RNTPC Paper No. A/TKO/127 For Consideration by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee on 25.11.2022

APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION UNDER SECTION 16 OF THE TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE

APPLICATION NO. A/TKO/127

Applicant : China State Construction Engineering (Hong Kong) Limited represented

by KTA Planning Limited

<u>Site</u>: Government Land at Area 78, Pak Shing Kok, Tseung Kwan O

Site Area : About 60,100m²

Land Status : Permanent Government Land Allocation ("PGLA") No. SK-4016

allocated to Health Bureau for Chinese Medicine Hospital (CMH) and No. SK-4017 allocated to Department of Health for Government Chinese Medicines Testing Institute (GCMTI), both subject to a building height restriction of not exceeding 106mPD at main roof level under the

Engineering Condition (EC)

Plan : Approved Tseung Kwan O Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/TKO/28

Zoning : "Government, Institution or Community(8)" ("G/IC(8)")

- maximum building height restriction (BHR) of 106mPD, or the

height of the existing building, whichever is the greater

Application: Proposed Minor Relaxation of BHR for Permitted Hospital and

Government Use

1. The Proposal

1.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for minor relaxation of BHR from 106mPD to not exceeding 121mPD (i.e. +14.2% in terms of mPD or +33.3% in terms of absolute building height (BH) (i.e. +15m)) for CMH and from 106mPD to not exceeding 108mPD (i.e. +1.9% in terms of mPD or +6% in terms of absolute BH (i.e. +2m)) for GCMTI at the application site (the Site), which is zoned "G/IC(8)" on the approved Tseung Kwan O Outline Zoning Plan No. S/TKO/28 (the OZP) (**Plan A-1**). According to the Notes of the OZP for the "G/IC(8)" zone, 'Hospital' and 'Government Use' are Column 1 uses which are always permitted.

Minor relaxation of the BHR may be considered by the Town Planning Board (the Board) on application under section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance based on the individual merits of a development proposal. The Site is subject to a BHR of 106mPD, or the height of the existing building, whichever is the greater. While the proposed BHs for CMH and GCMTI meet the BHR at main roof, the heights of the roof-top structures for both developments exceed 10% of the BH or 15m (whichever is the less) and should be counted towards the height of the buildings under Joint Practice Note (JPN) No. 5, resulting in the overall BHs exceeding BHR of 106mPD as stipulated on the OZP.

- 1.2 CMH, which is located at the western side of the Site, consists of a 9-storey building including a lower ground floor (LG/F). While the main roof of CMH is measured at 106mPD, the proposed roof-top ancillary structures for provision of electrical and mechanical (E&M) facilities (including cooling tower) with a height of 14.85m exceed 10% of the BH (i.e. 4.5m for the development with a BH of 45m) (**Drawing A-9**). In addition, a public vehicle park (PVP) of about 146 parking spaces will be provided on LG/F of CMH in accordance with the "single site, multiple use" principle.
- 1.3 GCMTI, which is located at the eastern side of the Site, consists of a 6-storey building. While the main roof of GCMTI is measured at 99.35mPD, the proposed roof-top ancillary structures for provision of E&M facilities (cooling tower and lift machine room (LMR)) with a height of 8m exceed 10% of the BH (i.e. 3.335m for the development with a BH of 33.35m) (**Drawing A-13**).
- 1.4 Various design features will be incorporated in CMH and GCMTI to enhance visual permeability and amenity, including 21.5m and 19m building setbacks along Pak Shing Kok Road for CMH and GCMTI respectively and 49m wide building separation between CMH and GCMTI (**Drawing A-4** and **Drawing A-5**). A central garden interconnecting CMH and GCMTI will be provided. Vertical greening and stepped terraced design, as well as special architectural features will be adopted. The conceptual landscape master plan for CMH and GCMTI is at **Drawing A-2**. Vehicular access for CMH and GCMTI will be provided at Pak Shing Kok Road. Excavation works at the Site are currently in progress and both proposed developments are scheduled for completion by 2025.
- 1.5 The master layout plan, landscape master plan, floor layouts, section plans and photomontages submitted by the applicant are at **Drawings A-1** to **A-16**. The major development parameters of the proposed CMH and GCMTI are set out below:

