

**APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION**  
**UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE**

**APPLICATION NO. A/NE-TK/753**

- Applicant** : The Society of Rehabilitation and Crime Prevention, Hong Kong (香港善導會) represented by Urban Design & Planning Consultants Limited (UDP International)
- Site** : Government land in D.D. 26, Shuen Wan, Tai Po, New Territories
- Site Area** : About 4,310m<sup>2</sup>
- Land Status** : Government land
- Plan** : Approved Ting Kok Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/NE-TK/19
- Zoning** : “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”)
- Application** : Proposed Temporary Residential Institution (Transitional Housing) for a Period of 5 Years

**1. The Proposal**

- 1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for a proposed temporary transitional housing development for a period of 5 years at the application site (the Site), which falls within an area zoned “G/IC” on the OZP (**Plan A-1**). According to the Notes of the OZP, ‘Residential Institution’ is a Column 2 use in the “G/IC” zone requiring planning permission from the Town Planning Board (the Board). The Site, forming part of the vacant school premises (VSP) site namely former Shuen Wan Eu Tong Sen School<sup>1</sup>, is currently fenced off, partly paved and partly occupied by some derelict school structures with grass and trees (**Plans A-2, A-4a and A-4b**).
- 1.2 The proposed development consists of a 4-storey domestic block with 4 extended wings and a single-storey non-domestic block with a total plot ratio (PR) of about 1.44 (**Drawing A-1**). A total of 276 units will be provided with 2 types of flats (i.e. 248 nos. 1-to-2-person units and 28 nos. 3-to-4-person units) with unit size of 14.8m<sup>2</sup> and 29.6m<sup>2</sup> respectively (**Drawing A-6**). Ancillary facilities including convenience store, multi-purpose hall, management office, mail collection room and refuse area will be provided to

---

<sup>1</sup> The remaining part of the VSP site is occupied by the Spanish Primary School.

serve the future tenants. Major development parameters of the proposed development are as follows:

<b>Site Area</b>	About 4,310m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Total Plot Ratio</b>	About 1.44
Domestic PR	About 1.41
Non-domestic PR	About 0.03
<b>Total Gross Floor Area (GFA)</b>	About 6,195.3m <sup>2</sup>
Domestic GFA	About 6,082.4m <sup>2</sup>
Non-domestic GFA <sup>1</sup>	About 112.9m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Total Site Coverage</b>	About 40%
<b>No. of Blocks</b>	1 Domestic Block (including residential units, a multipurpose hall, a management office, a mail collection room and refuse area)  1 Non-domestic Block (including a convenience store & E&M plant room)
<b>No. of Storeys/ Building Height (BH)</b>	Domestic Block: 4 storeys (13.0m/37mPD)  Non-domestic Block: 1 storey (3.65m/27.65mPD)
<b>No. of Units</b>	About 276
<b>Flat Size</b>	1-2P units: about 14.8m <sup>2</sup> 3-4P units: about 29.6m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Estimated Population</b>	About 608
<b>Open Space</b>	Not less than 608m <sup>2</sup>
<b>Green Coverage</b>	Not less than 20%
<b>No. of Bicycle Parking Spaces</b>	8
<b>No. of Loading/Unloading Bay</b>	1 (11m X 3.5m)

<sup>1</sup> Excluding E&M plant room with GFA of about 90.4m<sup>2</sup> which is assumed to be exempted from GFA calculations according to Practice Note for Authorized Persons, Registered Structural Engineers and Registered Geotechnical Engineers (PNAP) APP-151.

