

TOWN PLANNING BOARD

TPB Paper No. 10587

For Consideration by
the Town Planning Board on 25.10.2019

DRAFT FANLING/SHEUNG SHUI OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/FSS/23

CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/FSS/23-1 TO 124
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/FSS/23-C1 TO C2

**DRAFT FANLING/SHEUNG SHUI OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/FSS/23
 CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/FSS/23-1 TO 124
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/FSS/23-C1 TO C2**

Subject of Representations / Representation Site	Representers	Commenter
<p><u>Amendment Item A1</u> Rezoning of a site at Sheung Shui Area 30 from “Industrial” (“I”) to “Residential (Group A)4” (“R(A)4”) with stipulation of building height restriction (BHR)</p> <p><u>Amendment Item A2</u> Rezoning of a site at Sheung Shui Area 4 from “I” and “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Bus Depot” (“OU(Bus Depot)”) to “R(A)4” with stipulation of BHR</p> <p><u>Amendment Item A3</u> Rezoning of a site to the east of Po Shek Wu Road, Sheung Shui Area 4 from “Open Space” (“O”) to “R(A)5” with stipulation of BHR</p> <p><u>Amendment Item A4</u> Rezoning of a site at Jockey Club Road, Fanling Area 11 from “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”) to “R(A)4” with stipulation of BHR</p> <p><u>Amendment Item B</u> Rezoning of a site at Wu Tip Shan, Fanling Area 40 from “G/IC” to “R(A)6” with stipulation of BHR</p> <p><u>Amendment Item C1</u> Rezoning of a strip of land along Choi Yuen Road, Sheung Shui Area 30 from “I” to area shown as ‘Road’</p>	<p><u>Total: 124</u></p> <p><u>Support all or individual items (6):</u></p> <p><i>Organisation (1)</i> R1: Hong Kong Housing Society (HKHS)</p> <p><i>Individuals (5)</i> R2 to R6</p> <p><u>Oppose all or individual items (116):</u></p> <p><i>Individuals (116)</i> R7 to R122</p> <p><u>Providing views (2):</u></p> <p><i>Organisations (2)</i> R123: MTR Corporation Limited R124: The Hong Kong and China Gas Company Limited</p>	<p><u>Total: 2</u></p> <p><u>Providing views (2):</u></p> <p><i>Organisation (1)</i> C1: HKHS (provides comments on R1 to R120 and R122)</p> <p><i>Individual (1)</i> C2 (provides general views, not in respect of any representation)</p>

Subject of Representations / Representation Site	Representers	Commenter
<p><u>Amendment Item C2</u> Rezoning of a strip of land along San Wan Road to the northwest of Po Shek Wu Road, Sheung Shui Area 4 from “I” and “OU(Bus Depot)” to area shown as ‘Road’</p> <p><u>Amendment Item C3</u> Rezoning of a strip of land along San Wan Road to the southeast of Po Shek Wu Road, Sheung Shui Area 4 from “O” to area shown as ‘Road’</p>		

Note: The names of all representers and commenters are attached at **Annexes III**. Soft copy of their submissions is sent to TPB Member via electronic means (for TPB Members only); and is also available for public inspection at the TPB’s website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/Website_S_FSS_23_ENG.html. A set of hard copy is deposited at the TPB Secretariat for Members’ inspection; and is also available for public inspection at the Planning Enquiry Counters of the Planning Department in North Point and Sha Tin.

1. **Introduction**

- 1.1 On 29.3.2019, the draft Fanling/Sheung Shui Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/FSS/23 (the Plan) (**Annex I**) was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). The Schedule of Amendments setting out the amendments incorporated into the Plan is at **Annex II**. The amendments mainly involve rezoning of five sites for public or private residential developments, including a site at Sheung Shui Area 30 (**Item A1**) from “I” to “R(A)4”; a site at Sheung Shui Area 4 (**Item A2**) from “I” and “OU(Bus Depot)” to “R(A)4”; a site to the east of Po Shek Wu Road (PSWR), Sheung Shui Area 4 (**Item A3**) from “O” to “R(A)5”; a site at Jockey Club Road, Fanling Area 11 (**Item A4**) from “G/IC” to “R(A)4”; and a site at Wu Tip Shan, Fanling Area 40 (**Item B**) from “G/IC” to “R(A)6”; as well as technical amendments to reflect the existing use of roads (**Items C1 to C3**).
- 1.2 During the two-month exhibition period, a total of 124 valid representations¹ were received. On 19.7.2019, the representations were published for public comment for three weeks until 9.8.2019. Two comments were received.
- 1.3 On 13.9.2019, the Town Planning Board (the Board) agreed to consider all the representations and comments collectively in one group.

¹ During the two-month exhibition period of the OZP, a total of 3,919 representations were received. Among them, 3,796 submissions were made with identity information in doubt or missing. After verification by the Secretariat of the Board, only one representer submitted the required information. As no response was received from the remaining 3,795 submissions, they were considered as invalid and treated as not having been made pursuant to sections 6(2)(b) and 6(3)(b) of the Ordinance.

