Meeting re-scheduled for 25.4.2022

### **TOWN PLANNING BOARD**

TPB Paper No. 10799
For Consideration by the
Town Planning Board on 21.1.2022

DRAFT PING SHAN OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/YL-PS/19

CONSIDERATION OF
REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/YL-PS/19-R1 TO R62
AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/YL- PS/19-C1 TO C4

TPB Paper No. 10799 For Consideration by the Town Planning Board on 21.1.2022

# DRAFT PING SHAN OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/YL-PS/19 CONSIDERATION OF REPRESENTATIONS NO. TPB/R/S/YL-PS/19-R1 TO R62 AND COMMENTS NO. TPB/R/S/YL-PS/19-C1 TO C4

Subject of Representations (Amendment Items)	Representers (No. TPB/R/S/ YL-PS/19-)	Commenters (No. TPB/R/S/ YL-PS/19-)
_	(No. TPB/R/S/	(No. TPB/R/S/
	Tsuen R7: Member of PSRC R8: Manager of Tang's Tong (鄧維新堂) R9: VR of Fung Ka Wai R10 to R55: Individuals	
	Amendments to the Notes (1) R61: Individual  Providing Views (2) R60 and R62: Individuals	

#### 1. Introduction

- 1.1 On 7.5.2021, the draft Ping Shan Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/YL-PS/19 (the Plan) at **Annex I** was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance). The Schedule of Amendments setting out the amendments to the OZP is at **Annex II** and the locations of the amendment items are shown on **Plan H-1**.
- 1.2 During the two-month statutory exhibition period, a total of 62 valid representations were received <sup>1</sup>. On 23.7.2021, the representations were published for public comments. Upon expiry of the publication period, a total of 4 valid comments on the representations were received.
- 1.3 On 19.11.2021, the Town Planning Board (the Board) agreed to consider all the representations and comments of the Plan collectively in one group.
- 1.4 This Paper is to provide the Board with information for consideration of the representations and comments. The lists of representers and commenters are at **Annex III**<sup>2</sup>. The summary of representations and comments and the Government's responses are at **Annex IV**. The representers and commenters have been invited to attend the meeting in accordance with section 6B(3) of the Ordinance.

#### 2. Background

Proposed Wang Chau Remaining Phases (WCRP) Public Housing Development (Item A)

2.1 To increase housing land supply, a review of "GB" sites for housing development was conducted by the Planning Department (PlanD) in 2011 mainly focusing on land which had been de-vegetated, deserted or formed, near the fringes of new towns or planned New Development Areas (NDAs), in close proximity to existing settlements, and/or accessible to existing roads. A number of sites were identified for further studies for residential purposes. Among these sites, a piece of land (about 33.31 ha) to the west of Long Ping Estate and the Yuen Long Industrial Estate (YLIE), partly zoned "GB" and partly zoned "OS", was identified suitable, subject to further feasibility study, for public housing development and possible extension of YLIE, if required. In 2014, the Government decided to carry out the public housing development in phases and a site to the west of Long Ping Estate (about 5.67 ha) was rezoned from "GB" to "Residential (Group A)4" ("R(A)4") for public housing development first, i.e.

On 19.11.2021, the Board noted 25 representations with the required identity information missing should be treated as not having been made pursuant to sections 6(2) and 6(3) of the Ordinance. As a result, there are 62 valid representations.

<sup>2</sup> The names of all representers and commenters are attached at **Annex III**. Soft copy of their submissions is sent to the Town Planning Board Members via electronic means; and is also available for public inspection at the Board's website at <a href="https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/plan\_making/S\_YL-PS\_19.html">https://www.info.gov.hk/tpb/en/plan\_making/S\_YL-PS\_19.html</a> and the Planning Enquiry Counters of the PlanD in North Point and Sha Tin. A set of hard copy is deposited at the Town Planning Board Secretariat for Members' inspection.

Wang Chau Phase 1 Public Housing Development<sup>3</sup> (**Plan H-1**).

2.2 To facilitate the WCRP public housing development, the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) completed an engineering feasibility study (EFS) for the proposed housing development and associated Government, Institution and Community (GIC) facilities to provide about 13,000 public housing units to accommodate about 36,400 people.

Proposed Public Housing Development near Tin Tsz Road (TTR) and supporting infrastructural facilities (Items B and C)

- 2.3 To meet the policy objective for ten-year housing supply target announced in the 2015 Policy Address, PlanD and other relevant government departments have jointly identified potential public housing sites for study on the feasibility and development potential. The site in Ping Shan north near Tin Tsz Road is one of these potential public housing sites.
- 2.4 CEDD completed an EFS for the proposed public housing development and associated GIC facilities at the site to provide about 9,000 to 9,500 public housing units to accommodate about 24,300 to 25,650 people.

Amendments to the Notes of the OZP

2.5 Opportunity was also taken to revise the Notes of the OZP to incorporate the amendments of the Revised Master Schedule of Notes to Statutory Plans (MSN) agreed by the Board in 2018, i.e. deleting 'Market' use and subsuming it under 'Shop and Services' use. Also, with a view to streamlining the planning application process/mechanism, technical amendments were made to the Remarks of the Notes to extend the clause exempting the land/pond filling and land excavation works pertaining to public works co-ordinated or implemented by Government and minor works (i.e. maintenance, repair and rebuilding works) from the requirement of planning permission (the 'Exemption Clause') to "CA" zone.

#### Proposed Amendments to the OZP

2.6 On 16.4.2021, the Rural and New Town Planning Committee (RNTPC) agreed that the proposed amendments to the approved Ping Shan OZP No. S/YL-PS/18 was suitable for exhibition under section 5 of the Ordinance for public inspection. The relevant RNTPC Paper No. 3/21 is available at the Board's website and the Secretariat for Members' inspection, while the extract of the minutes of the RNTPC meeting is at **Annex V**.