- 1.3 The applicant, which is a non-profit making organization, will be responsible for the construction, management and maintenance of the proposed development including the operation of ancillary facilities. The proposed development is anticipated to be completed by the second quarter of 2024.
- 1.4 The applicant has conducted various technical assessments including Landscape Master Plan and Tree Preservation and Removal Proposal (LMP and TPRP), Visual Impact Assessment (VIA), Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA), Environmental Assessment (EA), Drainage Impact Assessment (DIA),

Sewerage Impact Assessment (SIA), Water Supply Impact Assessment (WSIA) and Geotechnical Planning Review (GPR) to demonstrate that the proposed development will not cause adverse impacts on the surrounding areas. The master layout plan (MLP), floor plans, section plan, typical block layout, unit layout, LMP, landscape section, photomontages, indicative diagram of view corridors and wind penetration, plans showing existing public transport services and proposed footpath improvement works submitted by the applicant are shown in **Drawings A-1 to A-14** respectively.

### Traffic

- 1.5 The Site is accessible from Ting Kok Road via a local access road and footpath at the southwestern part of the Site (**Plan A-2**). According to the TIA, the Site is well served by public transport services including franchised bus and green minibus services (**Drawing A-12**). A loading/unloading bay (11m X 3.5m) for different vehicle types will be provided within the Site for meeting daily needs. There will be no car parking spaces as the future tenants are expected to commute by public transport. A total of 8 bicycle parking spaces will be provided for the future tenants. In assessing the traffic impacts arising from the proposed development, traffic generated by the planned/committed developments in the vicinity, including Wong Yue Tan transitional housing development, have been taken into account in the TIA. Subject to the completion of the junction improvement works at Ting Kok Road/Fung Yuen Road proposed under Wong Yue Tan transitional housing development, no adverse traffic impacts are anticipated.
- 1.6 To cater for the anticipated public transportation demand, additional trips for existing bus routes during peak hour on weekdays are proposed<sup>2</sup>. Since the existing footpath leading to the Site is not continuous, the applicant also proposes to extend the existing footpath to Ting Kok Road to enhance pedestrian accessibility (**Drawings A-13 to A-14**). Opportunities to provide better paving to improve pedestrian experience will be further explored. Enhancement in public transport services and the improvement to existing footpath would be subject to further liaison with relevant government departments including Transport Department (TD) at a later stage.

### Environment

- 1.7 The EA assesses potential environmental impacts arising from the proposed development during construction and operation stages in terms of air quality, noise, water quality, waste management and land contamination. With the adoption of Modular Integrated Construction (MiC) method and good site practices, the proposed development will not cause any insurmountable environmental impacts on the surrounding areas.

### Landscape and Tree Preservation

- 1.8 Landscaped open space will be provided in between the extended wings of the domestic block and at the southern part of the Site to serve as gathering and

---

<sup>2</sup> According to the TIA, 2 additional outbound trips for bus route 75K to Tai Po Market would be required at AM peak hour on weekdays, and a total of 4 additional inbound trips for bus route 75K, 74E and 73P would be required at PM peak hour on weekdays.

recreational spaces for future tenants (**Drawings A-7 to A-8**). Various uses including leisure sitting-out area, playground/plaza, fitness area and community garden are furnished at these outdoor open spaces to encourage social interaction and healthy and active lifestyle. Greenery coverage of not less than 20% of total site area and local open space of not less than 608m<sup>2</sup> will be provided at the proposed development.

- 1.9 A total of 70 trees of common species (i.e. including 68 nos. within and 2 nos. around the Site) will be affected by the proposed development. Of them, 37 trees are proposed to be felled and 33 trees mostly located at the periphery of the Site are proposed to be retained. Having considered the site constraints, the applicant proposes to plant 12 new trees within the Site to compensate for the loss of existing trees. According to the TPRP, existing trees have been preserved as far as possible. The trees proposed to be felled are either invasive weed species, unavoidably affected by the proposed development or in poor condition in terms of form and health.

#### Visual

- 1.10 The proposed development is generally compatible with the surrounding low-rise residential developments and village type developments (**Drawings A-9 to A-10**). To preserve view corridors and facilitate light and wind penetration through the Site, building separation ranging from 7m to 10m are provided between the extended wings of the domestic block (**Drawing A-11**). The proposed development will adopt a green building façade to blend in harmoniously with the surrounding environment. The periphery planting of the Site will also offer physical and visual separation and screen off any potential disturbance on the neighbouring developments. According to the VIA, no adverse visual impacts are anticipated.