- 1.4 This Paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of the representations and comments. A summary of the representations and comments with Government departments' responses is at **Annex V**. The representation sites are shown on **Plan H-1**. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the meeting in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

2. **Background**

- 2.1 According to the 2013 Policy Address, the Government would adopt a multi-pronged approach to build up land reserve with a view to meeting housing and other development needs. It was reaffirmed in the 2014 Policy Address that the Government would continue to review various land uses and rezone sites as appropriate for residential use. This includes reviews on the Government land (GL) currently vacant, under Short Term Tenancies or different short-term or government uses. In this regard, some 150 potential housing sites (including **Items A1, A2 and A4**) were identified. In the 2017 Policy Address, 26 additional potential housing sites (including **Item A3**) have been further identified through the on-going land use reviews.
- 2.2 The amendments to the OZP are mainly related to the said four proposed public housing sites (all on GL), including three in Sheung Shui (**Items A1 to A3**) for public housing development by Hong Kong Housing Authority (HA) and one in Fanling (**Item A4**) for subsidized housing development by HKHS.
- 2.3 To take forward a s.12A application (No. Y/FSS/13) agreed by the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (RNTPC) on 23.6.2017, OZP was amended to rezone a site at Wu Tip Shan from "G/IC" to "R(A)6" (**Item B**) for private residential development cum supporting retail facilities.
- 2.4 Opportunity was taken to amend the OZP to reflect current as-built conditions of some roads (**Items C1 to C3**), and to revise the Notes of the OZP to incorporate the latest revision of the Master Schedule of Notes to Statutory Plans (MSN) endorsed by the Board.
- 2.5 On 8.3.2019, the RNTPC agreed that the proposed amendments to the approved Fanling/Sheung Shui OZP No. S/FSS/22 were suitable for exhibition under section 5 of the Ordinance for public inspection. The relevant RNTPC Paper No. 1/19 and the minutes of the RNTPC meeting are available at the Board's website at https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/papers/RNTPC/622-rntpc_1-19.pdf and https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/meetings/RNTPC/Minutes/m622rnt_e.pdf respectively. The Paper is also available for inspection at the Planning Enquiry Counters of the Planning Department.

3. **Local Consultation**

- 3.1 Prior to the submission of the proposed OZP amendments for consideration by the RNTPC, PlanD, Housing Department (HD), HKHS and Transport Department (TD) consulted the District Minor Works and Environmental Improvement Committee

(DMW) of the North District Council (NDC) on 21.1.2019 on the proposed public housing schemes and corresponding proposed OZP amendments. In general, members were supportive to the provision of more public housing developments to meet the needs of the community, but raised concerns on whether there would be sufficient and timely provision of traffic infrastructure to meet the demand of the increased population. The DMW expressed support to the proposed housing developments and OZP amendments.

- 3.2 During the exhibition period of the OZP, Fanling District Rural Committee (FDRC), the DMW of NDC, and Sheung Shui District Rural Committee (SSDRC) were consulted on 9.5.2019, 20.5.2019 and 23.5.2019 respectively on the OZP amendments. Their views are summarized below.
- 3.3 While supporting the provision of public housing developments to meet the need of the community, members of the DMW of NDC raised concerns on whether the traffic infrastructure including roads and railway and community facilities in the district could support the increased population. The relevant extract of minutes of the DMW's meeting on 20.5.2019 summarizing the views of members and the responses of PlanD's representatives is at **Annex VI**.
- 3.4 Having considered the acute needs for housing, FDRC members had generally no objection to the proposed housing developments. Members suggested the provision of childcare facilities in the housing developments and a footbridge network from Fanling MTR Station to Luen Wo Hui to create a more direct pedestrian connection. They supported the proposed pedestrian footbridge linkage between the proposed housing development at Jockey Club Road (**Item A4**) and the future New Territories East Cultural Centre. The notes of the meeting on 9.5.2019 are at **Annex VII**.
- 3.5 SSDRC members generally had no objection to the proposed public housing developments, which could address the acute housing demand. However, they raised concerns on the potential adverse traffic impact caused by the proposed housing developments, and the provision of hostels for mentally handicapped persons at the Sheung Shui Area 30 site (**Item A1**). The notes of meeting on 23.5.2019 are at **Annex VIII**.

4. The Representations

4.1 Subject of Representations

4.1.1 There are a total of 124 representations including six supporting representations, 116 opposing representations, and two providing views. Their views are briefly summarised below.

Supporting (6)

4.1.2 The six supporting representations (**R1 to R6**) were submitted by HKHS and individuals. **R1** (HKHS) and **R5** support **Item A4**, while **R2 to R4** and **R6** support **Items A1 to A4** in relation to the four proposed public

housing developments. **R6** also support **Items C1 to C3**.

Opposing (116)

- 4.1.3 All the 116 opposing representations (**R7 to R122**) were submitted by individuals. Except for two (**R121** opposes **Item A3** only, **R122** opposes **Items A1 to A4** and **B**), all of them were submitted in two standard formats (i.e. (i) **R7 to R32** oppose **Items A1 to A4**, (ii) **R33 to R120** oppose all **Items** shown on Plan).