	СМН	GCMTI	
Total Site Area (about)	60,100m ²		
Individual Site Area (about)	$42,900\text{m}^2$	$17,200\text{m}^2$	
Plot Ratio (PR) (about)	2.8	1.5	
Total Gross Floor Area (GFA)	119,950m ²	$25,730\text{m}^2$	
(about)			
Site Coverage (SC) (about)	55%	45%	

No. of Storeys Main Roof Level 9 (including LG/F) 6 Mean Site Formation Level (about) 61mPD 66mPD BH (about) 106mPD 99.35mPD Main Roof Level 120.85mPD 107.35mPD Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 146 - No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area At-grade 15% 15%			
Mean Site Formation Level (about) 61mPD 66mPD BH (about) 106mPD 99.35mPD Main Roof Level 120.85mPD 107.35mPD Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 146 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 5 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m²	_		
(about) BH (about) 99.35mPD Main Roof Level 106mPD 99.35mPD Top Roof Level 120.85mPD 107.35mPD Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 16 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m²	Main Roof Level	9 (including LG/F)	6
BH (about) 106mPD 99.35mPD Top Roof Level 120.85mPD 107.35mPD Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 146 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m²	Mean Site Formation Level	61mPD	66mPD
Main Roof Level 106mPD 99.35mPD Top Roof Level 120.85mPD 107.35mPD Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 16 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m²	(about)		
Top Roof Level 120.85mPD 107.35mPD Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 146 - No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area - -	BH (about)		
Absolute BH (about) 45m 33.35m Main Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 16 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 5 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area 3 3	Main Roof Level	106mPD	99.35mPD
Main Roof Level 45m 33.35m Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 16 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area 3	Top Roof Level	120.85mPD	107.35mPD
Top Roof Level 59.85m 41.35m No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 146 3 No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area 3	Absolute BH (about)		
No. of Blocks 1 1 No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces 137 41 Spaces 146 - No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP 146 - No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area - -	Main Roof Level	45m	33.35m
No. of Ancillary Car Parking Spaces No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays Lay-bys Open Space Provision Greenery Area About 74,500m² Alage	Top Roof Level	59.85m	41.35m
Spaces 146 - PVP 146 - No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays 16 3 Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area 3	No. of Blocks	1	1
No. of Car Parking Spaces for PVP No. of Loading/Unloading 16 3 (L/UL) Bays Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m² About 36,600m² Greenery Area	No. of Ancillary Car Parking	137	41
PVP No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays Lay-bys Open Space Provision Greenery Area 16 3 About 74,500m² About 36,600m²	Spaces		
No. of Loading/Unloading (L/UL) Bays Lay-bys 5 Open Space Provision About 74,500m ² About 36,600m ² Greenery Area	No. of Car Parking Spaces for	146	-
(L/UL) Bays Lay-bys 5 3 Open Space Provision About 74,500m ² About 36,600m ² Greenery Area	PVP		
Lay-bys53Open Space ProvisionAbout 74,500m²About 36,600m²Greenery Area	No. of Loading/Unloading	16	3
Open Space Provision About 74,500m ² About 36,600m ² Greenery Area	(L/UL) Bays		
Greenery Area	Lay-bys	5	3
	Open Space Provision	About 74,500m ²	About 36,600m ²
At-grade 15% 15%	Greenery Area		
1370 1370	At-grade	15%	15%
Overall 30% 20%	Overall	30%	20%

Note: While the proposed schemes as submitted are indicative only with their actual development layout designs and uses subject to change at the detailed design stage, the main roof of the proposed developments should not exceed 106mPD and the design merits as proposed should be provided.

1.6 The floor uses of CMH and GCMTI are set out below:

	СМН	
LG/F	Administrative and supporting facilities, ancillary car park, L/UL	
	Bays, PVP, refuse collection area and E&M facilities	
G/F to 7/F	Entrance lobby, clinical uses, wards, administrative and supporting	
	facilities, Lay-bys, E&M facilities and landscape areas	
MR/F	E&M facilities	
UR/F	E&M facilities (cooling tower, photovoltaic (PV) panels and solar hot	
	water panel collector)	

	GCMTI
G/F to 5/F	Carpark, L/UL Bays, laboratories, entrance lobby, E&M facilities,
	landscape areas, PV panels and office
MR/F	E&M facilities (cooling tower, LMR, PV panels and outdoor chiller
	area)