#### Drainage, Sewerage and Water Supply

- 1.11 According to the DIA, surface run-off generated from the proposed development will be discharged to the existing drainage channel to the northwest of the Site. According to the SIA, sewage generated from the proposed development will be discharged to the Ting Kok Road trunk sewerage system currently undergoing upgrading works and target for completion by late 2023. According to the WSIA, the existing freshwater mains will provide sufficient supply of freshwater to cater for the water demand of the proposed development.

#### Geotechnical

- 1.12 According to the GPR, the proposed development is feasible from the geotechnical perspective. Details of slope upgrading works will be proposed at detailed design stage.
- 1.13 In support of the application, the applicant have submitted the following documents:

(a) Application form received on 8.7.2022

(Appendix I)

- (b) Supplementary planning statement (Appendix Ia)
- (c) Supplementary information (SI) received on 14.7.2022 (Appendix Ib)
- (d) Further Information (FI) received on 15.8.2022 (Appendix Ic)
- (e) FI received on 19.8.2022 (Appendix Id)

## 2. **Justifications from the Applicant**

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are detailed in the supplementary planning statement, SI and FIs at **Appendices Ia** to **Id** as summarized below:

- (a) the proposed transitional housing development echoes with the government's policy to alleviate short-term housing shortage by increasing the supply of transitional housing. Since the Site has been left idle for years, the proposed development can make better use of the underutilised government land to improve living conditions of those households in need;
- (b) the proposed transitional housing development is generally in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone. Its temporary nature will not jeopardize the long-term use of the subject "G/IC" zone;
- (c) the proposed development with a PR of about 1.44 and maximum BH of 4 storeys is compatible with the surrounding low-rise developments with BH ranging from 1 to 4 storeys. The proposed development is also designed with building separation to allow visual penetration and penetration of wind and sunlight;
- (d) the proposed development will improve the living conditions and quality of life of households in need by providing housing units equipped with essential facilities and various outdoor facilities (e.g. playground and sitting out area). With a wide array of community facilities together with supporting services provided by the applicant, such as volunteer programmes, family activities, career development workshops and health talks, the proposed development will promote community building and enhance the social capital of the future tenants;
- (e) by creating a pleasant landscaped environment, the proposed development will improve the visual and landscape quality of the Site, benefitting both future tenants and the neighbouring community. The proposed improvement of existing footpath will also enhance pedestrian accessibility in the area;
- (f) the use of MiC method can speed up project delivery, enhance cost-efficiency and environmental sustainability. It will also allow the housing modules to be easily dismantled and relocated to other sites for reuse upon expiry of the planning approval;
- (g) the proposed development will be constructed, operated and maintained by the applicant, which is a non-government organization (NGO) with profound experience in offering diversified community services and running transitional

housing/residential care projects. Various community services leveraging on the applicant's experience will be provided to the future tenants;

- (h) the applicant has been engaging the local community to understand their concerns and views on the proposed development scheme. To address local concerns, the development scheme has been refined throughout the process. Support from stakeholders including concern groups, NGOs, local residents and the principal of the Spanish Primary School have been obtained; and
- (i) the technical assessments concluded that the proposed development will not cause adverse traffic, environmental, visual, drainage, sewerage, water supply and geotechnical impacts on the surrounding areas.

### **3. Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements**

As the Site involves government land only, the "owner's consent/ notification" requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No. 31A) are not applicable to the application.

### **4. Background**

- 4.1 The Site forms part of a VSP which was previously used as Shuen Wan Eu Tong School. The school has closed down since 1994. Remaining part of the VSP site has been occupied by the Spanish Primary School since 2017. According to the Central Clearing House Mechanism of VSP, the VSP site is recommended for long-term G/IC use. There is currently no designated use nor known programme for long-term use of the Site.
- 4.2 Part of the Site currently serves as the vehicular access/emergency vehicular access (EVA) for the adjoining Spanish Primary School (**Plan 4-b**).