Providing views (2)

- 4.1.4 They were submitted by MTR Corporation Limited (**R123**) providing views on **Items A1 to A3** and **B**, and The Hong Kong and China Gas Company Limited (**R124**) providing views on **Item B** respectively.

4.2 Major Grounds, Proposals and Views of Representations

- 4.2.1 Major grounds of objections and views are summarised below.

Supportive Representations

- 4.2.2 **R1** (HKHS) and **R5** support **Item A4**. **R1** considers that the proposed subsidised housing development at the Jockey Club Road site could enable timely provision of public housing to meet the territorial demand and a more diverse choice of housing for families of low to middle income; include a Residential Care Home for the Elderly (RCHE) to serve the ageing population and public car parking spaces to meet the public demand for parking spaces in the district; is compatible with the surrounding land uses comprising of GIC and residential developments; reserve connection points with the adjacent future New Territories East Cultural Centre and existing and planned pedestrian network to Fanling MTR Station (**Plan H-2b**); and has no insurmountable technical problem. **R5** considers that the site is underutilized and suitable for residential development due to its accessibility.
- 4.2.3 **R2 to R4** and **R6** support **Items A1 to A4** (**R6** also support **Items C1 to C3**) on the grounds that the proposed public housing developments could increase housing supply to meet public demand. It will achieve a better use of land resource for the Jockey Club Road site under **Item A4** which is currently occupied by underutilised tennis courts.

Opposing Representations and Representations Providing Views

Housing Supply

- 4.2.4 Infill public housing developments are not compatible with the existing developments in the Fanling/Sheung Shui area. Fanling Golf Course should be first developed for housing developments with community facilities (**R7 to R32**).

Traffic and Transport

- 4.2.5 Due to increasing population and the pressure exerted by the Mainland visitors, the current road and railway networks of the Fanling/Sheung Shui area have been overloaded and severe traffic congestions has been increasing in the past few years. The population will further increase with the completion of planned housing developments. Without any new roads and the proposed Northern Link, the traffic will continue to rely on Tolo Highway and East Rail Line. The traffic condition in the district will deteriorate with the additional population from these proposed housing developments and other planned housing developments like Kwu Tung North/Fanling North New Development Area (NDA) and Queen's Hill project (**R7 to R120**).
- 4.2.6 Priority should be given to construction of multi-storey car park building to address the shortage of public car parking spaces and alleviate the serious illegal on-street parking in the district (**R33 to R120**).

Visual and Air Ventilation

- 4.2.7 The proposed developments with tall buildings and large podium will have adverse visual and air ventilation impacts on the surroundings. The proposed developments at **Items A1 and A2** sites would cast wind shadow to the leeward region and reduce the wind availability to the playground and the low-rise village in Tai Tau Leng (**Plan H-2a**). The PSWR site under **Item A3** is an existing air path and the proposed buildings would result in adverse impact on the air ventilation to the downstream area (**R122**).
- 4.2.8 The proposed housing development at the PSWR site under **Item A3** would block the view of the adjacent old buildings (**Plan H-2a**), and their view to the sky and air ventilation will be affected. The design of the proposed buildings should have regard to the living quality of nearby residents (**R121**).

Environment and Others

- 4.2.9 The three sites under **Items A1 to A3** in Sheung Shui Area 30 and 4 are very close to MTR line and are subject to noise pollution from the railway. These sites should be retained for uses which could generate employment opportunities for the locals. The technical assessments carried out by the consultants for the projects are not independent and are unreliable (**R122**).
- 4.2.10 MTR Corporation Limited (**R123**) offers the view that the proposed housing developments under **Items A1 to A3** and **B** are sensitive to air-borne noise of railway operation. The proponents of these projects should conduct detailed assessment at design stage to address the noise issue and implement appropriate mitigation measures. The Board should consider imposing related development requirements through Planning Briefs, statutory plans

and/or land administration documents.

- 4.2.11 The Hong Kong and China Gas Company Limited (**R124**) offers the view that since the site at Wu Tip Shan under **Item B** is in close vicinity to an existing high pressure gas pipeline along Fanling Highway, the project proponent should conduct a Quantitative Risk Assessment to evaluate the potential risk and identify the necessary mitigation measures if required, and consult the company at the design and construction stages.

Landscape

- 4.2.12 There is no assessment on the cumulative impact of removal of trees (**R122**).