#### 3. <u>Local Consultations</u>

Prior to the submission of the proposed amendments to the approved OZP for consideration by RNTPC, the PlanD, CEDD and the Housing Department (HD) consulted the Housing, Town Planning and Development Committee (HTPDC) of the

 $^3$  The "R(A)4" for Wang Chau Phase 1 development was gazetted on 31.10.2014 under the draft Ping Shan OZP No. S/YL-PS/15.

YLDC on 17.3.2021, and PSRC on 9.4.2021 regarding the proposed amendments to the OZP for the two proposed public housing developments. The HTPDC members have some reservations on the proposed developments mainly due to the concerns on compensation and rehousing, traffic impact on road network, provision of public transport and cycle track as well as provision of market, retail facilities and social welfare facilities. The PSRC strongly objected to the proposed public housing developments and raised concerns mainly on compensation and rehousing, local employment, over-population, traffic impact on road network and fung shui aspects. The PSRC counter-proposed to develop the Fung Lok Wai area for public housing. The detailed views and comments of HTPDC of YLDC and PSRC, as well as the responses of PlanD/CEDD/HD are recorded in the minutes of the said meetings at Annexes VI and VII respectively.

#### 4. The Representation Sites and their Surrounding Areas

4.1 The Representation Sites and their Surrounding Areas

#### Representation Site under Item A

4.1.1 Item A (with a total area of about 12.09 ha including Government Land (GL) of about 29.7%), being at the north-western fringe of Yuen Long New Town, is located to the west of Fuk Hi Street, east of Kai Shan and south of YLIE in Wang Chau (**Plans H-2a to H-2f**). The site is currently occupied by farmland, rural residential dwellings, scrubland, open storage yards and warehouses. The site is accessible from Fuk Hi Street at the east.

Proposed WCRP Public Housing Development

4.1.2 Item A is zoned "R(A)5" with maximum PR of 6.5 and maximum BH of 135mPD. An indicative layout is at **Plan H-3** and the photomontages are at **Plans H-4a to H-4f**. The development parameters of the proposed housing development are as follows:

Rezoning Area	About 12.09 ha	
Site Area for Housing	About 10.83 ha	
Development <sup>4</sup>		
Maximum Plot Ratio (PR)	6.5	
Maximum Building Height	135mPD	
(BH)		
Estimated No. of Flats	13,000 (about)	
Estimated Population	36,400 (about)	
Proposed No. of Residential	13	
Blocks		
Supporting Facilities	- Kindergarten(s)	
	- Two 24-classroom primary schools	
	- Retail facilities	
	- A multi-storey carpark with	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Excluding two sites for primary school and area for road.

.

	community facilities	
	- An at-grade covered public	
	transport interchange (PTI)	
	- Other social welfare facilities <sup>5</sup>	
Tentative Population Intake	2033	

#### Representation Sites under Items B and C

4.1.3 Item B (with a total area of about 9.23ha including GL of about 17.4%) and Item C (with a total area of about 0.5 ha including GL of about 4%), being at the eastern fringe of Tin Shui Wai (TSW) New Town, is located to the east of Tin Tsz Road, west of Kai Shan and north of Ha Mei San Tsuen in Ping Shan north (**Plans H-5a to H-5f**). The site is currently mainly occupied by open storage yards. The site is accessible from Tin Wah Road via a local track. The area under Item B is for the proposed public housing development whereas the area under Item C is for a sewage pumping station, a floodwater pumping station and a floodwater retention tank.

Proposed Public Housing Development at Ping Shan North near Tin Tsz Road and supporting infrastructural facilities

4.1.4 Item B is zoned "R(A)6" with maximum PR of 6.7 and maximum BH of 160mPD while Item C is zoned "G/IC". An indicative layout is at **Plan H-6** and the photomontages are at **Plans H-7a to H-7d**. The development parameters of the proposed housing development are as follows:

Rezoning Area	About 9.23 ha	
Site Area for Housing	About 6.2 ha	
Development <sup>6</sup>		
Maximum PR	6.7	
Maximum BH	160mPD	
Estimated No. of Flats	9,000 to 9,500 (about)	
Estimated Population	24,300 to 25,650 (about)	
Proposed No. of Residential	10	
Blocks		
Supporting facilities	- Kindergarten(s)	
	- Retail facilities	
	- An at-grade covered PTI	
	- Other social welfare facilities <sup>5</sup>	
Tentative Population Intake	2033	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> According to the 2020 Policy Address, the Hong Kong Housing Authority, together with the Development Bureau, will explore to set aside about 5% of the gross floor area of future public housing projects for the provision of social welfare facilities, as far as practicable. HD, in consultation with the Social Welfare Department (SWD), will further consider the type of social welfare facilities to be provided at the proposed developments at the detailed design stage.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Excluding area for road and drainage reserve, and other GL not for development.

#### 4.2 <u>Planning Intentions</u>

The planning intentions of the zones in relation to the above representation sites are as follows:

- (a) The "R(A)" zone is intended primarily for high-density residential developments. Commercial uses are always permitted on the lowest three floors of a building or in the purpose-designed non-residential portion of an existing building.
- (b) The "G/IC" zone is intended primarily for the provision of GIC facilities serving the needs of the local residents and/or a wider district, region or the territory. It is also intended to provide land for uses directly related to or in support of the work of the Government, organizations providing social services to meet community needs, and other institutional establishments.