### **5. Previous Application**

There is no previous application at the Site.

### **6. Similar Application**

There is no similar application for temporary residential institution development within the same "G/IC" zone.

### **7. The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1 to A-4)**

- 7.1 The Site is:
  - (a) located on a foothill slope;

- (b) currently fenced off. It is partly paved and partly occupied by some derelict school structures with grass and trees; and
  - (c) accessible from Ting Kok Road via a local track.
- 7.2 The surrounding areas are predominantly rural in character with low-density residential developments, village houses and scattered trees:
- (a) to its immediate northeast is the Spanish Primary School falling within the same “G/IC” zone. To the further northeast and east are the village houses of Shuen Wan Chan Uk, Shuen Wan Lei Uk and Shuen Wan Sha Lan;
  - (b) to its immediate south are a low-rise residential development, namely the Beverly Hills, and village houses; and
  - (c) to its immediate northwest is a vegetated hillslope zoned “GB”. To the further northwest across Ting Kok Road are the village houses of Wong Yue Tan and Shuen Wan Chim Uk, and the subject site of Wong Yue Tan transitional housing development under an approved application No. A/NE-TK/702.

## **8. Planning Intention**

The planning intention of the “G/IC” zone is primarily for the provision of government, institution or community facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.

## **9. Comments from Relevant Government Departments**

9.1 Apart from the government bureaux’s comments as set out in paragraphs 9.2 and 9.3 below, other government departments consulted have no objection to or no adverse comment on the application. Their general comments on the application and recommended advisory clauses are provided at **Appendices II** and **III** respectively.

9.2 The following government bureau supports the application:

Comments of the Secretary for Housing (S for H):

The Housing Bureau (HB) states that in-principle policy support from the Task Force on the Transitional Housing Project of HB has been given to the subject application. HB will also give policy support for reprovisioning of the Spanish Primary School to another site during the construction and operation of the proposed transitional housing development and coordinate with TD on public transport services with due consideration on progress of tenants’ intake of the transitional housing development.

- 9.3 In relation to the reprovisioning of the Spanish Primary School, comments of the Secretary for Education (SED) are as follows:

Comments of the Secretary for Education (SED):

The Spanish Primary School is a private primary school. According to the prevailing policy, the Education Bureau will not, in principle, offer policy support for the provision of government land/school premises for the establishment and reprovisioning of private schools.

## **10. Public Comments Received During Statutory Publication Period (Appendix IV)**

- 10.1 The application was published for public inspection. During the statutory public inspection period, a total of 56 public comments were received. One supporting comment received from an individual considered that the application would optimize the use of vacant land to address housing need and provide open space and shared facilities to the neighbouring community. One comment received from an individual provided views on public transport enhancement measures. Two comments from individuals raised objection to land sharing pilot scheme, which is irrelevant to the current application. The remaining 52 comments were received from the Chairman of Tai Po District Council, Sha Lan Villas Residents' Association, Joint Village Office for Villages in Shuen Wan Tai Po, 汀角路民生關注組, 黃魚灘村事務管理委員會, 民主黨大埔工作隊, village representatives of Shuen Wan Chan Uk, Sha Lan and San Tau Kok, local residents and individuals raising objection to/making adverse comments on the application. Among which, the comment of 汀角路民生關注組 enclosed a questionnaire survey about the proposed development, with 277 out of the 284 respondents raised objection to the application.