GIC Facilities and Open Space

- 4.2.13 There is a high demand for community facilities in North District. Medical, elderly and child-care facilities are clearly inadequate. The shortage would be aggravated with the increasing population. Facing the aging population, there is a need to better utilize land resources like provision of social welfare complex building to meet the demand (**R33 to R120**).
- 4.2.14 “G/IC” sites should be retained for community facilities. Based on the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG), there is a shortfall in GIC facilities in the district particularly community care services facilities and RCHE, and the RCHE provision in the proposed housing sites is low. It is stated in Town Planning Board Planning Guidelines No. 16 that s.16 planning applications for development in “G/IC” zone should dedicate more than 50% of the GFA to GIC and other public uses. The rezoning of the Wu Tip Shan site under **Item B** from “G/IC” for private housing development is objected as it is in breach of the 50% rule (**R122**).
- 4.2.15 The land zoned as “O” on the OZP (about 42 ha) falls short of meeting the requirement under the HKPSG. The rezoning of the PSWR site under **Item A3** from “O” to “R(A)5” is objected (**R122**).
- 4.2.16 Shortage of land cannot be used as an excuse to justify rezoning of **Item A3, A4 and B** from “O” and “G/IC” to residential uses, which would deprive the community of a planned open air recreation space and areas intended for community uses (**R122**).

Proposals of Representer

- 4.2.17 **R34** proposes to (a) withdraw all OZP amendments; and (b) rezone a site at Fung Nam Road at Sheung Shui Area 6 (**Plans H-5a and H-5b**), which is currently occupied by a metered public car park and bus stop, from “G/IC” to “R(A)” with BH restriction. In determining the maximum plot ratio (PR), any floor space for public vehicle parks, public transport facilities and GIC facilities, as required by the Government, should be disregarded.

5. The Comment on Representation

- 5.1 Two comments on representations were submitted by HKHS (**C1**) and an individual (**C2**), which are **R1** and **R122** respectively. **C1** reiterates its support and justifications for the proposed housing development at Jockey Club Road under **Item A4**, and provides responses to the views and concerns raised in other relevant representations. **C2** considers that the rezoning of “G/IC” sites cannot be tolerated because of the urgent need for social and community services to cope with the demand of additional population in the district. There is a need for improvement and upgrading of Government facilities in the Fanling/Sheung Shui area and to achieve a better synergy with the Kwu Tung North/Fanling North NDA.
- 5.2 A summary of the representations and comments and Government departments’ responses are at **Annex V** respectively.

6. Planning Considerations and Assessments

6.1 The Representation Sites and their Surrounding Areas

Item A1 (Plans H-2a, H-3a and H-4a)

- 6.1.2 The site (about 1.55 ha) is located on the west side of PSWR, to the northwest of the centre of Sheung Shui New Town and is about 600m from MTR Sheung Shui Station. It is bounded by PSWR to the east, Choi Yuen Road to the south and southwest, and Choi Fai Street to its north. The western portion of the site is a temporary public car park held under Short Term Tenancy while the eastern portion is vacant land covered by trees and shrubs (**Plans H-3a and H-4a**). The site falls within the eastern fringe of industrial area of Sheung Shui Area 30, which is zoned “I” on OZP.
- 6.1.3 On its east across PSWR is the existing residential areas including Choi Po Court (BH of 100mPD) and Choi Yuen Estate (BH of 65mPD), and Po Shek Wu Estate (BH of 114mPD). On its south across Shek Sheung River is an area of village type development (Tai Tau Leng, mainly 3-storey buildings). On its north and northwest is Sheung Shui Area 30 industrial area which has three existing industrial buildings mainly for non-manufacturing industrial uses including warehouses and storage, Sheung Shui Ambulance Depot, some temporary public car parks held under Short Term Tenancy and some vacant land. The area is undergoing transformation, and planning permissions have been granted for wholesale conversion of the three existing industrial buildings (i.e. Jumbo Plaza, Advanced Technology Centre and Hi Tech Centre) for ‘Eating Place’, ‘Office’ and/or ‘Shop and Services’ uses (**Plan H-2a**). East Rail Line lies on the further north.

Item A2 (Plans H-2a, H-3a and H-4b)

- 6.1.4 The site (about 1.36 ha) is located on the west side of PSWR, to the north of Sheung Shui Area 30 Site on the opposite side of railway. It is bounded by

PSWR to its southeast, San Wan Road and East Rail Line to its southwest, and Ka Fu Close to its northeast. Majority of the site is occupied by a temporary public car park held under Short Term Tenancy, and a part of the site is occupied by a temporary works area of Water Supplies Department (**Plans H-3a and H-4b**).

- 6.1.5 On its southeast across PSWR is another potential housing site (PSWR Site, **Item A3**). On its south across PSWR is the existing residential areas including Po Shek Wu Estate. On its southwest across East Rail Line are Sheung Shui Area 30 and the potential housing site under **Item A1**. On its northwest and north is Sheung Shui Area 4 industrial area with several existing industrial buildings which are mainly for non-manufacturing industrial uses including warehouses and storage. There is an approved s.16 application (No. A/FSS/234) for wholesale conversion of an existing industrial building (i.e. Alpha Appliances Building) for 'Eating Place', 'Office' and 'Shop and Services' uses at the further northwest (**Plan H-2a**).