1.7 In support of the application, the applicant has submitted the following documents:

- (a) Application form received on 27.9.2022 (Appendix I)
- (b) Supporting Planning Statement received on 27.9.2022 (Appendix Ia)

(c)	Supplementary Information received on 7.10.2022	(Appendix Ib)
(d)	Further information (FI) received on 7.11.2022*	(Appendix Ic)
(0)	El manaissad on 21 11 2022*	(A d: T.J)

(e) FI received on 21.11.2022*

(Appendix Id)

2. <u>Justifications from the Applicant</u>

The justifications put forth by the applicant in support of the application are provided in the Supporting Planning Statement at **Appendix Ia**. They can be summarised as follows:

In line with Government's policy and planning intention

2.1 CMH and GCMTI developments would promote Chinese Medicine development, education and training, innovation and research, which are in line with the Government Policy as stated in the 2018 and 2021 Policy Addresses (PA). The proposed CMH and GCMTI are in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone on the OZP.

Accommodating necessary roof-top structures

- 2.2 The bulk of roof-top ancillary structures has been reduced as far as possible and only a small portion of the roof areas would exceed the BHR. The E&M plant rooms on the roofs are essential to the operation of CMH and GCMTI:
 - (a) water cooled air conditioning system (including cooling tower) will be provided on upper roof and main roof levels of CMH and GCMTI respectively (**Drawings A-9** and **A-13**). According to the Code of Practice for Fresh Water Cooling Towers as well as the Code of Practice for Prevention of Legionnaires' Disease, the cooling tower shall be sited away (with minimum separation of 7.5m) from fresh air intakes of the building and air conditioning system, openable windows and outlets of air exhaust. The minimum vertical separation could not be met if the cooling towers are to be provided on main roof level of CMH and 5/F of GCMTI; and
 - (b) for CMH, sufficient clear headroom of 6.1m is required on main roof level to facilitate the maintenance and replacement of E&M equipments (**Drawing A-9**). For GCMTI, a LMR of about 8.9m is required for goods lift to serve the main roof for delivery and maintenance of E&M facilities. (**Drawing A-13**).

Site constraints/Requirements

2.3 The buildable area (above-ground) is constrained by slopes at the northern portions of the CMH and GCMTI sites (**Drawings A-3** to **A-5** and **Plan A-2**). Apart from one LG/F at CMH for accommodating a PVP (**Drawing A-6**), deeper rock excavation is not desirable due to high rockhead profile ranging from 5m to 20m for CMH and about 3m for GCMTI below existing ground.

^{*}accepted and exempted from publication and recounting requirements

- 2.4 The western part of CMH site encroaches onto the sewage tunnel protection area maintained by the Drainage Services Department while GCMTI site falls within the Railway Protection Zone of the Mass Transit Railway tunnel of Tseung Kwan O line (**Drawing A-3** and **Plan A-2**). Excavation into the rock should be avoided to minimise disturbance and stress change.
- 2.5 Terraced landscape will be provided to meet the minimum 30% and 20% SC of greenery for CMH and GCMTI respectively in accordance with the Sustainable Building Design Guidelines (SBDG). With the need to accommodate essential components on G/F including emergency vehicular access and meeting building setback requirement, the proposed building footprints have already been optimized (**Drawings A-4** and **A-5**).

Minimised F-to-F height of the proposed developments

- 2.6 CMH and GCMTI will adopt the Modular Integrated Construction (MiC) in accordance with DevB TC (Works) No. 2/2020 for Government projects with construction floor area larger than 300m². As MiC will need to be self-supportive, supporting frames will take up more space on each floor. Besides, a 6m F-to-F height on G/F is required to accommodate E&M plant rooms with higher headroom requirement (**Drawings A-9** and **A-13**).
- 2.7 For CMH, a 4.5m F-to-F height will be adopted for the typical floors which is similar to other public hospitals in Hong Kong (**Drawing A-9**). As the habitation space on 4/F to 7/F shall meet the natural lighting and ventilation requirements under the Building (Planning) Regulations (B(P)R), a "H shape" build form (instead of a conventional building form with maximized SC) will be adopted.
- 2.8 For GCMTI, the laboratories on 1/F to 4/F would require a F-to-F height of 4.7m to 5m to support special equipment installation. A clear headroom of 5.75m would be required on 5/F to facilitate maintenance and replacement of E&M facilities (**Drawing A-13**).