#### 5. The Representations

#### 5.1 <u>Subject of Representations</u>

- 5.1.1 There are a total of 62 representations, including 60 adverse representations (**R1 to R59, R61**) and two representations providing comments (**R60 and R62**).
- 5.1.2 Among the 60 adverse representations, three (**R1 to R3**) oppose to all amendment items, five (**R4, R56 to R59**) oppose to Item A, 51 (**R5 to R55**) oppose to Item B and one (**R61**) opposes to the amendments to the remarks of the Notes of the "CA" zone regarding the extension of the 'Exemption Clause'. The adverse representations were submitted by HYK (**R1**), PSRC (**R5**), village representatives of Tai Tseng Wai, Ng Uk Tsuen, Wang Chau six villages, Wang Chau Yeung Uk Tsuen, Ha Mei San Tsuen and Fung Ka Wai (**R2 to R4, R6 and R9**), a member of PSRC (**R7**), a manager of Tang's Tong (鄧維新堂) (**R8**), three companies (**R56 to R58**) and individuals (**R10 to R55, R59 and R61**). Besides, amongst the 60 representations, 46 representations (i.e. **R7 to R51 and R55**) are made on two same sample letters.
- 5.1.3 The remaining two representations (**R60 and R62**) providing general view(s) and comment(s) on Items A, B and/or C were submitted by two individuals.
- 5.1.4 The major grounds of representations as well as their major suggestions, and PlanD's responses, in consultation with the relevant government bureaux/departments (B/Ds), are at **Annex IV** and summarised in paragraph 5.2 below.

#### 5.2 Major Grounds and Views of Representations

Representations in respect of Items A, B and C for WCRP and TTR Public Housing Developments

#### 5.2.1 Traffic and Transportation

Ma	jor Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)	Rep. No.
	Additional population arising from the proposed public housing developments and other proposed residential developments in TSW will overstrain the existing traffic capacity, for instance, aggravating the traffic condition of Tin Tsz Road, Fuk Hi Street and Wang Lok Street.	R1 to R3, R5, R7 to R51, R53 to R55
(2)	The current traffic condition in TSW is undesirable with constant traffic jam and long bus travelling time with many detour stops. The existing traffic infrastructure could not accommodate the additional population.	R7 to R40
(3)	There will be insufficient parking spaces to meet the increased population.	R54
(4)	It is suggested to construct a new road connecting the junction of Tin Tsz Road/Wetland Park Road to San Tin Highway via Fung Lok Wai and Tai Sang Wai with a slip road to Yuen Long Town Centre via Fuk Shun Street and Fuk Hi Street. The new road could alleviate traffic congestion in Yuen Long.	R5, R53, R54

#### Response

#### (a) In response to (1) and (2):

Preliminary Traffic and Transport Impact Assessments (TTIAs) were conducted under the EFSs to assess the traffic impact and suggest necessary mitigation measures to minimize the traffic impact. WCRP public housing development, it was proposed to conduct and complete road improvement works (Plan H-8) including road widening at Fuk Hi Street, junction improvement at junctions of Fuk Hi Street/Long Ping Road, Fuk Hi Street/Wang Lok Street, Long Ping Road/Long Ping Estate Bus Terminus, Long Ping Road/Fung Chi Road, Fung Chi Road/Wang Tat Road before population intake. For TTR public housing development, it was proposed to upgrade an existing local track to become a proposed access road to connect the site to the junction of Tin Wah Road and Tin Tsz Road, and to provide dedicated left turn lane for junction at Tin Tsz Road/Tin Wah Road. With the implementation of the aforementioned improvement measures, the traffic impact due to the proposed housing developments on local and nearby road links and junctions should be manageable. Detailed TTIAs will be conducted in the investigation and design stage to further review and formulate improvement measures to minimize traffic impact.

In order to cater for the anticipated demand for public transport services generated by the existing and planned developments, Transport Department (TD) will review and implement the public transport services at appropriate time to tie-in with the population in-take of the proposed developments and to cater for the demand of public transport services at the concerned district area.

(b) In response to (3):

Parking spaces will be provided at the proposed public housing developments according to the latest Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) requirements.

(c) In response to (4):

The proposed road improvement works as listed out in response (a) above are considered adequate to address the traffic impact arising from the proposed public housing developments. There is no detailed justification and assessment to support the proposed new road.

#### 5.2.2 Environmental and Landscape Issues

Ma	jor Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)	Rep. No.
(1)	The proposed public housing developments at Items A and B are subject to significant noise impacts.	R60
(2)	It is not appropriate to locate the proposed primary school at Item A next to a PTI ( <b>Plan H-3</b> ) as the air pollution will affect the primary school students.	R60
(3)	A total of 594 and 512 trees are proposed to be felled for the site formation and associated infrastructural works for WCRP and TTR public housing developments respectively. The trees along the main road should be retained to serve as natural buffer.	R60
(4)	There is no information on the future planning of an area (with 700 trees) located to the south of Item B.	R60
D		

#### Response

(a) In response to (1) and (2):

According to CEDD, Preliminary Environmental Reviews (PERs) were conducted under the EFSs to ensure proper mitigation measures will be adopted to minimize the environmental impact. According to the PERs, with the implementation of mitigation measures including low noise road surfacing, architectural fins and acoustic windows at receiver, the predicted noise levels at the planned sensitive receivers within the proposed housing developments will comply with the relevant noise criteria. Regarding the two proposed primary schools at Item A, it was proposed to provide 5m-high boundary wall at the sides facing the roads. However, the adoption of the 5m-high boundary wall shall be reviewed by Architectural Services Department (ArchSD) or the future project proponent of the school during detailed design stage. A mechanical ventilation system will be provided for the PTI to ensure that the air quality inside the PTI would comply with the requirement of the Environmental Protection Department (EPD). The exhaust louver of the ventilation fan would be located at the northern façade of the PTI, which faces away from the planned sensitive receivers within the proposed public housing development and the existing sensitive receivers along Fuk Hi Street. Other feasible school layouts, provision of mechanical

ventilation and its design shall be further reviewed in the detailed design stage to ensure the PTI would not cause unacceptable adverse noise and air quality impacts to the surrounding area.