Item A3 (Plans H-2a, H-3a and H-4c)

- 6.1.6 The site (about 1.38 ha) is located on the east side of PSWR, to the northwest of the centre of Sheung Shui New Town and about 400m from MTR Sheung Shui Station. It is bounded by San Wan Road to its southeast and southwest, and PSWR to its northwest. The site is occupied by a temporary bus depot of Kowloon Motor Bus (KMB) under Short Term Tenancy (**Plans H-3a and H-4c**). A reprovisioning site has been identified for the bus depot.
- 6.1.7 On its east is Shek Wu Hui (**Plan H-2a**), which is an existing market town with commercial and residential uses, and predominantly low-rise buildings (about 25mPD) with some individual commercial/residential developments of about 60-90mPD. Landmark North (about 96mPD) is located at the southern fringe of Shek Wu Hui. On southwest of the site across San Wan Road and East Rail Line are the existing residential areas including Po Shek Wu Estate. On its northwest is the potential housing site under **Item A2**. Shek Wu Hui Jockey Club Playground is at its immediate north.

Item A4 (Plans H-2b, H-3b and H-4d)

- 6.1.8 The site (about 0.55 ha) is located at about 400m to the northwest of MTR Fanling Station. It is bounded by Jockey Club Road to the northeast and Pik Fung Road to the northwest. The northwest portion of the site is a temporary tennis court managed by LCSD while the remaining portion is vacant GL covered by trees (**Plans H-3b and H-4d**).
- 6.1.9 On its southeast is the former Fanling Magistracy, which is a Grade 3 historic building revitalized for a training centre with a hostel and eating place. On its further southeast across Sha Tau Kok Road is an existing public housing estate, i.e. Cheung Wah Estate (about 110mPD) (**Plan H-2b**). On its immediate south and northwest across Pik Fung Road are two GIC clusters (ranging from 26mPD to 62mPD) respectively which include

Fanling Law Courts Building, North District Government Offices, the site proposed for the future New Territories East Cultural Centre, Fanling Health Centre and Pentecostal Gin Mao Sheng Primary School. On its north across Jockey Club Road is a low density residential area (La Verte, about 24mPD) and village type development (Fan Leng Lau, mainly 3-storey buildings).

Item B (Plans H-2c, H-3c and H-4e)

6.1.10 The site (about 0.36 ha) is located at Wu Tip Shan and is the subject of a s.12A application (No. Y/FSS/13) agreed by the RNTPC on 23.6.2017 to rezone the site from “G/IC” to “R(A)4” for residential development cum supporting retail facilities.

6.1.11 The site is private land and currently fenced off and occupied by several vacant domestic dwelling structures (**Plans H-3c and H-4e**). It is currently without vehicular access. The applicant of the s.12A application would construct a new roundabout extending from the northern end of Yan Shing Lane to serve the proposed development and the adjacent areas (**Plan H-2c**). TD and HyD would take up the long-term management and maintenance of the roundabout respectively in the future.

Item C1 to C3 (Plans H-2a, H-3a, H-4a to H-4c)

6.1.12 The sites are strips of land being part of existing roads in Sheung Shui Areas 4 and 30 (i.e. Choi Yuen Road and San Wan Road), and rezoned to areas shown as ‘Road’ to reflect the as-built condition (**Plans H-2a, H-3a and H-4a**).

6.1.13 The development restrictions for the sites under **Items A1 to A4 and B** and major development parameters of the proposed housing developments are summarized in the table below.

	Item A1 Site	Item A2 Site	Item A3 Site	Item A4 Site	Item B Site
Site Area (ha)	1.55	1.36	1.38	0.55	0.36
Maximum PR/GFA under OZP	PR 6.6	PR 6.6	PR 7.0	PR 6.6	Domestic GFA: 19,750m ² Non-domestic GFA: 3,092m ²

	Item A1 Site	Item A2 Site	Item A3 Site	Item A4 Site	Item B Site
Maximum Building Height under OZP	130mPD			100mPD	128mPD
No. of Flats (About)	2,000	1,500	1,800	640	300
	Total 5,300				
Transport and community facilities[#]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Public transport interchange (PTI) - Community hall - RCHE(100-place) - Day Activity Centre - Hostel for Severely Mentally Handicapped Persons - Hostel for Moderately Mentally Handicapped Persons - Integrated Vocational Rehabilitation Services Centre 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Public vehicle park with about 306 spaces (300 for private cars, 6 for light goods vehicles (LGVs)) 	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RCHE (100-place) - Public vehicle park with about 135 spaces (130 for private cars, 5 for LGVs) 	-
Other facilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Kindergarten - District health centre - Retail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Post office - Retail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Kindergarten - Retail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Retail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Retail

As stipulated in the Notes of the relevant "R(A)" zones, public vehicle parks, public transport facilities and GIC facilities as required by the Government, are exempted from PR calculation.

6.2 Planning Intentions

6.2.1 The planning intentions of the zones in relation to the Items are as follows:

Current Zoning

(a) The "R(A)" zone is intended primarily for high-density residential

developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building. The various “R(A)” subzones are subject to different PR/GFA and/or other development restrictions.

- (b) Areas shown as ‘Road’ are intended for road use.