Design merits

2.9 Building setbacks will be provided along Pak Shing Kok Road (**Drawings A-4** and **A-5**) and about 49m building separation between CMH and GCMTI will be provided to enhance visual permeability. A central garden between CMH and GCMTI will be provided and stepped terraced design will be adopted to break down visual bulk, soften building mass and enhance amenity (**Drawing A-2**). The special architectural feature of vertical fins at the curtain wall façade would create visual interest and reduce heat gain.

No envisaged adverse visual impact

2.10 The ancillary roof-top structures are small in scale and will not lead to visual change to the public sensitive receivers from different viewpoints. With the adoption of the above-mentioned design merits and enhancement measures, the

proposed developments will continue to be congruous with the adjacent GIC developments, and no adverse visual impact on the surrounding area is anticipated.

3. Background

- 3.1 The Chief Executive announced in the 2014 PA to develop the CMH after agreeing with the Chinese Medicine Development Committee's (CMDC) recommendations that the provision of Chinese Medicine inpatient services would enhance the professional standards of Chinese Medicine practitioners and the quality of scientific research in Chinese Medicine. While the Government would finance CMH construction, a suitable non-profit making organisation will be identified to manage, operate and maintain CMH. The Government has re-affirmed the positioning of Chinese Medicine as an integral part of the healthcare system in Hong Kong in the 2018 and 2021 PA.
- 3.2 The Government also announced in the 2015 PA to establish a Chinese Medicine Testing Centre to be managed by the Department of Health. While a temporary GCMTI was set up in the Hong Kong Science Park with operation commenced in phases since March 2017, the Government announced in the 2019 PA that the permanent GCMTI would be constructed adjacent to CMH to achieve synergy and leverage on their respective strengths and hardware facilities for collaboration.
- 3.3 The Site was rezoned from "Residential (Group C)4" to "G/IC(8)" on the approved Tseung Kwan O OZP No. S/TKO/20 in 2012. Based on the advice of the then Secretary for Food and Health, a maximum BH of 106mPD (i.e. 36m above a site level of about 70mPD) was incorporated for the "G/IC(8)" zone.

4. Compliance with the "Owner's Consent/Notification" Requirements

As the Site involves government land only, the "owner's consent/notification" requirements as set out in the Town Planning Board Guidelines on Satisfying the 'Owner's Consent/Notification' Requirements under Sections 12A and 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (TPB PG-No. 31A) are not applicable.

5. Previous Application

There is no previous application at the Site.

6. Similar Application

6.1 There are three similar applications (No. A/TKO/99, A/TKO/105 and A/TKO/120) for minor relaxation of BHR within the "G/IC" zone of the OZP.

- 6.2 Application No. A/TKO/99 was for proposed minor relaxation of BHR from 75m (81mPD) to 100.5m (100mPD) (+25.5m or 34%) in terms of absolute BH for government offices development. The application was approved by the Committee on 4.9.2015 with conditions, inter alia, a condition restricting the maximum BH to 97mPD (+16mPD or 21% in terms of absolute BH) mainly for the reasons that the proposed minor relaxation of BHR would optimise the utilisation of scarce land resources; the proposed development was not incompatible with the surrounding developments; and would not have significant adverse environmental, traffic, sewerage, drainage and/or landscape impacts on the surrounding area.
- Application No. A/TKO/105 was for proposed Fire Services Department (FSD)'s rank and file quarters with minor relaxation of BHR from 40m to 52m (+12m or 30%), which is located to the east of the Site. Application No. A/TKO/120 was for FSD's departmental quarters with minor relaxation of BHR from 40m to 55.6m (+15.6m or 39%). The applications were approved with conditions by the Committee on 18.3.2016 and 4.9.2020 respectively mainly on the considerations that the proposed developments were in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone and the Government's policy; the utilisation of scarce land resources would be optimized, and there was no significant adverse air ventilation, visual, environmental, traffic and drainage impacts on the surrounding area.
- Details of the three similar applications are set out in **Appendix II** and their locations are shown on **Plan A-1**.