#### (b) In response to (3):

The proposed felling of trees is required for the site formation works of the proposed public housing developments. Detailed tree surveys will be carried out in the detailed design stage to avoid unnecessary tree felling. According to the broad-brush tree survey under the EFSs, although there are about 594 and 809 trees falling within WCRP and TTR public housing developments respectively and the associated infrastructure works areas. they are all common species and no Old and Valuable Trees (OVTs) are identified. For WCRP public housing development, amongst the surveyed trees, 5 will be transplanted, 31 will be retained, and 558 will be felled due to unavoidable conflicts with the development. For TTR public housing development, amongst the surveyed trees, 297 will be retained, and 512 will be felled due to unavoidable conflicts with the development. compensatory planting ratio of a minimum of 1:1 in terms of number will be provided as far as possible in accordance with the Development Bureau Technical Circular (Works) No. 4/2020. Approximately 640 and 550 new trees will be planted for WCRP and TTR public housing developments respectively. The greenery area will not be less than 20% of the site area with reference to "Sustainable Building Design Guidelines" (Practice Notes for Authorized Persons, Registered Structural Engineers and Registered Geotechnical Engineers No. APP-152).

#### (c) In response to (4):

The area with approximately 700 trees is located outside the boundary of the TTR public housing site. It is zoned "REC" which is intended for recreational developments for the use of the general public (**Plan H-5a**).

#### 5.2.3 Other Technical Issues

Major Grounds/Comment(s)	Rep. No.
(1) Severe flooding has been occurring at Fuk Hi Stre The Government should solve the drainage problem	
(2) There is insufficient information with regard watercourses within the proposed public housing sites. It is not clear if transforming the watercour into a box culvert would impact the terrain with Items A and B.	ng se

#### Response

#### (a) In response to (1):

The Drainage Impact Assessment (DIA) conducted under the EFS for WCRP public housing development confirmed that there is no insurmountable drainage problem arising from the proposed development. Drainage Services Department (DSD) will keep monitoring the condition at Fuk Hi Street and carry out flood alleviation works as necessary.

#### (b) In response to (2):

Most of the minor watercourses within WCRP and TTR public housing sites are modified watercourses (**Plans H-2a and H-5a**) and have concrete-lined bottom and banks. As they are located near village area and/or open storage yards, it is likely that the watercourses have suffered certain degree of pollution from the surroundings. Considering various technical constraints, all watercourses within the sites would be demolished and diverted to proposed box culvert within the sites. The adoption of box culvert which occupies less land area was recommended with a view to achieving both maximum flat production and flood prevention.

#### 5.2.4 Impacts on Surrounding Villages

Major Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)	Rep. No.
(1) The six indigenous Wang Chau villages will be surrounded by tall buildings which will create 'wall effect' and affect villagers' health.	R1 to R3
(2) The proposed public housing sites are located close to major access to the burial ground, a number of famous 'fung shui' graves at Kai Shan, and the Ha Mei San Tsuen ancestral altar. The proposed development would affect 'fung shui' of the burial ground and villages.	R1 to R4, R6
(3) The boundary of village 'environs' (VE) is shrinking and there is insufficient land for villagers to construct small houses.	R2, R3
(4) The future public housing population would induce adverse noise and traffic impacts on Ha Mei San Tsuen.	R6
(5) The Government committed to resume land for the development of village expansion area (VEA) of Ha Mei San Tsuen yet the proposal has been suspended. The villagers queried on the intention of land resumption for the public housing development.	R6
Racnanca	

#### Response

#### (a) In response to (1):

Preliminary Air Ventilation Assessments (AVAs) and Landscape and Visual Impact Assessments (LVIAs) were conducted under the EFSs to ensure proper mitigation measures will be adopted to minimize air ventilation and visual impacts.

To minimize the air ventilation impact to the surrounding area, building block disposition aligned with the prevailing wind direction, building separations between residential towers and setback from adjacent roads have been adopted in the indicative layouts. At detailed design stage, quantitative air ventilation assessments will need to be conducted for the public housing developments to assess the effectiveness of the proposed

mitigation measures and optimise the building arrangement, in accordance with the Technical Circular for AVA by the Government. Planning briefs will also be prepared to set out the planning parameters and the design requirements to guide the future developments.

Building separation of about 15m between building blocks has been incorporated in the indicative layouts (**Plans H-3 and H-6**). Other mitigation measures, including sensitive design of buildings to reduce visual weight in terms of scale, height and bulk, and usage of appropriate building materials and colour to complement the surroundings are proposed to alleviate the possible visual impacts. The overall visual impact is considered acceptable with mitigation measures as shown in the photomontages at **Plans H-4a to H-4f and H-7a to H-7d**.

#### (b) In response to (2):

During the planning of the proposed developments, the local environment, greening, culture and history of the communities are respected and protected as far as possible. The development areas for the proposed public housing projects had avoided encroaching onto the nearby villages and burial grounds.

There is no grave, urn and kam tap identified within the proposed public housing sites. A wind/visual corridor in southeast-northwest direction between two rows of residential blocks is proposed at the WCRP public housing development (**Plan H-3**). The proposed public housing development will not cause visual obstruction to the famous 'fung shui' grave (**Plan H-2a**) located to its west.