Previous Zonings

- (c) The “I” zone is intended primarily for general industrial uses to ensure an adequate supply of industrial floor space to meet demand from production-oriented industries. Information technology and telecommunications industries and office related to industrial use are also always permitted in this zone.
- (d) The “G/IC” zone is intended primarily for the provision of Government, institution or community facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.
- (e) The “O” zone is intended primarily for the provision of outdoor open-air public space for active and/or passive recreational uses serving the needs of local residents as well as the general public.
- (f) The “OU(Bus Depot)” zone is intended primarily to provide/reserve land for specific purposes and uses.

6.3 Responses to Grounds, Views and Proposals of Representations

Supportive Representations

- 6.3.1 The supportive views of **R1 to R6** are noted.

Opposing Representations and Representations Providing Views

Housing Supply

- 6.3.2 Over the years, the Government has adopted multi-pronged approach for increasing land supply. To meet the acute housing need of the community, various measures in short, medium and long terms will be considered and explored concurrently. Among other measures, an immediate and effective way to augment housing land supply in the short to medium terms is to optimize the use of developable areas in the urban areas and new towns with available infrastructure. The proposed public housing sites under **Item A1 to A4** fall within the Fanling/Sheung Shui New Town with infrastructure support and are close to railway stations and major road networks. They are formed sites of sufficient size (about 0.55 ha to 1.55 ha) to allow early and comprehensive planning to include various supporting transport and

GIC facilities, and are generally compatible with the surrounding areas comprising mainly residential developments, GIC uses, open space and Sheung Shui industrial area which is being transformed for commercial uses. As confirmed by various technical assessments, they are suitable for residential use (**R7 to R32**).

- 6.3.3 Regarding the representers' suggestion to use Fanling Golf Course, the Government will continue to explore various measures to increase housing land supply including exploring the feasibility of using part of Fanling Golf Course (**R7 to R32**).

Traffic and Transport

- 6.3.4 The Traffic Impact Assessments (TIAs) conducted for the four proposed public housing developments (**Items A1 to A4**) by HA and HKHS have taken into account the planned developments in the district including Queen's Hill project, Kwu Tung North/Fanling North NDA. Among others, a new PTI is proposed at the public housing development at **Item A1** site to facilitate redistribution of public transport routes and alleviate the existing traffic condition in the town centre of Sheung Shui. With the implementation of the traffic improvement measures recommended in the TIAs and other measures committed under other projects² (**Annex IX, Plans H-6a to H-6l**) in the district to be completed progressively, TIAs concluded that the major road junctions in the vicinity of the sites will be performing within capacity, and the proposed housing developments will not induce significant traffic impacts on the surrounding road networks and are acceptable from traffic engineering point of view. The Commissioner for Transport has no objection to the proposed housing developments and the findings of the TIAs (**R7 to R120**).

- 6.3.5 To meet the demand for vehicle parking spaces in the district, 306 and 135 public vehicle parking spaces will be provided at the proposed housing developments at **Item A2** and **A4** sites respectively (**R33 to R120**).

Visual and Air Ventilation

- 6.3.6 The proposed public housing developments with BHs of 100mPD and 130mPD under **Items A1 to A4** are generally compatible with the surrounding developments comprising high-rise housing estates (Choi Po Court (100mPD) and Po Shek Wu Estate (114mPD) in Sheung Shui near **Items A1 to A3** sites; Cheung Wah Estate (110mPD) in Fanling near **Item A4** site), industrial buildings and GIC uses. Visual Impact Assessments conducted for these sites concluded that the visual impacts at various public viewing points (**Plans H-7a to H-7d**) are not significant. With implementation of appropriate design mitigation measures (e.g. visual

² To cater for the population increase by planned housing development in North District, the Government have committed to implement a series of traffic improvement proposals in the area, including Lung Shan Tunnel (opened in May 2019) and Fanling Bypass (Eastern Section) (targeted to be completed in 2024), and improvement works for individual roads and junctions including So Kwun Po Road Interchange, Po Shek Wu Road Interchange, and various junctions along Po Shek Wu Road.

corridor, stepped building height, appropriate façade treatments), it is anticipated that the proposed housing developments will not cause significant adverse visual impact to its vicinity (**R122**).

- 6.3.7 In response to **R121**'s concern that the proposed housing blocks at the PSWR site under **Item A3** will block the existing view of the nearby buildings in Shek Wu Hui, in the highly developed context of Hong Kong, it is not practical to protect private views without stifling development opportunity and balancing other relevant consideration. In the interest of the public, it is far more important to protect public views, particularly those easily accessible and popular to the public or tourists (**R121**).
- 6.3.8 According to the Air Ventilation Assessments (AVAs) conducted for the four proposed public housing developments, with the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures including building separations, setback from site boundary, and podium design (permeable and terraced design) to facilitate wind penetration, the proposed housing developments would not have significant adverse impact to the surrounding pedestrian environment. Further quantitative AVA would be conducted by HA and HKHS for assessing the effectiveness of the mitigation measures at the detailed design stage as well as optimizing the development schemes (**R121** and **R122**).