- 10.2 The major objecting views are summarized as follows:

- (a) the proposed development is not in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone;
- (b) the Site is not suitable for transitional housing development. The Site, with a small site area, is inefficient for producing housing units. The proposed development is incompatible with the surrounding rural environment;
- (c) the Site involves an area currently serving as vehicular access/EVA for the adjoining Spanish Primary School. The proposed development would inevitably affect the operation of the school and the provision of primary education in the area;
- (d) the proposed development will bring about population increase in folds. There are insufficient community and retail facilities (e.g. markets) to cater for the need of increased population in the area. Given its close proximity with existing residential developments, the proposed development will also bring about security and fire safety concerns;



- (e) the proposed development will cause adverse traffic impacts on the surrounding areas having considered that (i) Ting Kok Road is already very congested at peak hours and during weekends, (ii) public transport serving developments along Ting Kok Road is insufficient, (iii) traffic capacity of Ting Kok Road has been overloaded by recent and planned developments along Ting Kok Road including Phase 3 of Mont Vert, land sharing pilot scheme project at Lo Fai Road and Fung Yuen Road and Wong Yue Tan transitional housing development. Traffic demand from the proposed development would further aggravate these problems. Besides, the methodology adopted in the TIA is not site-specific and the TIA does not represent the characters of Shuen Wan area resulting in underestimation of the traffic demand generated by the proposed development. No transportation arrangement nor traffic improvement measure is proposed in the TIA. Improvement works of individual road junctions could not resolve the traffic congestion problem along Ting Kok Road;
- (f) the proposed development will cause adverse noise, air quality, visual and air ventilation impacts on the surrounding areas; and
- (g) the proposal should not be regarded as a temporary development as it would cause permanent changes to the local character of the area and could become perpetual through repeated renewal applications.

## **11. Planning Considerations and Assessments**

- 11.1 The application is for a proposed temporary residential institution (transitional housing) for a period of 5 years at the Site zoned “G/IC” on the OZP. The proposed development is generally in line with the planning intention of the “G/IC” zone, which is primarily for the provision of government, institution or community facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory; and to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments. It is also in line with the government policy to increase the supply of transitional housing to alleviate short-term housing shortage. S for H has no objection to the application and confirms that in-principle policy support has been given to the proposed development. In addition, the Site forms part of the VSP site of former Shuen Wan Eu Tong Sen School. As there is no designated GIC use nor known programme for the Site, the proposed development is in line with the government’s intention to make gainful use of VSP site and optimize use of vacant land resources.
- 11.2 The proposed development consists of a 4-storey domestic block and a single-storey non-domestic block with a total PR of about 1.44 and provides a total of 276 units. The residential nature and low-rise built form (maximum 4 storeys) of the proposed development is considered not incompatible with the surrounding areas which are predominantly rural in character mainly comprising low-rise residential developments and village houses.

- 11.3 Various technical assessments, including TIA, EA, DIA, SIA, WSIA and GPR, were submitted by the applicant to demonstrate that there will be no significant adverse traffic, environment, drainage, sewerage, water supply and geotechnical impacts arising from the proposed development. On traffic aspect, the submitted TIA has already taken into account the traffic generated by the planned/committed developments in the vicinity including Wong Yue Tan transitional housing development. With junction improvement works at Ting Kok Road/Fung Yuen Road to be completed by June 2023 before the scheduled completion of the proposed development, no adverse traffic impacts resultant from the proposed development are anticipated. The Commissioner for Transport has no in-principle objection to the application from traffic engineering point of view, and HB will coordinate with TD on enhancement of public transport services with due consideration to the progress of tenants' intake. In order to avoid potential interface issues with the Spanish Primary School, HB will also give policy support for reprovisioning of the Spanish Primary School during the construction and operation of the proposed development. District Lands Officer/Tai Po, Lands Department also advised that temporary government land allocation for reprovisioning of the Spanish Primary School is under processing.
- 11.4 Having considered the proposed design and landscape measures as detailed in paragraphs 1.8 to 1.10 above, the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape of Planning Department has no objection to the application from urban design and landscape planning perspectives. The Director of Environmental Protection considers the submitted EA with proposed mitigation measures acceptable. Other relevant government departments consulted including CE/MN of DSD, CE/C of WSD, CHE/NTW of HyD, H(GEO) of CEDD and D of FS have no adverse comment or no objection to the application, and relevant approval conditions are recommended in paragraph 12.2 below to address their technical concerns.
- 11.5 Regarding the public comments as detailed in paragraph 10 above, government departments' comments and the planning assessments above are relevant. In relation to the concerns on affecting the operation of the adjoining Spanish Primary School, it should be noted that the Spanish Primary School will be relocated to another site during the construction and operation of the proposed development, and the principal of the Spanish Primary School has indicated support to the application. For the concerns on perpetually using the Site for transitional housing development and insufficient retail and community facilities, it should be noted that the proposed development is not for long-term purpose. Besides, ancillary facilities such as the convenience store and local open spaces will be provided within the Site to meet the needs of future residents.
- 11.6 Taking into account the scale and implementation timeframe (completion by the second quarter of 2024) of the proposed development, a longer compliance period (i.e. 9 months for submissions and 12 months for implementation) as compared with the common temporary uses is suggested to allow more time to fulfil the approval conditions, should the Committee decide to approve the application.