Footpath will be provided to access to the burial ground in the surrounding of the proposed public housing developments.

#### (c) In response to (3):

The proposed public housing developments will not encroach onto the VEs of Fung Ka Wai, Ha Mei San Tsuen and Wang Chau six villages.

#### (d) In response to (4):

Regarding the noise impact on Ha Mei San Tsuen, the TTR public housing development is not incompatible with its surrounding village development in land use term, and should not cause environmental nuisance to the adjoining villages. In fact, various technical assessments, including the PER, have been conducted under the EFS, which concluded that there is no insurmountable technical problem for the proposed public housing development. In particular, according to the findings of the PER, there will be no adverse construction noise impacts to Ha Mei San Tsuen with the implementation of noise mitigation measures such as good site practices, use of powered mechanical equipment, movable noise barriers and noise enclosures.

Regarding the traffic impacts on Ha Mei San Tsuen, responses in paragraph 5.2.1 (a) above are relevant.

#### (e) In response to (5):

The proposed development area boundary for TTR public housing site

would not encroach onto the VEA of Ha Mei San Tsuen.

#### 5.2.5 Land Resumption, Compensation and Rehousing

Major Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)	Rep. No.
(1) The proposed sites involve substantial 'Tso/Tong' land. Resumption of 'Tso/Tong' land is in contravention of Article 40 of the Basic Law in that 'the lawful traditional rights and interests of the indigenous inhabitants of the New Territories shall be protected by the HKSAR'.	R1 to R3
(2) Without reprovisioning sites for existing open storage, logistics and warehouse operations, there will be adverse impact on the industry and local employment. The Government should retain brownfield sites for operations that could not be relocated into industrial buildings, e.g. car repairing, vehicle parking, logistics warehouses and open storage of heavy machinery, in order for them to continue their business.	R1 to R4
(3) Numerous squatters will be affected by the proposed developments and the squatter residents will lose their homes. There is concern over the rehousing and compensation arrangements for the affected squatter residents. The Government should adopt Zone A ex-gratia compensation rate for resuming the concerned lots as the sites are proposed for public housing developments in the new town area.	R1 to R4
(4) The boundary of proposed sites should be revised to include more nearby squatters to improve the environment of the village.	R62
Response	
(a) In response to (1):	
As advised by the Development Bureau, accord	ling to the Lands

As advised by the Development Bureau, according to the Lands Resumption Ordinance and other relevant legislation, the Government could resume land if such resumption is for a public purpose as required under the law. The legal title to the land (including whether the land is held by Tso/Tong) is not a relevant factor when considering whether land should be resumed, nor does it affect the statutory power to resume land under the relevant legislation. In this regard, it is considered that there is no evidence that the resumption of private land for the proposed public housing developments is incongruent with the Basic Law.

#### (b) In response to (2):

Brownfield operations are business undertakings. While the Government does not make 'one-on-one' re-provisioning arrangements for brownfield operators affected by development projects, they may wish to move their businesses to other locations zoned "OS", "Industrial" and/or "Industrial (Group D)" in the New Territories. The revised "Town Planning Board

Guidelines on Application for Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses under Section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance" (TPB PG-No. 13F) promulgated by the Board in March 2020 set out the criteria for assessing planning applications for open storage and port back-up uses, which help channel such uses to more suitable locations.

In parallel, the Government will provide eligible operators with monetary compensation; provide assistance on planning and land matters through the Lands Department (LandsD) if the operators have identified suitable relocation sites in the market; make suitable vacant government sites available for letting to eligible business operators affected by land resumption and clearance exercises for NDA or other relevant government projects; by way of short-term tenancy through tender; and in the long-term, reserve land in the Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen NDA (HSK/HT NDA) and Yuen Long South (YLS) Development Area for possible development of multi-storey buildings to provide accommodation to consolidate brownfield operations.

#### (c) In response to (3):

The Finance Committee of the Legislative Council in July 2018 endorsed the enhancement made to the ex-gratia compensation and rehousing (C&R) arrangements for eligible domestic occupants in squatters and business undertakings affected by the government's development clearance exercises. The enhanced arrangements are formulated to address the needs of different groups of people, while balancing the use of public money and public housing resources, principles of fairness, and expectations of affected clearees as well as the wider community.

Notwithstanding the above, the C&R arrangements for affected residents are outside the scope of the OZP, which is to show the broad land use framework and planning intention for the area. The concerns of the affected stakeholders would be dealt with separately by the Government in accordance with established mechanism in firming up the implementation arrangements.

#### (d) In response to (4):

In determining the development area, the Government aimed at minimizing land resumption especially to minimize impact to existing dwellers while achieving the most public housing units under various technical constraints and limitations. Taking into account the above, it is considered that the proposed development is a pragmatic and balanced scheme.

#### 5.2.6 Provision of GIC facilities and Open Space

Ma	ajor Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)	Rep. No.
(1)	Additional population arising from the proposed	R5, R7 to R40,
	public housing development and other proposed	R42 to R51, R53,
	residential developments in TSW will exacerbate the	R54
	current situation of the lack of community, health	
	service and social welfare facilities.	

(2)	With no details provided, the commitment to provide GIC facilities to meet the shortfalls is doubtful. This is less than desirable given the ageing population.	R60
(3)	Many "G/IC" sites were rezoned on mistaken assumption that there is no deficit in community service. The current solution to the shortfall is to provide GIC facilities in leftover spaces instead of well-planned independent premises, the latter of which would foster better quality of life for especially those with impaired movement.	R60
(4)	One of the two primary schools proposed at WCRP public housing site should be built at TTR public housing site. Primary schools should be located within walking distance for public housing residents.	R60
(5)	There is insufficient information on the location of the proposed open space within the proposed public housing developments.	R60

#### Response

(a) In response to (1) to (3):

Based on the HKPSG requirements, the planned provision for GIC facilities in Yuen Long District is generally adequate to meet the demand of the overall planned population (including the WCRP and TTR public housing developments), except for hospital beds, child care services facilities, community care services facilities, and residential care home for the elderly (RCHE) (Annexes VIII and IX).