Environment and Others

- 6.3.9 According to the Preliminary Environmental Assessment (PEA)/Environmental Assessment (EA) conducted for the four proposed public housing developments, with proper building layout, design and provision of fixed glazing for facades of the residential blocks facing the rail line, the proposed residential developments will comply with the respective Acceptable Noise Level under Noise Control Ordinance (Cap. 400) and the criteria set in HKPSG. For the private housing development at Wu Tip Shan under **Item B**, an Environmental Noise Impact Assessment conducted at the s.12A application stage concluded that with the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures, insurmountable fixed noise or rail impacts were not anticipated. The Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) has no objection to the findings of the relevant assessments and the proposed housing developments from environmental perspective (**R122**).
- 6.3.10 Regarding the view of MTR Corporation Limited (**R123**), HA will conduct an Environmental Assessment Study at the detailed design stage for the three public housing sites under **Items A1 to A3** and an EA has been conducted by HKHS to address the potential impacts with respect to the HKPSG and suitable mitigation measures will be/have been proposed. Appropriate requirement will be stipulated in the Planning Briefs and/or lease documents as appropriate to ensure the implementation of the mitigation measures.
- 6.3.11 Regarding the view of the Hong Kong and China Gas Company Limited (**R124**), the requirement for a QRA will be imposed on the proposed private

housing development in the relevant lease document if considered necessary by the concerned departments and the Gas Company will be consulted in the process.

Landscape

6.3.12 Tree assessments have been conducted for these proposed housing developments. There is no Old and Valuable Trees (OVTs) within these sites and the existing trees are generally species commonly found in Hong Kong with average health and amenity value. While some of these trees will be felled for the developments, compensatory planning will be carried out according to Development Bureau Technical Circular (Works) No. 7/2015 – Tree Preservation in a ratio of not less than 1:1 in terms of numbers (**R122**).

GIC Facilities and Open Space

6.3.13 Taking into account the additional population of the five proposed housing developments, the planned provision for GIC facilities in the Fanling/Sheung Shui area is generally sufficient in accordance with requirements of the HKPSG (**Annex X**). In particular, there is surplus provision of planned hospital beds, clinic/health centre, and integrated children and youth services centre. Taking into account views of the Social Welfare Department (SWD) and concerned departments, various GIC facilities have been included in the proposed public housing developments, including community hall, RCHEs, kindergartens, post office, hostels for moderately or severely mentally handicapped persons, day activity centre, integrated vocational rehabilitation services centre and district health centre (**R33 to R120**).

6.3.14 According to the population-based planning standards for elderly services and facilities recently incorporated into the HKPSG, there will be shortfalls in Community Care Services Facilities and RCHE of 1,211 places and 532 beds in the Area respectively. As the HKPSG requirements for these two facilities are a long-term goal, the actual provision would be subject to the consideration of the SWD in the planning and development process as appropriate. Since these facilities are premises based, consideration will be given to include facilities requested by SWD in the planned GIC and residential developments in Fanling and Sheung Shui area as well as in Kwu Tung North/Fanling North NDA (**R122**).

6.3.15 Based on HKPSG requirement and the planned population, there is a surplus of 32.47 ha of open space in the Fanling/Sheung Shui area. Apart from land zoned as “O” on OZP, local open spaces falling within areas of other zonings or provided in public housing estates and large private residential developments are also taken into account in the assessment (**R122**).

6.3.16 For **Item A4** (Jockey Club Road) and **Item B** (Wu Tip Shan) sites which were originally zoned “G/IC”, there are no designated GIC use. **Item B** site is private land and the rezoning is to take forward an approved S.12A

application agreed by the RNTPC. Various technical assessments were conducted in the s.12A application stage to confirm that the proposed housing development is acceptable in land use and technical terms (**R122**).

6.3.17 In view of the above, it is considered appropriate to rezone **Items A1 to A4 and B sites** for housing developments.

Response to Proposals of Representer

Withdraw all proposed amendments

6.3.18 On the basis of the above, it is considered appropriate to rezone the relevant representation sites (**Items A1 to A4 and B**) for housing developments to meet the acute housing demand of the community. **Items C1 to C3** are technical amendments to reflect the as-built conditions of land currently used as roads. As such, **R34**'s proposal to withdraw all OZP amendments is not supported.

To rezone a site at Fung Nam Road from "G/IC" to "R(A)"

6.3.19 For **R34**'s proposal to rezone the site (**Plans H-5a and H-5b**) for housing development, the Government will consider reviewing suitable sites for housing development where appropriate. The site is an undesignated GIC site and is currently occupied by an open-air metered public car park, a bus terminus and a taxi stand to serve the immediate community. In the absence of supporting technical assessments and reprovisioning arrangement of the existing facilities, **R34**'s proposal to rezone the site to "R(A)" is not supported.

6.4 **Responses to Grounds of Comment**

6.4.1 **C1**'s supportive views to the proposed housing development at Jockey Club Road (**Item A4**) are noted.