## **12. Planning Department's Views**

- 12.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 11, and having taken into account the public comments mentioned in paragraph 10 above, Planning Department has no objection to the application.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid on a temporary basis for a period of 5 years until 26.8.2027. The following approval conditions and advisory clauses are also suggested for Members' reference:

### Approval Conditions

- (a) the submission of a drainage proposal within 9 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board by 26.5.2023;
- (b) in relation to (a) above, the implementation of drainage proposal within 12 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Drainage Services or of the Town Planning Board by 26.8.2023;
- (c) in relation to (b) above, the implemented drainage facilities at the Site shall be maintained at all times during the planning approval period;
- (d) the submission of a proposal for fire service installations (FSIs) and water supplies for fire-fighting within 9 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by 26.5.2023;
- (e) in relation to (d) above, the implementation of FSIs and water supplies for fire-fighting within 12 months from the date of planning approval to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services or of the Town Planning Board by 26.8.2023;
- (f) if any of the above planning conditions (a), (b), (d) or (e) is not complied with by the specified date, the approval hereby given shall cease to have effect and shall on the same date be revoked without further notice; and
- (g) if the above planning condition (c) is not complied with during the planning approval period, the approval hereby given shall cease to have effect and shall be revoked immediately without further notice.

### Advisory clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are attached at **Appendix III**.

- 12.3 There is no strong reason to recommend rejection of the application.

### **13. Decision Sought**

- 13.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.
- 13.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s) to be attached to the permission, and the period of which the permission should be valid on a temporary basis.
- 13.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

### **14. Attachments**

<b>Appendix I</b>	Application form with attachments received on 8.7.2022
<b>Appendix Ia</b>	Supplementary planning statement
<b>Appendix Ib</b>	Supplementary information received on 14.7.2022
<b>Appendix Ic</b>	FI received on 15.8.2022
<b>Appendix Id</b>	FI received on 19.8.2022
<b>Appendix II</b>	Government departments' general comments
<b>Appendix III</b>	Recommended advisory clauses
<b>Appendix IV</b>	Public comments
<b>Drawing A-1</b>	Master layout plan
<b>Drawings A-2 to A-3</b>	Floor plans
<b>Drawing A-4</b>	Section plan
<b>Drawing A-5</b>	Typical block layout
<b>Drawing A-6</b>	Unit layout
<b>Drawing A-7</b>	Landscape master plan
<b>Drawing A-8</b>	Landscape section
<b>Drawings A-9 to A-10</b>	Photomontages
<b>Drawing A-11</b>	Indicative diagram of view corridors and wind penetration
<b>Drawing A-12</b>	Existing public transport services in the vicinity of the Site
<b>Drawings A-13 to A-14</b>	Proposed footpath improvement works
<b>Plan A-1</b>	Location plan
<b>Plan A-2</b>	Site plan
<b>Plan A-3</b>	Aerial photo
<b>Plans A-4a to A-4b</b>	Site photos

**PLANNING DEPARTMENT  
AUGUST 2022**