Hospital services are assessed on a wider regional basis and can be partly addressed by the provision in Yuen Long Town and TSW New Town. HKPSG requirements for social welfare facilities are a long-term goal and the actual provision would be subject to the consideration of relevant B/Ds in the planning and development process as appropriate, and as detailed design proceeds. PlanD and SWD will also work closely to ensure that more community facilities can be included in new and redevelopment proposals from both public and private sectors in Yuen Long District.

SWD has all along adopted a multi-pronged approach, and maintained close liaison with relevant government departments, to identify suitable accommodation for the provision of welfare facilities, so as to meet the ongoing welfare service needs of different districts. Under the existing mechanism, when a NDA or site is identified as having potential for housing or GIC development, relevant government departments will plan for the proposed development with the required community facilities (including recreational, education, welfare facilities, etc.), taking into account the views of the community during the process.

According to the 2020 Policy Address, about 5% of the gross floor area of future public housing projects could be set aside for the provision of social welfare facilities as far as practicable. The social welfare facilities (such as child care centre and community care services facilities), as well as other GIC facilities would be integrated comprehensively in the proposed public housing developments and would be further considered in consultation

with the relevant government departments in the detailed design stage.

#### (b) In response to (4):

Education Bureau (EDB) will consider factors such as the latest projections, other factors that may affect the demand for school places in certain districts, different options to increase the supply of school places in particular districts, the prevailing education policies (including to enhance teaching and learning environment through reprovisioning) in the planning of public sector school provision. Nevertheless, there is a surplus of primary school classrooms<sup>7</sup> in the adjoining TSW New Town which could serve the future residents of TTR public housing development.

#### (c) In response to (5):

The indicative locations of the local open space for WCRP and TTR public housing developments are at **Drawings H-1 and H-2** respectively. Provision of local open space in public housing projects would be in accordance with HKPSG, in which the standard of provision for local open space is  $1\,\mathrm{m}^2$  per person. The location of the open space within the proposed public housing developments would be reviewed and determined in the detailed design stage.

Rep. No.

#### 5.2.7 Local Employment

Major Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)

		<b>3</b>	
	(1)	There is a lack of employment opportunities in TSW.	R5, R7 to R55
		The proposed public housing developments would	
		only create limited and/or low-ended employment	
		opportunities. As a result, TSW residents commuting	
		to work in other districts would put extra burden on	
		the traffic capacity in the area.	
L		• •	
	Res	sponse	
	(a)	The YLS Development and HSK/HT NDA will pro	vide about 163,630
		employment opportunities for North West New T	erritories (NWNT),
		including Yuen Long district. The implementation of the	ne aforesaid projects
		will bring more jobs closer to residents in the NWN	
		redress the current imbalance in the spatial distributio	-
		jobs in the territory.	r r r · · · · · ·

#### 5.2.8 Public Consultation

Ma	jor Comment(s)	Rep. No.
(1)	The Government did not consult the existing brownfield operators and residents regarding the development proposals.	R56 to R59
Res	sponse	
(a)	The established public consultation procedures for OZP amendments had been followed. As detailed in paragraph 3 above, prior to the consideration	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> There are 297 surplus primary school classrooms in the TSW District.

\_

of the proposed amendments to the OZP by RNTPC, PlanD together with concerned departments jointly consulted YLDC and PSRC on 17.3.2021 and 9.4.2021 respectively on the proposed public housing developments. The views and comments received have been duly relayed to the RNTPC upon submission of the proposed amendments to the OZP.

The draft OZP incorporating the proposed amendments was published for two months under the Ordinance. The amendment details, including the relevant RNTPC Paper and technical assessments, were made available to the members of the public on the Board's website. Members of the public could submit representations in respect of the proposed amendments to the Board. Upon the exhibition of the representations received under the Ordinance, members of the public could submit comments on the representations within three-week time. All representers and commenters have been invited to the Board to present their views.

#### 5.2.9 Others

Ma	ijor Grounds/Comment(s)/Suggestion(s)	Rep. No.
(1)	Proposed housing sites should be appropriately distributed in the whole territory and should not only be concentrated in Yuen Long and TSW districts. The Government should consider developing the abandoned fish ponds at Fung Lok Wai and/or Country Park/ fringe of Country Park for public housing.	R1, R5, R41 to R55
(2)	The Government should allow the villagers to develop village-type housing at 'Tso/Tong' land. Alternatively, the Government should reserve 20% of the public housing units for villagers or 20% of the land for villagers to construct their own houses.	R2, R3
(3)	Proposed housing sites should be developed for employment creation, such as logistics, commercial or industrial buildings, to avoid residents in the area travelling to work in other districts.	R41 to R52, R55
(4)	An area between TTR public housing site and Fung Ka Wai ( <b>Plans H-5a and 5b</b> ) is not included. It is unclear whether the open storage operations located in this area would continue to operate and affect the proposed public housing development.	R60

#### Response

(a) In response to (1) to (3):

The Government has been adopting a multi-pronged approach to make available sufficient supply of housing land progressively to meet the acute demand on housing. The Task Force on Land Supply stressed that there was no single solution to the land shortage problem, and a multi-pronged approach to increasing land supply would be necessary. The Government has therefore been developing land resources through various measures. The supply of land in the short-to-medium term is achieved through reviewing existing land uses of sites within the territory, while the

development of NDAs, new town extensions and land reclamation, etc., will be amongst the key medium- to long-term options.