7. The Site and Its Surrounding Areas (Plans A-1, A-2, Aerial photo on Plan A-3 and Site photos on Plan A-4)

7.1 The Site is:

- (a) a piece of vacant land with site excavation and site formation works currently in progress;
- (b) with slope features at the northern and southeastern parts of the Site;
- (c) bounded by a slope and Wan Po Road to its west and Pak Shing Kok Road to its east and southeast; and
- (d) accessible by public transport with bus stops located near the roundabout of Pak Shing Kok Road to the northeast of the Site.
- 7.2 The surrounding areas have the following characteristics:
 - (a) an area predominantly occupied by GIC facilities with a planned public housing site in the "Residential (Group A)7" ("R(A)7") zone;

- (b) to its immediate north is the Fire and Ambulance Services Academy within "G/IC(7)" zone subject to a maximum BHR of 100mPD (except a fire services rescue training tower up to 114mPD) in Area (a) and 120mPD in Area (b). The main roof level of the buildings is in the range of about 92.55 to 120mPD;
- (c) to its east across Pak Shing Kok Road is FSD Pak Shing Kok Married Quarters within "G/IC(4)" zone covered by an approved planning application (No. A/TKO/105) for relaxing the BHR from 40m to 52m (at about 118mPD). The main roof level of the buildings is in the range of about 114.75 to 118mPD;
- (d) to its south across Pak Shing Kok Road are a planned public housing development within "R(A)7" zone subject to a maximum BHR of 210mPD and the Hong Kong Movie City (Shaw Studios) within "G/IC" zone without development restriction. The main roof level of the buildings in the Shaw Studios is in the range of about 78.5 to 91.5mPD;
- (e) to its west across Wan Po Road and further southeast across Pak Shing Kok Road are areas zoned "Green Belt"; and
- (f) to its further west and southwest across Wan Po Road is the former Tseung Kwan O Stage I Landfill within "Recreation" zone subject to a maximum BH of 1 storey. Part of the site has been restored for recreational uses.

8. Planning Intention

- 8.1 The planning intention of the "G/IC" zone is primarily for the provision of GIC facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.
- 8.2 As stated in paragraph 8.8.4 of the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the OZP for the "G/IC" zone, to provide flexibility for innovative design adapted to the characteristics of particular sites, minor relaxation of the BHR of the sub-areas may be considered by the Board through the planning permission system. Each proposal will be considered on its individual planning merits.

9. Comments from Relevant Bureau/Government Departments

9.1 The following government bureau/departments have been consulted and their views on the application are summarised as follows:

Policy Aspect

9.1.1 Comments of the Secretary for Health (S for Health):

policy support is given to the proposed development of CMH and GCMTI, and in-principle support is given to the application.

Land Administration

- 9.1.2 Comments of the District Lands Officer/Sai Kung, Lands Department (DLO/SK, LandsD):
 - (a) no comment on the application;
 - (b) the Site includes two parts, one allocated to Health Bureau (the former Food and Health Bureau) under Permanent Government Land Allocation (PGLA) No. SK-4016 for CMH and another one allocated to Department of Health under PGLA No. SK-4017 for GCMTI; and
 - (c) according to the relevant EC of the PGLAs, the main roof level of any structure erected on the site shall not exceed a height of 106mPD. It is noted that the main roof levels of CMH and GCMTI do not exceed 106mPD as stipulated in the EC. There is no EC restricting the height of roof-top structures at CMH and GCMTI.

Traffic

- 9.1.3 Comments of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T):
 - (a) no in-principle objection to the application; and
 - (b) other comments are included in the advisory clauses at **Appendix IV**.

Environment

- 9.1.4 Comments of the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP):
 - (a) no objection to the application; and
 - (b) according to the Preliminary Environmental Review completed by Architectural Services Department in October 2020, no adverse water quality impact is anticipated during the construction and operation phases of CMH and GCMTI.

