrate in the submission that the development would not result in adverse landscape impacts on the area.
- 12.2 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid on a temporary basis for a period of 3 years until <u>28.1.2025</u>. The following conditions of approval and advisory clauses are also suggested for Members' reference:

## Approval Conditions

- (a) no vehicle without valid licence issued under the Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) Regulations is allowed to be parked/stored on the Site at any time during the planning approval period;
- (b) only private car as defined in the Road Traffic Ordinance is allowed to be parked/stored on or enter/exit the Site at any time during the planning approval period;
- (c) the submission of a drainage proposal within **6** months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board by <u>28.7.2022</u>;
- (d) in relation to (c) above, the implementation of drainage facilities within 9 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board by 28.10.2022;
- (e) the submission of a proposal for fire service installations (FSIs) and water supplies for fire-fighting within 6 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by <u>28.7.2022</u>;
- (f) in relation to (e) above, the implementation of FSIs and water supplies for fire-fighting within **9** months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by <u>28.10.2022</u>;
- (g) if any of the above planning conditions (a) or (b) is not complied with during the planning approval period, the approval hereby given shall cease to have effect and shall be revoked immediately without further notice;
- (h) if any of the above planning conditions (c), (d), (e) or (f) is not complied with by the specified date, the approval hereby given shall cease to have effect and shall on the same date be revoked without further notice; and
- (i) upon expiry of the planning permission, the reinstatement of the Site to an amenity area to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning or of the Town Planning Board.

#### Advisory Clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at Appendix IV.

## 13. <u>Decision Sought</u>

13.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.

- 13.2 Should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.
- 13.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s) to be attached to the permission, and the period of which the permission should be valid on a temporary basis.

# 14. <u>Attachments</u>

Appendix I	Application form and attachments dated 1.12.2021
Appendix Ia	FI submitted by the applicant received on 28.12.2021
Appendix II	Similar application
Appendix III	Public comments
Appendix IV	Recommended advisory clauses
Drawing A-1	Parking layout submitted by the applicant
Plan A-1	Location Plan
Plan A-2	Site Plan
Plan A-3	Aerial Photos
Plan A-4	Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT JANUARY 2022