The proposed WCRP and TTR public housing sites, which are located close to Yuen Long Town and TSW New Town respectively with existing public roads and supporting infrastructural facilities, are considered suitable for public housing developments. The Government will continue to conduct land use reviews to identify potential housing sites at other suitable locations. The Government has been and will continue resuming private land for public purposes, including various public housing projects. The suggestion of allocating portion of the sites for villagers' houses would inevitably pose constraints on comprehensive planning of the sites and result in loss of public housing units, which is undesirable in light of the current acute demand for public housing. Besides, land is reserved in "Village Type Development" ("V") zone for village type development.

(b) In response to (4):

The concerned area is outside the EFS boundary and falls within the VE of Fung Ka Wai, which is currently zoned "REC". When considering the future planning applications for brownfield operations at these areas, the Board would take into account the proposed public housing development to ensure no adverse impacts would be incurred from the brownfield activities on the residents of the public housing site.

## Representation in respect of the Amendments to the Notes of the "CA" zone for extending the 'Exemption Clause'

5.2.10 The major grounds and views of the one adverse representation are summarised below:

Ma	jor Grounds	Rep. No.
(1)	The amendment undermines the statutory gatekeeping role of the Board in controlling and the statutory rights of the public under the Ordinance in knowing and commenting government works involving land/pond filling and excavation operations in "CA" zone.	R61
(2)	The intention of the amendment, which is indeed a significant policy change, is unclear.	R61
(3)	There is doubt that the amendment made to individual OZPs instead of the MSN is to blind the public from noticing until it is too late to reverse course.	R61
Res	sponse	
(a)	In response to (1) to (3):  The extension of the 'Exemption Clause', i.e. exemption and land excavation works pertaining to public	

or implemented by Government and maintenance, repair and rebuilding

works from the requirement of planning permission, to the "CA" zone is in line with the latest revision of MSN, which was agreed by the Board on 6.8.2021 and subsequently promulgated on 24.8.2021.

The objective of extending the 'Exemption Clause' to conservation-related zones is to streamline the planning application process/mechanism. Public works co-ordinated or implemented by government are under an established monitoring mechanism where proposed works have to be agreed by B/Ds concerned and in compliance with the relevant government requirements. Maintenance and repair works are small in scale and do not involve new development. Rebuilding works are also small in scale which are regarded as a respect of the rebuilding right of the owner/occupier of an existing permitted building/structure. In gist, the 'Exemption Clause' is only applicable to public works and minor works which no major adverse impacts are anticipated. It should also be noted that such works exempted from planning permission still have to conform to any other relevant legislation, the conditions of the government lease concerned, and other government requirements, as may be applicable.

Besides, the 'Exemption Clause' only applies to the land/pond filling and land excavation works. If a 'use' requires planning permission from the Board in terms of the Notes (e.g. a Column 2 use), the use itself still requires planning permission and its associated land/pond filling and/or land excavation works would form part of the proposal. Planning permission for filling of land/pond and excavation of land is also required for a permitted use/development (i.e. a Column 1 use or a use specified in the Covering Notes) if the works are not exempted in the Remarks of the Notes. In this regard, statutory control over the developments in the "CA" zone have not been undermined under the Ordinance.

#### 6. Comments on Representations

- 6.1 The 4 comments are submitted by Green Sense Hong Kong (C1), Hong Kong Bird Watching Society (C2), a member of the YLDC (C3) and an individual (C4). C4 is also the representer of R60. Details of the comments received are set out below.
- 6.2 C1 opposes to R1, R5, R41 to R55. C2 opposes the amendments to the Notes. C3 provides comments on Items A, B and C which are largely similar in nature/identical to the concerned representations, which are covered in paragraph 5.2 above. C4 provides comments on Items A, B and C.
- 6.3 The major concerns raised in the comments, which have not been mentioned in the representations, are summarised below:

Major Comments	Comment No.
(1) Opposes to the suggestion to develop Fung Lok and Country Park.	x Wai C1
(2) The planning intention of the "CA" zone conserve and protect the natural environment.	

	amendments to the Notes of "CA" zone contradict the planning intention.	
(3)	At least 1.5m <sup>2</sup> open space per person should be provided in the proposed public housing sites with reference to the recommendations under the HK2030+ Study.	C4
(4)	Surplus car parking spaces in the existing public housing estates are rented out for public use. Consideration should be given to providing less car parking spaces and more recreational space in the proposed public housing sites.	C4
Res	sponse	
(a)	Response 5.2.9 (a) above is relevant for (1).	
(b)	Response 5.2.10 (a) above is relevant for (2).	
	Response 5.2.10 (a) above is relevant for (2).  Response 5.2.6 (c) above is relevant for (3).	
(c)		

#### 7. <u>Departmental Consultation</u>

The following government B/Ds have been consulted and their comments have been incorporated in the above paragraphs and **Annex IV**, where appropriate:

- (a) Secretary for Development;
- (b) Secretary for Transport and Housing;
- (c) Secretary for Education;
- (d) Commissioner of Innovation and Technology;
- (e) Antiquities and Monuments Office, Development Bureau;
- (f) District Lands Officer/Yuen Long, LandsD;
- (g) Principal Land Executive/Yuen Long Projects (Acquisition Section), LandsD;
- (h) Director of Housing;
- (i) Commissioner for Transport;
- (j) Chief Highway Engineer/New Territories West, Highways Department;
- (k) Chief Architect, Central Management Division 2, ArchSD;
- (1) Director of Environmental Protection;
- (m) Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene;
- (n) Director of Social Welfare;
- (o) Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation;
- (p) Director of Leisure and Cultural Services;
- (q) Director of Fire Services;
- (r) Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services;
- (s) Director of Health;
- (t) Commissioner of Police;