Urban Design, Visual and Landscape

9.1.5 Comments of the Chief Town Planner/Urban Design and Landscape, Planning Department (CTP/UD&L, PlanD):

Urban Design and Visual

- (a) the Site is located at a formed platform in mid-hill level of Pak Shing Kok with existing and planned developments in its immediate vicinity. According to the applicant, the proposed development will incorporate design features to enhance visual permeability and amenity including (a) building setback along Pak Shing Kok Road; (b) building separation of about 49m wide between CMH and GCMTI; (c) stepped terraced design; and (d) vertical greening and various landscaping areas;
- (b) while the main roof levels of the proposed CMH and GCMTI do not exceed the BHR under the OZP, the proposed minor relaxation of BHR is to accommodate the rooft-top structures which are up to 121mPD and 108mPD for CMH and GCMTI respectively;
- (c) as shown in the Visual Impact Assessment (**Drawings A-14** to **A-16**), given that the surrounding developments and the proposed developments at the Site are the dominant visual features in the locality, the proposed increase in BH by 15m for CMH and 2m for GCMTI for accommodating the roof-top structures will not be noticeable, and no visual impact is anticipated;

Landscape

- (d) no comment on the application from landscape planning perspective;
- (e) a central garden including a medicinal plant garden and plant nursery is proposed between CHM and GCMTI. Landscape areas with stepped terraced design and vertical greening are proposed to enhance the landscape quality of the proposed developments. Significant adverse landscape impact on the existing landscape resources arising from the proposed developments is not anticipated; and
- (f) other comments are included in the advisory clauses at **Appendix IV.**
- 9.1.6 Comments of the Chief Architect/Central Management Division 2, Architectural Services Department (CA/CMD2, ArchSD):
 - (a) no comment from architectural and visual impact point of view given the BHR for the adjacent "R(A)7" zone is 210mPD; and
 - (b) other comments are included in the advisory clauses at **Appendix IV.**

Water Supply

- 9.1.7 Comments of the Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department (CE/C,WSD):
 - (a) no objection to the application; and
 - (b) other comments are included in the advisory clauses at **Appendix IV**.

Others

- 9.1.8 Comments of the Chief Engineer/Railway Development 2-1, Railway Development Office, Highways Department (CE/RD2-1, RDO, HyD):
 - (a) no comment on the application; and
 - (b) other comments are included in the advisory clauses at **Appendix IV**.
- 9.2 The following departments have no objection to/comment on the application:
 - (a) Director of Health (D of Health);
 - (b) Head of the Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department (H(GEO), CEDD);
 - (c) Chief Building Surveyor/North Territories East (2) and Rail, Buildings Department (CBS/NTE2&Rail, BD);
 - (d) Director of Fire Services (D of FS);
 - (e) Chief Highway Engineer/ New Territories East, Highways Department (CHE/NTE, HyD);
 - (f) Chief Engineer/Mainland South, Drainage Services Department (CE/MS, DSD);
 - (g) Project Manager (East), Civil Engineering and Development Department (PM(E), CEDD);
 - (h) Commissioner of Police (C of P);
 - (i) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (DEMS); and
 - (j) District Officer (Sai Kung), Home Affairs Department (DO(SK), HAD).

10. Public Comment Received During Statutory Publication Period

One public comment from Kadoorie Farm & Botanic Garden Corporation providing views on the application was received (**Appendix III**). The commenter mainly reminds the project proponent that as the watercourse to the southeast of Pak Shing Kok Road is of considerable conservation concern, potential water quality impact affecting the watercourse during the construction and operation phases should be avoided.

11. Planning Considerations and Assessments

11.1 The application is to seek planning permission for minor relaxation of BHR from 106mPD to not exceeding 121mPD (i.e. +14.2% in terms of mPD or +33.3% in terms of absolute BH (i.e. +15m)) for CMH and from 106mPD to not exceeding 108mPD (i.e. +1.9% in terms of mPD or +6% in terms of absolute BH (i.e. +2m)) for GCMTI (**Drawings A-9** and **A-13**). The Site is zoned "G/IC(8)" which is intended primarily for the provision of GIC facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or territory. The proposed hospital and government use at the Site are always permitted. The proposed minor relaxation of BHR is to accommodate the roof-top ancillary structures above the main roofs of CMH and GCMTI which are in line with the planning intention of the "G/IC" zone. The application is supported by S for Health.