6.4.2 Regarding **C2**'s views on the provision of social and community services, the planning considerations and assessments as set out in paragraphs 6.3.13 and 6.3.14 above are relevant.

7. **Consultation**

7.1 The following Government bureau/departments have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs or **Annex V**, where appropriate.

- (a) Secretary for Education;
- (b) Commissioner for Transport;
- (c) Director of Environmental Protection;
- (d) Director of Social Welfare;
- (e) Director of Housing; and
- (f) Chief Town Planner/Urban Design & Landscape, Planning Department.

7.2 The following departments have no comment on the representations and comments:

- (a) Antiquities and Monuments Office, Development Bureau;
- (b) Chief Building Surveyor/New Territories West, Buildings Department;
- (c) District Land Officer/North, Lands Department;
- (d) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department;
- (e) Chief Engineer/Mainland North, Drainage Services Department;
- (f) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
- (g) Director of Fire Services;
- (h) Commissioner of Police;
- (i) Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation;
- (j) Director of Food and Environmental Health;
- (k) Project Manager/North, Civil Engineering and Development Department;
- (l) Head of Geotechnical Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department;
- (m) Chief Highway Engineer/New Territories East, Highways Department;
- (n) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services;
- (o) District Officer (North), Home Affairs Department;
- (p) Director of Health;
- (q) Director-General of Trade and Industry; and
- (r) Government Property Administrator.

8. Planning Department's Views

8.1 The supportive views of **R1 to R6** on **Items A1 to A4** and **C1 to C3**, and the views provided in **R123** and **R124** are noted.

8.2 Based on the assessments in paragraph 6 above and the following reasons, the Planning Department does not support **R7 to R122** and considers that the Plan should not be amended to meet the representations:

Items A1 to A4 and B

- (a) Land suitable for housing development in Hong Kong is scarce and there is a genuine need for optimising the use of land available to meet the pressing demand for housing. The proposed developments at the representation sites are compatible with the surrounding environment, suitable for residential development, and sustainable from traffic, visual, air ventilation, environment and landscape perspectives (**R7 to R122**);
- (b) With the implementation of recommended and committed traffic improvement measures, the proposed housing developments will not pose unacceptable traffic impacts on the road network in the surrounding areas (**R7 to R122**);
- (c) With the adoption of recommended mitigation measures, the proposed housing developments would not be subject to unacceptable environmental impacts or have adverse environmental impacts on their surrounding areas

(R122);

- (d) The planned GIC facilities and open spaces are generally sufficient to meet the demand of the planned population in the district in accordance with the HKPSG. Appropriate community facilities and local open space will be provided in the proposed housing developments to serve the residents and locals. The provision of community facilities will be closely monitored by the relevant Government bureau/departments **(R30 to R120 and R122);**

Items C1 to C3

- (e) Amendment Items C1 to C3 are technical amendments to reflect current as-built conditions of roads **(R33 to R120).**

Proposals of Representer

- (f) It is considered appropriate to rezone the representation sites **(Items A1 to A4 and B)** for housing developments to meet the acute housing demand and to reflect the as-built conditions of land currently used as roads **(Items C1 to C3)**. **R34's** proposal to withdraw these amendments is not supported.
- (g) While the Government will consider reviewing suitable sites for housing development where appropriate, in the absence of supporting technical assessments and reprovisioning arrangement for the existing facilities, **R34's** proposal to rezone a site at Fung Nam Road to "R(A)" is not supported.

9. Decision Sought

The Board is invited to give consideration to the representations and the related comment and decide whether to propose/not to propose any amendment to the Plan to meet/partially meet the representations.

10. Attachments

Annex I	Draft Fanling/Sheung Shui OZP No. S/FSS/23 (reduced size)
Annex II	Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Fanling/Sheung Shui Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FSS/22
Annex III	List of Representatives (R1 to R124) and Commenters (C1 to C2)
Annex IV	Submissions of Representatives and Commenters (<i>for TPB Members Only via electronic means</i>)
Annex V	Summary of Representations and Comments and Government department's Response
Annex VI	Extract of the Minutes of the Meeting of District Minor Works and Environmental Improvement Committee of North District Council held on 20.5.2019

Annex VII	Notes of meeting with Fanling District Rural Committee held on 9.5.2019
Annex VIII	Notes of meeting with Sheung Shui District Rural Committee held on 23.5.2019
Annex IX	Summary of Junction Improvement Schemes
Annex X	Provision of Open Space and Major Community Facilities and in Fanling/Sheung Shui New Town
Plans H-1	Location Plans of Amendment Items and Representation Sites
Plans H-2a to 2c	Site Plans
Plans H-3a to 3c	Aerial Photos
Plans H-4a to 4e	Site Photos
Plan H-5a to 5b	Location Plan and Site Plan of R34's proposed rezoning site at Fung Nam Road
Plans H-6a to 6l	Committed/Proposed Traffic Improvement Measures and Major Road Works
Plans H-7a to 7d	Photomontages

**PLANNING DEPARTMENT
OCTOBER 2019**