- (u) Chief Building Surveyor/New Territories West, Buildings Department;
- (v) Project Manager (West), CEDD;
- (w) Chief Engineer/Housing Project 2, CEDD;
- (x) Chief Engineer/Housing Project 3, CEDD;
- (y) Head of Geotechnical Engineering Office, CEDD;
- (z) Chief Engineer/Mainland North, DSD;
- (aa) Chief Engineer/ Special Duty, DSD;
- (bb) Chief Engineer/Construction, Water Supplies Department;
- (cc) District Officer (Yuen Long), Home Affairs Department; and
- (dd) Chief Town Planner/Urban Design & Landscape, PlanD.

#### 8. Planning Department's Views

Based on the assessments in paragraph 5 above, PlanD <u>does not support</u> representations **R1 to R62** and considers that the OZP <u>should not be amended</u> to meet the representations for the following reasons:

#### Items A, B and C

- (a) the Government has been adopting a multi-pronged approach to increase housing land supply, including carrying out various land use reviews on an on-going basis. The representation sites are located at the fringe of and in close proximity to the Yuen Long Town and Tin Shui Wai New Town with existing public roads and supporting infrastructural facilities. Taking into account that there is no insurmountable technical problem identified for the proposed public housing developments, it is considered suitable for rezoning the representation sites for residential use with a view to increasing housing land supply (R1 to R59);
- (b) Engineering Feasibility Studies with technical assessments on the potential impacts on various aspects, including traffic, environmental, landscape, air ventilation and drainage, have been conducted and confirmed that there is no insurmountable technical problem in developing the representation sites for public housing developments. Detailed design of building block disposition, design and provision of local open space and recreational facilities, location of compensatory tree planting will be further considered at the detailed design stage (R1 to R51, R53 to R55, R60);
- (c) land resumption and compensation and rehousing arrangements are outside the scope of the subject OZP, which is to show the broad land use framework and planning intention for the area. The concerns of the affected stakeholders would be dealt with separately by the Government in firming up the implementation arrangements (**R1 to R4, R6, R62**);
- (d) the planned GIC facilities and open space are generally sufficient to meet the demand of the planned population in the district in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. Appropriate social welfare and community facilities will be provided in the proposed public housing developments to serve the residents and locals. The provision of social welfare and community facilities will be closely monitored by the relevant Bureaux/Departments (R5, R7 to R40, R42 to R51, R53, R54, R60);

#### Amendment to the Notes of the "CA" zone for extending the exemption clause

(e) the amendment to the Notes to extend the exemption clause for filling of land/pond and excavation of land in relation to the "Conservation Area" zone is to streamline the planning application process/mechanism. The amendment is in line with the latest revision of the Master Schedule of Notes to Statutory Plans (**R61**); and

#### **Public Consultation**

(f) the Yuen Long District Council and Ping Shan Rural Committee were consulted on 17.3.2021 and 9.4.2021 respectively on the proposed public housing developments and the statutory consultation process under the Town Planning Ordinance was duly followed (**R56 to R59**).

#### 9. <u>Decision Sought</u>

- 9.1 The Board is invited to give consideration to the representations and comments taking into consideration the points raised in the hearing session, and decide whether to propose/not to propose any amendment to the Plan to meet/partially meet the representations.
- 9.2 Should the Board decide that no amendment should be made to the Plan to meet the representations, Members are also invited to agree that the Plan, together with its Notes and updated Explanatory Statement, are suitable for submission under section 8 of the Ordinance to the Chief Executive in Council for approval.

#### 10. Attachments

**Drawing H-2** 

Plan H-1

Annex II Annex III	Draft Ping Shan OZP No. S/YL-PS/19 (reduced size) Schedule of Amendments to the Approved Ping Shan OZP No. S/YL-PS/18 List of Representers and Commenters
Annex IV	Summary of Representations and Comments and the
	Government's responses
Annex V	Extract of the Minutes of RNTPC Meeting held on 16.4.2021
Annex VI	Extract of the Minutes of HTPDC of YLDC Meeting held on 17.3.2021
Annex VII	Extract of the Minutes of PSRC Meeting held on 9.4.2021 (Chinese version only)
Annex VIII	Provision of Major GIC Facilities and Open Space in Yuen Long District
Annex IX	Provision of Major GIC Facilities and Open Space in Ping Shan Area
Drawing H-1	Indicative Open Space Plan for Proposed Wang Chau Remaining Phases Public Housing Development

Development near Tin Tsz Road Location Plan of Representation Sites

Indicative Open Space Plan for Proposed Public Housing

Plans H-2a to H-2f	Site Plan, Aerial Photo and Site Photos of Item A
Plan H-3	Conceptual Layout of Proposed Wang Chau Remaining
	Phases Public Housing Development
Plans H-4a to H-4f	Photomontages of the Proposed Wang Chau Remaining
	Phases Public Housing Development
Plans H-5a to H-5f	Site Plan, Aerial Photo and Site Photos of Items B and C
Plan H-6	Conceptual Layout of Proposed Public Housing
	Development near Tin Tsz Road and supporting
	infrastructural facilities
Plans H-7a to H-7d	Photomontages of the Proposed Public Housing
	Development near Tin Tsz Road and supporting
	infrastructural facilities
Plan H-8	Proposed Road Improvement Works

PLANNING DEPARTMENT JANUARY 2022