Minor Relaxation of BHR

- 11.2 The proposed developments comprise a 9-storey CMH (including LG/F) and a 6-storey GCMTI. While the main roofs of CMH and GCMTI at 106mPD and 99.35mPD respectively will not exceed the BHR, the roof-top ancillary E&M facilities with heights of 14.85m for CMH and 8m for GCMTI exceed 10% of the BHs (i.e. exceeds 4.5m for CMH with BH of 45m and 3.335m for GCMTI with BH of 33.35m) and will need to be counted towards the height of the buildings under JPN No. 5, which is technical in nature.
- 11.3 According to the applicant, these roof-top ancillary structures, which are essential to support the operation of CMH and GCMTI, have to meet the headroom and space requirements, as well as maintenance and management needs. In particular, the water cooled air conditioning system will need to be located on upper roof and main roof levels of CMH and GCMTI respectively to meet the fresh air intake requirement. A LMR with a height of 8.9m is required in GCMTI to allow the goods lift to access the main roof for delivery and maintenance needs. DEMS had no comment on the application from regulatory services point of view.
- 11.4 As explained in paragraphs 2.3 to 2.8 above, the proposed minor relaxation of BHR for CMH and GCMTI are due to site constraints (slope, rockhead profile, sewage tunnel protection area and railway protection zone) and operational requirements (regulatory requirements, and maintenance and management needs). According to the applicant, there is no room to further reduce the BHs of CMH and GCMTI under the proposed schemes as the building footprints have been maximised and the F-to-F heights have been minimised. CE/MS, DSD, CE/RD2-1 of RDO, HyD and H(GEO) of CEDD have no comments on the application from technical points of view.

Visual Impact

11.5 The proposed developments with BHs not exceeding 121mPD for CMH and 108mPD for GCMTI are considered not incompatible with the adjacent GIC developments (with BHs ranging from 78.5mPD to 120mPD) and the planned

public housing development (with BHR of 210mPD) (**Plan A-2**). CTP/UD&L considers that the proposed increase in BHs by 15m/14.2% for CMH and 2m/1.9% for GCMTI in accommodating the roof-top structures will not be noticeable, hence no visual impact is anticipated. CA/CMD2, ArchSD also has no comment on the application from architectural and visual impact points of view. With the proposed design features including building setbacks and separation, a central garden, stepped terraced design, etc. as explained in paragraph 2.9 above, the proposed minor relaxation of BHR is considered not unreasonable and is in line with the intention to allow flexibility for minor relaxation of BHR for the "G/IC" zone based on the individual merits of a development proposal.

Public Comment

11.6 Regarding the public comment raising concern on the potential water quality impact on the nearby watercourse during the construction and operation phases, DEP advises that no adverse water quality would be anticipated during the construction and operation phases according to the Preliminary Environmental Reviews.

12. Planning Department's Views

- 12.1 Based on the assessments made in paragraph 11 and having taken into account the public comment mentioned in paragraph 10, the Planning Department <u>has no objection</u> to the application.
- 12.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, it is suggested that the permission shall be valid until <u>25.11.2026</u>, and after the said date, the permission shall cease to have effect unless before the said date, the development permitted is commenced or the permission is renewed. The following advisory clauses are also suggested for Members' reference:

Advisory Clauses

The recommended advisory clauses are at **Appendix IV**.

12.3 There is no strong reason to recommend rejection of the application.

13. Decision Sought

- 13.1 The Committee is invited to consider the application and decide whether to grant or refuse to grant permission.
- 13.2 Should the Committee decide to approve the application, Members are invited to consider the approval condition(s) and advisory clause(s), if any, to be attached to the permission, and the date when the validity of the permission should expire.

13.3 Alternatively, should the Committee decide to reject the application, Members are invited to advise what reason(s) for rejection should be given to the applicant.

14. Attachments

Appendix I Application form received on 27.9.2022

Appendix IaSupporting Planning Statement received on 27.9.2022Appendix IbSupplementary Information received on 7.10.2022

Appendix IcFI received on 7.11.2022Appendix IdFI received on 21.11.2022Appendix IIDetails of Similar Applications

Appendix IIIPublic CommentAppendix IVAdvisory Clauses

Drawing A-1 Master Layout Plan

Drawing A-2 Conceptual Landscape Master Plan

Drawings A-3 to **A-5** Site Constraint and Site Layout Plans for CMH and GCMTI

Drawings A-6 to **A-9 Floor Plans and Section Plan for CMH Drawings A-10** to **A-13**Floor Plans and Section Plan for GCMTI

Drawings A-14 to **A-16** Photomontages

Plan A-1 Location Plan Plan A-2 Site Plan A-1 Plan A-3 Aerial Photo Plan A-4 Site Photos

PLANNING DEPARTMENT NOVEMBER 2022